

#### TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE IN THE ASIA-PACIFIC

The question of how the human rights violations of previous regimes and past periods of conflict ought to be addressed is one of the most pressing concerns facing governments and policy makers today. New democracies and states in the fragile post-conflict peace-settlement phase are confronted by the need to make crucial decisions about whether to hold perpetrators of human rights violations accountable for their actions and, if so, the mechanisms they ought to employ to best achieve that end. This is the first book to examine the ways in which states and societies in the Asia-Pacific region have navigated these difficult waters.

Drawing together several of the world's leading experts on transitional justice with Asia-Pacific regional and country specialists, the book provides an overview of the processes and practices of transitional justice in the region as well as detailed analysis of the cases of Cambodia, Sri Lanka, Aceh, Indonesia, South Korea, the Solomon Islands, and East Timor.

Renée Jeffery is an Associate Professor of International Relations at the Australian National University. She is the author of Amnesty and Accountability: The Persistence of Amnesties from Athens to Aceh, Indonesia (scheduled for 2014), Reason and Emotion in International Ethics (scheduled for 2014), Evil and International Relations: Human Suffering in an Age of Terror (2008), and Hugo Grotius in International Thought (2006) and the editor of Confronting Evil in International Relations: Ethical Responses to Problems of Moral Agency (2008).

Hun Joon Kim is a Senior Lecturer at Griffith University. His PhD dissertation, *Expansion of Transitional Justice Measures: A Comparative Analysis of Its Causes*, was the winner of the 2009 American Political Science Association Best Dissertation Award (Human Rights Section). He is the author of *The Massacres at Mt Halla: Sixty Years of Truth-Seeking in South Korea* (scheduled for 2014).





# Transitional Justice in the Asia-Pacific

Edited by

## Renée Jeffery

Australian National University

## **Hun Joon Kim**

Griffith University





### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107040373

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Jeffery, Renée.

Transitional justice in the Asia-Pacific / Renée Jeffery, Australian National University; Hun Joon Kim, Griffith University, Brisbane.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-04037-3 (hardback)

Transitional justice – Asia.
 Transitional justice – Pacific Area.
 Political crimes and offenses – Pacific Area.
 Rule of law – Asia.
 Rule of law – Pacific Area.
 Kim, Hun Joon, 1975 – II. Title.

K5250.J44 2014

340'.115-dc23 2013019591

ISBN 978-1-107-04037-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



## **Contents**

	Contributors	page vii
	Acknowledgments	xi
	Introduction: New Horizons: Transitional Justice in the Asia-Pacific Renée Jeffery and Hun Joon Kim	1
1	Transitional Justice in the Asia-Pacific: Comparative and Theoretical Perspectives Leigh A. Payne and Kathryn Sikkink	33
2	Sri Lanka: Atrocities, Accountability, and the Decline of Rule of Law Chandra Lekha Sriram	61
3	<b>Transitional Justice Delayed in Aceh, Indonesia</b> Edward Aspinall and Fajran Zain	87
4	Transitional Justice in Cambodia: The Coincidence of Power and Principle Kirsten Ainley	125
5	Beyond 'Pragmatism' versus 'Principle': Ongoing Justice Debates in East Timor Lia Kent	157

٧



Vİ	CONTENT	
6	Reconciliation and the Rule of Law in the Solomon Islands Renée Jeffery	195
7	Transitional Justice in South Korea Hun Joon Kim	229
	<b>Conclusion</b> Hun Joon Kim and Renée Jeffery	259
	Bibliography Index	281 305



## **Contributors**

**Kirsten Ainley** is a Lecturer in the Department of International Relations at the London School of Economics and Political Science. She is the coauthor, with Chris Brown, of *Understanding International Relations*, 4th edition (2009), as well as several book chapters and articles on aspects of international criminal law.

Edward Aspinall is a Professor of Politics in the Department of Political and Social Change at Australian National University, Canberra. He is the author of Islam and Nation: Separatist Rebellion in Aceh, Indonesia (2009); Opposing Suharto: Compromise, Resistance and Regime Change in Indonesia (2005); The Helsinki Peace Agreement: A More Promising Basis for Peace in Aceh? East West Center, Policy Paper series (2003 and 2005); and The Peace Process in Aceh: Why It Failed (coauthored with Harold Crouch), as well as the editor of Problems of Democratisation in Indonesia: Elections, Institutions, and Society (coedited with Marcus Mietzner) (2010) and Local Power and Politics in Indonesia: Decentralisation & Democratisation (coedited with Greg Fealy) (2003).

**Renée Jeffery** is an Associate Professor of International Relations at the Australian National University. She is the author of *Amnesty and Accountability: The Persistence of Amnesties from Athens to Aceh, Indonesia* (forthcoming); *Reason and Emotion in International Ethics* (forthcoming); *Hugo Grotius in International Thought* (2006); and *Evil and International Relations: Human Suffering in an Age of Terror* (2008)

vii



viii CONTRIBUTORS

and the editor of Confronting Evil in International Relations: Ethical Responses to Problems of Moral Agency (2008), as well as the author of numerous articles.

Lia Kent is a Postdoctoral Research Fellow with the State, Society and Governance in Melanesia Program at the Australian National University. She has worked in, and conducted research on, East Timor, since 2000. Dr. Kent received her PhD in 2010 for a thesis entitled *Justica Seidauk Mai (Justice Is Yet to Come): Rethinking the Dynamics of Transitional Justice in East Timor.* She is the author of *Transitional Justice and Local Realities: East Timor and Beyond* (2012), as well as of several articles and book chapters.

Hun Joon Kim is a Senior Lecturer in the Griffith Asia Institute and Centre for Governance and Public Policy at Griffith University. Dr. Kim received his PhD in 2008 for a dissertation titled *Expansion of Transitional Justice Measures: A Comparative Analysis of Its Causes*, which was the winner of the 2009 American Political Science Association Best Dissertation Award (Human Rights Section). He is the author of several journal articles published in *International Organization, International Studies Quarterly*, Human Rights Quarterly, the Journal of Peace Research, the International Journal of Transitional Justice, Global Governance, and the Journal of Human Rights. He is the author of The Massacres at Mt Halla: Sixty Years of Truth-Seeking in South Korea (forthcoming).

Leigh A. Payne is Professor of Sociology (Latin American Societies) and a Fellow of St. Antony's College at the University of Oxford. She is also a faculty affiliate at the University of Minnesota Law School and was a Visiting Professor in the Political Science Department at the University of Minnesota (2008–2011). She is the author of *Brazilian Industrialists and Democratic Change* (1994), *Uncivil Movements: The Armed Right Wing and Democracy in Latin America* (2000), and *Unsettling Accounts: Neither Truth nor Reconciliation in Confessions of State Violence* (2008). Her most recent coauthored book is *Transitional Justice in Balance: Comparing Processes, Weighing Efficacy* (2010). She has edited



CONTRIBUTORS ix

other volumes and written various book chapters and articles on human rights and transitions from authoritarian rule in Latin America and South Africa.

Kathryn Sikkink is Regents Professor and holds the McKnight Presidential Chair in Political Science at the University of Minnesota. She is the author of *The Justice Cascade: Human Rights Trials and Global Change* (2011), *Mixed Signals: U.S. Human Rights Policy and Latin America* (2004), and *Activists Beyond Borders: Advocacy Networks in International Politics* (with Margaret Keck) (1998); coeditor of *Restructuring World Politics: Transnational Social Movements, Networks, and Norms* (with Sanjeev Khagram and James Riker) (2002) and *The Power of Human Rights: International Norms and Domestic Change* (with Thomas Risse and Stephen Ropp) (1999); and author of more than forty book chapters and articles.

Chandra Lekha Sriram is Professor of International Law and International Relations at the University of East London. She is author and editor of various books and journal articles on international relations, international law, human rights, and conflict prevention and peace-building. She is the author of three monographs: Peace as Governance: Power-Sharing, Armed Groups, and Contemporary Peace Negotiations (2008); Globalizing Justice for Mass Atrocities: A Revolution in Accountability (2005); and Confronting Past Human Rights Violations: Justice versus Peace in Times of Transition (2004). In 2010, the book she coedited with Suren Pillay, Peace versus Justice? The Dilemma of Transitional Justice in Africa (2010), won an Outstanding Academic Title award from Choice, of the American Librarian Association.

**Fajran Zain** is a PhD student in the Department of Political and Social Change at the Australian National University, doing research on transitional justice and reconciliation in Aceh. He works with the Aceh Institute, a public policy research institute based in Banda Aceh, as political analyst, and was a consultant for International Center for Transitional Justice (ICTJ).





## **Acknowledgments**

This volume of essays is the product of a two-day workshop, hosted by Griffith University and funded by an Area of Strategic Investment workshop grant in the winter of 2011. The workshop, titled "Transitional Justice in the Asia-Pacific," brought together several of the world's leading scholars of transitional justice as well as experts on transitional and post-conflict justice processes in the Asia-Pacific cases of Cambodia; East Timor; the Solomon Islands; Aceh, Indonesia; South Korea; and Sri Lanka. This volume is, in large part, the result of two days of vibrant and intensive discussions and debates about transitional justice in a region of the world that largely had been ignored by scholars of transitional justice. Without that concentrated effort, this volume would have been greatly diminished. We therefore thank all of the participants who presented papers at the Brisbane workshop, particularly those who traveled around the world to get there. We thank them for their generosity, of both time and intellectual engagement, and for making the workshop so enjoyable. In addition we thank our discussants and observers for their keen critiques and contributions to both the individual papers that appear in this volume and the framing of the book as a whole. In particular, we would like to thank Tim Dunne, Jason Sharman, Liane Hartnett, and Sri Lestari Wahyuningroem. Thanks also go to Pat Weller, Andrew O'Neil, Angela McDonald, Paula Cowan, and the staff at the Ship Inn for their support throughout the planning stages and during the workshop.

χi