CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04129-5 - Legal Resolution of Nuclear Non-Proliferation Disputes
James D. Fry
Table of Contents
More information

CONTENTS

PART I **Introduction** 1

1 Foundational elements of the study 3
- 1.1 The problem and solution 3
- 1.2 Outline 7
- 1.3 Methodology 12
- 1.4 Audience 14
- 1.5 Originality of this study 16

2 Definitions, delimitations and disclaimers of the study 19
- 2.1 The nuclear non-proliferation regime 20
  - 2.1.1 Treaties comprising the regime 23
  - 2.1.2 Nuclear weapons 28
- 2.2 Focus on legal resolution 34
  - 2.2.1 Variety in dispute settlement mechanisms 34
  - 2.2.2 Legal resolution in this study 43
- 2.3 Pragmatism over utopianism 47

PART II **Security Council involvement with nuclear non-proliferation disputes under UN Charter Chapter VII** 53

3 Exploring potential problems with Security Council involvement 55
- 3.1 Introduction 55
  - 3.1.1 Structure of this chapter 59
  - 3.1.2 Disclaimers for this chapter 60
  - 3.1.3 Methods of interpreting Security Council resolutions 61
  - 3.1.4 Binding resolutions of the Security Council 75
- 3.2 Security Council Chapter VII measures 87
  - 3.2.1 Resolutions 255 and 984: establishing security assurances 88
    - 3.2.1.1 Positive security assurances of Resolution 255 89
    - 3.2.1.2 Positive security assurances of Resolution 984 93

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04129-5 - Legal Resolution of Nuclear Non-Proliferation Disputes
James D. Fry
Table of Contents
More information

3.2.1.3 Negative security assurances of the unilateral statements 95
3.2.1.4 International estoppel and security assurances 96
3.2.1.5 Legal nature of these assurances 101
3.2.1.6 Binding permanent members of the Security Council 103
3.2.1.7 Binding the Security Council 105
3.2.2 Resolution 487 and Israel's attack on Iraq 107
3.2.3 The 1991 Gulf War and Resolution 687 110
3.2.3.1 Cease-fire agreement on the ground 111
3.2.3.2 Nuclear disarmament obligations of Resolution 687 112
3.2.3.3 UNSCOM and UNMOVIC under Resolution 687 114
3.2.3.4 Iraq's acceptance of Resolution 687 121
3.2.3.5 UNSCOM's strength 122
3.2.3.6 Due-process concerns with Security Council proceedings 123
3.2.3.7 Reiterating treaty obligations 131
3.2.3.8 Suspending Iraq's NPT rights 133
3.2.4 India, Pakistan, and Resolution 1172 135
3.2.5 North Korea and various Security Council resolutions 144
3.2.5.1 Imposing treaty obligations on North Korea 152
3.2.5.2 Imposing treaty obligations on all States parties 154
3.2.6 Iran and various Security Council resolutions 154
3.2.7 WMD terrorism and Resolution 1540 163
3.2.7.1 New obligations concerning non-State actors 167
3.2.7.2 New obligations concerning legislation 167
3.2.7.3 New obligations in preventing trade in nuclear weapons and material 169
3.2.7.4 Shifting to supply-side non-proliferation measures through imposition 171
3.3 Conclusion for this part 173

PART III **Legal resolution and nuclear non-proliferation disputes** 179

Introduction 181

4 The history of legal resolution of similarly sensitive disputes as nuclear non-proliferation disputes 197
4.1 Early debates between the US and the USSR over the role of legal resolution 200
4.2 Military-related arbitration from ancient times 203
4.3 Military-related disputes before the PCIJ and the ICJ 212

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04129-5 - Legal Resolution of Nuclear Non-Proliferation Disputes
James D. Fry
Table of Contents
More information

4.3.1 Nuclear-weapon-related disputes 216
4.3.2 ICJ cases involving the use of force 225
4.3.3 ICJ cases involving international crimes by military forces 232
4.4 Conclusion for this chapter 233

5 Jurisdiction over nuclear non-proliferation disputes 236
5.1 Standing before the ICJ and international arbitral tribunals 237
5.2 Specific jurisdictional consent to legal resolution 251
5.2.1 Direct consent to legal resolution through compromissory clauses 254
5.2.2 Compromissory clauses 255
5.2.3 Compromissory clauses in nuclear non-proliferation agreements 259
5.2.3.1 IAEA Statute and dispute settlement 264
5.2.3.2 IAEA safeguards agreements and dispute settlement 268
5.2.3.2.1 Standard language 270
5.2.3.2.2 Variations on the standard language 281
5.2.3.2.3 Genuine arbitration clauses 285
5.2.3.3 Convention on the Physical Protection of Nuclear Material 286
5.3 Advantages and disadvantages of legal resolution 294
5.3.1 Application of law 299
5.3.1.1 Impartiality of legal resolution 301
5.3.1.2 Greater control through procedural safeguards 312
5.3.1.3 Predictability through the rule of law 319
5.3.1.3.1 Defining "consistency" 320
5.3.1.3.2 Goals of consistency 323
5.3.1.3.2.1 Predictability 324
5.3.1.3.2.2 Fairness 326
5.3.1.3.2.3 Confidence in legal resolution 328
5.3.1.4 Potential conflicts of interest 330
5.3.2 The litigation process 333
5.3.2.1 Showing good faith through legal resolution 333
5.3.2.2 Expediency through legal resolution 336
5.3.2.3 Revealing the heart of the dispute 340
5.3.2.4 Improper shifting of burdens 340
5.3.3 Gaps in nuclear non-proliferation agreements 342
5.4 Conclusion for this chapter 355

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04129-5 - Legal Resolution of Nuclear Non-Proliferation Disputes
James D. Fry
Table of Contents
More information

6 Justiciability of nuclear non-proliferation disputes 357
6.1 Basics of justiciability 360
6.1.1 How justiciability relates to jurisdiction 364
6.1.2 How justiciability differs from admissibility 365
6.1.3 Justiciability and optional clause declarations 367
6.2 History of justiciability 371
6.2.1 Justiciability before 1945 371
6.2.2 Justiciability after 1945 381
6.3 Treaty interpretation as a legal dispute 389
6.4 Treaty interpretation of nuclear non-proliferation agreements 393
6.5 Handling mixed disputes 401
6.5.1 Substantive approach to justiciability 408
6.5.2 Process approach to justiciability 409
6.5.3 Reasons to favor the process approach 415
6.6 Fragmentation of disputes as an alternative 420
6.6.1 Examples of fragmentation 426
6.6.2 Criticism of fragmentation 428
6.7 Conclusion for this chapter 430

PART IV **Conclusion** 433

7 Conclusion 435

Bibliography 439
I Books and treatises 439
II Articles and book chapters 449
Index 485

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org