

#### The Language Myth

Language is central to our lives, the cultural tool that arguably sets us apart from other species. Some scientists have argued that language is innate, a type of unique human 'instinct' pre-programmed in us from birth. In this book, Vyvyan Evans argues that this received wisdom is, in fact, a myth.

Debunking the notion of a language 'instinct', Evans demonstrates that language is related to other animal forms of communication; that languages exhibit staggering diversity; that we learn our mother tongue drawing on general properties and abilities of the human mind, rather than an inborn 'universal' grammar; that language is not autonomous but is closely related to other aspects of our mental lives; and that, ultimately, language and the mind reflect and draw upon the way we interact with others in the world.

Compellingly written and drawing on cutting-edge research, *The Language Myth* sets out a forceful alternative to the received wisdom, showing how language and the mind really work.

**Vyvyan Evans** is Professor of Linguistics in the School of Linguistics and English Language at Bangor University.





## The Language Myth

Why Language Is Not an Instinct

**VYVYAN EVANS** 





### **CAMBRIDGE**UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107619753

© Vyvyan Evans 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Evans, Vyvyan.

The language myth : why language is not an instinct / Vyvyan Evans. pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-04396-1 (Hardback) - ISBN 978-1-107-61975-3 (Paperback)

Linguistic universals.
 Cognitive grammar.
 Innateness hypothesis
 (Linguistics)
 Language and languages-Philosophy.
 Psycholinguistics.
 Title.

401-dc23 2014014932

ISBN 978-1-107-04396-1 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-61975-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Every effort has been made to secure necessary permissions to reproduce copyright material in this work, though in some cases it has proved impossible to trace or contact copyright holders. If any omissions are brought to our notice, we will be happy to include appropriate acknowledgements on reprinting, or in any subsequent edition.



For Andrea Tyler



The great enemy of the truth is very often not the lie, deliberate, contrived and dishonest, but the myth, persistent, persuasive and unrealistic.

John F. Kennedy



#### Contents

Acknow	vledgements	7
ACKNOV	vieugemenis	2

1	Language and mind rethou	ght	1
	Taking stock of language	5	
	Myths and realities 13		
	A straw man? 19		
	Lessons from evolution	22	

#### 2 Is human language unrelated to animal

communication systems? 27

From busy bees to startling starlings 29

Communication in the wild 35

Talking animals 39

Design features for language 45

But wherefore 'design features'? 47

All in the mind of the beholder 57

Of chimps and men 60

# 3 Are there language universals? 64 Linguistic diversity: a whistle-stop tour 65 Universal Grammar meets (linguistic) reality 67 Lessons from linguistic typology 77 So, how and why does language change? 79 The myth of Proto-world 88 Adieu, Universal Grammar 93

# 4 Is language innate? 95 An instinct for language? 98 Arguments for the language instinct 101

vii



viii	Contents
	Lessons from neurobiology 106 Lessons from language learning 109 So how do children learn language? 118 Towards a theory of language learning 123 Learning what to say from what isn't said 126 But couldn't language emerge all at once? 128 It's all about language use! 131
5	Is language a distinct module in the mind? 133  On grammar genes and chatterboxes 135  The chatterbox fallacy 142  Alas, poor Darwin 148  So, what's the alternative to modularity? 156  What's all the fuss anyway? 159
6	Is there a universal Mentalese? 161  Mentalese and the computational mind 163  Wherefore meaning? 168  Fodor's retort 175  Intelligent bodies, embodied minds 178  Metaphors we live by 180  Embodiment effects in the brain 183  So, where does this leave us? 189
7	Is thought independent of language? 192 Who's afraid of the big bad Whorf? 195 The rise of the Sapir–Whorf hypothesis 196 Born to colour the world? 198 The neo-Whorfian critique 204 Lessons from Rossel Island 206 Colour through the eyes of a child 212 Pinker's broadside 213 Greek Blues 215 All about sex 217



Contents ix

On time and space 221 What is linguistic relativity anyway? 226

8 Language and mind regained 229
Cultural intelligence and the ratchet effect 230
The human interaction engine 235
The rise of language 240
What does our mental grammar look like? 242
Universal scenes of experience 250
Why are there so many languages? 252
One final reflection . . . 256

Notes 259 References 274 Index 301



#### Acknowledgements

I have wanted to write this book since I was a graduate student. But some things are better for the time it takes to grow, experience and learn. The specific impetus for this book was a challenge made to me by Stéphanie Pourcel, on Brighton pier, of all places. Her challenge, a number of years ago now, was to explain why the language-as-instinct thesis, the thesis associated with Noam Chomsky and his followers, is wrong. This book is my response to that challenge. I hope it does that job. More than that, I hope it fulfils the greater task of explaining how I think language works, how language relates to the mind, and what this reveals about what it means to be human.

A large number of colleagues have supported the research and the writing that has gone into this book. For logistical support, specific advice or simply responding to queries, I gratefully acknowledge Ben Bergen, Andy Clark, Ewa Dabrowska, Adele Goldberg, George Lakoff, Ineke Mennen, Thora Tenbrink, Mike Tomasello, Mark Turner and Mike Wheeler. For detailed feedback on chapters, I am extremely indebted to Ben Ambridge, Mihailo Antović, Bastien Boutonnet, Vivien Mast, Svetoslava Antonova-Baumann and Alan Wallington. I am particularly indebted to Paul Ibbotson: Paul went way beyond the call of duty, and fearlessly read quite literally an entire draft of the book. His very extensive comments have shaped my presentation of various aspects of the book's content. I hope he approves of how I have responded to, and incorporated, his advice. I am also grateful for the immensely detailed and helpful advice provided by a number of anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press.

Finally, I gratefully acknowledge the support and care I have received from my editor at Cambridge University Press, Andrew Winnard. Andrew is a paragon of sound judgement and

X



#### Acknowledgements

хi

efficiency, and has provided extremely helpful advice on many aspects of the book. I hope to have done justice to the support he has afforded me.

This book is dedicated to my former Ph.D. supervisor, colleague, co-author and dear friend, Andrea Tyler. For a number of years, Ande and I have been intellectual co-conspirators in the language-as-use thesis – the thesis I present in the pages that follow. I hope she approves of what I have done in my part of the conspiracy.