#### Narrative Development in Young Children

As children begin to use language in early childhood, they produce increasingly large units of coherent speech, including narrative descriptions of events. This book examines the process of narrative development in young children, focusing on the development of "cohesion" – the use of *speech and gesture* to create coherent perspectives on events. Surveying early narrative development in which gesture plays an integral part, the book explores the development of cohesive, clause-linking devices during the period from age two to three. Illustrated with longitudinal case studies, the book examines the crib-talk of two-year-old Emily and compares it to the discourse patterns of storybooks and nursery rhymes, and to her father's pre-bedtime routines. In a second case study, the authors trace the changing relationships between speech and gesture in the spontaneous narratives of two-year-old Ella. This book will be invaluable to students and researchers in language acquisition, developmental psychology, and gesture studies.

ELENA T. LEVY is an Associate Professor in the Department of Psychology at the University of Connecticut. Her publications on narrative discourse include studies of typically developing children and adults, as well as individuals with autistic spectrum disorders. She is co-editor, with Susan D. Duncan and Justine Cassell, of *Gesture and the Dynamic Dimension of Language* (2007).

DAVID MCNEILL is Professor Emeritus in the Departments of Psychology and Linguistics at the University of Chicago. His publications include a "trilogy" of gesture books, *Hand and Mind* (1992), *Gesture and Thought* (2005), and *How Language Began: Gesture and Speech in Human Evolution* (2012), plus an edited volume, *Language and Gesture* (2000).

# Narrative Development in Young Children

Gesture, Imagery, and Cohesion

Elena T. Levy University of Connecticut David McNeill University of Chicago



#### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107041110

© Elena T. Levy and David McNeill 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data Levy, Elena Terry, 1952– Narrative development in young children : gesture, imagery, and cohesion / Elena T. Levy, David McNeill. pages cm ISBN 978-1-107-04111-0 (Hardback) 1. Communicative competence in children. 2. Children–Language. 3. Language acquisition. 4. Gesture. I. McNeill, David, 1933– II. Title.

P118.4.L48 2015

401'.93-dc23 2014045660

ISBN 978-1-107-04111-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

> For my parents, Harry Levy and Hilda Jonas Levy, for passing on to me their love of language – ETL

David McNeill dedicates the book to Nobuko, his lucky charm

# Contents

		<i>page</i> viii	
	List of tables		
	Preface		
Acknowledgments			
1	Toward an embodied account of narrative development	1	
Pa	rt I Narratives as symbol formation	17	
2	Narratives, cohesion, and symbol formation	19	
3	Social and natural sources of change	37	
Pa	rt II Social sources of cohesion	65	
4	Social sources of cohesion - cohesive sources of coherence	67	
5	How early cohesion is grounded in enactment	88	
Pa	rt III Gestures, cohesion, and narrative development	107	
6	Dual semiosis and the roots of cohesion	109	
7	Gestural sources of early cohesion - insights from Ella's stories	132	
8	Gestures, cohesion, and symbol formation	169	
9	Implications for children with autism	187	
10	The material carrier	214	
Appendix 1 Method of transcription of Ella's speech and gestures Appendix 2 Ella and father's description of <i>Rosie and Jim</i> episodes <i>References</i> <i>Index</i>		226 235	
		vii	

## Figures

3.1	Gesture of "rising hollowness" with "he goe[ss up through	
	the pipe] this time" pa	ge 53
6.1	Catchments in a bowling ball episode description	111
6.2	"Drops"	115
6.3	Agency	115
6.4	Manner decomposition (from McNeill, 2005)	121
6.5	English-speaking two-and-a-half-year-old. Manner and path fused	122
7.1	Ella at age 1;10: "broccoli broccoli"	136
7.2	Ella at age 1;10: "monkey monkey"	137
7.3	Ella at age 1;10: "she clip clop"	137
7.4	Ella at age 1;10: pushing pantomime	139
7.5	Ella at age 2;0: "hhh fall down on bike"	141
7.6	Ella at age 2;4: "good mummy had big shoes on"	148
7.7	Ella at age 2;4: "hh huge"	149
7.8	Ella at age 2;4: "in my ear"	151
7.9	Ella at age 2;4: "an choo choo"	152
7.10	Ella at age 2;4: "an an an in my ear"	152
7.11	Ella at age 2;4: "and Diesel pushed n side, Eva"	153
7.12	Ella at age 2;4: "wind pushed"	156
7.13	Ella's gestural catchment at age 2;7	161
7.14	Ella at age 2;9: "he pushed me over"	165
8.1	Ella's pantomime illustrating single semiosis	172
9.1	Path of development of target utterance: summary of milestones	195

# Tables

Objects-of-cognition: diagram of developmental		
transformations (from Werner and Kaplan, 1963)	page 5	
Continuum of accessibility of referents relative to degree of		
materialization (adapted from Givón, 1985)	22	
Proposed trajectory of narrative change: development of thematic	atic	
characters across ontogenetic time	31	
A four-year-old's repeated retellings of The Snowman	39	
A five-year-old's repeated retellings of The Snowman	40	
A second four-year-old's repeated retellings of The Snowman	43	
An eight-year-old's repeated retellings of The Snowman	44	
A ten-year-old's repeated retellings of The Snowman	46	
Emily's successive retellings of a series of events at 1;11.8	50	
Emily's repeated retelling at 2;8	51	
Semiotic contrasts within GPs	54	
A six-year-old's repeated retelling of description of "thermometer	r"	
portion of Reksio cartoon: speech alone	57	
Compression in speech and gesture of six-year-old's utterances	60	
Relationship between speech and gesture across a six-year-old's		
repeated retellings of "thermometer" portion of Reksio cartoon	61	
A six-year-old's retellings of "fan" portion of Reksio cartoon	62	
A three-year-old analyzes the wanna construction		
(from Iwamura, 1980)	72	
History of a two-year-old's construction, "are you watching me		
make this castle pretty for Linda" (from Moerk and Moerk, 1979	) 73	
Analysis of father's discourse pattern when Emily is 2;2.4	75	
Analysis of Emily's discourse pattern at 2;0.23	78	
Highlights of speech and enactment in days preceding early		
cohesive use of feminine pronoun in passage (7)	99	
Highlights of speech and enactment in days preceding early		
cohesive use of masculine pronoun in passage (8)	99	
Gesture Continuum	116	
	transformations (from Werner and Kaplan, 1963) Continuum of accessibility of referents relative to degree of materialization (adapted from Givón, 1985) Proposed trajectory of narrative change: development of thematic characters across ontogenetic time A four-year-old's repeated retellings of <i>The Snowman</i> A five-year-old's repeated retellings of <i>The Snowman</i> A second four-year-old's repeated retellings of <i>The Snowman</i> A neight-year-old's repeated retellings of <i>The Snowman</i> A ten-year-old's repeated retellings of <i>The Snowman</i> A ten-year-old's repeated retellings of <i>The Snowman</i> Emily's successive retellings of a series of events at 1;11.8 Emily's repeated retelling of description of "thermomete portion contrasts within GPs A six-year-old's repeated retelling of description of "thermomete portion of <i>Reksio</i> cartoon: speech alone Compression in speech and gesture of six-year-old's utterances Relationship between speech and gesture across a six-year-old's repeated retellings of "fan" portion of <i>Reksio</i> cartoon A six-year-old's retellings of "fan" portion of <i>Reksio</i> cartoon A three-year-old analyzes the <i>wanna</i> construction (from Iwamura, 1980) History of a two-year-old's construction, "are you watching me make this castle pretty for Linda" (from Moerk and Moerk, 1979 Analysis of father's discourse pattern when Emily is 2;2.4 Analysis of Emily's discourse pattern at 2;0.23 Highlights of speech and enactment in days preceding early cohesive use of feminine pronoun in passage (7) Highlights of speech and enactment in days preceding early cohesive use of masculine pronoun in passage (8)	

ix

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04111-0 - Narrative Development in Young Children: Gesture, Imagery, and Cohesion
Elena T. Levy and David McNeill
Frontmatter
More information

x List of tables

7.1	Evolution of bimodal utterances with pointing, emblems,	
	pantomime, and large iconic gestures: period 1 and transition	143
7.2	Ella's successive retellings at 2;4	150
7.3	Construction of utterance, "wind pushed my own swingy chair	
	right over," from a combination of gesture and speech	157
7.4	Evolution of bimodal utterances with iconic gestures: transition	
	and period 3	166
8.1	Proposed evolution of cross-utterance gestural parataxis relative	
	to the emergence of a dual semiotic	170
9.1	Partial transcript of Session 1A	191
9.2	Partial transcript of Session 3	193
9.3	Comparison of linguistic segments of target utterance to event	
	sequences in film	195
9.4	Transcript of interaction in Session 1E	199
9.5	History of target utterance in Session 2	202

### Preface

This book is a joint effort. It grew entirely from our collaboration. And it is not our first collaboration by any means. Indeed, the first publication on the gesture topic for either of us was a joint effort (McNeill and Levy, 1982). We joined forces on other papers as well, two of which had cohesion, a theme of this book, as the topic (Levy and McNeill, 1992; McNeill and Levy, 1993). The book is a bookend of what has been, for both of us, a wonderful career of studying a field new to science, the gesture-speech unity of the human condition, and now how it develops in young children. We will not summarize our observations and arguments in this Preface - they will appear soon enough; but we realize that we are advancing views that, apart from our guides, Werner and Kaplan (1963), have been largely overlooked. Efforts of this kind are a matter of going out on a limb. The view, however, is splendid, there is plenty of room, and we invite the reader to climb out with us. Our collaboration began when one of us (ETL) saw that a chapter in a book the other had written (McNeill, 2012) could be enlarged in two important directions. The first was to enrich the growth point theory of that book, joining it to the important, but (for historical reasons) often neglected work of Werner and Kaplan. We adopt their concept of symbol formation as an overarching concept of language development and add the topic of McNeill's chapter, the child's development of *dual semiosis*. The second direction was the equally rich idea that the development of language is, in many respects, a story of how thought grows in coherence, the impact of this genesis on language, then the impact of language back on thought. These ideas, plus the theme of gesturespeech unity from the 2012 book, form what we see now as a triangle of concepts, and this triangle we have formed here.

> ETL AND DMCN June 16, 2014

## Acknowledgments

We are very grateful to Michael Forrester for his interest in this approach, and especially for his comments on an earlier version of Chapter 7; all of his insights have been incorporated into the chapter. Brady Wagoner also provided comments on an earlier version of Chapter 7. We would also like to thank Armenta Gjini and Rawan Shilleh, both undergraduate students at the University of Connecticut, for their work on the Ella transcripts.

Katherine Nelson was a great influence on early sections of the book. Her experiential approach, which foreshadowed much of the current focus on the sociocultural bases of development of language and thought, underlies much of Chapter 4. We are indebted to her for her ground-breaking work.

Elena Levy would like to thank Daniel, Rick, and Sarah Leonard for their help and support, and David Levy and Lester Levy for their help and encouragement. With deep gratitude to Fannie Mulford, for being a tremendous teacher in the art of listening to children, even before they can speak.

David McNeill takes this opportunity to thank four beyond thanking who have had a great influence on him. To absorb their ideas while dodging their conflicts has long been a guide: Peirce, Saussure, Vygotsky, and Merleau-Ponty.