

Thomas Jefferson's Ethics and the Politics of Human Progress

Could Thomas Jefferson claim any consistency in his advocacy of democracy and the rights of man while remaining one of the largest slaveholders in Virginia? This extensive study of Jefferson's intellectual outlook suggests that, once we fully acknowledge the premises of his ethical thought and his now outdated scientific views, he could. Jefferson famously thought the human mind to be "susceptible of much improvement ... most of all, in matters of government and religion." Ari Helo's thorough analysis of Jefferson's understanding of Christian morality, atheism, contemporary theories of moral sentiments, ancient virtue ethics, natural rights, and the principles of justice and benevolence suggests that Jefferson refused to be a philosopher, and did so for moral reasons. This book finds Jefferson profoundly political in his understanding of individual moral responsibility and human progress.

Ari Helo is currently a University Lecturer in History of Science and Ideas at the University of Oulu. He earned his PhD at the University of Tampere in 1999 with a doctoral dissertation examining Thomas Jefferson's political thought. He has taught intellectual history, American studies, and cultural studies at numerous universities since 1996, and he has worked as a visiting researcher at the University of Virginia in Charlottesville. Helo's articles on American intellectual history have been published in Britain, Estonia, Finland, Hungary, Netherlands, and the United States, among them the widely noticed "Jefferson, Morality, and the Problem of Slavery," with Peter Onuf, in *The William and Mary Quarterly* (2003) and a survey article on Jefferson's political thought in *The Cambridge Companion to Thomas Jefferson* (2009).





CAMBRIDGE STUDIES ON THE AMERICAN SOUTH

Series Editors

Mark M. Smith, University of South Carolina, Columbia
David Moltke-Hansen, Center for the Study of the American South, University of
North Carolina at Chapel Hill

Interdisciplinary in its scope and intent, this series builds on and extends Cambridge University Press's long-standing commitment to studies on the American South. The series not only offers the best new work on the South's distinctive institutional, social, economic, and cultural history, but also features works in national, comparative, and transnational perspectives.

Titles in the Series

Robert E. Bonner, Mastering America: Southern Slaveholders and the Crisis of American Nationhood

Ras Michael Brown, African-Atlantic Cultures and the South Carolina Lowcountry Christopher Michael Curtis, Jefferson's Freeholders and the Politics of Ownership in the Old Dominion

Ari Helo, Thomas Jefferson's Ethics and the Politics of Human Progress: The Morality of a Slaveholder

Kathleen Hilliard, Masters, Slaves, and Exchange: Power's Purchase in the Old South

Scott P. Marler, The Merchants' Capital: New Orleans and the Political Economy of the Nineteenth-Century South

Peter McCandless, Slavery, Disease, and Suffering in the Southern Lowcountry Johanna Nicol Shields, Freedom in a Slave Society: Stories from the Antebellum South

Brian Steele, Thomas Jefferson and American Nationhood

Jonathan Daniel Wells, Women Writers and Journalists in the Nineteenth-Century South





Thomas Jefferson's Ethics and the Politics of Human Progress

The Morality of a Slaveholder

ARI HELO





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107040786

© Ari Helo 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data Helo, Ari.

Thomas Jefferson's Ethics and the Politics of Human Progress: the Morality of a Slaveholder / Ari Helo, University of Oulu, Finland. pages cm. – (Cambridge Studies on the American South)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04078-6 (hardback)

1. Jefferson, Thomas, 1743–1826 – Relations with African Americans.

Jefferson, Thomas, 1743–1826 – Ethics.
 Slavery – Moral and ethical aspects – United States.
 Presidents – United States – Biography.
 Title.

E332.2.H46 2013 973.4'6092-dc23 2013013352

ISBN 978-1-107-04078-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To all those Jefferson scholars whose insights on the topic the author has failed to address



> No man can be sovereign because not one man, but men, inhabit the earth ... Hannah Arendt The Human Condition (1958) 1998, p. 234



Contents

Acknowledgments Abbreviations Used in Notes		<i>page</i> xi xiii
	Jefferson's Image and Intellectual Leanings	I
	Jefferson the Politician	7
	On the Methods and the Thesis	II
1.	History, Progress, and Politics	16
	Something New under the Sun	16
	Progress in History	19
	The New Paradigm of Moral Thought	24
	"True Religion"	29
	Prudence and Progress	32
	Innovations in Political Science	34
	Anti-Utopian Notion of Politics	37
	Jefferson's Antislavery Stance	40
2.	Progress in Natural and Moral Sciences	46
	Scientific "Superstructures" and Deistic Beliefs	46
	The Cosmos and Nature in Constant Change	50
	The Naturalistic View of Man	54
	Improvement of Human Capacities	59
	The Concept of the Moral Sense	62
	The Thomas Law Letter	65
	Manners, Morals, and the Standard of Justice	68
	A Sound System of Morals	72
	Scientifically Consistent Beliefs	75
3.	Progress and the Wise Man's Virtue	78
	Virtues of the Head and Heart	78
	Moral Faith	80



x Contents

The Limits of Love	84
Artificiality in Learning Virtue	87
The Epicurean Virtues	90
Two Kinds of Prudence	93
Utility and Jeffersonian Virtue	98
The Virtue of a Politician	100
Moral Obligation and Self-Realization	107
4. The Perfectible Rights of Men	109
The Self-Evident Right of Resistance	109
Inherent, Morally Inalienable Rights	II2
The State of Nature in Jefferson's Parlance	117
The Consent of the Governed in 1776	121
The Consent of the Governed over Time	I 24
Perfect and Imperfect Rights	128
The Slaveholder's Conscience	133
5. Progressive Politics	139
Benevolence and Distributive Justice	139
Jeffersonian Republicanism	141
Changing Constitutions	149
Progress through Law	152
Democracy through Representation	156
Regulating Property Rights	162
Big Little Government	164
Statesman's Conscience	168
Conclusions	172
The Jeffersonian Ethics of the Living	172
Notes	181
Select Bibliography	261
Index	275



Acknowledgments

To paraphrase Tacitus, it is more becoming for a historian to remember than to bewail the dead. Many colleagues have asked me what I "truly think" of Thomas Jefferson as a person. I therefore wish to begin this book with a brief answer to that.

Regardless of the many years I have spent reading Jefferson's records and trying to grasp his thinking, I have never thought of him as a model to be embraced or rejected, but rather as a stranger from a strange culture. It was in Karen Blixen's *Out of Africa* (1937) – a book about a strange African culture written from an almost equally strange European perspective of "the olden times" – where I found a short passage best exemplifying how I would estimate Jefferson. The passage is about Blixen's last visit to see a dying great Kikuju chief, called Kinanjui:

From the look of him, I thought that he had come back from his journey triumphant, and had got all his cattle back with him, in spite of his Masai sons-in-law.... [H]e had plainly, I thought, done his worldly task, gone home, and taken his wages in every sense. If he were clear enough in his mind to look back at his life, he would find very few instances in which he had not got the better of it. A great vitality and power of enjoyment, a manifold activity were at their end here, where Kinanjui lay still.¹

To turn to the far easier assessments of persons and characters: On getting this book written I owe my biggest debt to a great historian and a great friend, Peter Onuf from the University of Virginia. It was his ceaseless encouragement and belief in the project over many years that made me finish the book. He is also one of those very rare scholars I have met who can discuss any topic in his field of expertise with genuine readiness to reconsider his own position on it.

Another friend and great intellectual, Allan Megill from the University of Virginia, has tirelessly responded to my pleas for critical advice over the years. Anyone familiar with Allan's extensive writings in philosophy and history can guess that critique was sometimes hard, but always helpful.



xii

Acknowledgments

Other important friends, colleagues, and sparring partners in numerous discussions on intellectual history and Jefferson include Jonathan Lagerquist, Petteri Pietikäinen, Markku Roinila, and Mikko Saikku.

An incredibly long time ago, Kari Palonen gave me the idea to study Jefferson and Seppo Tamminen had the questionable honor to review the first paper I ever wrote on Jefferson. I also wish to express my heartfelt thanks to a number of friends and colleagues for their comments and critical remarks about this manuscript at various stages. They include Robert Bannister, Roger Clarke, Cheryl Greenberg, Erkki Helo, Markku Henriksson, Marjatta Hietala, Maijastiina Kahlos, Petter Korkman, Kenny Marotta, Jeffrey Meikle, Sari Nokkanen, Keith Olson, Riikamaria Paakkunainen, Christoph Parry, Gerald Porter, Kari Saastamoinen, Leonard Sadovsky, Eran Shalev, Frank Shuffelton (d. 2010), Katri Sieberg, Juha Sihvola (d. 2012), Mark C. Smith, Mechal Sobel, Keijo Virtanen, and Brian Yost. For their immensely important editorial help in finishing the book I owe special thanks to Niina Koskipää and David Moltke-Hansen.

Numerous universities and academic institutions have provided funding and other help for my research work, including the Academy of Finland, the International Center for Jefferson Studies at Monticello, and the Leo and Regina Wainstein Foundation. I also thank the faculty and staff of the Corcoran History Department at the University of Virginia for providing me an excellent environment for research and study during the three years I lived in Charlottesville.

To my son Elias I owe special thanks for that patient, and occasionally strangely amused, smile on his face during the years he watched his father writing "that book." Finally, I wish to express my immense debt to two, now passed away, friends and intellectuals, who more than anyone else modified my thinking as a historian: Tapani Hietaniemi (d. 2009) and Matti Viikari (d. 1994).



Abbreviations Used in Notes

AJL The Adams-Jefferson Letters: The Complete

Correspondence Between Thomas Jefferson and Abigail and John Adams, Lester J. Cappon (ed.), 2 vols., Chapel

Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1959.

Anthology Moral Philosophy from Montaigne to Kant: An

Anthology, J. B. Schneewind (ed.), 2 vols., Cambridge:

Cambridge University Press, 1990.

Extracts Jefferson's Extracts from the Gospels: The Papers of

Thomas Jefferson, Second Series, Dickinson W. Adams and Ruth W. Lester (eds.), Princeton, NJ: Princeton

University Press, 1983.

Ford The Works of Thomas Jefferson, Paul Leicester Ford

(ed.), 12 vols. (Federal edition), New York, 1904-1905.

Kames, Essays Kames, Henry Home (Lord Kames), Essays on the

Principles of Morality and Natural Religion, Edinburgh: 1751, facsimile reprint: London: University Microfilms

International, Ann Arbor, MI, 1981.

L&B The Writings of Thomas Jefferson, Andrew A. Lipscomb

and Albert Ellery Bergh (eds.), 20 vols., Washington, DC,

1903-1904.

Legal CB The Commonplace Book of Thomas Jefferson: A

Repertory of His Ideas on Government [Jefferson's Legal Commonplace Book], Gilbert Chinard (ed.), Baltimore:

Johns Hopkins University Press, 1926.

Literary CB Jefferson's Literary Commonplace Book: The Papers of

Thomas Jefferson, Second Series [Jefferson's Literary Commonplace Book], Douglas L. Wilson (ed.), Princeton,

NJ: Princeton University Press, 1989.

xiii



xiv Abbreviations Used in Notes

Locke, Essay Locke, John, An Essay Concerning Human

Understanding (1690, 1700), Peter H. Nidditch (ed.), Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1979.

Locke, Second Treatise Locke, John, The Second Treatise of Government,

in John Locke, Two Treatises of Government (1690, 1698), Peter Laslett (ed.), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1960, 1994,

265-428.

Notes Thomas Jefferson, Notes on the State of Virginia

(London, 1787), in *Thomas Jefferson Writings*, Merrill D. Peterson (ed.), New York: Library of

America, 1984.

PAPERS The Papers of Thomas Jefferson, Julian P. Boyd

et al. (eds.), Princeton, NJ: Princeton University

Press, 1950-.

Smith, TMS Smith, Adam, The Theory of Moral Sentiments

(1759, 6th edition), D. D. Raphael and A. L. Macfie (eds.), [The Glasgow Edition], Oxford:

Oxford University Press, 1982.

TJ Thomas Jefferson

TIW Thomas Jefferson Writings, Merrill D. Peterson

(ed.), New York: Library of America, 1984.