

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Today, most Americans lack constitutional rights on the job. Instead of enjoying free speech or privacy, they can be fired for almost any reason, or for no reason at all. This history explains why. It takes readers back to the 1930s and 1940s when advocates across the political spectrum – labor leaders, civil rights advocates, and conservatives opposed to government regulation – set out to enshrine constitutional rights in the workplace. The book tells of their interlocking fights to win constitutional protections for American workers, recovers their surprising successes, explains their ultimate failure, and helps readers assess the outcome.

Sophia Z. Lee is Professor of Law and History at the University of Pennsylvania Law School. She earned her JD and her PhD in history from Yale.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right
Sophia Z. Lee
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Studies in Legal History

EDITORS

Sarah Barringer Gordon, *University of Pennsylvania*

Holly Brewer, *University of Maryland, College Park*

Michael Lobban, *London School of Economics and Political Science*

Sophia Z. Lee, *The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right*

Michael A. Livingston, *The Fascists and the Jews of Italy: Mussolini's Race Laws, 1938–1943*

Mitra Sharafi, *Law and Identity in Colonial South Asia: Parsi Legal Culture, 1772–1947*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

To my amazing postnuclear family, with love and gratitude

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

SOPHIA Z. LEE

University of Pennsylvania Law School



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right
Sophia Z. Lee
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107613218

© Sophia Z. Lee 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Lee, Sophia Z. (Sophia Zoila), 1970– author.

The workplace constitution from the New Deal to the New Right / Sophia Z. Lee.
pages cm – (Studies in legal history)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03872-1 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-61321-8 (paperback)

1. Industrial relations – United States – History. 2. Employee rights – United States – History. 3. Constitutional law – United States – History. 4. Labor laws and legislation – United States – History. 5. United States – Race relations. I. Title.

KF3369.L36 2014

344.7301'12–dc23 2014002496

ISBN 978-1-107-03872-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-61321-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page ix</i>
Introduction	i
PART I. CRAFTING THE WORKPLACE CONSTITUTION IN THE NEW DEAL 1930S AND 1940S	
1 Liberals Forge a Workplace Constitution in the Courts	11
2 Agencies Discover the Liberal Workplace Constitution	35
3 Conservatives Create a Workplace Constitution in the Courts	56
PART II. ADVANCING THE WORKPLACE CONSTITUTION IN THE COLD WAR 1950S	
4 Liberals Test the Workplace Constitution in the Courts	81
5 Agencies Consider the Liberal Workplace Constitution	97
6 Conservatives Pursue the Workplace Constitution in the Courts	115
PART III. ADMINISTERING THE LIBERAL WORKPLACE CONSTITUTION IN THE LONG 1960S	
7 Agencies Recognize the Liberal Workplace Constitution in the New Frontier	135
8 The Liberal Workplace Constitution on the Air and over the Wires	155
9 The NLRB Expands the Liberal Workplace Constitution	175
	vii

viii	<i>Contents</i>
PART IV. THE WORKPLACE CONSTITUTION IN THE NEW RIGHT 1970S AND 1980S	
10	Conservatives Reject the Liberal Workplace Constitution 193
11	Liberals Rethink the Workplace Constitution 212
12	Conservatives Unite the Workplace Constitutions 223
13	The Conservative Workplace Constitution Divides the New Right Coalition 238
	<i>Epilogue</i> 257
	<i>Appendix: Figures</i> 261
	<i>Notes</i> 265
	<i>Selected Bibliography of Primary Sources</i> 379
	<i>Index</i> 389

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

Thanking all those who have made this book possible is a daunting, probably impossible, yet deeply rewarding task. Like many first books, this one was inspired by research I did for a professor, which grew into a seminar paper, from there into a dissertation, and then finally into this book. I made it through each of these steps owing to the support of an incredible community of teachers, mentors, classmates, colleagues, and friends. There is no way to rank their gifts, each of which has been invaluable.

One person to whom you as a reader, no less than I as a writer, owe tremendous thanks is Sarah (Sally) Barringer Gordon. Sally has been a mentor, colleague, editor par excellence, and dear friend. She has provided the best kind of tough love: she has balanced unfailing advice, boundless encouragement, unwavering faith, and a seemingly infinite willingness to read, discuss, and mark up the manuscript with hard questions about everything from word choice to framing concepts to the necessity of entire chapters. She and her coeditors of the *Studies in Legal History* series at Cambridge University Press have provided a level of engagement and support that is rare in academic publishing today and that greatly enriched this book.

I could not have conceived of this project without excellent teachers. My adviser and the chair of my dissertation committee, Glenda Gilmore, taught me the craft of history and has been an endless source of wise counsel. Reva Siegel steered me to this project and gave me the scholarly tools with which to proceed. Robert Gordon shaped my

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

understanding of legal history. Erudite and encyclopedic, his insightful feedback was invaluable. Jennifer Klein gave me my bearings in labor history and has been at the ready with careful reads and keen advice.

This project was nourished by the many academic communities to which I have belonged since its inception. Yale historians Jean Christophe-Agnew, John Demos, and Beverly Gage helped me grow as a historian and writer. At Yale Law School, Richard Brooks, William Eskridge, Owen Fiss, Heather Gerkin, Daniel Markovitz, Jerry Mashaw, Robert Post, Judith Resnik, and Vickie Schultz provided welcome support and intellectual inspiration. At New York University School of Law, Cynthia Estlund, Barry Friedman, Daniel Hulsebosch, and William Nelson provided lively feedback and welcome encouragement. Deborah Malamud deserves special mention: not only has her work on race and labor critically informed my own, but she also generously shared primary sources without which Chapter 1 would not have been possible.

Since joining the faculty at the University of Pennsylvania Law School, I have found among my colleagues a tremendously creative and rigorous community. I am particularly indebted to Shyamkrishna Balganesh, Cary Coglianese, Frank Goodman, Seth Kreimer, Howard Lesnik, David Skeel, Thomas Sugrue, Michael Wachter, Tess Wilkinson-Ryan, Tobias Wolff, and Christopher Yoo for their friendship, advice, support, and comments. Serena Mayeri, in particular, generously read the entire manuscript, saving me from errors and infelicities large and small; my dean, Mike Fitts, deserves special thanks for the financial backing he secured for my research and the time he gave me for focused writing. I have also been extremely lucky to have Writers Bloc(k), our legal history writing group, the members of which have provided incredible camaraderie and excellent feedback.

I have benefited immeasurably from the guidance and support of a more diffuse community of scholars, as well. Special thanks are owed to Nelson Lichtenstein and Theodore St. Antoine, both of whom provided that most precious gift in the book's final stages: they read the full manuscript and provided valuable correction, guidance, and reassurance. Susanna Blumenthal, Tomiko Brown-Nagin, Mary Dudziak, Daniel Ernst, Risa Goluboff, Kenneth Mack, Bill Novak, James Pope, Reuel Schiller, and Barbara Welke have inspired and advised me; they

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xi

have also given generously of their time to read and comment on my work. I have had the good fortune of receiving perceptive responses to presentations of my work from Bruce Ackerman, Eric Arnesen, Brian Balogh, Christopher Capozzola, Anthony Chen, David Chappell, Drew Days III, William Forbath, John Harrison, Meg Jacobs, Laura Kalman, Randy Kozel, Robert Lieberman, Nancy MacLean, Wendell Pritchett, Gretchen Ritter, James Sparrow, Steven Teles, Christopher Tomlins, and Dorian Warren. Margot Canaday and Paul Frymer have enlightened, counseled, and encouraged me at key junctures.

As immensely grateful as I am to these scholars for all they have shared with me, I could not have written this book without the incredible friends and colleagues who have made the journey through graduate school and beyond with me. Adam Arenson, Kevin Arlyck, Christopher Beauchamp, Deborah Dinner, Nicholas Parillo, Gautham Rao, Christopher Schmidt, Jed Shugerman, Karen Tani, Laura Weinrib, and R. Owen Williams have challenged me in the most wonderful ways; kept me sane, well fed, and in good humor; and have shown me by their example what the best work of my generation of historians will be. Dara Orenstein's friendship, counsel, and encouragement have been particularly critical, right down to enlisting her talented friends Brett Snyder and Irene Cheng to help with the cover design.

The book would not have been possible without generous financial assistance. I am indebted to Yale University, including its John F. Enders Fund; Yale Law School, including its Legal History and Coker Teaching Fellowships as well as the Benjamin Scharps and Joseph Parker Prizes; the William Nelson Cromwell Foundation; New York University School of Law's Samuel I. Golieb Fellowship; the University of Pennsylvania Law School; the American Historical Association's Littleton-Griswold Research Fund; and the American Society for Legal History's J. Willard Hurst Summer Institute in Legal History and Kathryn T. Preyer Prize.

Portions of the book have appeared in *Law and History Review*, the *Virginia Law Review*, and *The Right and Labor in America: Politics, Ideology, and Imagination*, ed. Nelson Lichtenstein and Elizabeth Tandy Shermer (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012). I thank those publishers for allowing me to reprint the material here. I am also indebted to David Tanenhaus, Tamara Fishman, Lauren Willard, Kasey Levit, Nelson Lichtenstein, Elizabeth Tandy-Shermer,

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

and the anonymous reviewers for *Law and History Review* for their expert editing and suggestions.

I was lucky to receive excellent assistance with my research from numerous archivists, librarians, and clerks of the court. In addition to enjoying the many conversations I had across the country about the future of archives in a digital age, I benefited greatly from the quick, professional, and illuminating help of archivists at the Archive of Labor and Urban Affairs, the George Meany Memorial Archives, the Harris County Courthouse in Texas, Harvard Law School Library, the Hoover Institution, the John F. Kennedy Presidential Library, the Library of Congress Manuscript Division, the Moorland-Spingarn Research Center at Howard University, Notre Dame University Archives, the Seeley G. Mudd Manuscript Library at Princeton University, the L. Tom Perry Special Collections at Brigham Young University, the Ronald Reagan Presidential Library and Museum, the Wisconsin Historical Society, and the Wisconsin Supreme Court. Staff at the National Archives locations across the country were of tremendous help locating and copying court records.

I am particularly indebted to several individuals. At the National Archives in College Park, Maryland, James Matthis moved mountains to expeditiously screen files for me. In addition, he and Tab Lewis located National Labor Relations Board and Department of Justice records without which I would not have been able to piece together the story told herein. Linda Whitaker at the Arizona Historical Society was not only extremely helpful during the time I spent in Phoenix researching the Barry M. Goldwater Papers but also continued to send me useful finds long after my visit. Professor Roberto Corrada of the Sturm College of Law at the University of Denver greatly enhanced my visit to the Penrose Library with his personal insights into the remarkable Howard Jenkins Jr. At Cornell's Kheel Center, Patrizia Sione diligently tracked down mislabeled material. The library staff at the University of Pennsylvania Law School's Biddle Law Library, especially Alvin Dong, have been a joy to meet and a pleasure to work with. I have also benefited from excellent research assistance by graduate students Anne Fleming, Smita Ghosh, Rebecca Serbin, and David Williams as well as professional researchers Debby Cooney, Carolyn Harbus, Rosemary Lewis, Andrew Skabelund, and Anita Sower. Chaz Lively and Collin Payne provided expertise I lacked, generating the

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03872-1 - The Workplace Constitution from the New Deal to the New Right

Sophia Z. Lee

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xiii

book's study of workers' understanding of their constitutional rights and its figures, respectively.

Books would not make the leap from electronic file to tangible object without the support of a press and the collective efforts of many. I have been in particularly good hands at Cambridge, thanks not only to my series editors, but also to Lew Bateman, Eric Crahan, Shaun Vigil, copy editor extraordinaire Julie Hagen, and the crew at Newgen. The blind reader reports Cambridge solicited were also incredibly helpful in shaping and refining the book-in-process.

To my parents, sisters, sister-in-law, nephew, and the family to come, you've given and give me so much. My mother, Melissa Nelken, is owed special thanks for her tireless support and for her patient and lifelong efforts to teach me the craft of writing. Nicole, Julian, Lauren, Ellis, Shea, Mike, and Lorin, thank you for making your family my own, for drawing my head out of the books and into the present, and for the extreme joy of discovering the world together. My wife, Nicole, deserves more than thanks for holding our family together when the book has consumed me and for sacrificing so much to help Julian and me thrive. She is the most loyal and loving person I know. I would be lost without her.