Index

Achternbusch, Herbert, 53 Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of Complementary Standards, 184-7, 190-5 Afghanistan, 120 African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, 142 Algeria, 350 proceedings after the Danish cartoons, 82 al-Qaradhawi, Yousef, 5, 6 American Convention on Human Rights, 142 defamation and freedom of speech, 204-5 Amnesty International, 168 Amor, Abdelfattah, 233, 236 Annan, Kofi, 47 anti-Semitism, 110, 188, 227 discrimination against people not faith. 244 Durban Declaration, 222 Quran stated to be source of, 166 racism and discrimination as related issues, 224 apostasy, 8, 92, 327 inherently related to speech, 331-2 Rushdie committing, 5 Arab Charter on Human Rights, 143 Arab Spring, 54 Arabic League, 39 Arbour, Louise, 232 Areopagitica (Milton), 279 Augustine, Saint, 373 Austin, J. L, 292 autonomy, 278 Bacon, Francis 'idols of the cave', 21 'idols of the mind', 19-20, 21 'idols of the theatre', 22 Barroso, José Manuel, 48

Bentham, Jeremy, 313 Berlin, Isaiah, 278 Bielefeldt, Heiner, 237 blasphemy, 8, 13, 92 blasphemous libel, 150 blasphemy laws replaced by prohibition of incitement to religious hatred, 341-2 Christianity, in, 329-30 defamation of religions as attempt to reintroduce, 8, 15 doubts raised about blasphemy laws, 250-1 efforts to introduce new laws against, 181 - 2European supervision, importance of, 152 - 4free speech, blasphemy laws restricting, 61 freedom of religion, and, 112-13 Human Rights Committee on blasphemy laws, 112–13 Islam, in, 331-4 Judaism, in, 327-9 laws aimed at protecting specific faith, 109 margin of appreciation, cultural relativism, 158 meaning of, 326-7 meaning of blasphemy, 24 national blasphemy law, criticism of, 104 omnipresent in religion, 327 Pakistan blasphemy cases, 167 Pakistan legislation, criticism of, 167-8 profanity, and, 326 prohibited by Muslim States, 105-6 religious norms on offence, 326-34 reputation of the faithful, 111 Special Rapporteurs criticising national blasphemy laws, 235 State's role to define offence, 150 UK, in, 60-1, 202-3

409

Benedict XVI, Pope, 51, 161, 223

410 INDEX

Cairo Declaration, 143, 364-6 Canada proceedings after the cartoons, 77-80 cartoons, nature of, 38 Chaffee, Zefariah, 9 Chirac, Jacques, 47 Christianity, 265 blasphemy, 329-30 interpretation, importance of, 54 legal enforcement of religious speech norms, 340-2 religious offence, 23-4 secular society of West rooted in, 3 Christianophobia, 227 civil rights freedom of expression as central to, 92 protection of civil/human rights as comprehensive rationale, 264 civil rights, meaning of, 23 civilisation, meaning of, 25-6 clashes of civilisation, 26-7 Cohn-Bendit, Daniel, 48 Coke, Edward, 294 cultural bias, 20-2 culture, meaning of, 25-6 current legal framework, 91-159 Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief. See Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief (1981) ECHR. See European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) perspectives in quantification of religious offence, 91 regional instruments, 142-59 Da Vinci Code, 53 Dakar Declaration, 165-6 Danish cartoons, 3-8, 13, 15, 31-50 catalyst for changing balance between free expression and protection from religious insult, 16-17 Danish context of publication, 37-8 discussion of legal norms to suppress insult to religion predating, 16 effort to protect free speech, as, 34, 92 facts account of events, 297 accounts varying, 34 controversy spreading beyond Denmark, 40-1

description of cartoons, 35–7

origins of cartoons, 34-5 reaction to cartoons, 4-6 reprinting declined, 44 reprinting of cartoons, 41-3, 44-6, 77 'failure' to curb religious offence, 160 focus of legal analysis on human rights/ free speech, 15 Juste's leader in Jyllands-Posten, 35 justification for cartoon, doubts over, 37 legal proceedings after. See under legal responses to religious insult legal remedies, focus on, 6–7 no government sponsored call to violence, 64 reaction to cartoons, 39–42 reaction to the controversy, 46-50 complex political/sociological parameters, 49 EU views, 48 Western views, 46-8 repercussions, 33-4 republication, effect of, 32 Rose, comment by, 35 scope of legal proceedings engendered, 55 violent protest at violation of religious commands, 4-5, 40, 41 Das Gespenst (The Ghost), 53, 55 Das Liebeskonzil (The Love Council), 53, 55, 221-4 De iure belli ac pacis (Grotius), 20 Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief (1981), 125-33, 366-8 no significant additional rights, 130-1 origins, 125-8 proponents of new norms not referring to, 228 qualifying statements, 128-9 rights protected, 129-30 defamation conceptual criticism, 241-7 double standards, application of, 247-8 relationship between defamation of religions/traditional defamation notions not addressed, 240-1 religious defamation suffering from lack of specifity, 239-40 defining, 199-255 as technical term and defamation of religions, 206-8 elements of religious defamation, 209-28 adoption of new norms, 225-8 discrimination, racism and Islamophobia, 218-25 freedom of expression, relationship with, 214-16

> freedom of religion, 213-14 incitement to religious hatred, 216-18 insult to religions, 13 English defamation law, 201-4, 294 criminal proceedings for seditious speech and blasphemy, 202 - 3criminal prosecutions for defamatory libel, 201-2 libel, 201-2 slander, 201 institutional responses, 228-48 High Commissioner for Human Rights, 232 Holy See, 229-30 OIC Members, 238-9 persistent objections, 230 Special Rapporteurs, 233-8 support for defamation measures not limited to OIC, 228-9 support for defamation resolutions declining, 229-31 UN. 231 on international level, recognition of, 204 - 6legal concept, 199-209 majority of jurisdictions, approach to defamation in, 204 no offical definition of religious defamation, 199 Pakistan proposals emerging from Anglophone setting, 200-1 prospects, 249-55 doubts raised about blasphemy laws, 250 - 1efforts at UN marred by misjudgements, 249-50 grievances not remedied, 253-4 reasons concept of defamation of religion failed, 249 religious defamation concept as re-establishing religion as normative source of law, 241-7, 254-5 religious defamations' focus on faith, 82-3 traditional notions of defamation and religious defamation, 208 - 9of religions, 160-98 Ad Hoc Committee on the Elaboration of Complementary Standards, 184-7, 190-5 additional norms of defamation, further push for, 190-5 African Group road map approved, 186 - 7basis of arguments for new norms, 13

INDEX 411

before the Danish cartoons, 165-9

concept pre-dating Danish cartoons, 160 criticisms of concept, 14-15 Danish cartoons and their aftermath, 222 defamation of Islam, 7-8, 13-14 defining. See defamation, defining demands for legally binding instruments, 161 discussion initially political in nature, 161 Durban Review Conference, 182, 187-9, 191 emphasis on 'correct' intepretation of existing norms/need for new norms, 181-2 first resolution at the Commission, 169-76 gaining increasing traction, 7 gaining traction after Danish cartoons, 160 - 1Inter-Governmental Working Group, 182-4 legal relevance of insult to religions, 13 - 15new concept of, 7 non-paper of Ad Hoc Committee, 185-6 origins of term, 23 paramount importance of freedom of expression in Durban Review Conference, 188-9 UN Human Rights Council 2012 defamation resolution gaining only low support, 195-6 waning relevance of concept of religious defamation, 193-5 video clip of Mohammed, international response to, 251-4 Denmark Danish cartoons. See Danish cartoons free speech, 39-40, 71 free speech, importance of, 92 proceedings after the cartoons, 64-73 Diène, Doudou. See UN Special Rapporteur on Racism (Diène) discrimination. See equality and non-discrimination Durban Declaration, 175 Islamaphobia, 222 Durban Review Conference, 182, 187-9, 191 Egypt, 189 religious offence provisions, 349-50

right to change religion, 96, 120

412 INDEX

equality and non-discrimination discrimination where access to rights restricted, 218 discrimination, ICCPR and ICERD provisions on, 218-19 discrimination, racism and Islamaphobia, 218-25 racist and xenophobic acts, 220 religious discrimination, 219-20 UDHR provisions on (Arts. 2 and 7), 96 Erasmus, 282 European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR), 143-59 Art. 9, 62, 155-6 Art. 10, 70, 144 Art. 14, 62 causing (religious) offence (Arts. 10 and 17), 144-54 combating religious offence (Arts. 9 and 14), 154-9 freedoms protected not absolute, 61 hate speech, 146-54 margin of appreciation, 108-9 scope of Art. 17 in flux, 147-9 scope of States' obligations, 84 European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR), 92 Danish cartoons violating human rights, claims that, 6 duties and responsibilities of free speech, 145 emphasis on different cultural contexts, 188-9 flexible approach, 159 free speech, importance of, 144 freedom of political debate, importance of, 285-6 legal proceedings after Danish cartoons, 84-5 margin of appreciation, 108-9, 145-6, 152 cultural relativism, 158 wider, 152 'pressing social need', 151-2 religious rationale not acknowledged, 159 satirical texts/films, 150-1 European Union blasphemy laws, 6 defamation of religions, 192 freedom of religion or belief, 190 rejecting 'vilification' concept, 196 expression, freedom of. See free speech fatwas, 5, 7, 41, 52, 57 nature of, 57 Feinberg, Joel, 297 France

freedom of expression, importance of, 92

freedom of expression as 'total', 252 free speech threatened by religious extremism, 92 proceedings after the Danish cartoons, 73-7 France, Anatole, 287 free speech, 18-9 balancing several rights, as matter of, 18 blasphemy laws restricting, 61 codification of, 274-5 Danish cartoons as effort to protect, 34 defamation of religions concept as diluting individual's rights, 14-15 defamation of religions concept as suppression of, 8, 14-15 Denmark, in, 71 duties and responsibilities, 145 freedom of expression, as, 23 freedom of expression, defining defamation and, 214-16 ICCPR provisions. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) incitement to religious hatred, defining defamation and, 216 - 18instrumental justifications for, 278-90 discovery of truth and marketplace of ideas, 278-82 free speech and organisation of public life, 282-90 weaknesses of instrumentalist arguments, 288 justifications for, 274-90 consequentialist and non-consequentialist justifications, 275-6 instrinsic justifications for free speech, 276-8 instrumental justifications for free speech, 276, 278-90 limitations on, 93–4 meaning of 'speech', 23 pornography, 308-9 rationales for speech restriction, 290-310 preventing 'harm' to individuals, 294 - 9speech restrained in interests of groups/community, 293-4 speech and societal harm, 299-310 religions prohibiting insulting speech, 13 religious insult, meaning of, 24 remedy for defamation, 7 republication of Danish cartoons reasserting, 32 role of law, 150

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-03957-5 - Religious Offence and Human Rights: The Implications of Defamation of Religions Lorenz Langer Index More information

self-censorship, 3-4, 37, 71, 72 States basing free speech on religious considerations, 19 UDHR (Art.19), 92-4 UK, in, 59 freedom of religion. See under religions Glélé-Ahanhanzo, Maurice, 233 Greenawalt, Kent, 275 harm, 290 bodily injury, 9 harm principle, 290 meaning of, 294 preventing 'harm' to individuals, 294-9 quantifying damage caused by words, 10 relative concept, harm to reputation as, 296 - 7reputation, harm to, 294-7 words, caused by, 9-10 hate speech ECHR provisions. See under European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) ICCPR provisions. See under International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) ICERD provisions. See under ICERD incitement present in, 302-3 incitement to religious hatred, 185 Danish cartoons as, 116 defining defamation, and, 216-18 indeterminate link between incitement and defamation, 217-18 meaning, 218 public peace, and, 299 societal harm, 302-5 heresy, 327 link to the faith, 331 meaning of, 330 Hobbs cartoon, 1, 4, 7, 13, 32 Holmes, Justice Oliver Wendell, 280-2 Holy, 229-30 international law attibuting legal personality, 253-4 honour, 110 nature of concept, 295-6 protection against intentional infringement, 111 reputation, harm to, 294-7 human rights customary law, arising out of, 366 defamation of religion as suppression of, 8 freedom of expression as central pillar, 92

INDEX 413

international law and interpretation, 370 - 7limits to religious interpretations, 376-7 meaning of, 23 Muslim, 7 norm rationale, as. See under normrationales for the regulation of speech primarily concerned with individual rights, 242 protection of civil/human rights as comprehensive rationale, 264 rights tied to humans not divine entities, 242 States' voluntary acceptance of obligations, 19 Western cultural bias in, 19 Hussain, Abid, 237 incitement to religious hatred. See under hate speech iniuria, 10 Inter-American Court, 286 International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD), 63, 133-41 hate speech, 135 obligations, 134-6 origins, 134 proceedings after Danish cartoons, 88-90 religious discrimination, relevance of, 138-41 speech restrictions, 112 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 97-118 Art. 18, 119-20 Art. 19, 98-9 atheism, 124-5 expression, meaning of, 98 faith related discourse and expression, 104 - 5freedom of expression and hate speech (Arts. 19 and 20), 97-118 freedom of religion (Art.18), 118-25 freedom of religion and blasphemy, 112 - 13freedom of speech and defamation, 205 group rights, 111–12 hate speech, 100–2 justifications for restrictions of speech, 214 - 15limitation clause in Art. 19(3), 105-13 matters justifying exceptions to right to free expression, 106 proceedings after Danish cartoons, 85-8, 122 - 3

414 INDEX

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) (cont.) public morals protection as exception to right to free expression, 107-9 public order exception to right to free expression, 106-7 religious offence, 23-4 religious offence, regulation of, 102-3 perspective of the offended (Art. 20), 113-18 potential protection for the offender (Art.19), 103-13 reputation, nature of, 110 reputation, statutory protection against intentional infringement, 111 rights and reputation of others, protection of, 109-13 international human rights/norms. See human rights international law. See current legal framework; law International Law Commission, 362 international legal scholars, 20-1 questioning inevitability of their framework, 21 relevance of author's background, 22 Islam blasphemy, 331-4 prohibition of, 105-6 treatment of blasphemers, 332-4 concern over image of Islam, 165-6 Danish cartoons providing unity, 49-50 faith not having an obligatory manner, 96 fatwas. See fatwas fear of criticising, 3 Islamaphobia. See Islamaphobia Islamic civilisation, 27 Islamic law, 57 legal enforcement of religious speech norms, 346-51 law and religion congruent in Islam, 336-7 negative impact of Danish cartoons on perception of Islam, 49 OIC criticising Western attitudes towards, 14 paramount importance of the Prophet, 188-9 Quran, 35 as source of anti-Semitism, 166-7 riba, 265 Sharia law, 105 codified in most Muslim countries, 376 public advocacy for, 147 reservations in Declaration for, 128-9

State's duties, 370 uncodified nature of, 105-6 Islamaphobia, 179 ambiguity as regards its object, 242-7 discrimination, racism, and, 218-25 history of term, 221-2 main aspects of, 222-3 meaning of, 221 Israel, 342-6 Jahangir, Asma, 236-7 Jerry Springer: The Opera, 54 blasphemous libel proceedings, failure of, 150 threats of violence resulting, 54 Jordan, 103 proceedings after the Danish cartoons, 83 Judaism blasphemy, 327-9 law and religion congruent in Judaism, 336-7 legal enforcement of religious speech norms, 342-6 Juste, Carsten leader in Jyllands-Posten, 35 proceedings against, 68 defence, 70-1 Jyllands-Posten. See Danish cartoons Khomeini, Ayatollah, 5, 41, 57 fatwa on Rushdie politically expedient, 64 La Rue, Frank, 238 Last Temptation of Christ, 53, 54 Lauterpacht, Hersch, 312 law aims of law, 17 current legal framework. See current legal framework definition and meaning, 260 no universal approval of definition, 261 legal norms. See norms and normrationales legal relevance of religious insult, 13-15 legal responses to religious insult. See legal responses to religious insult myth of law as mechanical exercise, 20 offence and the law, 330. See also offence open framework implementing norm-rationales, as, 17 religion historically providing norm-rationale, 17 Le Pen, Jean-Marie, 47 legal responses to religious insult proceedings after the cartoons, 64-90 Canada, in, 77-80 CCPR. in. 85-8

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-03957-5 - Religious Offence and Human Rights: The Implications of Defamation of Religions Lorenz Langer Index More information

INDEX 415

CERD, in, 88-90 Denmark, in, 64-73 France, in, 73-7 international fora, in, 83-90 Muslim countries, in, 82-3 national courts, in, 64-83 Russia, in, 81-2 UK, in, 80-1 religious offence, ubiquity of, 51-6 court proceedings, 55-6 Satanic Verses. See Satanic Verses liberty, 287 Life of Brian, 52-3, 55 Ligabo, Ambeyi, 237 Low, David. See also Hobbs cartoon nature of cartoons, 38 reaction to cartoon not foreseen, 2-3 margin of appreciation, 108-9, 145-6, 152 cultural relativism, 158 wider, 152 marketplace of ideas, 280-2 criticisms of, 288-9 Mill, John Stuart, 9 harm, meaning of, 294 harm principle, 290 press freedom, 284 punishing harm, 11 search for truth, 279-80 truth best served by open discussion, 304 utilitarianarism, 279-80 Milton, John, 279, 301 Montesquieu, Charles-Louis de Secondat, Baron de, 356 Muigai, Githu, 234-6 'Muslim countries', meaning of, 23 Nasreen, Taslima, 51 national courts, proceedings in. See legal responses to religious insult neminem laedere, 9 New International Economic Order, 181-2 non-discrimination. See equality and non-discrimination norm-rationales for the regulation of speech, 272-319 human rights as official rationale, 310-19 criticism of universal validity claims, 313-15 free speech as intrinsic right, 310-11 human rights as absolute and universal, 312 human rights conceptualised as atemporal/ahistorical, 312-13 human rights guiding entire international normative system, 311-12

human rights and religious rights, 316-19 human rights theory, 311-12 religions appropriating language of human rights, 316 justifications for free speech. See under free speech rationales for speech restriction. See under free speech speech and the law, 272-4 norms and norm-rationales, 259-71 comprehensive norm-rationales, 264-7 congruent norm-justifications, impossibility of finding, 267-9 definition of law, no universal approval of, 261 four elements characterising law, 261-2 institutional aspects of law as distinguishing feature, 262 law, definition and meaning of, 260 legal norms and their aims as central aspect of law, 262-3 legal norms in normative systems, 17-18 legal norms on-going calibration process of, 16 no consensus on appropriate goals of international law, 270-1 partial relevance, rationales being of, 264 purpose of law, difering views as to, 259-60 rationales, categorised in numerous ways, 263 religion becoming law where commands are enforced, 263 religion as norm-rationale, 260-1 religious and non-religious norm-rationales as partially overlapping, 267 religious rationales, absolute and exclusive nature of, 265-7 uncertainty over the law, 259 Obama, President Barack, 252

obscene materials and pornography, 306–10 offence causality, 299 event-based concept, as, 297 harm, and, 290 lacking specificity as a concept, 11 law's response to offence, 8–12 legal relevance of insult to religions, 13–15 meaning of offence, 8–9, 23 personal affliction, as, 12 quantifying damage caused by words, 10 range of responses to, 11 relatavist component of offence, 298

416 INDEX

offence (cont.) religious insult, legal response to. See legal response to religious insult religious offence linked to expression, 92 religious offence, meaning of, 23-4 religious offence, perspectives in quantifying, 91 religious offence, ubiquity of, 51-6 remedy for defamation, 7 violent reactions offence may entail, 298-9 Organisation of the Islamic Conference (OIC), 23, 168-9 association of Islam with terrorism, 214 'bad press' for Islam, addressing, 177-8 complaint about Pope Benedict, 51 concern over image of Islam, 165-6 Danish cartoons as desecration of Prophet's image, 7 Durban Review Conference, flexible position in, 187-9 establishment and purpose, 163-4 Islamaphobia, 223-4 joint statement with Annan and Solana, 47 letter of complaint about Danish cartoons, 39 Satanic Verses, reaction to, 62-3 supporting international codification of defamation. 14 universal declaration to criminalise defamation of religions, calls for, 226 Pakistan, 13-14, 180-1, 190 blasphemy cases, 167 blasphemy legislation, criticism of, 167-8 concept of defaming religions from Anglophone setting, 200-1 criminal sacrilege and blasphemy provisions, 347-9 defamation law, 203-4, 208 first draft resolution on defamation of religions, 163, 165 first resolution at the Commission, 169-76 international human rights law not static, 193 interpretation of law, changes in, 373 - 4Islamic faith not having an obligatory manner, 96 Panizza, Oskar, 53 persisting relevance of religious law Cairo Declaration underlining, 364-6 emphasis on free disclosure in the West, 352-3 foundations of legal orders diverging, 356

international norms and domestic law, 358-60 Muslim countries' efforts to increase influence of religion, 353-6 religion as basis for legal order, advantages of, 356-7 religious freedom, meaning of, 367-8 reservations to treaties, 361-4 Piss Christ, 52, 54, 55 Plato, 299 Pollock, Frederick, 201 pornography, 306-10 profanity, 325-6 public life organisation and free speech, 282-90 public morals, 107-9 public order, 106-7 Pussy Riot, 54, 55 racial discrimination convention. See ICERD racism, 235. See also equality and non-discrimination Rasmussen, Anders Fogh recommending legal action, 6, 39-40, 64 request to meet following Danish cartoons, 4, 39 religions atheism, 124–5 beliefs shaping people's identity, 13 creed as centre of value system, 13 defamation of religions. See defamation of religions explicitly prohibiting insulting speech, 13 free exercise of, 92 freedom of religion, coercion impairing, 123-4 freedom of religion, ICCPR provision, 118 - 25freedom of religion, UDHR provision on, 94-6 freedom of religions, defining defamation and, 213-14 historically providing norm-rationales, 17 incitement to religious hatred, 216-18 insult to religions, defining defamation and, 209-13 interpretation, importance of, 373-7 legal relevance of insult to religions, 13-15 meaning of religion, 24-5 minority rights, 92 persisting relevance of religious law. See persisting relevance of religious law religions appropriating language of human rights, 316 religious freedom, meaning of, 367-8 religious insult, legal responses to. See legal responses to religious insult

INDEX 417

religious insult, meaning of, 24 religious offence. See under offence religious rationale. See religious rationale right to prosper undisturbed, 15 religious law, persisting relevance of. See persisting relevance of religious law religious offence. See under offence religious rationale, 320-51 legal enforcement of religious speech norms, 334-51 blasphemy laws replaced by incitement to religious hatred, 341-2 Christianity, in, 340-2 Christianity not directly stating the law, 337-9 Islam, in, 346-51 Israel, in, 342-6 law and religion congruent in Judaism and Islam, 336-7 religion, offence and the law, 320-3 regulation of religious offence, importance of, 322-3 relevance of religion for afterlife, 321-2 religion as norm-rationale characterised by its source, 321 religious regulation of language, importance of, 320-1 religious norms on offence, 324-34 blasphemy. See blasphemy, sacrilege and profanity, 325-6 reputation nature of, 295 relative concept, harm to reputation as, 296-7 Roosevelt, President Franklin, 93, 94 Rose, Flemming. See also Danish cartoons attacks on Flemming planned, 41 proceedings against, 68 Rushdie, Salman, 5, 41 fatwa, 41, 57 counterproductive nature of, 63-4 Russia, 103 proceedings after Danish cartooons, 81-2 sacrilege, 325-6 Saïd, Edward, 22 Satanic Verses, 7, 16-17, 51 blasphemy proceedings, UK, 59-61 book banned, 58-9 criticisms of, 57-8 description, 56-7 ECHR proceedings, failure of, 61-2 fatwa on Rushdie condemned, 57 fatwa on Rushdie, counterproductive nature of, 63-4 international repercussions, 62-3

publication, 5

unco-ordinated response to, 6 violence resulting, 54 violent protests, 5 Saudi Arabia right to change religion, objections to, 120 self-censorship, 3-4, 37, 71, 72 Sharia law. See under Islam Sikhism, 52 societal harm, 299-310 fighting words, ban on, 301-2 hate speech, 302-5 obscene material and pornography, 306-10 speech censored for the public good, 299 Solana, Javier, 47 speech damages caused by words, 292-3 elemental rather than instrumental, 276 free speech. See free speech importance/centrality of speech for the social order, 272-3 legal systems adopting concerns and taboos, 293-4 meaning of, 23 norm-rationales for regulation of. See norm-rationales for the regulation of speech psychological aspects of speech, 276, 285 rationales for speech restriction. See under free speech speech acts influencing reality, 290-1 fear of harm through curses, 291-2 Star, The. See Hobbs cartoon Straw, Jack, 46 terrorist attacks of 11 September 2001, 38, 149, 175-6, 222 Thatcher, Margaret, 59 truth, discovery of, 278-82 UN Charter, 93 sovereign equality, 269 UN Commission on Human Rights defamation of religions, 7, 13-14, 165 drafting international bill of rights, 97 freedom of religion, 94 incitement to hatred, 216 Pakistan submissions at, 168-9 UDHR freedom of expression provision, adopting, 93 UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD), 63 'due regard' obligation, 135

importance of Convention obligations, 135-6

418 INDEX

UN Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) (cont.) religious discrimination, relevance of, 138-41 submission to CERD following Danish cartoons, 137-8 UN Economic and Social Council, 127, 128, 163, 168 UN General Assembly defamation of religions concept gaining increasing traction, 7 defamation resolutions, 196-8 freedom of religion and defamation of religions, 214 resolutions corroborating notion of defamation of religion, 14 Satanic Verses, reaction to, 196-8 UN High Commissioner for Human Rights, 232 UN Human Rights Committee, 92 blasphemy laws, 112-13 constitutive elements of hate speech not specified, 113-17 Danish cartoons violating human rights, claim that, 6 expression, meaning of, 104 freedom of religion, 121-2 freedom of religion, limitations on, 122 hate speech, 100-2 margin of appreciation, 108-9 matters justifying exceptions to right to free expression, 106 national blasphemy law, criticising, 104 public morals protection as exception to right to free expression, 107-9 public order exception to right to free expression, 106-7 religious discourse/expressions, 104-5 rights or reputation of others, protection of, 109-13 UN Human Rights Council African Group road map as guiding framework for future work, 186-7 defamation of religions as affront to human dignity, 213 defamation of religions gaining increasing traction, 7 defamation resolution of 2012 gaining only low support, 195-6 OIC complaint about Pope Benedict, 51 OIC placing hopes on, 180 racial and religious hatred, decision linking, 181

UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Expression, 14 criminal defamation laws, criticising use of, 205-6 defamation of religions opposed, 237-8 UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief, 14, 131-2, 167, 169, 171, 233 defamation of religions, 236-7 Pakistan blasphemy legislation, criticism of, 167-8 UN Special Rapporteur on Racism, 166-7 Diène, 14 defamation, views on, 361-4 inadequacy of international law in religious matters, 225 Islamaphobia, 179, 121-4 views on defamation of religion changing, 234 Muigai, 234-6 UN Special Rapporteur on Religious Intolerance, see UN Special Rapporteur on Freedom of Religion or Belief UN World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, 171 UNESCO, 181-2, 252 United Kingdom (UK) Bill of Rights, 282 blasphemy, 60-1 controversial nature of blasphemy laws, 152 English defamation law. See under defamation, defining proceedings after the Danish cartoons, 80-1 Satanic Verses proceedings, 59-61 United Nations (UN), 163 calls for UN to prohibit affronts to prophets, 5-6 criticisms of, 162-3 normative order, 269 United States (US), 189 blasphemy, 252 defamation of religions, 192 free speech, intrinsic value of, 285 freedom of expression, importance of, 92-3 freedom of religion, importance of, 94 hate speech, 305

marketplace of ideas, 280-2

resolutions corroborating notion

of defamation of religions, 14

replacing Human Rights Commission, 180

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-03957-5 - Religious Offence and Human Rights: The Implications of Defamation of Religions Lorenz Langer Index More information

INDEX 419

obscene materials, 306 rationales of free speech, discussion of, 310 Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), 92–6, 98, 313 adoption, 97 blueprint for subsequent human rights instruments, 97 freedom of expression (Art.19), 92–4 limitations on, 93–4 freedom of religion (Art.18), 94–6 non-discrimination and equality (Arts. 2 and 7), 96 normative instrument, 96

video clip of Mohammed, 16, 33, 161, 199 ability to cause global violence, 33 intention to cause offence, 51–2 international response to, 251–4 Rights, 312 Westergaard, Kurt, 4. *See also* Danish cartoons approach to cartoons, 38 attacks on planned, 4 furore over cartoon not foreseen, 38 plot to murder, 41 Western values 38 meaning of, 41, 46 World Conference on Religion and Peace, 38 Yemen, 220–1, 231

Vienna World Conference on Human

reinen, 220-1, 231 proceedings after the Danish cartoons, 58 right to change religion, 103, 179