

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE EAST ASIAN CHALLENGE FOR DEMOCRACY

The rise of China, along with problems of governance in democratic countries, has reinvigorated the theory of political meritocracy. But what is the theory of political meritocracy, and how can it set standards for evaluating political progress (and regress)? Can meritocracy be reconciled with democracy, and, if so, how? What is the history of political meritocracy, and what can it teach us today? How is political meritocracy practiced in contemporary societies – in China, Singapore, and elsewhere – and what are its advantages and disadvantages in terms of producing just outcomes and contributing to good governance? To help answer these questions, this volume gathers a series of commissioned research papers from an interdisciplinary group of leading philosophers, historians, and social scientists. The result is the first book in decades to examine the rise (or revival) of political meritocracy and what it will mean for political developments in China and the rest of the world. Despite its limitations, meritocracy has contributed much to human flourishing in East Asia and beyond and will continue to do so in the future. This book is essential reading for those who wish to further the debate and perhaps even help to implement desirable forms of political change.

Daniel A. Bell is Professor of Ethics and Political Philosophy and Director of the Center for International and Comparative Political Philosophy at Tsinghua University (Beijing) and Zhiyuan Chair Professor in the Institute of Arts and Humanities at Jiaotong University (Shanghai). He has coedited three previous books for Cambridge University Press and authored, coauthored, and coedited seven other books. He is a frequent contributor to leading media outlets in China and the West. His writings have been translated into twenty-three languages.

Chenyang Li is Associate Professor and founding director of the philosophy program at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. Previously, he served as Professor and Chair of the Philosophy Department at Central Washington University, where he received the Distinguished Research Professor Award, Outstanding Department Chair Award, and Keys to Success Award (Student Service). He was a 2008–2009 American Council on Education Fellow. His research interests include Chinese philosophy, comparative philosophy, and value theory. Among his publications are *The Confucian Philosophy of Harmony* (2013); *The Tao Encounters the West: Explorations in Comparative Philosophy* (1999); and *The Sage and the Second Sex: Confucianism, Ethics, and Gender* (ed., 2000), as well as about 100 journal articles and book chapters.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The East Asian Challenge for Democracy

POLITICAL MERITOCRACY IN
COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

Edited by

DANIEL A. BELL

Tsinghua University

Shanghai Jiaotong University

CHENYANG LI

Nanyang Technological University

Singapore



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective
Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107623774

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

The East Asian challenge for democracy : political meritocracy in comparative perspective /
edited by Daniel A. Bell, Chenyang Li.

pages cm

Includes index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03839-4 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-62377-4 (paperback)

1. Democracy – East Asia. 2. East Asia – Politics and government.

I. Bell, Daniel (Daniel A.), 1964–

JQ1499.A91E22 2013

321.8095–dc23 2013010562

ISBN 978-1-107-03839-4 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-62377-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for
external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee
that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

From Daniel A. Bell

To Valérie, Oliver, and Yana

From Chenyang Li

To Fay and Hansen

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective
Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

<i>Contributing Authors</i>	<i>page ix</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xv
Introduction: The Theory, History, and Practice of Political Meritocracy	1
<i>Daniel A. Bell</i>	
SECTION I. THE THEORY OF POLITICAL MERITOCRACY	
1. Political Meritocracy and Meritorious Rule: A Confucian Perspective	31
<i>Joseph Chan</i>	
2. A Confucian Version of Hybrid Regime: How Does It Work, and Why Is It Superior?	55
<i>Tongdong Bai</i>	
3. Confucian Meritocracy for Contemporary China	88
<i>Ruiping Fan</i>	
4. The Liberal Critique of Democracy	116
<i>John Skorupski</i>	
5. Meritocratic Representation	138
<i>Philip Pettit</i>	

SECTION II. THE HISTORY OF POLITICAL MERITOCRACY	
6. Between Merit and Pedigree: Evolution of the Concept of “Elevating the Worthy” in Pre-imperial China <i>Yuri Pines</i>	161
7. A Society in Motion: Unexpected Consequences of Political Meritocracy in Late Imperial China, 1400–1900 <i>Benjamin Elman</i>	203
8. Meritocratic Democracy: Learning from the American Constitution <i>Stephen Macedo</i>	232
SECTION III. REALIZING POLITICAL MERITOCRACY TODAY	
9. How East Asians View Meritocracy: A Confucian Perspective <i>Doh Chull Shin</i>	259
10. Political Meritocracy in Singapore: Lessons from the PAP Government <i>Benjamin Wong</i>	288
11. Meritocracy and Political Liberalization in Singapore <i>Kenneth Paul Tan</i>	314
12. China’s Meritocratic Examinations and the Ideal of Virtuous Talents <i>Hong Xiao and Chenyang Li</i>	340
13. Reflections on Political Meritocracy: Its Manipulation and Transformation <i>Philippe C. Schmitter</i>	363
14. Political Meritocracy and Direct Democracy: A Hybrid Experiment in California <i>Nicolas Berggruen and Nathan Gardels</i>	375
Index	395

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributing Authors

Tongdong Bai is the Dongfang Chair Professor of Philosophy at Fudan University in China. His research interests include Chinese philosophy and political philosophy, especially the comparative and contemporary relevance of traditional Chinese political philosophy. His books are *A New Mission of an Old State: The Comparative and Contemporary Relevance of Classical Confucian Political Philosophy* (in Chinese, Peking University Press, 2009) and *China: The Political Philosophy of the Middle Kingdom* (in English, Zed Books, 2012).

Daniel A. Bell (贝淡宁) is Professor of Ethics and Political Philosophy and Director of the Center for International and Comparative Political Philosophy at Tsinghua University (Beijing) and Zhiyuan Chair Professor in the Institute of Arts and Humanities at Jiaotong University (Shanghai). He has coedited three previous books with Cambridge University Press and authored, coauthored, and coedited seven books with Princeton University Press. He is a frequent contributor to leading media outlets in China and the West. His writings have been translated into twenty-three languages.

Nicolas Berggruen is an investor and philanthropist and founder and president of Berggruen Holdings, a private investment company, and the Nicolas Berggruen Institute, a think tank that works on addressing governance issues.

Joseph Chan is Professor and Head of the Department of Politics and Public Administration at the University of Hong Kong. His research interests include contemporary liberalism and perfectionism, Confucian political philosophy, the theory and practice of human rights, civil society and NGOs, and social cohesion. He has published articles in

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x

Contributing Authors

various journals, including *China Quarterly*, *Ethics*, *History of Political Thought*, *Journal of Chinese Philosophy*, *Journal of Democracy*, *Oxford Journal of Legal Studies*, *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, and *Philosophy East and West*. He serves on the editorial committees of *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* and *Law and Philosophy*.

Benjamin Elman is the Gordon Wu '58 Professor of Chinese Studies, Professor of East Asian Studies and History, and chair of the Department of East Asian Studies at Princeton University. He works at the intersection of several fields including history, philosophy, literature, religion, economics, politics, and science. His ongoing interest is in rethinking how the history of East Asia has been told in the West as well as in China, Japan, and Korea. He is currently studying cultural interactions in East Asia during the eighteenth century – in particular, the impact of Chinese classical learning, medicine, and natural studies on Tokugawa, Japan, and Choson, Korea.

Ruiping Fan is Professor of Philosophy in the Department of Public Policy at City University of Hong Kong. He authored *Reconstructionist Confucianism: Rethinking Morality after the West* (2010) and *Contemporary Confucian Bioethics* (2011). He is the editor or coeditor of *Confucian Bioethics* (1999), *Confucian Society and the Revival of Dao* (2008), *The Renaissance of Confucianism in Contemporary China* (2011), *Ritual and the Moral Life* (2012), and *A Confucian Constitutional Order* (2013).

Nathan Gardels is editor-in-chief of NPQ and Global Services of the LA Times Syndicate. He is coauthor with Nicolas Berggruen of “Intelligent Governance for the 21st Century: A Middle Way between West and East.”

Chenyang Li is Associate Professor and founding director of the philosophy program at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. He served as Professor in and Chair of the Philosophy Department at Central Washington University (1999–2010). His research interests include Chinese philosophy, comparative philosophy, and value theory. His publications include *The Confucian Philosophy of Harmony* (Routledge, 2013); *The Tao Encounters the West: Explorations in Comparative Philosophy* (State University of New York Press, 1999; Chinese trans. Remin University Press, 2005); and *The Sage and the Second Sex*:

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributing Authors

xi

Confucianism, Ethics, and Gender (ed., Open Court, 2000), and about 100 journal articles and book chapters. He is a member of the editorial/academic boards of the *Journal of Chinese Philosophy* and thirteen other scholarly publications.

Stephen Macedo is Laurence S. Rockefeller Professor of Politics in the University Center for Human Values at Princeton University, where he has also served as Director of the Center and Founding Director of the Program in Law and Public Affairs. His books include *Diversity and Distrust: Civic Education in a Multicultural Democracy* and *Liberal Virtues: Citizenship, Virtue, and Community in Liberal Constitutionalism* (Chinese trans., Yilin Press, 2010).

Philip Pettit is Laurence S. Rockefeller University Professor of Politics and Human Values at Princeton University and Distinguished Professor of Philosophy at the Australian National University. His recent books include *On the People's Terms: A Republican Theory and Model of Democracy* (Cambridge University Press, 2012), *Group Agency* (with Christian List, Oxford University Press, 2011), and *A Political Philosophy in Public Life* (with Jose Marti, Princeton University Press, 2010). His work is the focus in *Common Minds: Themes from the Philosophy of Philip Pettit* (Oxford University Press, 2007), edited by H. G. Brennan et al.

Yuri Pines (尤锐) is Michael W. Lipson Professor of Asian Studies at Hebrew University of Jerusalem. His major publications include *The Everlasting Empire: Traditional Chinese Political Culture and Its Enduring Legacy* (Princeton University Press, 2012); *Envisioning Eternal Empire: Chinese Political Thought of the Warring States Era* and *Foundations of Confucian Thought: Intellectual Life in the Chunqiu Period, 722–453 B.C.E.* (both University of Hawaii Press, 2009 and 2002); and the coedited volume *Birth of an Empire: The State of Qin Revisited* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013).

Philippe C. Schmitter is Professorial Fellow and a recurring lecturer at the Istituto Italiano di Scienze Umane (SUM) in Florence and at the Central European University in Budapest. He has published books and articles on comparative politics, regional integration in Western Europe and Latin America, the transition from authoritarian rule in Southern Europe and Latin America, and the intermediation of class, sectorial, and professional interests. His current work is on the political

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

characteristics of the emerging Euro-polity, the consolidation of democracy in southern and eastern Europe, and the possibility of postliberal democracy in western Europe and North America.

Doh Chull Shin is Jack W. Peltason Scholar in Residence at the Center for the Study of Democracy at the University of California, Irvine. His publications include *Mass Politics and Culture in Democratizing Korea* (Cambridge University Press, 1999); *Economic Crisis and Dual Transition in Korea* (Seoul National University Press, 2004); *Citizens, Democracy, and Markets around the Pacific Rim* (Oxford University Press, 2006); *How East Asians View Democracy* (Columbia University Press, 2009); *The Quality of Life in Korea* (Kluwer Academic, 2003); and *The Quality of Life in Confucian Asia* (Springer, 2009).

John Skorupski studied philosophy and economics at Cambridge University. After lecturing at the University of Glasgow, he moved to the Chair of Philosophy at Sheffield University in 1984 and to the Chair of Moral Philosophy at Saint Andrews in 1990. His interests at the moment are moral and political philosophy, meta-ethics and epistemology, and the history of nineteenth- and twentieth-century philosophy. His books include *John Stuart Mill* (1989), *Ethical Explorations* (1999), and *The Domain of Reasons* (2010).

Kenneth Paul Tan is Associate Professor at the National University of Singapore's Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy. He has written widely about Singapore, mainly on governance, democracy, and civil society; the creative city and culture industry; and race, gender, and sexuality. He has published in leading international journals such as *Asian Studies Review*, *Critical Asian Studies*, *International Political Science Review*, and *Position: Asia Critique*. He has authored two books: *Renaissance Singapore? Economy, Culture, and Politics* (NUS Press, 2007) and *Cinema and Television in Singapore: Resistance in One Dimension* (Brill, 2008).

Benjamin Wong is Associate Professor of Policy and Leadership Studies at the National Institute of Education, Nanyang Technological University. His teaching and research interests include history of political thought, Singapore politics, and education policy. He is coeditor of *Dissident Democrats: The Challenge of Democratic Leadership in Asia* and has published articles in the *Journal of Chinese Philosophy*, *Philosophy East and West*, and *Millennium: Journal of International Studies*, among others.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contributing Authors

xiii

Hong Xiao is Associate Professor of Sociology and Director of Master of Arts in Contemporary China at Nanyang Technological University, Singapore. She served as Professor and Chair of the Sociology Department at Central Washington University (1999–2010). She is the author of *Childrearing Values in the United States and China: A Comparison of Belief Systems and Social Structure* (Praeger, 2001) and has published on topics such as social class and values, child socialization, culture and values, gender, domestic violence, and human rights.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03839-4 - The East Asian Challenge for Democracy: Political Meritocracy
in Comparative Perspective

Edited by Daniel A. Bell and Chenyang Li

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

The editors thank the Center for Liberal Arts and Social Sciences of the College of Humanities, Arts, and Social Sciences at Nanyang Technological University for a generous grant and Ang Wee Li, Leo Chung Hoe Gary, and Li Jifen for their dedicated service in support of the conference “The Idea of Political Meritocracy: A Nanyang Technological University Interdisciplinary Symposium” on 6–8 January 2012, from which this volume was generated. This project was partially supported by NTU Research Grant M4080394. Thanks are also due to Alan Chan, Ian Chong, Chua Beng Huat, Michael Dowdle, Prasenjit Duara, Daniel Goh, He Baogang, Leigh Jenco, Leo Koguan, Loy Hui Chieh, William Nienhauser, Pan Wei, Michael Puett, Lisa Raphals, Tan Ern Ser, Tan Sor-hoon, Ten Chin Liew, and Zheng Yongnian, for participating in the conference and for providing valuable comments on the papers; to Mark Elliott for helpful suggestions of translations of Chinese key terms; to Gu Qingfeng and Song Bing for helping us obtain the cover photo, and to photographer of the cover photo Hu Yong at Center for Public Service Examinations, Organization Department, Changsha City (Hunan province, China), for permitting us to use it; to Wu Huawei, Li Jifen, and Sun Qingjuan for help with proofreading and technical assistance in preparing the manuscript; and last but not least, especially to our thoughtful and efficient editor at Cambridge University Press, John Berger, who has made publishing this volume a particularly pleasant and rewarding experience.