

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

# Contents

<i>List of Tables and Charts</i>	<i>page</i> xxi
<i>List of Cases</i>	xxiii
<i>Preface to the Second Edition</i>	xxxi
<b>1 INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
I. Scope of Book	1
II. Development of Taxes on Consumption – A Brief Review of History	2
III. Direct and Indirect Taxes on an Income or Consumption Base	5
A. Direct and Indirect Taxes	5
B. Income and Consumption Base for Tax	7
IV. Tax Structures in Developed and Developing Economies	8
V. The Value Added Tax	10
VI. The Proliferation of VATs	12
VII. Glossary of VAT Terms	14
VIII. Discussion Questions	18
<b>2 CONSUMPTION TAX FORMS AND BASE ALTERATIONS</b>	<b>20</b>
I. Forms of Consumption-Based Taxes	20
A. Introduction	20
B. Consumption-Based Direct Tax on Individuals	20
C. Single and Multistage Sales Taxes	22
II. Overview of the Value Added Tax	23
A. In General	23
B. Jurisdictional Reach of the Tax	24
C. Inclusion of VAT in Tax Base	25
D. Inclusion of Capital Goods in Tax Base	26
	ix

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

x	<i>Contents</i>	
	III. Methods of Calculating VAT Liability	28
	A. Credit-Invoice VAT	28
	B. Credit-Subtraction VAT That Does Not Rely on VAT Invoices	30
	C. Sales-Subtraction VAT	31
	D. Addition-Method VAT	33
	IV. Methods of Altering the Tax Base	36
	A. Entity Exemptions	39
	B. Zero Rating	40
	C. Transaction Exemption	42
	D. Alteration of Base by Granting or Denying Credits	43
	E. Multiple Rates	44
	V. Discussion Questions	44
3	VARIETIES OF VAT IN USE	47
	I. Introduction	47
	II. European Union: A Mature VAT Resistant to Change	48
	A. VAT in the European Community	48
	B. European Court of Justice	52
	C. Application of the EU VAT Directive	53
	III. Japanese Consumption Tax	54
	A. Credit-Subtraction VAT Without Invoices	54
	B. Movement Toward Invoice-Method VAT	55
	IV. New Zealand Goods and Services Tax	55
	A. Broad Tax Base	56
	B. Taxation of Government Services	56
	C. Taxation of Casualty and Other Nonlife Insurance	56
	D. Global Reach of the New Zealand GST	57
	V. African Experience Expanding Base to Tax Financial Services	58
4	REGISTRATION, TAXPAYER, AND TAXABLE ACTIVITY	59
	I. Introduction	59
	II. Registration	59
	A. In General	59
	B. Mandatory Registration	60
	1. General Rules	60
	2. Promoters of Public Entertainment	61
	3. Registration Regardless of Turnover	62

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	xi
C. Registration Threshold and the Small Business Exemption	62
1. In General	62
2. A Single Business and Related Person Rules	67
3. Severing Value from the Business	69
D. Voluntary Registration	71
E. Cancellation of Registration	72
F. Transition to Registration and Cancellation of Registration	73
G. Registration of Branches and Group of Companies	74
H. Electronic Commerce, Broadcasting, and Telecommunication Services	74
<b>III. Person Liable for Tax</b>	<b>75</b>
A. General Principles	75
B. Person Treated as Seller	75
1. In General	75
2. Services Rendered by Nonresidents	76
3. Auctions	76
4. Local Government Services	77
<b>IV. Business Activity Subject to VAT</b>	<b>77</b>
A. Economic or Taxable Activity	77
B. Personal Sales	83
C. When Does a Business Begin?	87
D. Employee Not Engaged in Taxable Activity	89
V. Discussion Questions	90
<b>5 TAXABLE SUPPLIES AND TAX INVOICES</b>	<b>92</b>
I. Introduction	92
II. Supplies of Goods and Services	92
A. What Is a Supply for Consideration?	93
1. Nonsupplies or Supplies Other Than in the Course of Taxable Activity	103
2. Sales for Consideration	104
3. Transactions or Transfers Deemed to Be Supplies for VAT Purposes	108
a. <i>Cease to Conduct Taxable Transactions</i>	109
b. <i>Diversion of Business Assets to Personal or Employee Use</i>	109
c. <i>Change in the Use of Goods or Services</i>	110
d. <i>Repossession of Goods Sold in a Taxable Transaction</i>	110
B. Supply of Goods versus Services	111
1. Supply of Goods – in General	111
2. Supply of Services – in General	112
3. Classification as Goods or Services – Predominant Element	115

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xii	<i>Contents</i>	
	C. Single, Mixed, and Composite Supplies	122
	D. Vouchers	130
	III. The VAT Invoice	133
	A. Role of VAT Invoice	133
	B. Who Receives VAT Invoices?	133
	C. Contents of Required VAT Invoices	133
	D. Waiver of Required VAT Invoices	134
	IV. Discussion Questions	135
6	THE TAX CREDIT MECHANISM	136
	I. Tax Credit for Purchases	136
	A. Basic Input Tax Credit Rules	136
	1. Allowance of Credit – General Rules	136
	2. Credit for Input VAT on Capital Goods	138
	3. Who Is Entitled to Claim Credit?	151
	4. Conditions to Claim Credit for Input VAT	152
	5. Purchases Not Used in Making Taxable Supplies	157
	B. Pre-Opening Expenses and Post-Economic Activity	164
	C. Impact of Subsidies on Allowable Input Credits	166
	D. Transactions Involving Shares of Stock	167
	E. Bad Debts	172
	F. Allocation of Deductions Between Taxable and Other Activities	173
	II. Treatment of Excess Input Credits – Carry Forward, Offset, or Refund	174
	III. Change from Exempt to Taxable or Taxable to Exempt Status	178
	IV. Used Property	179
	A. Business-to-Business Sales of Used Property	179
	B. Sales of Used Property in Non-Taxable Transactions	179
	V. Post-Sale Price Adjustments and Refunds	182
	A. In General	182
	B. Third Party Post-Sale Rebate to Final Consumer	183
	VI. Casual Sales by Consumers	183
	VII. Japan’s System to Calculate Input Credits	184
	VIII. Calculation of Tax Liability and Special Schemes	185
	IX. Discussion Questions	186

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	xiii
7 INTRODUCTION TO CROSS-BORDER ASPECTS OF VAT	187
I. Introduction to International Trade	187
II. Vocabulary of Interjurisdictional (Cross-Border) Aspects of VAT	188
III. Definition of Tax Jurisdiction	189
A. Introduction	189
B. Territorial or Global Reach of the Tax	189
C. Origin or Destination Principle	195
1. In General	195
2. Double Taxation of Consumer-to-Consumer Imports	197
IV. Basic Place of Supply Rules for a Territorial, Destination Principle VAT	201
V. Goods Involved in International Trade	208
A. Imports of Goods	208
B. Exports of Goods	209
VI. Services Involved in International Trade	210
A. Services Beyond the Scope of Tax in User's Jurisdiction	210
B. Imports of Services	210
C. Exports of Services	211
D. EU's Revised Rules on Services	215
1. Business-to-Business Services	216
2. Business-to-Consumer Services	216
3. Special Rules for Particular Situations	216
4. Rules to Avoid Double Tax or Non-Tax	217
E. The OECD Project on Place of Supply for Cross-Border Services and Intangibles	217
VII. Special Treatment for Particular Industries	218
A. Telecommunications, Broadcasting, and Electronically Supplied Services	218
1. Telecom and Broadcast Services	218
2. Electronically Supplied Services	220
3. Special Schemes for Non-Established Taxable Persons	221
B. Electronic Commerce	221
C. International Transportation Services	223
VIII. Proposal to Fund Disaster Relief	224
IX. Discussion Questions	225
8 TIMING AND VALUATION RULES	226
I. The Timing Rules	226

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xiv	<i>Contents</i>	
	A. Accrual, Hybrid, and Cash Methods – in General	226
	1. Imports	227
	2. Accrual Method	228
	3. Invoice Method	235
	4. Cash Method	235
	B. Taxable Period	236
	1. Taxable Period – in General	237
	2. Variations in Length of Period	237
	3. Time to File Returns and Pay Tax	238
	C. Special Rules for Certain Sales	239
	1. Installment or Deferred Payment Sales	239
	2. Goods Diverted to Personal Use	240
	3. Other Special Cases	241
	<b>II. Transition Rules</b>	241
	A. Introduction	241
	B. Change in Rates	241
	C. Other Amendments	242
	D. Registration Requirement	242
	E. Pre-Effective Date Contracts Not Specifying VAT	242
	<b>III. Valuation Rules</b>	243
	A. Taxable Amount or Value of a Supply – General Rule	243
	B. Sales Free of Charge or for a Nominal Charge	248
	C. Discounts, Rebates, and Price Allowances	249
	D. Pledged Goods and Repossessions	250
	E. Post-Sale Adjustments	251
	F. Related Party Transactions	253
	G. Margin Schemes	254
	H. Sales to Door-to-Door Sellers and Similar Independent Contractors	255
	I. Self-Supply Transactions	256
	J. Taxable Amount – Imports	257
	1. General Rule	257
	2. Imports Placed in a Bonded Warehouse	257
	3. Imports of Previously Exported Articles	258
	4. Imports from Unregistered Persons	258
	<b>IV. Discussion Questions</b>	259

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	xv
9 ZERO-RATING, EXEMPTIONS, AND EXEMPT ENTITIES	260
I. Introduction	260
II. Zero-Rated Sales	260
A. In General	260
B. Zero-Rated Exports	268
C. Zero Rating Other Transactions	268
III. Exempt Sales	269
IV. Allocation of a Single Price between Supplies with Different Tax Consequences	281
V. A-B-C Transactions	282
VI. Governmental Entities and Nonprofit Organizations	285
A. Introduction	285
B. Various Approaches to the Taxation of Governments and NPOs	288
C. Taxation in New Zealand	289
D. Taxation in the European Union	290
VII. Special Treatment for Diplomats, Embassies, and International Organizations	309
VIII. Discussion Questions	309
10 VAT EVASION AND AVOIDANCE	311
I. Introduction	311
II. Avoidance	311
III. VAT Evasion	339
11 GAMBLING AND FINANCIAL SERVICES (OTHER THAN INSURANCE)	347
I. General Introduction	347
II. Gambling, Lotteries, and Other Games of Chance	347
III. Financial Services (Other than Insurance)	351
A. Introduction	351
B. Exemption for Most Financial Services	354
1. Early Rationale Has Lost Force	354
2. Administrative Problems Associated with Exempting Financial Services	354

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xvi	<i>Contents</i>	
	a. <i>Importance of Certainty in Tax Treatment – Interpretation Problems</i>	354
	b. <i>Allocation of Input Tax Between Taxable and Exempt Supplies</i>	360
	i. Introduction	360
	ii. Methods of Allocating Disallowed Credits	360
	3. Distortions Caused by Exemption of Financial Services	362
	a. <i>Vertical Integration</i>	362
	b. <i>Outsourcing</i>	363
	C. Financial Intermediation Services – Services Measured by Margins	367
	1. Deposits and Loans	370
	2. EU Approach	371
	D. Departures from Total Exemption – Retain Exemption for Intermediation Services, But Tax Many Other Financial Services	373
	1. Introduction	373
	2. Taxation of Fee-Based Services – South Africa	374
	3. Narrow Definition of Financial Services – Australia	376
	E. Departures from Total Exemption – Zero-Rate Financial Intermediation Services Fully or Partially	377
	1. Singapore’s Zero-Rating of Services to Taxable Customers	377
	2. New Zealand’s Zero-Rating for Some Services Rendered by Financial Service Providers	378
	F. Other Approaches to the Taxation of Financial Services	380
	1. Israel	380
	2. Italy’s IRAP	381
	3. Canadian Flirtation with Taxation of Intermediation Services	381
	4. Proposals in the United States	382
	5. The Poddar–English Proposal	383
	6. Zee’s Modified Reverse-Charging Approach	385
	7. Some Thoughts	387
	G. Islamic Finance	387
	IV. Discussion Questions	388
12	INSURANCE	391
	I. Introduction	391
	II. Broad-Based Tax on Casualty Insurance	393
	III. Exemption for Insurance Other than Life Insurance	394
	IV. New Zealand Taxation of Insurance	399
	A. Application of the NZ Taxation of Casualty Insurance to GST-Registered Policyholders	402



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	xvii
B. Application of the NZ Taxation of Casualty Insurance to Policyholders Who Are Consumers	403
C. Are Warranties “Insurance” in New Zealand?	404
V. Australia’s Taxation of Insurance	405
VI. A U.S. Proposal – The Nunn-Domenici USA Tax System	406
VII. Discussion Questions	407
13 REAL PROPERTY	408
I. Introduction	408
II. Array of VAT Treatment of Real (or Immovable) Property	409
III. EU Approach to the Taxation of Real (or Immovable) Property	412
A. In General	412
B. Exemption for Leasing and Terminating a Lease	413
1. What Is a “Lease” or “Letting” of Immovable Property?	413
2. Disposition or Transfer of a Lease	418
C. Mixed Business–Personal Use and Change in Use	426
D. Tax-Motivated Transactions	429
E. Interaction of Provisions	429
IV. Proposals for the Taxation of Real Property	437
V. Discussion Questions	439
14 AN ANATOMY OF THE CHINESE VAT	441
I. Introduction	441
II. Complementary Tax Base with a Turnover Tax on Services	442
III. Absence of the Business (or Economic) Activity Concept	445
IV. The VAT Threshold and Small-Scale Taxpayers	448
A. The Scope of the Small-Scale Taxpayers Regime	449
B. The Setting of Tax Rates for Small-Scale Taxpayers	451
C. Overall Incentive Effects	452
V. VAT Administration through the Golden Tax Project	453
A. The Mechanics of the GTP	454
1. The Generation of VAT Invoices	454
2. Claiming Input Credit on the Basis of Invoices	460
3. Cross-Checking and Inspecting VAT Special Invoices	461
B. Controversy Surrounding the GTP	462
VI. The Grant and Denial of Input Credits	463

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

xviii	<i>Contents</i>	
	A. The General Unavailability of Refunds for Domestic Supplies	463
	B. Reduced VAT Refunds for Exports	465
	C. Denial of Input Credit for “Sham” Invoices	467
	VII. “Refund as Collected” and “Simplified Collection” Mechanisms as Tax Preferences	474
	A. Refund of VAT Paid	475
	B. “Simplified Collection”	477
	VIII. Managing the Transition from the BT to the VAT	480
	A. Some Economic Effects of VAT Transitions	480
	B. Special Challenges Facing China’s Effort to Expand the VAT	482
	C. The Initial Approach to Replacing the BT: 2012–2013	483
	IX. Discussion Questions	486
15	INTERJURISDICTIONAL ASPECTS	487
	I. Introduction	487
	II. EU’s Commitment to Intra-Union Borderless Trade	489
	A. Introduction	489
	B. Selected Provisions of the Treaty Establishing the European Community	491
	C. Timetable to Move Toward a Definitive VAT Regime	492
	D. EU Member States Limited to One VAT	492
	III. EU Commitment to an Origin VAT: Its Problems and Proposals	498
	A. In General and Early Proposals	498
	B. The Keen and Smith VIVAT for Intra-EU Trade	499
	C. Howell Zee’s VAT Voucher System	501
	IV. Canadian VATs and the Bird/Gendron Dual VAT	504
	A. Introduction	504
	B. Variety of Canadian Approaches	504
	C. Bird and Gendron Dual VAT Proposal	506
	V. Brazil and the Varsano “Little Boat Model”	508
	A. Brazil’s Tax Structure in General	508
	B. Varsano’s “Little Boat Model”	509
	C. McLure’s CVAT Modification of the Varsano Proposal	511
	D. General Comments	514

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-04298-8 - Value Added Tax: A Comparative Approach: Second Edition

Alan Schenk, Victor Thuronyi and Wei Cui

Table of Contents

[More information](#)

<i>Contents</i>	xix
<b>VI. Subnational VATs in India</b>	515
A. Enacted State-Level VATs	515
B. Proposal for an Indian GST with an Integrated Interstate GST	516
<b>VII. Origin-Based Business Value Tax to Finance     Subnational Government</b>	518
<b>VIII. Reform of Subnational Taxes in the United States</b>	519
A. Coexistence of Federal VAT and State Retail Sales Tax	522
B. Subnational VATs in Use and Proposed for the United States	523
1. New Hampshire Business Enterprise Tax	523
2. Michigan Single Business Tax	524
3. Proposed State-Level VATs	525
C. Streamlined Sales and Use Tax in the United States	527
<b>IX. Discussion Questions</b>	528
<i>Appendix: VATs Worldwide</i>	531
<i>Index</i>	537