#### RELIGIOUS NETWORKS IN THE Roman Empire

The Spread of New Ideas

The first three centuries AD saw the spread of new religious ideas through the Roman Empire, crossing a vast and diverse geographical, social, and cultural space. In this innovative study, Anna Collar examines both how this happened, and why. Drawing on research in the sociology and anthropology of religion, physics and computer science, Collar examines the relationship between social networks and religious transmission to explore why some religious movements succeed, while others, seemingly equally successful at a certain time, ultimately fail. Using extensive epigraphic data, Collar provides new interpretations of the diffusion of ideas across the social networks of the Jewish Diaspora and the cults of Jupiter Dolichenus and Theos Hypsistos, and in turn offers important reappraisals of the spread of religious innovations in the Roman Empire. This study will be a valuable resource for students and scholars of ancient history, archaeology, ancient religion and network theory.

ANNA COLLAR is Fellow of the McDonald Institute for Archaeological Research at the University of Cambridge, and has published articles in *Mediterranean Historical Review, Asia Minor Studien, Iuppiter Dolichenus* (Habelt), and *Network Analysis and Archaeology*.

# RELIGIOUS NETWORKS IN The roman empire

The Spread of New Ideas

ANNA COLLAR





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8Bs, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

> www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107043442

> > © Anna Collar 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Collar, Anna, 1979– Religious networks in the Roman empire : the spread of new ideas /Anna Collar. pages cm Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-I-107-04344-2 (hardback) 1. Rome – Religion. 2. Social networks – Rome. 3. Religion and sociology - Rome. I. Title.

BL805.C65 2013 200.937 – dc23 2013013781

ISBN 978-1-107-04344-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLS for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04344-2 - Religious Networks in the Roman Empire: The Spread of New Ideas
Anna Collar
Frontmatter
More information

## Contents

List of figures and maps p		
Acknowledgements		
Lis	st of select abbreviations	xi
	Introduction	I
I	The network approach	5
2	Networks and religion in the Roman world	40
3	Jupiter Dolichenus: military networks on the edges of empire	79
4	The Jewish Diaspora in the west: the rabbinic reforms, ethnicit and the (re?)activation of Jewish identity	ty 146
5	Theos Hypsistos: God-fearers, the rabbinic reforms, the <i>fiscus Judaicus</i> and the redefinition of the Jewish–gentile relationship	0 224
	Conclusions: religion and social networks in archaeology and ancient history	287
Bibliography Index		292 316

# Figures and maps

#### FIGURES

I.I	The small-world network	page 11
1.2	Upper and lower boundaries within which information	
	cascades are possible	21
3.1	Stele from the central temple of Jupiter Dolichenus at Doliche	87
3.2	Stele of Jupiter Dolichenus found at Carnuntum	88
	MAPS	
<b>3</b> T	The region of Doliche	81
	Early distribution map of evidence for the cult of Jupiter	01
J.2	Dolichenus	100
3.3	Movements of officers worshipping Jupiter Dolichenus in the	100
J. J	Roman army	118
3.4	Full distribution map of evidence for the cult of Jupiter	
5.1	Dolichenus	120
3.5	Full PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus	126
	Temporal PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus: first century	
-	BC-AD ISO	128
3.7	Temporal PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus: AD 151–211	130
	Temporal PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus: AD 212–253	132
	Temporal PPA of the cult of Jupiter Dolichenus: AD 254-300	134
	Movements of Jews in the western Jewish Diaspora	204
4.2	Distribution map of evidence for the western Jewish Diaspora	206
4.3	Full PPA of the Jewish Diaspora	208
4.4	Temporal PPA of the Jewish Diaspora: first-second centuries A	D 214
4.5	Temporal PPA of the Jewish Diaspora: third century AD	216
4.6	Temporal PPA of the Jewish Diaspora: fourth century AD	218
4.7	Temporal PPA of the Jewish Diaspora: fifth-sixth centuries AD	220
сτ	Distribution man of evidence for the cult of Theos Hypsistos	2 4 2

5.1 Distribution map of evidence for the cult of Theos Hypsistos 242

Cambridge University Press	
78-1-107-04344-2 - Religious Networks in the Roman Empire: The Spread of New Idea	s
Anna Collar	
Frontmatter	
Aore information	

List of figures and maps	vii
5.2 Full PPA of the cult of Theos Hypsistos	272
5.3 Temporal PPA of the cult of Theos Hypsistos: Hellenistic	
period–first century вс	276
5.4 Temporal PPA of the cult of Theos Hypsistos: first century AD	278
5.5 Temporal PPA of the cult of Theos Hypsistos: second-third	
centuries AD	280

### Acknowledgements

This book has been a long time coming, and, of course, there are many people without whom it could not have been achieved at all. The original research was completed as my Ph.D. thesis, written between 2004 and 2008 at the University of Exeter, under the supervision of Stephen Mitchell and as part of his AHRC-funded project on *Pagan Monotheism in its Intellectual Context*. Stephen's consistent intellectual generosity and vision gave me the confidence and freedom to pursue new lines of thought, and his lucid criticism, careful guidance and unstinting support ensured that the project met with success. His continued friendship and enthusiasm for my work mean that I cannot thank him enough. My work has been fundamentally inspired by that of Carl Knappett, whose intellect, drive and quest for innovative approaches to archaeology have always challenged and demanded more of me. Without our numerous conversations and his influence and support I should be a laggard indeed.

A number of institutions have generously supported my research, both financially and in kind: the AHRC, the British Institute at Ankara, the British School at Athens, the Kluge Center at the Library of Congress and the Forschungsstelle Asia Minor in Münster. My thanks are due to Elmar Schwertheim, who welcomed me to the Forschungsstelle, and Engelbert Winter, who incorporated me into the excavation team at Dülük Baba Tepesi and who has supported my work ever since. My thanks go to the entire team in all its configurations, and especially to my epigraphic guides, Margherita Facella and Charles Crowther. In my third year I was fortunate enough to be an AHRC British Council fellow at the Kluge Center, I thank everybody there for the opportunity and for their great hospitality. Working alongside the people in the Classics and Ancient History department at Exeter was a great pleasure, my thanks to all of them, and especially to the tireless and wonderful Claire Turner and Kerensa Pearson. Irad Malkin I thank wholeheartedly for his enthusiastic support and for pushing for the inclusion of my initial, tentative attempt at exploring networks in the first

viii

#### Acknowledgements

volume of the special edition of the *Mediterranean Historical Review*. I am grateful to Tom Elliott (previously of the Ancient World Mapping Center) for enabling my access to the electronic versions of the Barrington Atlas. My editor at Cambridge University Press, Laura Morris, has been patient, kind and supportive; my sub-editor, Anna Lowe, has helped greatly with thinking about images and the final production and Barbara Docherty has done an incredible job of copy-editing: I thank them all most warmly for their hard work in getting this book into production.

The chapter on Jupiter Dolichenus has been enormously improved by conversations with and corrections by Michael Blömer, my special thanks go to him for freely sharing with me his knowledge and ideas, and for being such a genial excavation partner and intellectual sounding board over many years. Anthony Birley generously shared his thoughts on the new Vindolanda Dolichenum and altar with me, and Simon James encouraged me greatly with his questions at the American Institute of Archaeology meeting in Philadelphia in 2009. My thoughts on networks, innovation and evolution have benefited greatly from intense and meandering conversations with physicists and philosophers: Jonathan Davies, Harry Platanakis and Jake Snow.

During my second year at Manchester University, I was privileged enough to be taught by Geoff Stone, who rekindled my childhood love of the ancient world, and who has encouraged my efforts ever since: to him I offer my warmest thanks. Along the way I have been blessed by the friendship of a huge number of people. During my time in America, and beyond, Alice Bellini, Theo Black, Jessica Bogo, Amie Braütigam, Fabrizio de Francesco, Daniel Matlin, Sonja and Al Mitchell, Ger O'Donoghue, Stefanie Reetz, Dave Saunders, Elsa Suckle, Jørgen, Jasper and Zoë Thomsen and Aaron Tugendhaft. From Exeter, Anna Blurtsyan, Rowan Fraser, Sean Goddard, Brutus Green, Pauline Hanesworth, Jill Hilditch, the Reverend Dr John Hughes, Alan Outram, Gillian Ramsey and Matthew Wright. My stints at the British Institute at Ankara have been made thoroughly enjoyable by both the staff, Yaprak Eran, Yiğit Erbil, Gülgün Girdivan and Lutgarde Vandeput, and by various companions along the way: Shane Brennan, Tristan Carter, Anastasia Christophilopoulou, Ricardo Borges de Castro, Boran Dervişoğlu, Hugh Elton, Naoise Mac Sweeney, Peter Popkin, Janine Su and Mark Weedon. Other great friends who have been instrumental over the years are Amalia Kakissis, Pete Lockley, Michael Scott and Pete Vardon. In particular, Laura Searle and Polly Westlake have been humorous and adventurous travel companions, risking their lives on more than one occasion to visit extreme places in Turkey with me. The long

ix

х

#### Acknowledgements

and painful process of writing my Ph.D. would have been far less enjoyable without the company of some wonderful women: Susannah Cornwall, Cassie Hague, Sandra Lohmann, Sarah Lorimer, Bee Taylor, and especially, my blood, Rebecca Catto. Their support, brilliance and humour kept me sane.

My warmest thanks go to my Ph.D. examiners, Elena Isayev and Martin Millett who, during my viva, combined being excited and enthused about my project with clear criticisms and suggestions for improvement. Since then, they have both been the most supportive examiners one could hope for. I am extremely grateful to the two anonymous reviewers who have read this manuscript a number of times and who have offered useful suggestions and advice. This book would be poorer by far without the aid of these guides.

As ever, my most enormous love and thanks go to my amazing family, for their emotional, intellectual and financial support: my inspirational, irreverent, hilarious sisters Beth and Clio Collar. My wonderful, generous grandparents, Eileen and Leslie Carter, for always telling me to get a real job but actually being proud of me – it is a great sadness to me that my beloved grandpa did not live to see the final outcome of this effort. And finally, the triple stars in my sky – my radiant husband Stuart Eve, for everything, and my darling sons Wilfred and Edwin, the most extraordinary things in the world.

I here repeat and augment the dedication made in my Ph.D. thesis: to my adored dad, Nigel Collar, and to my incredible mum, Alison Carter. They have both in their different ways given me more than I could ever thank them for enough – argument, challenge, independence of thought and self, encouragement, love and an appreciation of the value of knowledge for its own sake.

This is for them.

# Select abbreviations

AA	Archäologischer Anzeiger
AE	L'Année Épigraphique
AJA	American Journal of Archaeology
AJP	American Journal of Philology
AJS	American Journal of Sociology
AJSLL	American Journal of Semitic Languages and Literature
ANRW	Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt
AOAT	Alter Orient und Altes Testament
ASR	American Sociological Review
AW	Antike Welt
BA	Biblical Archaeologist
CCID	Corpus Cultus Iovis Dolicheni
CIG	Corpus Inscriptionum Graecarum, 4 vols. Berlin, 1825–1877
CIJ	Corpus Inscriptionum Judaicum
CIL	Corpus Inscriptionarum Latinarum
CJZC	Corpus jüdischer Zeugnisse aus der Cyrenaika
EA	Epigraphica Anatolica
HSCP	Harvard Studies in Classical Philology
HThR	Harvard Theological Review
IG	Inscriptiones Graecae, 14 vols. Berlin, 1873–1890
IJO 1–3	Inscriptiones Judaicae Orientis vols. 1–111
IM	Istanbuller Mitteilungen
JAOS	Journal of the American Oriental Society
JECS	Journal of Early Christian Studies
JIGRE	Jewish Inscriptions of Graeco-Roman Egypt
JIWE	Jewish Inscriptions of Western Europe
JJS	Journal of Jewish Studies
JMA	Journal of Mediterranean Archaeology
JPE	Journal of Political Economy
JRA	Journal of Roman Archaeology

xii	List of select abbreviations
JRS	Journal of Roman Studies
JSJ	Journal for the Study of Judaism
KST	Kazi Sonuçları Toplantısı
MHR	Mediterranean Historical Review
$PIR^{2}$	Prosopographica Imperii Romani, ed. 11, ed. E. Groag, A. Stein
	and L. Petersen. Berlin, 1933 ff.
RIB	The Roman Inscriptions of Britain
SCI	Scripta Classica Israelica
SEG	Supplementum epigraphicum graecum
Syll <sup>3</sup> .	W. Ditterberger, Sylloge inscriptionum graecarum (SIL).
	Leipzig, 1915–1924
TAM	Tituli Asia Minoris
WA	World Archaeology