PROLOGUE

This book appears during the quincentennial of the death of Donato Bramante (1444–1514), who was recognized in his own time and still today for recovering the principles of Classical architecture that define the Renaissance. Without the slightest exaggeration, it could be said that Bramante changed the history of Western art, influencing everything that came after and informing our vision of antiquity itself. By common consent, the first fully articulated expression of his achievement is found in the Tempietto, the memorial chapel honoring Saint Peter on the site of his martyrdom in Rome. When Bramante built the Tempietto at the beginning of the sixteenth century, he was a master artist with an impressive record of accomplishments in Milan where he served the duke as architect and engineer. In Rome he created projects subtle in concept and prodigious in scale for that most ambitious Renaissance Maecenas, Pope Julius II, and in prime position New Saint Peter's basilica, enduring symbol of the papacy and of the Roman Church. Saint Peter's, like the other projects Bramante initiated for the pope, was completed long after his death by architects who defined his legacy for the later sixteenth century and after. The Tempietto is among the few surviving works that Bramante conceived during his first years in the Eternal City and saw through to completion.

The Tempietto is also one of those special monuments in the history of art that exerts an immediate and lasting impression on all who come into its presence, nestled in the first cloister of the Franciscan monastery of San Pietro in Montorio located high on the Janiculum Hill overlooking the city (Plates I–IV). Bramante's artistic heirs, Sebastiano Serlio, Giorgio Vasari, and Andrea

Palladio, famously praised the Tempietto, but a well-informed visitor in the 1540s best expressed its compelling presence, remarking on its centralized plan, construction material, columnar system, and degree of refinement both outside and within, concluding "it is truly a joy," *et veramente una gioia*.[1] And so it was for me during an extended period of residence in Rome, at times with students alongside, when I enjoyed the privilege of sustained exposure to this pivotal monument in the Western architectural tradition. The first time I entered the crypt of the Tempietto and made out the names of Ferdinand and Isabel, Catholic King and Queen, inscribed on the 1502 foundation stone, I knew that the relationship of those illustrious monarchs to this most lauded Renaissance building held rich possibilities for defining the historical underpinnings of Bramante's architecture.

During the five centuries of its existence, the Tempietto has attracted widespread admiration and detailed examination, but its status as the premier commission of the Spanish monarchs in Rome has received scant attention. The incomplete documentary record may have contributed to this neglect, but equally relevant is the unfamiliar circumstance that foreign sovereigns sponsored one of the canonical works of the Italian Renaissance. The goal of the present study is to recover the conceptual foundations of Bramante's architecture by situating the Tempietto at the center of a coordinated program of the arts exalting Spain's leadership in the quest for Christian hegemony. Bramante's innovations emerge as inseparable from the realities of patronage and politics, and Spain's contributions to shaping this central monument of Renaissance art are brought into sharp focus.

Roma patria comunis, the ancient praise of Rome as the homeland of all peoples, was revived during the Renaissance to acknowledge the universal character of the city, reflected in its residents who came from across the Italian Peninsula and throughout Europe.[2] Spain's influence in Italy was propelled by the 1442 conquest of the Kingdom of Naples by Ferdinand's uncle, King Alfonso V of Aragon (1416–58), consisting of territories reaching from southern Italy to the borders of the Papal States. During the second half of the fifteenth century that influence emanated from Rome when two members of the Borja family, Borgia in Italian, both subjects of the crown of Aragon, were elevated to the papacy, Alfonso as Callixtus III (1455–58) and Rodrigo, his nephew, as Alexander VI (1492–1503). The influx of their compatriots to Rome increased in step with the international status achieved by Ferdinand and Isabel, afterwards expanded by their grandson, Charles, King of Spain and Holy Roman Emperor.

When Bramante arrived in Rome "before the Holy Year of 1500," according to his first biographer Giorgio Vasari, he was a mature artist aged 55, who

commanded an impeccable artistic pedigree, born and trained in the shadow of the Montefeltro court in Urbino and active for two decades at the court of Milan.[3] When first in Rome, again according to Vasari, Bramante worked for Alexander VI in a supervisory role as *sottoarchitetto*, and participated in projects sponsored by members of the philohispanic group within the Curia, including the expansion of San Giacomo degli Spagnoli in Piazza Navona, national church of the Castilian community. Vasari praised the Tempietto in a later section of the biography devoted to Bramante's influence on other architects, but it too belongs on the roster of works conducted under Spanish patronage in Rome.[4] The program of state celebration that included the Tempietto was coordinated by Bernardino López de Carvajal (1455–1523), native of the Castilian city of Plasencia in Estremadura, and prominent member of the Roman Curia.[5] During the course of the fifteenth century, the Carvajal family rose to distinction in the administration of both the Church and royal court, with Bernardino and his uncle, Cardinal Juan de Carvajal (ca. 1400–69), extending their activities to Rome.[6] In 1488, Bernardino de Carvajal became Ferdinand and Isabel's representative to the Holy See, a post he maintained until his elevation to the cardinalate in 1493, and afterwards informally as the leading Spanish prelate in Rome.[7]

Contemporaries attest to Bernardino de Carvajal's sharp intellect, expertise in theology and Church ceremonial, and unswerving commitment to advancing Spain's prestige in the international ambience of the papal city. He employed diplomacy, published tracts, festive celebrations, and patronage of the monumental visual arts to advance that goal. The artistic program he oversaw centered on two venerable churches, Santa Croce in Gerusalemme and San Pietro in Montorio, one preserving relics of Christ's Passion from Jerusalem, and the other identified as the place of Saint Peter's martyrdom. At Santa Croce, Carvajal conducted initial works on behalf of Pedro González de Mendoza, the titular cardinal, and continued them in his own name after succeeding Mendoza in 1495. At San Pietro in Montorio, Carvajal acted as proxy for Ferdinand and Isabel. In these projects, Carvajal employed the same artists who defined the core artistic projects sponsored by the popes at the Vatican, in the first place Bramante, followed by his associates and artistic heirs, Baldassare Peruzzi and Antonio da Sangallo the Younger. The fresco cycle of the True Cross in the apse of Santa Croce, the first project Carvajal oversaw for Cardinal Mendoza, reflects the renewal of the early Christian heritage sponsored by Pope Sixtus IV at the Vatican.

Rome's architectural legacy provides a third focus of this study with special attention to Spain's own ancient past and the contemporary ambitions

of its monarchs. By way of introduction, I turn to an event drawn from the mid-fifteenth century when Spain's influence in Rome was firmly established. In the autumn of 1461 Enea Silvia Piccolomini, the humanist Pope Pius II (1458–64), visited the city of Porto, located near Ostia just west of Rome. His longtime friend Cardinal Juan de Carvajal staged an elaborate outdoor welcome for the papal party, sheltering his guests with tents and arbors formed with the intertwined branches of trees. On October 21 of that year, Pius elevated Carvajal to the office of bishop of Porto, an honor that came after three decades spent in papal service.[8] Carvajal belonged to an influential group of Spaniards in the Roman Curia including fellow Castilians Juan de Torquemada (d. 1468) and Rodrigo Sánchez de Arévalo (d. 1470), each one known for staunchly defending the doctrine of papal primacy and vigorously promoting crusade. Pius recalled how on that autumn day Carvajal delivered a speech in which he "talked a great deal about Trajan, saying that he was succeeding him as one Spaniard another."[9] The content of the oration, lacking in Pius's account, is readily imagined. Of immediate importance was Trajan's Spanish origins and responsibility for constructing the artificial harbor perpetuated in the city's name, Porto. Carvajal would have passed to the reputation of the emperor for beneficent rule and military achievement, which was recognized with exceptional honors in his own day and in the Christian era. The Roman Senate honored him with the title Optimus Princeps and permitted his burial within the sacred boundaries of the city. By means of arduous military campaigns, Trajan succeeded in expanding the Roman empire to limits in northern Europe and the Middle East never matched by his successors. The commemorative column rising from the center of the immense Forum built with the spoils of conquest provided Trajan's funerary monument. Those ancient distinctions carried over into Christian tradition. It was said that Pope Gregory the Great (590–604), learning of one of the emperor's great acts of justice, wept so profusely that Trajan's soul was released from purgatory, a rare example of Christian redemption being extended to a pagan.[10] Trajan was widely honored as a model of proto-Christian virtue, winning particular praise among Spanish authors of the Middle Ages and Renaissance.[11]

It can be certain that Carvajal extended the theme of Trajan's virtuous exercise of power to address the contemporary threat to Western Christendom. That threat had engaged the attention of Pius II long before his accession to the Petrine dignity and consistently thereafter, and it was a central issue in Juan de Carvajal's own biography. In 1454, one year after the fall of Constantinople to the Ottomans, Callixtus III reigning, Piccolomini represented Holy Roman Emperor Frederick III at the Imperial Diet in Frankfurt, which was convened

with the purpose of forging a united Christian front to counter Turkish military advances.[12] After acceding to the papacy in 1458, Pius pursued the goal of crusade with escalating commitment right up to the year of his death.[13] Juan de Carvajal played a prominent role in advancing that same goal. Acting as Callixtus's legate to Hungary, he assembled an enormous military force to halt Ottoman incursions in eastern Europe. That force, led by the general John Hunyadi and fortified by the preaching of John Capistran, engaged the enemy at the battle of Belgrade in 1456.[14] The resulting victory was promoted as the harbinger of a definitive Christian triumph. Celebrations were staged in Rome's Piazza Navona with an actor filling in for the absent Carvajal, who continued to pursue military objectives in northern Europe before returning to the papal city in 1461.[15] Against this background, the central claim Carvajal made in the oration that Pius did record, his succession of Trajan, is understood in a new light. The military exploits immortalized in the spiraling band of marble relief adorning the emperor's honorific column commemorate the campaigns against the Dacians, who occupied an area of eastern Europe contiguous to Carvajal's own arena of military action.[16] Moreover, Juan de Carvajal, although modest in his personal life, combined exceptional virtue with military valor, as had Trajan. The rhetoric of Catholic imperial power that Carvajal would have developed in his oration was applied to him directly by the Greek cardinal Bessarion in the epitaph inscribed on his tomb: "Peter in Spirit, Caesar in Courage."[17]

Bernardino de Carvajal, Juan's nephew, expressed his own vision of how universal Christian concerns and Rome's venerable history cohered with Spain's privileged status in the address he delivered before Pope Alexander VI and cardinals in a public consistory held on June 19, 1493. On that day a royal delegation conveyed Ferdinand and Isabel's formal obedience to the pope, a traditional practice that the monarchs expanded to include the announcement of royal policy.[18] The delegation was led by Diego López de Haro, viceroy of Galicia, accompanied by Gonzalo Fernández de Heredia, archbishop of Tarragona and governor of Rome, Bernardino de Carvajal, bishop of Carthage, and Juan Ruiz de Medina, bishop of Badajoz. Carvajal, already known for his eloquent oratory, delivered the address, and it was soon published, providing a lasting record of Spanish prestige in papal Rome.[19]

Carvajal opened the address by remarking on the national origins shared by both the pope and monarchs, which he identified as the fulfillment of Biblical prophecy concerning concord between the spiritual and temporal spheres. Citing Isaiah 11:6, he associated the peaceful calf and the lion that sleep side by side with the heraldic symbols of Alexander VI and the royal house of

Castile and Léon. Rome, he declared, had been chosen to rule the world, but Spain's rights and privileges approached equivalent status. Carvajal cited the Spanish origins of Rome's political and intellectual elite, naming among others the emperors Nerva, Trajan, Hadrian, Theodosius, and the authors Seneca, Lucan, Martial, Quintilian. The honor roll included the Arab philosophers Avicenna, Averroes, the rabbi Moses Maimonides, and even Aristotle, who was linked to Spain in one medieval tradition.[20] Carvajal itemized Spain's contributions to the Church beginning with the sacrifices of the martyrs, continued with the early Councils, and extended by the theological tracts of Orosius, Isidore of Seville, and Ildephonsus. He also emphasized the importance of the Apostle James Major, honored as Spain's evangelizer, who was venerated by the faithful from all nations at the great shrine dedicated to him at Compostela. Carvajal concluded it was only natural for a Spaniard to occupy the highest ecclesiastical dignity, following previous Spanish popes, Damasus I (366–84), John XXI (1276–77), Benedict XIII (antipope, 1394–1423), and Alexander's uncle, Callixtus III. This noble Christian lineage found a parallel in the secular sphere through the sacred bloodline that flowed to Ferdinand and Isabel from the heroic race of the Goths, conferring upon them nobility exceeding other rulers.

All those versed in Spain's history both real and legendary would have recognized the claims Carvajal advanced in the oration. He drew from two historiographical strands that Isidore of Seville had first brought together in the seventh century, later absorbed in the encyclopedic history sponsored by King Alfonso X the Wise of Castile in the thirteenth century, and elaborated by humanists working at the courts of Aragon, Castile, Naples, and Rome in the fifteenth century.[21] One strand concerned Spain's contributions to Rome's achievements in intellectual, religious, and political history. The other strand brought forward an independent dignity rooted in the superior piety and exceptional courage of the primeval Iberian tribes, which was transmitted to the royal houses of Castile and Aragon by the Goths. The Goths had established political and religious unity across the Iberian Peninsula, a goal that even the mighty Romans had failed to achieve. That unity lasted until it was shattered by the Muslim invasions of the eighth century. To be sure, Carvajal's concept of a unified Spain was an ideal vision, the kingdoms ruled by Ferdinand and Isabel being quite separate in their laws, language, and culture. Nevertheless, a single nation under the rule of the monarchs had its ideological roots in geography, politics, and religion.[22] The nexus was provided by the struggle to assert Christian control over the peninsula and the prospect of extending that control to the Holy Land. Carvajal buttressed the idea of Ferdinand and

Isabel's providential reign by enumerating the recent events of 1492: conquest of the kingdom of Granada, last Muslim stronghold on the Iberian Peninsula, and initial discoveries in the New World. He added to these achievements the expurgation of vice, restoration of purity, conquest of heresy, banishment of infidels, and expulsion of Jews.

Following the norms governing orations of obedience, Carvajal set aside the disagreements between the pope and monarchs already evident at that early point in Borgia's reign. During the same consistory, Diego López de Haro delivered a scathing criticism of certain actions of the pope that Ferdinand and Isabel judged to be damaging to the Christian community. This conflicted relationship between the monarchs and the pope, which continued throughout Borgia's pontificate, is insufficient to diminish the claims Carvajal made in the oration or his broader efforts to celebrate Spain's destiny. By the time of the consistory of 1493, those efforts had been under way for five years at Santa Croce in Gerusalemme and San Pietro in Montorio.

San Giacomo degli Spagnoli, national church of the Castilian community in Rome, where from 1491 to 1498 Carvajal held the chief administrative office, provided a third site of Spanish celebration.[23] In the mid-fifteenth century, Alfonso Paradinas, canon of the Cathedral of Seville and later bishop of Ciudad Rodrigo, constructed the church along the outer perimeter of Piazza Navona. It was the first of the new churches built in Renaissance Rome, and the first to be sponsored by a national group.[24] At the end of the fifteenth century, San Giacomo was enlarged and a monumental facade was built on the side facing the piazza, transforming this vast public space in Rome's historic center into an atrium for the church. Because the church honored the Apostle James Major, both it and the piazza became the preferred sites for victory celebrations involving Spain. In January 1490, Bernardino de Carvajal delivered a sermon before the College of Cardinals gathered in San Giacomo degli Spagnoli to acclaim the fall of Baza to Ferdinand's troops, a crucial step in the progress toward Granada.[25] The most dramatic celebrations took place following the conquest of Granada, news of which reached Rome at the end of January 1492. Carvajal, along with Juan Ruiz de Medina, his colleague and collaborator at San Pietro in Montorio, gathered reports concerning the victory and disseminated the news to the courts of Europe.[26] Together, Carvajal and Medina sponsored one of the more spectacular events held in Piazza Navona with a mock siege of Granada centering on a high wooden tower standing for the city's defenses at the Alhambra.[27] In another display, also held in the piazza, Cardinal Raffaele Riario staged a triumphal procession in the ancient manner. Actors playing the role of the monarchs occupied a carriage drawn

by four white horses, accompanied by soldiers and captives.[28] On a less jubilant note, San Giacomo degli Spagnoli served for the obsequies of Ferdinand and Isabel's son and heir apparent, Prince Juan, held on January 16, 1498, and again for Queen Isabel on February 16, 1505, attended by representatives of Church and state.[29] Carvajal seized those opportunities to exalt the monarchs and their achievements.

These events at San Giacomo degli Spagnoli, along with the attendant ceremonies and associated works of art, contributed to the celebration of Spain in Rome. Yet to take them fully into account in this study would deflect attention from the projects most relevant for the genesis and meaning of the Tempietto. The first two chapters are dedicated to Santa Croce in Gerusalemme and San Pietro in Montorio where the fortunes of the Spanish monarchy were anchored to the history of Rome and of Christendom through the memory of Constantine and Saint Peter. The four chapters that follow are dedicated to the Tempietto, one to antecedents in ancient and Christian architecture, and another to the symbolism of the architecture and its decoration, in both cases arguing for an overarching iconographic program that engaged the most closely held spiritual beliefs and ideological positions of the royal patrons. In the fifth chapter, the much discussed date of the Tempietto is addressed as part of a consideration of the historical context, demonstrating that Bramante's formal and conceptual innovations were anchored in reality and addressed an anticipated future. The sixth chapter is devoted to the legacy of the Tempietto during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries in commissions by the popes in Rome and the kings in Spain. An Epilogue brings the history of the monument and of Spanish celebration in Rome forward to the nineteenth century and concludes in the present.

Chapter One

JERUSALEM IN ROME

Beginning in 1488 and continuing for three decades, Bernardino de Carvajal oversaw renovations to the basilica of Santa Croce in Gerusalemme, built in the fourth century by Saint Helen, Constantine's mother and Empress Dowager, within the confines of her own palace. The dedication to the Cross and the toponym "in Gerusalemme" refer to the relics of Christ's Passion that the empress discovered in Jerusalem and brought to Rome. Carvajal engaged that illustrious history to honor Ferdinand and Isabel's signal achievements of 1492: conquest of the kingdom of Granada and inaugural exploration of the New World. Two narrative cycles devoted to the legend of the True Cross, one in the apse of the basilica and the other in the vault of the subterranean chapel of Saint Helen, address Spain's mission to lead the Christian world. These cycles establish the vocabulary of Spanish royal celebration also found in San Pietro in Montorio and the Tempietto, discussed in the subsequent chapters.

INTRODUCTION

Santa Croce in Gerusalemme counts among the seven privileged basilicas of Rome, distinguished by the relics of Christ's Passion brought from Jerusalem by Saint Helen and deposited in her palace, later transformed into a site of Christian worship (Figure 1).[1] The venerable tradition linking the basilica to the origins of Christianity and the triumph of the Church provided the context to celebrate the power of Spain and its monarchs. Bernardino de Carvajal

FIGURE 1. Israël Silvestre, Santa Croce in Gerusalemme, etching. Harvard Art Museums / Fogg Museum, Gift of Belinda L. Randall from the collection of John Witt Randall, R11053. Photo: Imaging Department © President and Fellows of Harvard College.

was responsible for accomplishing that program, first as representative of Pedro González de Mendoza, titular cardinal of the basilica (1478–95), and thereafter in his own name. Carvajal established a professional association with Mendoza when, in his role as rector of the University at the Cathedral of Salamanca (1480–82), he solicited the cardinal's interest in establishing a new college at the university, a project ultimately realized in Valladolid.[2] Arriving in Rome in 1482, Carvajal received a ready welcome. Sixtus IV appointed him private secretary, *cubicularius*, and on All Saint's Day, November 1, 1482, the Spaniard delivered the sermon before the Curia, eliciting great praise for his command of theology and eloquent oratory.[3] Carvajal returned to Spain in 1485 as Innocent VIII's *nuncio* to the court of Ferdinand and Isabel, and when back in Rome in January 1488, he assumed responsibility for the renovations at Santa Croce.[4] After Pedro de Mendoza died in January 1495, Carvajal succeeded him as titular of the basilica and pursued additional renovations right up to his own death in December 1523.

PEDRO GONZÁLEZ DE MENDOZA AND THE TRUE CROSS

Cardinal Pedro de Mendoza's link to Santa Croce was fundamental in moving the basilica into prominence as a showcase of Spanish royal prestige in