

LAW AND LEGAL PROCESS

Substantive Law and Procedure in English Legal History

This collection of papers from the Twentieth British Legal History Conference explores the relationship between substantive law and the way in which it actually worked. Instead of looking at what the courts said they were doing, it is concerned more with the reality of what was happening. To that end, the authors use a wide range of sources, from court records to merchants' diaries and lawyers' letters. The way in which the sources are used reflects the possibilities of legal historical research which are opening up in the twenty-first century, as large databases and digitised images – and even online auction sites – make it a practical possibility to do work at a level which was almost unthinkable only a short time ago.

MATTHEW DYSON is a fellow in law at Trinity College, Cambridge, where he specialises in the relationship between tort and crime.

DAVID IBBETSON is the Regius Professor of Civil Law in the University of Cambridge. He is also Co-Director of the Centre for English Legal History.





LAW AND LEGAL PROCESS

Substantive Law and Procedure in English Legal History

Edited by
MATTHEW DYSON
and
DAVID IBBETSON





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

 $www. cambridge. org \\ Information on this title: www. cambridge. org/9781107040588$

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed and bound in the United Kingdom by the MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Law and legal process: substantive law and procedure in English legal history / [edited by]

Matthew Dyson, David Ibbetson.

pages cm ISBN 978-1-107-04058-8 (hardback)

Practice of law – Great Britain – Congresses.
 Practice of law – Great Britain – History.
 Procedure (Law) – Great Britain – Congresses.
 Procedure

(Law) – Great Britain – History. I. Dyson, Matthew, 1982 – editor of compilation. II. Ibbetson, D. J. (David J.) editor of compilation.

> KD460.A75L39 2013 349.42-dc23 2013019483

ISBN 978-1-107-04058-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> Er Cof Serchus a Pharchus am Dafydd Jenkins 1911–2012 Gwir Awdur a Thad Ein Cynadleddau

In
Affectionate and Respectful
Memory
of
Dafydd Jenkins
1911–2012
Founder and Father of these Conferences





CONTENTS

List of Contributors page ix Preface xi List of Abbreviations xiii

1 'The hypostasis of a prophecy': legal realism and legal history 1
CHARLES DONAHUE, JR.

Chancery, the justices and the making of new writs in thirteenth-century England
 PAUL BRAND

Copulative complexities: the exception of adultery in medieval dower actions
 GWEN SEABOURNE

4 Arbitration and the legal profession in late medieval England 56
ANTHONY MUSSON

Privileges and their application in the main English central courts in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries
 SUSANNE JENKS

6 Trusts litigation in Chancery after the Statute of Uses: the first fifty years 103

NEIL JONES

7 The assessment of contractual damages at common law in the late sixteenth century 126

DAVID IBBETSON

vii



viii	CONTENTS
8	The case of Joan Peterson: witchcraft, family conflict, legal invention and constitutional theory 148
	CLIVE HOLMES
9	Criminal informations of the Attorneys-General in the King's Bench from Egerton to North 167
	HENRY MARES
10	Lawyers, merchants, and the law of contract in the long eighteenth century 186 WARREN SWAIN
11	Creditors and the feme covert 217
	JAMES OLDHAM
12	Legal process as reported in correspondence 246 JOHN BAKER
13	Legal development in Victorian criminal trials 263 PHIL HANDLER
14	'Cutting the Gordian knot?' Arbitration and company insolvency in the 1870s 283
	MICHAEL LOBBAN
15	'Forty Years On': the British Legal History Conference, 1972–2011 314
	PATRICK POLDEN
	Index 336



CONTRIBUTORS

SIR JOHN BAKER is Emeritus Downing Professor of the Laws of England at the University of Cambridge.

PAUL BRAND is a senior research fellow and Senior Dean of All Souls College, Oxford.

CHARLES DONAHUE is Paul A. Freund Professor of Law at Harvard Law School.

PHIL HANDLER is a lecturer in law at the School of Law, University of Manchester.

CLIVE HOLMES is an emeritus fellow of Lady Margaret Hall, University of Oxford.

DAVID IBBETSON is Regius Professor of Civil Law at the University of Cambridge.

SUSANNE JENKS is a private scholar.

NEIL JONES is University Senior Lecturer in Law at the University of Cambridge.

MICHAEL LOBBAN is Professor of Legal History at Queen Mary, University of London.

HENRY MARES is College Lecturer in Law at Sidney Sussex College, Cambridge.

ANTHONY MUSSON is Professor of Legal History at the University of Exeter.

James Oldham is St Thomas More Professor of Law and Legal History at Georgetown University Law Center.



х

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

PATRICK POLDEN is Professor of Law at Brunel University.

GWEN SEABOURNE is a senior lecturer at the School of Law, University of Bristol.

WARREN SWAIN is a senior lecturer in law at the TC Beirne School of Law, University of Queensland.



PREFACE

The Twentieth British Legal History Conference was held in Cambridge, 13–16 July 2011, the third occasion on which Cambridge had played host. A total of eighty-one papers were delivered over the four days of the conference, and at least as many offers of papers had to be refused to avoid overburdening the programme. As it was, the programme had to be arranged in three parallel sessions with only a small number of plenary lectures, and the customary free afternoon with an organised outing had to be abandoned.

The core theme of the conference was Law and Legal Process, broadly interpreted to include all aspects of the interactions between legal practice and legal doctrine. The present volume is a selection of the papers delivered on that theme, reflecting the many ways in which these interactions have occurred in the history of the common law. They range between the study of a single case (Holmes) to the wide-ranging consideration of the nature of law at the interface of substance and process (Donahue). Some have their focus on the way in which the law worked in practice, some on the operation of law within courts; but they are held together by the common theme that the law should be understood not simply as a set of rules, but as a practical science whose functioning is an integral part of its being.

Some of those in Cambridge had themselves been at the first British Legal History Conference in Aberystwyth in 1972, and the conference provided an opportunity to reflect on the development of the study of legal history over the last forty years. Patrick Polden's paper in the present volume charts this through a history of the conferences. Particular attention was paid to the work of Brian Simpson, who had died earlier in the year, and to John Baker, who retired from the Downing Chair of the Laws of England in Cambridge in the summer of the conference.

As well as the editors of this volume, the organising committee of the conference was made up of Isabella Alexander, John Baker and Neil



XII PREFACE

Jones. It is only right that we should put on record that most of the burden of organisation was borne by Neil Jones. We are in his debt for all of his labour on behalf of the community of legal historians. We would also like to thank those organisations who provided sponsorship for the conference: the Journal of Legal History, Hart Publishing, Oxford University Press and Cambridge University Press. The publishers of the volume have made the job of the editors an easy one, and we are especially grateful to Finola O'Sullivan for her help and advice.



ABBREVIATIONS

Bracton Bracton on the Laws and Customs of England, G. E. Woodbine (ed.), S. E.

Thorne (trans.) (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press, 1968–77)

CCR Calendar of Close Rolls
CFR Calendar of Fine Rolls

CIPM Calendar of Inquisitions Post Mortem

CPR Calendar of Patent Rolls

CR Close Rolls
CRR Curia Regis Rolls

HMC Historical Manuscripts Commission PROME Parliament Rolls of Medieval England

RP Rotuli Parliamentorum

RS Rolls Series
Seld. Soc. Selden Society
SR Statutes of the Realm

St. Tr. State Trials

Except where expressly stated, archival sources are in the National Archives, London. Where possible, reference is also given to the the image number ([IMG]) on the Anglo-American Legal Tradition database, www.aalt.law.uh.edu/, abbreviated as AALT.