

THE METAPHYSICS OF LOGIC

Featuring fourteen new essays from an international team of renowned contributors, this volume explores the key issues, debates, and questions in the metaphysics of logic. The book is structured in three parts, looking first at the main positions in the nature of logic, such as realism, pluralism, relativism, objectivity, nihilism, conceptualism, and conventionalism, then focusing on historical topics such as the medieval Aristotelian view of logic, the problem of universals, and Bolzano's logical realism. The final section tackles specific issues such as glutty theories, contradiction, the metaphysical conception of logical truth, and the possible revision of logic. The volume will provide readers with a rich and wide-ranging survey, a valuable digest of the many views in this area, and a long overdue investigation of logic's relationship to us and the world. It will be of interest to a wide range of scholars and students of philosophy, logic, and mathematics.

PENELOPE RUSH is Honorary Associate with the School of Philosophy and Online Lecturer for Student Learning at the University of Tasmania. She has published articles in journals including Logic and Logical Philosophy, Review of Symbolic Logic, South African Journal of Philosophy, Studia Philosophica Estonica, and Logique et Analyse. She is also the author of The Paradoxes of Mathematical, Logical, and Scientific Realism (forthcoming).





THE METAPHYSICS OF LOGIC

EDITED BY
PENELOPE RUSH

University of Tasmania





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107039643

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data
The metaphysics of logic / edited by Penelope Rush, University of Tasmania.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03964-3 (Hardback)

I. Logic. 2. Metaphysics. I. Rush, Penelope, 1972– editor.

BC50.M44 2014

160–dc23 2014021604

ISBN 978-I-107-03964-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



With thanks to Graham Priest for unstinting encouragement, and to Annwen and Callum – never give up.





Contents

Lis	st of contributors	page ix
	troduction nelope Rush	1
PΑ	RT I THE MAIN POSITIONS	11
Ι	Logical realism Penelope Rush	13
2	A defense of logical conventionalism Jody Azzouni	32
3	Pluralism, relativism, and objectivity Stewart Shapiro	49
4	Logic, mathematics, and conceptual structuralism <i>Solomon Feferman</i>	72
5	A Second Philosophy of logic Penelope Maddy	93
6	Logical nihilism Curtis Franks	109
7	Wittgenstein and the covert Platonism of mathematical logic <i>Mark Steiner</i>	128
PΑ	RT II HISTORY AND AUTHORS	145
8	Logic and its objects: a medieval Aristotelian view <i>Paul Thom</i>	147

vii



viii	Contents	
9	The problem of universals and the subject matter of logic <i>Gyula Klima</i>	160
Ю	Logics and worlds <i>Ermanno Bencivenga</i>	178
II	Bolzano's logical realism Sandra Lapointe	189
PART III SPECIFIC ISSUES		209
12	Revising logic Graham Priest	211
13	Glutty theories and the logic of antinomies Jc Beall, Michael Hughes, and Ross Vandegrift	224
14	The metaphysical interpretation of logical truth <i>Tuomas E. Tahko</i>	233
References		249
Index		264



Contributors

- JODY AZZOUNI, Professor, Department of Philosophy, Tufts University.
- JC BEALL, Professor of Philosophy and Director of the UCONN Logic Group, University of Connecticut, and Professorial Fellow at the Northern Institute of Philosophy at the University of Aberdeen.
- ERMANNO BENCIVENGA, Professor of Philosophy and the Humanities, University of California, Irvine.
- SOLOMON FEFERMAN, Professor of Mathematics and Philosophy, Emeritus, and Patrick Suppes Professor of Humanities and Sciences, Emeritus, Stanford University.
- CURTIS FRANKS, Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, University of Notre Dame.
- MICHAEL HUGHES, Department of Philosophy and UCONN Logic Group, University of Connecticut.
- GYULA KLIMA, Professor, Department of Philosophy, Fordham University, New York.
- SANDRA LAPOINTE, Associate Professor, Department of Philosophy, McMaster University.
- PENELOPE MADDY, Distinguished Professor, Department of Logic and Philosophy of Science, University of California, Irvine.
- GRAHAM PRIEST, Distinguished Professor, Graduate Center, CUNY, and Boyce Gibson Professor Emeritus, University of Melbourne.
- PENELOPE RUSH, Honorary Associate, School of Philosophy, University of Tasmania.



List of contributors

STEWART SHAPIRO, Professor, Department of Philosophy, The Ohio State University.

MARK STEINER, Professor Emeritus of Philosophy, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem.

TUOMAS E. TAHKO, Finnish Academy Research Fellow, Department of Philosophy, History, Culture and Art Studies, University of Helsinki.

PAUL THOM, Honorary Visiting Professor, Department of Philosophy, The University of Sydney.

ROSS VANDEGRIFT, Department of Philosophy and UCONN Logic Group, University of Connecticut.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press