DEFENDING THE JURY

Crime, Community, and the Constitution

This book sets forth a new approach to twenty-first-century criminal justice and punishment, an approach that fully involves the community and provides a better way to make our criminal process more transparent and inclusive. The American criminal justice system faces numerous challenges because of its ongoing failure to integrate the community’s voice. Using the lens of the Sixth Amendment jury trial right, this book offers fresh and much-needed ways for incorporating the citizenry into the procedures of criminal justice, resulting in greater investment and satisfaction in the system. Ultimately, the people’s right to participate in the criminal justice system through the criminal jury – a right that is all too often overlooked – is essential to truly legitimizing the criminal process and ensuring its democratic nature.

Laura I Appleman is a professor of law at the Willamette University College of Law. She received the Meisner Award for Faculty Scholarship in 2011 and frequently speaks to local and national news media on topics of crime, incarceration, and sentencing. For five years, Appleman was a criminal appellate public defender at the Center for Appellate Litigation, where she briefed and argued approximately fifty appeals in front of the New York appellate courts, including the New York Court of Appeals. Appleman currently blogs at the Faculty Lounge (www.thefacultylounge.org).
Defending the Jury

CRIME, COMMUNITY, AND THE CONSTITUTION

Laura I Appleman

Willamette University College of Law
# CONTENTS

Acknowledgments .......................................................... page vii

1 Introduction ................................................................. 1

Part I History in the Crucible: Rediscovering
the Original Community Right in Criminal
Justice

2 The Collective Jury Right and the Sixth Amendment .......... 13

3 The Supreme Court and the Reaffirmation
of Community ............................................................. 39

Part II Old Becomes New: Sixth Amendment Jury
Rights and Twenty-First-Century Criminal
Procedure

4 Retribution, Restorative Justice, and the Sixth
Amendment Jury Right .................................................. 53

5 Defining Community in the Twenty-First Century:
Cities, Counties, and Collective Action ......................... 70

Part III Theory into Practice: Origins and
Community in Modern Criminal Procedure

6 Bail, Jail, and the Community Voice .............................. 91

7 Infusing Community through Criminal Procedure:
The Plea Jury .............................................................. 124

8 Eradicating the Bench Trial .......................................... 159
Contents

9 Restoring the Offender to Society .......................... 172
10 Back-End Sentencing: The Sixth Amendment and Post-Prison Procedures ......................... 191
11 Jury Nullification and Victim Rights: Going Past Procedure ........................................... 210
12 Conclusion ..................................................... 219

Selected Bibliography ............................................ 223
Index ............................................................. 233
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am deeply indebted to numerous individuals who helped me conceive, contemplate, and write this book. Particular thanks are owed to John Langbein, Judith Resnik, and Hans Linde, three scholars who have served as mentors for many years. I would also like to thank Douglas Berman, Stephanos Bibas, Bennett Capers, Jennifer Collins, Caroline Davidson, Carissa Hessick, Elizabeth Kaplan, Peter Letsou, Dan Markel, Risa Mealus, Alice Ristroph, Darren Rosenblum, Nick Rosenkranz, Rose Villazor, Bob Weisberg, Norman Williams, and Ron Wright for their patience and their willingness to endlessly read, review, and debate my work. Thanks are also owed to Dean Curtis Bridgeman and Willamette University College of Law for helping fund this project. Finally, this book is dedicated to David and Graham, without whose constant support and encouragement this project would never have happened.