

Ireland's Empire

How did the Irish stay Irish? Why are Irish and Catholic still so often synonymous in the English-speaking world? *Ireland's Empire* is the first book to examine the complex relationship between Irish migrants and Roman Catholicism in the nineteenth century on a truly global basis. Drawing on more than 100 archives on five continents, Colin Barr traces the spread of Irish Roman Catholicism across the English-speaking world and explains how the Catholic Church became the vehicle for Irish diasporic identity in the United States, Australia, Canada, South Africa, New Zealand, Newfoundland, and India between 1829 and 1914. The world these Irish Catholic bishops, priests, nuns, and laity created endured long into the twentieth century, and its legacy is still present today.

Colin Barr is Senior Lecturer in history in the School of Divinity, History and Philosophy at the University of Aberdeen. He is the author of several books on Irish history, including *Paul Cullen, John Henry Newman, and the Catholic University of Ireland, 1845–1865* (2003) and *The European Culture Wars in Ireland: The Callan Schools Affair 1868–1881* (2010), and is co-editor of *Nation/Nazione: Irish Nationalism and the Italian Risorgimento* (2014), with Michele Finelli and Anne O'Connor, and *Religion and Greater Ireland: Christianity and Irish Global Networks, 1750–1950* (2015), with Hilary M. Carey.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04092-2 — Ireland's Empire
Colin Barr
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Ireland's Empire

*The Roman Catholic Church in the English-
Speaking World, 1829–1914*

Colin Barr

University of Aberdeen



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04092-2 — Ireland's Empire
Colin Barr
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107040922

DOI: 10.1017/9781139644327

© Colin Barr 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

Printed and bound in Great Britain by Clays Ltd, Elcograf S.p.A.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-107-04092-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For the archivists

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-04092-2 — Ireland's Empire
Colin Barr
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page viii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiv
Introduction	1
1 The United States	22
2 Newfoundland	77
3 India	113
4 South Africa	151
The Irish Mission	160
The Hiberno-Roman Church	173
5 Canada	204
The Triple Minority: Atlantic Canada	206
The Ontario Irish	268
6 Australia	281
From Beginnings to Benedictines, 1800–1867	288
Building the Irish Church, 1867–1883	349
The Irish Ascendancy, 1884–1914	376
7 New Zealand	403
From French to Irish, 1838–1874	405
Stalemate, 1874–1914	435
Conclusion	467
<i>Bibliography</i>	483
<i>Index</i>	516

Acknowledgements

This book began with a trip to Australia in 2004. I was coming to the end of four happy years in the Department of History at what was then the National University of Ireland, Maynooth, where I had been first a Government of Ireland Research Fellow in the Humanities and Social Sciences and then a contract lecturer. For much of that time, I had been working on a biography of Cardinal Paul Cullen of Dublin, a project that had grown out of my doctoral thesis and subsequent book on the origins, development, and ultimate failure of John Henry Newman's Catholic University of Ireland. Somewhere I had seen a reference to a diary kept by Cullen's nephew which had apparently survived in Sydney, so I made the long trip. Once there, I fell in love with Australia and resolved to learn more about its history. This led to compulsive prowling in what were then the city's many second-hand bookshops, and it was in one of these that I found John Molony's *The Roman Mould of the Australian Catholic Church*, published in 1969 by Melbourne University Press. I had never heard of it, and when I got home realized that few other people in the northern hemisphere had either. I was astonished to discover that Cullen, whose career I thought I knew well, had been central to the ecclesiastical and in some ways the secular history of Australia. I also soon learned that, while aspects of Molony's argument were controversial among Australian historians, there was no dispute at all about Cullen's importance. My first reaction was mortification. How did I not know this? Cullen is probably the best-documented Irishman of the nineteenth century, and I was familiar with the vast collections of his papers in Dublin and Rome. I knew that they were filled with letters from bishops, priests, nuns, and laypeople from all over the world, but I had not thought about why that might be or what it might mean. Molony made me wonder if Cullen might have been similarly influential elsewhere. To find out, I began an archival odyssey that has now lasted well over a decade and taken me to every corner of the globe.

This book is the result of that research. It draws on material found in 104 archives in 12 countries on 5 continents, the vast majority of which

I have visited personally. I have thus contracted an unusually large number of debts to the archivists, librarians, and diocesan and other administrators who welcomed me with unfailing kindness, professionalism, and curiosity. I am grateful to them all without exception, including those whose names I never knew or can no longer recall. It is, however, a pleasure to be able to record my gratitude to Carol Anderson of the Bathurst Repository of the Institute of Sisters of Mercy of Australia and Papua New Guinea Archives; Donna Bailey, the archivist of the Diocese of Sandhurst in Bendigo, Victoria; Jennifer Ballantine Perera, the director of Gibraltar's magnificent Garrison Library; Wanita Bates, the archivist for the Presentation Sisters of St John's, Newfoundland; Aidan Bellenger, formerly the abbot of Downside Abbey in Somerset; Alberto Belletti, the archivist of the North American College in Rome; David Bracken, the archivist of the Diocese of Limerick; Damien Burke, the archivist of the Irish Jesuits; Fr Christopher Francis Clarke, who kindly permitted me to use the archives of the Discalced Carmelites in Dublin; Fr Kevin Clark, the (now retired) archivist of the Diocese of Christchurch, who rescued the archives after the devastating 2011 earthquake and then allowed me to use them in their temporary store shortly afterwards; the late Bishop Michael Coleman of Port Elizabeth, South Africa, who shared both his knowledge and his archive; Alan Delozier, at Seton Hall University in New Jersey; Gionni Di Gravio, the archivist of the University of Newcastle, Australia; Chris Doan, the archivist of the Archdiocese of San Francisco; the late and much lamented Larry Dohey, formerly the archivist of the Archdiocese of St John's, Newfoundland; Brian Fahey of the Diocese of Charleston, South Carolina; Kate Feighery, who has helped to return the archives of the Archdiocese of New York to its proper role in the story of the American Catholicism; Michael Foight, the Special Collections and Digital Library Coordinator at the Falvey Memorial Library, Villanova University; Richard Garcia of the Cathedral Archives, Gibraltar; Pauline Garland and her successors and colleagues at the archives of the Archdiocese of Sydney; the welcoming and hospitable Helena Glanville, who kindly hosted me in Port Elizabeth and guided me through the nearly untouched (by historians) diocesan archives; the similarly welcoming Jackie Grant, now retired from the archives of the Diocese of Bathurst, Australia; Sr Elizabeth Hellwig OP of the Dominican Archives in Sydney; Naomi Johnson of the archives of the Archdiocese of Birmingham; Fr Thomas Kilbride, the rector of the Royal Scots College in Salamanca; Marc Lerman, the former archivist of the Archdiocese of Toronto; Jan Linley, who looks after the archives of the Sisters of St Joseph of Peace in New Jersey; Ruth Long and her colleagues at the Carmelite Centre, Gort Muire; Donna Maguire of the

x Acknowledgements

Scottish Catholic Archives in Edinburgh; James McGuire, now retired from his role as chairman of the Irish Manuscripts Commission, who facilitated my access to the archives of the Archdiocese of Cashel; Áine McHugh, the archivist of the Loreto Sisters in Dublin; Mary McHugh, the archivist of the Archdiocese of Glasgow; Perry McIntyre, who in addition to her career as a scholar of Irish migration is also the archivist of St John's College in the University of Sydney; Fr Tom Murray of the Diocese of Ardagh and Clonmacnois; the estimable Rachel Naughton of the Melbourne Diocesan Historical Commission, upon whose labours most work on Catholic Victoria now rests; Odhran O'Brien of the Archdiocese of Perth; Fr Art O'Shea, the historian and archivist of the Diocese of Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island; Olivia Parkinson, the archivist at the Southern Administrative Centre of the Institute of Sisters of Mercy of Australia and Papua New Guinea in Alphington, Victoria; Anthony Pitaluga, the director of the Gibraltar National Archives; Tricia Pyne and Alison Foley at the Associated Archives, St Mary's Seminary and University, Baltimore; Richard Reid, formerly of the National Museum of Australia and now in retirement an independent researcher; Sr Assumpta Saunders RSM of Callan, Co. Kilkenny; Ken Scadden and the staff of the Marist Archives in Wellington, New Zealand; Rena Schergen, the archivist of the Archdiocese of St Louis; Robin Scott of the Archive Centre, Loreto College Ballarat; Fr Gerard Sharkey, the former vice rector of the Scots' College in Rome; Michael Taffe, the archivist of the Diocese of Ballarat; Karen White, formerly the archivist of the Archdiocese of Halifax; Kenneth White of the Archives and Records Center, Catholic Diocese of Pittsburgh; Maurice Whitehead of the Venerable English College in Rome; and, finally, Fr John Wisdom of the Falkland Islands, who kindly scanned important items from the archives of St Mary's parish in Port Stanley.

It is invidious to draw distinctions, but there are two archivists that I must nevertheless single out. The first is Julie Craig, now retired from the diocese of Maitland-Newcastle. Over several visits Julie gave me lifts, hosted me in her home, and granted me the run of her magnificent archive, probably the best-preserved Catholic archive in Australia. I could not have had a more productive and pleasant experience. Then there is Noelle Dowling, the archivist of the Archdiocese of Dublin. I never laugh so hard nor learn so much as when I go to see Noelle, and she oversees her great archive with professionalism, enthusiasm, and kindness. Both she and it are treasures. Finally, I am grateful to the staff at the many other archives and libraries that I have visited around the

world, from the British Library to the Tasmanian Archive Service. This book is dedicated to you and to all the archivists and librarians who made it possible.

I have many other debts. In New Zealand, I was twice welcomed by Peter and Helen Field into their home in Christchurch, while Rory Sweetman both hosted me in Dunedin and gave me books from his own vast library. Clyde and Connie Lee always had a bed for me in Sydney, as did Brian and Ruth Barr in Ottawa, Matt O'Brien and Gina Casalegno in Pittsburgh, Peter Ludlow and his family in Antigonish, and Caroline McGregor in Boston and New Jersey. In Dublin, I could always count on Isabella and Adam Hanna and Tom and Rebecca Bartlett for company and accommodation. In Rome, Ciarán O'Carroll has been for many years a welcoming host at the Irish College, as were his predecessors Liam Bergin and John Fleming. Matteo Binasco kindly checked references for me at the Propaganda Fide and generally guided me around the Roman archives, while Luca Codignola and Matteo Sanfilippo provided sage advice and guidance. Kathleen Sprows Cummings of the University of Notre Dame has proved herself many times over a gracious host in both South Bend and Rome, and the emphasis on women religious in this book owes much to her example.

I owe an especially great debt to Hilary M. Carey. Hilary and I collaborated on the edited volume *Religion and Greater Ireland: Christianity and Irish Global Networks, 1750–1950*, which was published in 2015, and she arranged my visiting fellowship at the Humanities Research Institute at the University of Newcastle, Australia. Many of the themes of *Ireland's Empire* were first discussed with Hilary and, in particular, the concept of a spiritual Greater Ireland. When I reread our Introduction and Conclusion to *Religion and Greater Ireland*, I can no longer tell which words were hers and which were mine, and I hope she will excuse seeing some of her ideas here. She also read each chapter of this book, and her honesty and support have made it very much better. I am also grateful to the wider Carey family, who have over the years welcomed me into their homes in Newcastle, Sydney, and Bristol. It is a profound regret to me that I will not be able to give Bernard Carey a copy of this book. He is sorely missed.

Vincent Comerford in Ireland and Terrence Murphy in Nova Scotia also read each chapter as it was produced, often with very long gaps between, and they made the book much stronger with their suggestions, criticisms, and encouragement. I am also grateful to Vincent for our many tours around Ireland. John McGreevy graciously read the chapter on the United States, as did Gerard Horn the one on New Zealand. Carolyn Lambert, Patrick Mannion, and John FitzGerald helped me with the

xii Acknowledgements

complexities of Newfoundland, while Peter Ludlow assisted with Canada as a whole. Leea Stroia lent her red pen and taught me about prepositions. Elizabeth Sullivan-Burton and Mary Carmichael graciously shared the research they conducted as undergraduates. I am grateful to them all, but, of course, the mistakes that remain are entirely my own.

This book would not have been possible without significant financial support. The Irish Research Council for the Humanities and Social Sciences (now the Irish Research Council) funded travel to South Africa, Australia, and New Zealand as part of the ‘Correspondence of Paul Cullen’ project, and I am grateful to the principal investigator Dáire Keogh and my fellow co-investigator Anne O’Connor for their help in launching this project. I am also grateful to Andrew Shields for his heroic work in deciphering and transcribing Cullen’s outgoing letters. The first fruits of the project will soon appear when Anne’s magisterial edition of Cullen’s Italian letters is published by the Irish Manuscripts Commission, and I am grateful to her for sharing some of her work in advance of publication. The Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada supported the project ‘Irish-Catholic Discourse and Social Mobility in Nineteenth-Century Halifax: The Exemplary Case of Holy Cross Cemetery’, which funded significant research travel and the services of a postdoctoral researcher, Ben Thomas. I am grateful to the principal investigator Mark McGowan for inviting me to join the project. I have also enjoyed excellent institutional support, first at Maynooth, then in Florida, and, finally, in Aberdeen. I am especially grateful to Michael Dauphinais, formerly Dean of Faculty at Ave Maria University, and John Morrison, formerly Head of the School of Divinity, History and Philosophy at the University of Aberdeen, for their financial, professional, and personal encouragement. My colleagues in all three places have provided friendship, support, and constructive criticism, and I would like to thank Filipe Ribeiro de Meneses, Terrence Dooley, Georgina Laragy, Ian Speller, Paul Baxa, Jeff Hass, Michael Sugrue, Michael Brown, Alex Crawford, Andrew Dilley, Isabella Jackson, Rose Luminiello, Andrew Mackillop, Heidi Mehrkens, and Tom Weber. Thomas Bartlett in particular has been an invaluable friend and supporter, both before our time together in Aberdeen and since. I have also benefited greatly from conversations with friends and colleagues around the world, including Jill Bender, Ciara Breathnach, Seán Brosnahan, Michael De Nie, Doug Kanter, Joe Lee, Mark McGowan, Matt O’Brien, Oliver Rafferty, John Stenhouse, Paul Townend, Angela McCarthy, Tim McMahon, and James H. Murphy. My former doctoral supervisor, Eugenio Biagini, has remained a constant source of encouragement and support. He also arranged my tenure as a visiting fellow of

Sidney Sussex College, Cambridge, and I am most grateful to the master and fellows for welcoming me to the College in 2012. I am similarly grateful to the Humanities Research Institute at the University of Newcastle, Australia, where I was a visiting fellow in 2013.

A project of this length has inevitably produced various by-products along the way, and, consequently, parts of this book have appeared in preliminary or abbreviated form elsewhere. A truncated version of Chapter 4 appeared in *Religion and Greater Ireland: Christianity and Irish Global Networks, 1750–1950*, for example, while sections of Chapter 1 appeared in modified form in *The Irish College, Rome, and Its Worlds*, edited by Dáire Keogh and Albert McDonnell. Elements of the discussion of St Brigid's Missionary College in Chapter 6 of this book first appeared in the essay I co-wrote with Rose Luminiello for *Ireland in an Imperial World: Citizenship, Opportunism, and Subversion*, edited by Timothy G. McMahon, Michael De Nie, and Paul Townend, and I am grateful to Rose not only for collaborating on this project but for much else besides. I am also grateful to the several editors and publishers for their support, patience, and forbearance. I must also record my gratitude to Michael Watson and Liz Friend-Smith of Cambridge University Press. I will always be grateful to Michael for commissioning this book and then waiting patiently as I missed deadline after deadline. Liz in turn then inherited with good humour and greater patience a project that she must have doubted would ever see completion. To them and the rest of the staff at the Cambridge University Press I owe an enormous debt. I am also grateful to Linsey Hague, who at short notice made effective sense of a text that was put together over many years and in many formats, and in doing so saved me from many errors.

It only remains to thank my family, without whose love and support none of this would have been possible or worthwhile.

Abbreviations

AAB	Archives of the Archdiocese of Boston
AACT	Archives of the Archdiocese of Cape Town
AAH	Archives of the Archdiocese of Halifax
AANY	Archives of the Archdiocese of New York
AAQ	Archives de l'Archevêché de Québec
AAS	Archives of the Archdiocese of Sydney
AASF	Archives of the Archdiocese of San Francisco
AASMSU	Associated Archives, St Mary's Seminary and University, Baltimore
ABSI	Archivum Britannicum Societatis Iesu, London
AC	<i>Letters on the Go: The Correspondence of Suzanne Aubert</i>
ACAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Adelaide
ACDA	Archives of the Catholic Diocese of Auckland
ACGA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Canberra-Goulburn
ACRSM	Archives of the Callan Sisters of Mercy, Co. Kilkenny
ACUA	The American Catholic Research Center and University Archives, The Catholic University of America
ADA	Antigonish Diocesan Archives, Nova Scotia
A ^A DB	<i>Australian Dictionary of Biography</i>
ADC	Archives of the Diocese of Charlottetown
ADD	Archives of the Diocese of Dunedin
ADDB	Archives Diocésaines de Bathurst, New Brunswick
AHCA	All Hallows College Archive
ANPF	<i>Annals of the Propagation of the Faith</i>
APF	Archivio Storico di Propaganda Fide
ARCSJ	Archives of the Archdiocese of St John's, Newfoundland
ARDA	Ardagh & Clonmacnois Diocesan Archives
ARSMP	Sisters of Mercy Archive, Parramatta, New South Wales
ASIC	Archivio Storico dell'Istituto della Carità
ASMA	Archives of the Sisters of Mercy, Auckland
ASSP	Archivio Storico di San Paolo fuori le Mura (St Paul's Outside the Walls)

List of Abbreviations

xv

ASV	Archivio Segreto Vaticano
AVCAU	Venerable English College, Rome
BAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Birmingham
BDA	Bathurst Diocesan Archives, New South Wales
BDAV	Ballarat Diocesan Archives, Victoria
CD	<i>The Cape Diary of Bishop Griffith, 1837–1839</i>
CDA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Cashel, Ireland
CHDA	Christchurch Diocesan Archives, New Zealand
CLD	Irish Province of the Order of Carmelites, Carmelite Library, Gort Muire, Dublin
CLHR	Cory Library for Historical Research, Grahamstown
CU	Rare Books and Manuscript Library, Columbia University, New York
CUL	Cambridge University Library
DAA	Downside Abbey Archives
DACI	Dominican Archives, Cabra, Ireland
DADL	Dominican Archives Dún Laoghaire, Ireland
DAS	Dominican Archives Strathfield, New South Wales
DCB	<i>Dictionary of Canadian Biography</i>
DDA	Dublin Diocesan Archives
DNZB	<i>Dictionary of New Zealand Biography</i>
Ff	<i>Freeman's Journal</i> (Sydney)
FLK	Franciscan Archives, Dún Mhuire, Killiney, Co. Dublin
HAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Hobart
IJA	Irish Jesuit Archives, Dublin
IOR	India Office Records, British Library, London
KD	<i>Diary and Visitation Record of the Rt. Rev. Francis Patrick Kenrick</i>
KFC	<i>The Kenrick-Frenaye Correspondence</i>
LAB	Loreto Archives, Ballarat
LAC	Library and Archives Canada, Ottawa
LAD	Loreto Archives, Dublin
LDA	Limerick Diocesan Archives
MAW	Marist Archives, Wellington
MCA	Maynooth College Archive
MD	Diary of Patrick Francis Moran
MDHC	Melbourne Diocesan Historical Commission
MNDA	Maitland-Newcastle Diocesan Archives
MSCUN	Manuscripts and Special Collections, University of Nottingham
MUL	Melbourne University Library

xvi List of Abbreviations

MUN	Archives and Special Collections, Queen Elizabeth II Library, Memorial University of Newfoundland
NLNZ	National Library of New Zealand, Alexander Turnbull Library
NZT	<i>New Zealand Tablet</i>
OCDA	Archives of the Discalced Carmelites, Clarendon Street, Dublin
PAHRC	Philadelphia Archdiocesan Historical Research Center
PANS	Nova Scotia Archives, Halifax
PCGA	Presentation Convent, Galway, Archives
PDA	Pittsburgh Diocesan Archives
PEDA	Port Elizabeth Diocesan Archives, Eastern Cape
PICRA	Pontifical Irish College, Rome, Archives
PL	<i>The Letters of John Bede Polding</i>
SAA	Archives of the Archdiocese of Southwark, London
SCA	Scottish Catholic Archives, Historic Collections, University of Aberdeen
SCACH	Scottish Catholic Archives, Columba House, Edinburgh
SCR	Scots College Rome Archives
SJDA	Saint John Diocesan Archives, New Brunswick
SMFI	St Mary's Church Archives, Stanley, Falkland Islands
TAA	Toronto Archdiocesan Archives
TNA	The National Archives, Kew
UNDA	University of Notre Dame Archives
WAA	Wellington Archdiocesan Archives
WDA	Westminster Diocesan Archives, London
WL	<i>The Correspondence of Mother Vincent Whitty, 1839–1892</i>