

Index

Family Health Program, 327-328 Abacha v. Fawehinmi, Nigeria, 385, 386 Abuja Declaration on HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis federal transfers to states in, and Other Related Infectious Diseases, 296 324-326 Accident Compensation Act 2001, New Zealand, Act on Social Care, Sweden, 75-76 health care system in, 320-332 Administrative Litigation Law (ALL), China, 277-278, 280 HIV/AIDS litigation, 342-343 African Charter on Human and People's Rights hospital services in, 328-330 (African Charter), 382-387 Alberta Health Care Insurance Act, Canada, 96 ALL. See Administrative Litigation Law, China Andrews v. Law Soc'y of British Columbia, Canada, 88 Article 14, India, 445 Article 15, India, 445-446 Article 21, India, 444-445 ministerial regulation, 334-335 Association of Gynaecologists, Sweden, 66 (RENAME), 334-335 Association of Patient Insurers, Sweden, 64 Atlas of NHS services, England, 111 Auckland Area Health Board v Attorney-General preventative primary care in, 344 (AAHB), New Zealand, 38-40 Auton v. British Columbia, Canada, 15-16, 99-101 Program for Primary Care, 328 AWBZ health-scheme, Netherlands, 190-191, reform proposals for, 344 203-205 Azubike v. Attorney General of the Federation and 3 Ors, Nigeria, 390 Sanitarist Movement, 327 statutory provisions, 333-334 BEE. See black empowerment process, South Africa Bill 33, Quebec Canada, 95 black empowerment process (BEE), South Africa, 321 Brown v. Plata, U.S., 356 304 Brazil

health care inequalities in, 326-330, 343 health care rights legislation in, 332-336 Health Community Agents Program, 327-328 investment inequalities, expenditures per capital in SUS by municipalities in, 324-326 investment level in system, 321-324 litigation effectiveness debate in, 319 litigation, government spending, 341 litigation, restricted access, 339-340 litigation trends, overview, 336-339 National List of Essential Medicines Normas Operacionais Básicas (NOBs), 334 private health care system in, 320-332 public-private partnerships in, 344 right to health litigation in, 336-343 Unified System of Health Care (SUS), 319, World Health Organization (WHO) report on, Buffet v. Canadian Forces, Canada, 91 Bureau of National Health Insurance (BNHI), Taiwan, 238

constitutional amendment in, 335-336

constitutional provisions, 332-333



482 Index

CAJANAL. See civil servant's social insurance Stein v. Quebec, 86 user-fees, extra-billing, and privatization in, institute, Columbia Canada, 457-458 96-98 abortion rights in, 92-94 vulnerable groups in, 92 Alberta Health Care Insurance Act, 96 winners vs. losers assessment, 105-106 Andrews v. Law Soc'y of British Columbia, Winnipeg Regional Health Authority's Home 88-90 Care program, 81 assisted suicide, right-to-die in, 102-103 CCGs. See Clinical Commission Groups, autism treatment, ABA/IBI program in, England CDSCO. See Central Drug Standards Control Auton v. British Columbia, 99-101 Organization, India CEHAT v. Union of India and Ors, 447-448 Bill 33, Quebec, 95 Buffet v. Canadian Forces, 91 Central Drug Standards Control Organization Cambie Surgical Corporation, 96, 97 (CDSCO), India, 433-434 Centrale Raad van Berop (CRvB), Netherlands, Cameron v. Nova Scotia, 90, 103-105 Canada Health Act (CHA), 80, 84-85 203-205 Canadian Abortion Rights Action League, 93 Chaoulli v. Quebec, Canada, 7, 88, 94-96, 97-98 Canadian Hearing Society, 89 China, 467 Canadian Human Rights Act, 91 Administrative Litigation Law (ALL), 277-278, Canadian Human Rights Tribunal, 91 Canadian Independent Medical Clinics cases, litigation landscape, 275-281 delivery service functions vs. public Association, 97 Chaoulli v. Quebec, 7, 88, 94-96, 97-98 characteristics, 263-265 Charter, 86 equity accountability in, 287 Charter Section 7, positive health rights, 87-88, equity, justiciable rights in, 281 health organizations funding in, 263-264 Charter, Section 15 Equality Guarantee, 88-90 health rights justiciability prospects for, 283-284 Deskin-Wynberg case, 101-102 health services infrastructure in, 264-265 discrimination claims pursuant to human Human Rights Plan, 282 rights Acts/Codes, 90-92 individual health care savings accounts in, Eldrige v. British Columbia, 89-90, 105-106 284-285 Flora v. Ontario Health Insurance Plan, 88 informal norms in, 281-283 Gosselin v. Quebec, 87–88 international law and, 270 health rights legislation, political impact in, litigation, grievance manifestations in, 273-281 98-105 local government and, 269 health rights litigation in, 87-105 Medical Assistance (MA), 266 IVF, ICSI procedures in, 90, 103-105 New Cooperative Medical System (NCMS), Lalonde v. Ontario, 86 265-266 Law v. Canada, 88 Professional Doctor's Law, 272 legal instruments regulating access, 83-87 public hospitals pilots, 268-269 medical necessity treatment in, 79-80 public vs. private reform plans, 267-270 Medicare in, 79 recent health system development, market Medicare Protection Act, British Columbia, 96, liberalization in, 264 reforms, demand-side subsidies by government negative rights of access litigation in, 92-94 in, 265–270 one-tier Medicare and equity, Charter rights role of law, right to health in, 270-273 litigation, 94-96 Social Insurance Law, 271–273 Ontario Human Rights Code, 91 supply-side cost controls in, 267 private health care in, 79, 83, 94-96 Urban Employee Basic Medical Insurance public coverage comprehensiveness in, 80-82 (UEBMI), 266 R. v. Morgentaler, 92–94 Urban Resident Basic Medical Insurance Rodriguez v. British Columbia, 102-103 (URBMI), 266

single payer system sustainability, 82-83

social determinants of health in, 81-82

urban vs. rural residents in, 265

vulgar conception of health rights in, 284–287



Index 483

Cigarettes and Other Tobacco Products (COPTA) Act, India, 434 civil servant's social insurance institute (CAJANAL), Columbia, 132 Clinical Commission Groups (CCGs), England, Clinical Establishments Act 2010, India, 433 CNPM regulatory agency, Columbia, 150 Code of Health and Disability Services Consumers' Rights, New Zealand, 20 Code of Rights and Commissioner, New Zealand, 28, 30-34 COIDA. See Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act, South Africa Columbia, 460-461 civil servant's social insurance institute (CAJANAL), 132 CNPM regulatory agency in, 150 Entidades Promotoras de Salud (EPS), 135 exclude health services, constitutional court's precedent, 142-144 Fondo de Solidaridad y Garantía (FOSYGA), 135-137 GES health managing companies, 155-156 health care as right, Tutela claim and constitutional court, 139-140 health care as right vs. system in, 131 health care sector constitutional and legal framework, 137-140 health care system, before 1993 reform, 132 judicial institutions, health care overhaul overlap in, 131, 149-158 Law 100 of 1993, 132-134, 135-137, 153-158 litigation trends in, 140-149 map rights and duties in, 151-153 Mi Plan health care services, 156 National Constituent Assembly (NCA), 1991 Constitution, 137-139 National Social Security Health Board CNSSS, 143-144 pharmaceuticalization of public health care system in, 149-151 reform bills 2013-2014, 155-158 right-to-health litigation, conflict resolution deficit in, 140-142 right-to-health litigation escalation, 144-146 Salud Mia, 155-156 Scientific Technical committees (CTC) in, social experimentation and health care reform in, 153-158 Social Insurance Institute (ISS), 132 SU-480 ruling, 143

Tutela claims, 139-141, 144-146 Unidad de Pago por Capitación (UPC), 136-137 Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act (COIDA), South Africa, 312 Compulsory Psychiatric Act, Sweden, 67, 74–75 Condliff v. North Staffordshire PCT, England, 122 constitutional rights. See domestic constitutional Consumer Protection Act, 1986, India, 432-433 co-payments Hungary, 214, 215–216, 222–223, 227–231, 234 Israel, 162, 177-178 judicial engagment and, 478, 479 Netherlands, 203 New Zealand, 21-22, 26 Taiwan, 240 COPTA. Cigarettes and Other Tobacco Products Act India countries, overview with public/private health care systems, 6, 464-468 with public/tax-finance health care, 5, 455-459 with social health insurance, 5-6, 459-464 Crusade against Tobacco v. Union of India and Others, 448-449 Cruz Bermudez et al., Venezuela, 413 CTC. See Scientific Technical committees, Columbia

de facto rights, 10
Decreto-Ley sobre Costos y Precios Justos,
Venezuela, 404–405
Deskin-Wynberg case, Canada, 101–102
DHBs. See District Health Boards, New Zealand
Discrimination Act, Sweden, 54, 65
District Health Boards (DHBs), New Zealand,
22–24
Doha Declaration, World Trade Organization, 8
domestic constitutional rights, 5, 9
Draft Charter on the Private and Public Health
Sectors in the Republic of South Africa, 304

ECHR. European Court on Human Rights Egypt, privatization of health care system in, 7 EHBs. See Essential Health Benefits, U.S. Eldrige v. British Columbia, Canada, 89–90, 105–106 Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA), U.S., 352 Employment Insurance Act, Taiwan, 248 Enforcement Rules of the National Health Insurance Act (NHI Rules), Taiwan, 249

T-760/08, 146-149



484 Index

England, 458-459 access, equity, avoidable illness in, 126-127 Atlas of NHS services, 111 Clinical Commission Groups (CCGs), 100 clinical need and social circumstance in, 121-122 community and individual interests balancing comprehensive health service promotion in, Condliff v. North Staffordshire PCT, 122 ECHR, ECJ impact, 122-124 Equality Act 2010, 127-128 equity issues, regional and demographic variations, 110-112 ex p A, D & G case, 119 judicial review, hard look, 118-121, 125 judicial review, private organizations regulation, 126 judicial review, weak look, 118 litigation, hard look procedural rights in, 117-124 litigation vs. equality in, 124-128 local health commissioners in, 109 National Assistance Act 1948, 117 National Commissioning Board, 110 National Health Service Act 2006, 112-113 National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE), 110 NHS Constitution, 114-115 NHS financing, access, 107-112 NHS founding in, 107 NHS legal documents, 112-117 NHS market for services, 109-110 NHS vs. social care in, 117 Patients who wish to Pay for Additional Care (NHS), 116

Primary Care Trusts (PCTs), 109, 114–115 private care payment in, 115–117 private organizations regulation, 126 regulations, directions and guidance for NHS Act 2006, 113

social, economic rights recognition in, 127–128 specialist care in, 110

Technology Appraisal Guidance (TAG), 110, 114

Entidades Promotoras de Salud (EPS), Columbia, 135

Epidemic Diseases Act, 1897, India, 433 EPS. See Entidades Promotoras de Salud,

Columbia

Equal Treatment Authority (ETA), Hungary, 231–232

Equality Act 2010, England, 127–128 Equality Ombudsman, Sweden, 65–66, 72–74 ERISA. See Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974, U.S.

Essential Health Benefits, U.S., 363 ETA. See Equal Treatment Authority, Hungary EU (European Union)

Central, Eastern European members legacy regimes and, 208–209

EU (European Union) law

access to treatment and, 123, 457, 463 court interventions and, 469 individual relief and, 469, 471 Swedish health care and, 68–70, 457

European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental freedoms, 57–58

European Court of Human Rights (ECHR), 58, 77, 122–124, 201

European Court of Justice (ECJ), 122–124 ex p A, D & G, England, 119

Family Health Program, Brazil, 327–328 Festus Odafe v. Attorney General of the Federation and 3 Ors, Nigeria, 390–391 Flora v. Ontario Health Insurance Plan, Canada,

88

FMV. See Medical Federation of Venezuela, Venezuela

Fondo de Solidaridad y Garantía (FOSYGA), Columbia, 135–137 FOSYGA. See Fondo de Solidaridad y Garantía,

FOSYGA. See Fondo de Solidaridad y Garantia, Columbia Framework Convention on Tobacco Control, 8

Francis Coralie Mullin v. The Administrator, Union Territory of Delhi, India, 432 Fundamental Law of Hungary, 218–219

Gear. See Growth, Employment and Redistribution, South Africa German Constitutional Court, 139 GES health managing companies, Columbia, 155–156

Gosselin v. Quebec, Canada, 87–88 Government of the Republic of South Africa & Others v. Irene Grootboom & Others,

307–308 Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR), South Africa, 296–297

HCJ. High Court of Justice Israel, petitions against government

Health and Medical Services Act (HMSA), Sweden, 52, 55, 58–66

Health and National Public Health System Act, Venezuela, 406–407

Health and Social Care Inspectorate (HSCI), Sweden, 55, 70–72



> Index 485

health care rights, sources de facto rights, 10 domestic constitutional rights and, 9 international, 7-9 statutory rights, 9-10 health care rights, themes constitutional recognition of, 5, 9 equal access and, 451-453 health care rights and, 1-2 human rights law, 1-2 individual vs. structural claims, 474-478 justiciability, access to justice impact on, law and politics intersection, 473-474 legal instruments, regulation of access, 11-12 litigation, consequences of, 12 litigation, types of, 12 reasonableness standard, 475–477 rights impact on, 470-471 rights litigation vs. resource allocation, 472-473 state sovereignty and, 9 health care spending, per capital globally, 4-5 Health Community Agents Program, Brazil, 327-328 Health Council, Israel, 167 Health Insurance Act (Ziekendfondswet) 1996, Netherlands, 189-190 Health Insurance Act (Zorgverkezeringswet), 2006 Netherlands, 190, 196-199, 200-202 Health Insurance Fund (HIF), Hungary, 210-212, 218-223, 234 Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA), U. S., 352-354 Health Insurance Supervisory Authority (HISA), Hungary, 229-231, 233-234 Health Services Basket (HSB), Israel, 159-160, 161-162, 168-170 High Court of Justice (HCJ) Israel, petitions against government, 171-176 HIPAA. See Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act, U. S. HISA. See Health Insurance Supervisory Authority, Hungary HMSA. See Health and Medical Services Act, Sweden Hospital Provision Act (HPZ), Netherlands, HPZ. See Hospital Provision Act, Netherlands HSB. See Health Services Basket, Israel HSCI. See Health and Social Care Inspectorate, Human Rights Act 1993, New Zealand, 29 Human Rights Plan, China, 282 Hungary, 463-464 basic package (HIF), 220-221

civil lawsuits in, 232-233 Commissioner for Fundamental Rights, ombudsman, 226-229 constitutional health care rights in, 218-219 constitutional litigation in, 224-226 co-payments, 214, 215-216, 222-223, 234 Equal Treatment Authority (ETA), 231–232 equity issues at public-private intersection, 215-217, 224-235 Fundamental Law of Hungary, 218-219 government health care system reforms in, 212-213 health care system features, 209-217, 234 health care system organization, financing, Health Insurance Fund (HIF), 210-212, 218-223, Health Insurance Supervisory Authority (HISA), 229-231, 233-234 health spending in, 212 informal payments challenge in, 216-217, 233-234 insurance package (HIF), 221-223 National Health Insurance Fund (NHIF), 210, 215, 228–229 non-contracted private providers in, 214-215 Parliamentary Act LXXXIII of 1997, 215 Parliamentary Act XCVI of 1993 on Voluntary Mutual Insurance Funds, 213–214 private for-profit health insurance in, 213-214 right to health, scope and content, 217-223 subsidized services in, 221-222 supplementary package (HIF), 223 technology, 26, 212 II/1972 Health Act, 217-218 IACHR. See Inter-American Commission on Human Rights Economic, Social and Cultural Rights law, 445



486 Index

India (cont.) Insurance Activity Act, Venezuela, 407 Crusade against Tobacco v. Union of India and Inter-American Commission on Human Rights Others, 448-449 (IACHR), 401 Epidemic Diseases Act, 1897, 433 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Francis Coralie Mullin v. The Administrator, Cultural Rights (ICESCR), 7-8, 166, Union Territory of Delhi, 432 194-195, 270, 406, 429-430 international law. See also specific laws, treaties future prospects, Five Year Plan, 428-429 health financing litigation in, 439-442 and conventions health, health care system in, 424-429 global standards, health rights approach and, HIV/AIDS in, 425, 428-429, 442-446 471 international right to health obligations of, preferential treatment and, 205 progressive realization principle and, 174, 308 429-431 KS Gopinath v. Union of India, 437-438 reasonableness standard, core obligations and, Life Insurance Corporation of India v. Consumer Education and Research Centre, state sovereignty, domestic law vs., 430-431 IoG. See Instrument of Government, Sweden 441-442 Lucy D'Souza v. State of Goa and Ors., 442-443 Israel, 461-463 Malick Brothers case, 435 access to drugs, services not provided, 168-176 Medical Termination of Pregnancy Act, 1971 Basic Law: Human Dignity and Liberty, (MTP Act), 434 165-166 Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), 426 co-payments, 162, 177-178 Mr. X v. Hospital Z, 443 co-payments issues, 177–178 Mullin case, 436 discrimination among residents in, 181-182 Murli Deora v. Union of India and Ors, 448 discrimination based on residency rights in, Naz Foundation v. Union of India, 444 182–183 non-discrimination litigation in, 442-446 financing/updates, structural issues, 167 out-of-pocket payments in, 427-428 Health Council, 167 Paschim Banga Khet Mazdoor Samiti v. State of health rights litigation in, 166-183 West Bengal, 437 Health Services Basket (HSB), 159-160, Pre-conception and Pre-natal Diagnostics 161–162, 168–170 Techniques Act, 1994 (PCPNDT Act), 434 High Court of Justice (HCJ) petitions against Pt. Paramanada Katara v. Union of India, government in, 171-176 Kiryati ruling, 178–181 436-437 public health, tobacco use litigation, 448-449 labor courts, claims against Sick Funds, 168–171 legal framework for health rights in, 165-166 Public Interest Litigation (PIL), 434-435, Luzon case, 171–176 public sector health care funding in, 427 National Health Insurance Law, 9 right to health, constitutional obligation, National Health Insurance Law (NHIL) creation, 159-160 431-432 right to health, judiciary role, 434-449 neo-liberal reforms, health services funding, right to health, statutory obligations, 432-434 162-164 right to life guarantee in, 388-389 in Occupied Territories, 164–165 Sahara House v. Union of India and Ors, 439 Patient Rights Law, o Social Jurist, A Lawyer's Group v. Government Patient's Right Law 1996, 166 of NCT, 437 in personam scope of coverage in, 164-165 State of Punjab v. Mohinder Singh Chawla, 440 Private Health Services (PHS), 178-181 State of Punjab v. Ram Lubhaya Bagga, private vs. public health care system funding in, 440-441 Suchita Srivastava and Anr. v. Chandigarh right-to-health in, 163–164 Administration, 446–447 role of rights, assessment, 183–187 Vincent Panikurlangara v. Union of India, 435 Sick Funds, 159-160, 162 Vishaka v. State of Ragasthan, 430-431 Israeli v. Committee for the Expansion of the women's right to health in, 446-448 Health Basket, 15-16

Instrument of Government (IoG), Sweden, 53, 56

ISS. See Social Insurance Institute, Columbia



Index 487

J. Y. Interpretation No. 473, Taiwan, 248–252 J. Y. Interpretation No. 476, Taiwan, 248–252 J. Y. Interpretation No. 524, Taiwan, 253–256 Jonah Ghemre v. Shell Petroleum Development Co. Nigeria and 2 Ors, Nigeria, 389–390

J. Y. Interpretation No. 472, Taiwan, 244-248

Kiryati ruling, Israel, 178–181 KS Gopinath v. Union of India, 437–438

Lalonde v. Ontario, Canada, 86 Law 100 of 1993, Columbia, 132–134, 135–137, 153–158

Law v. Canada, 88

Laxmi Mandal v. Deen Dayal Harinagar, India, 448

Lex Maria law, Sweden, 71 Lex Sarah law, Sweden, 71–72

Life Insurance Corporation of India v. Consumer Education and Research Centre, 441–442

Lucy D'Souza v. State of Goa and Ors., India, 442–443

Luzon case, Israel, 171-176

Malick Brothers case, India, 435 Mazibuko and Others v City of Johannesburg and Others, South Africa, 315–316

Medical Federation of Venezuela (FMV), Venezuela, 414–415

Medical Responsibility Board (MRB), Sweden, 55 Medical Schemes Act, South Africa, 297–298, 304, 310–311

Medical Termination of Pregnancy Act, 1971 (MTP Act), India, 434

Medicare, Medicaid in United States (U.S.), 348–349, 351–352

Medicare Protection Act, British Columbia Canada, 96, 99

Mi Plan health care services, Columbia, 156 Minister of Health & Another v. New Clicks South Africa (Pty) Ltd & Others, 310–311

Minister of Health and Another v. Treatment Action Campaign and Others, South Africa, 308–310

Misión Barrio Adentro, Venezuela, 400–402 mother to child transmission (MTCT) prevention program, South Africa, 301

Mr. X v. Hospital Z, India, 443

MRB. See Medical Responsibility Board, Sweden

MTCT. See mother to child transmission prevention program, South Africa

MTP Act, India. See Medical Termination of Pregnancy Act, 1971, India

Müller-Fauré (ECJ) case, 200

Mullin case, India, 436 Murli Deora v. Union of India and Ors, 448

National Assistance Act 1948, England, 117 National Board of Health and Welfare (NBHW), Sweden, 55, 70–72

National Commissioning Board, England, 110 National Constituent Assembly (NCA), 1991 Constitution Columbia, 137–139

National Department of Health, South Africa,

National Health Act, South Africa, 297, 303 National Health Bill 2011, Nigeria, 372

National Health Committee, New Zealand, 26 National Health Insurance (NHI), South Africa, 304–305

National Health Insurance (NHI), Taiwan, 236–237

National Health Insurance Act (NHI Act), Taiwan, 237–238

National Health Insurance Fund (NHIF), Hungary, 210, 215, 228–229

National Health Insurance Fund, South Africa, 294

National Health Insurance Law (NHIL), Israel, 9, 159–160

National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS), Nigeria, 374–379

National Health Service Act 2006, England, 112–113

National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (NICE), England, 110

National List of Essential Medicines (RENAME), Brazil, 334–335

National Social Security Health Board CNSSS, Columbia, 143–144

Naz Foundation v. Union of India, 444 NBHW. See National Board of Health and Welfare, Sweden

NCA. See National Constituent Assembly, 1991 Constitution Columbia

NCMS. See New Cooperative Medical System, China

Netherlands, 463

AWBZ health-scheme, 190–191, 199, 203–205 Centrale Raad van Berop (CRvB), 203–205 constitutional right to health care in, 194–196 co-payments, 203

dual approach inequalities, 190

Dutch health care history, main characteristics, 189–193

health care access enforcement, 199–205 health care access regulation in, 194–199 health care entitlements in, 196–199



488 Index

Netherlands (cont.) technology, 26 health care providers in, 191-193 2001 Primary Health Care Strategy, 26 Health Insurance Act (Ziekendfondswet) 1996, 2006/2007 Health Survey, 27 Walsh v. Pharmac, 41-50 180-100 Health Insurance Act (Zorgverkezeringswet) NHI. See National Health Insurance, South 2006, 190, 196-199, 200-202 Africa; National Health Insurance, Taiwan Hospital Provision Act (HPZ), 191-192 NHIL. See National Health Insurance Law, Israel human rights and international social security NHIS. See National Health Insurance Scheme, law reliance in, 203-205 Nigeria judicial decisions, review in, 188-189, 206-207 Nigeria, 466-467 Abacha v. Fawehinmi, 385, 386 long term care in, 199 price liberalization in, 193 African Charter on Human and People's Rights Sentges v. the Netherlands, 201-202 (African Charter) and, 382-387 2006 Health Insurance Act, 10 Azubike v. Attorney General of the Federation voluntary health insurance (VHI) in, 191 and 3 Ors, 390 New Cooperative Medical System (NCMS), constitutional recognition of right to health in, China, 265-266 381-382 New Zealand, 457 constitutional responsibility for health care in, access to justice in, 30 Accident Compensation Act 2001, 29 constitutional rights legislation in, 391-392 allocation decisions in, 20-28 democratic accountability, political legitimacy Auckland Area Health Board v Attorney-General in, 393 (AAHB), 38-40 domestic enforcement in, 385-387 Festus Odafe v. Attorney General of the budget allocation, District Health Boards Federation and 3 Ors, 390-391 (DHBs), 22-24 Code of Health and Disability Services health care organization, financing in, 374-379 Consumers' Rights, 20 health-related litigation in, 373 Code of Rights, Commissioner, 30-34 heath rights legal architecture, 379-382 co-payments, 21-22, 26 Jonah Gbemre v. Shell Petroleum Development elective surgery booking system in, 24-26 Co. Nigeria and 2 Ors, 389-390 evidence-based clinical guidelines in, 26 National Health Bill 2011, 372 government reforms, spending, 26 National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIS), health status disparities in, 27-28 Human Rights Act 1993, 29 Nigeria Demographic and Health Survey 2008, legal structure, 28-35 National Health Committee, 26 Ogugu v. State, 385 New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990, 29-30 Oruk Anam L.G. v. Ikpa, 385 Revised National Health Policy, 372 New Zealand Guidelines Group, 26 New Zealand Public Health and Disability Act right to health protection, enforcement 2000, 28–29 frameworks in, 382-391 patient-led litigation against health authorities right to life guarantee in, 387–391 Social and Economic Rights Action Centre in, 19, 34-35 percent of GDP spending on health, 20–21 (SERAC) v. Nigeria, 384-385 Pharmac, 21-22, 29, 41-49 WHO Report of the Commission on pharmaceutical spending in, 21-22 Macroeconomics and Health, 371-372 1998 Health Act, Venezuela, 407 Pharmacology and Therapeutics Advisory Committee (PTAC), 21 NOBs. See Normas Operacionais Básicas, Brazil Primary Health Care Strategy, 27 Normas Operacionais Básicas (NOBs), Brazil, 334 primary, secondary care in, 21 Novartis AG v. Union of India, 438-439 rationing decisions, legal challenges to, 35-49 Shortland v Northland Health Ltd., 30, 36-41, Occupational Diseases in Mines and Works Act (ODIMWA), South Africa, 312-313 South Auckland Health, 36 ODIMWA. See Occupational Diseases in Mines

and Works Act

supply vs. demand mismatch, 26-27



Index 489

Ogugu v. State, Nigeria, 385 Ontario Human Rights Code, Canada, 91 Oruk Anam L.G. v. Ikpa, Nigeria, 385

Parliamentary Act LXXXIII of 1997, Hungary, 215

Parliamentary Act XCVI of 1993 on Voluntary Mutual Insurance Funds, Hungary, 213–214 Paschim Banga Khet Mazdoor Samiti v. State of

West Bengal, India, 437 Patient Injury Act, Sweden, 63–64 Patient Injury Board, Sweden, 63

Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act (PPACA), U.S., 346–347, 360–369, 467–468

Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act, Taiwan, 245

Patient Rights Law, Israel, 9 Patient Safety Act, Sweden, 64–65

Patient's Right Law 1996, Israel, 166

Patients who wish to Pay for Additional Care (NHS), England, 116

PCPNDT Act, India. See Pre-conception and Pre-natal Diagnostics Techniques Act, 1994, India

PCTs. See Primary Care Trusts, England Pharmac, New Zealand, 21–22, 29, 41–49

Pharmacology and Therapeutics Advisory Committee (PTAC), New Zealand, 21

PHS. See Private Health Services, Israel PIL. See Public Interest Litigation, India PPACA. See Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act, U.S.

Pre-conception and Pre-natal Diagnostics
Techniques Act, 1994 (PCPNDT Act), India,

Primary Care Trusts (PCTs), England, 109, 114–115

Primary Health Care Strategy, New Zealand, 27 Private Health Services (PHS), Israel, 178–181 Professional Doctor's Law, China, 272

Program for Primary Care, Brazil, 328

Pt. Paramanada Katara v. Union of India, 436–437 PTAC. See Pharmacology and Therapeutics Advisory Committee, New Zealand

Public Finance Management Act, South Africa, 297

Public Interest Litigation (PIL), India, 434–435, 449–450

R. v. Morgentaler, Canada, 92–94 RDP. See Reconstruction and Development Program, South Africa Reconstruction and Development Program (RDP), South Africa, 290 Regulations for National Health Insurance Medical Care (NHI Regulations), Taiwan, 253

RENAME. See National List of Essential Medicines, Brazil

Revised National Health Policy, Nigeria, 372 rights to health and health care re-emergence since 1990s, contributing factors, 2–4 Rodriguez v. British Columbia, Canada, 102–103

Sahara House v. Union of India and Ors, India,

Salud Mia, Columbia, 155–156 Sanitarist Movement, Brazil, 327

Scientific Technical committees (CTC), Columbia, 132–134

Sentges v. the Netherlands, 201-202

SERAC case, Nigeria. See Social and Economic Rights Action Centre v. Nigeria

Shortland v Northland Health Ltd., New Zealand, 30, 36–41, 49

Sick Funds, Israel, 159–160, 162, 168–171 Sistema Único de Saúde (SUS). See Unified System of Health Care, Brazil

Smits-Peerboms (ECJ) case, 200

Social and Economic Rights Action Centre (SERAC) v. Nigeria, 384–385

Social Democratic Party, Sweden, 57 Social Insurance Institute (ISS), Columbia,

Social Insurance Law, China, 271–273 Social Jurist, A Lawyer's Group v. Government of NCT, India, 437

South Africa

apartheid-, post-apartheid era transformation, 289–292

black empowerment process (BEE), 304 Compensation for Occupational Injuries and Diseases Act (COIDA), 312

constitutional right to access litigation, 305–311 constitutional rights, 301–303

Draft Charter on the Private and Public Health Sectors in the Republic of South Africa, 304

fee structure, means test, 294–295 Government of the Republic of South Africa & Others v. Irene Grootboom & Others, 307–308

Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR), 296–297

health care equity in, 288, 317–318

health care systems financing, 294–297

health care systems in, 289–301 health, health care transformation progress in,

298–301

legal entrenchment, 301-313, 317



490 Index

South Africa (cont.) litigation impact on health equity assessment, Mazibuko and Others v. City of Johannesburg and Others, 315-316 Medical Schemes Act, 297-298, 304, 310-311 Minister of Health & Another v. New Clicks South Africa (Pty) Ltd & Others, 310-311 Minister of Health and Another v. Treatment Action Campaign and Others, South Africa, mother to child transmission (MTCT) prevention program, 301 National Department of Health, 292-293 National Health Act, 297, 303 National Health Insurance (NHI), 304-305 National Health Insurance Fund, 294 other health-related constitutional rights litigation examples in, 311-313 persistent deficiencies in, 299-300 prescribed baskets of services, 297-298 private health care system funding, 293-294 Public Finance Management Act, 297 public, private health care systems, 292-294 public-sector dependency in, 293 Reconstruction and Development Program (RDP), 290 regressive outcomes, HIV/AIDS health indicators, 300-301 Section 27 based legislation, 303-305 Thiagraj Soobramoney v. Minister of Health (Kwa-Zulu Natal), 306-307 Treatment Action Campaign (TAC), 16, 309, 314-316, 465 Van Biljon & Others v. Minister of Correctional Services and Others, 306 White Paper for the Transformation of the Health System in South Africa, 290-291 South Auckland Health, New Zealand, 36 State of Punjab v. Mohinder Singh Chawla, India, 440 State of Punjab v. Ram Lubhaya Bagga, India, 440-441 state sovereignty, 9 statutory rights, 9-10 Stein v. Quebec, Canada, 86 SU-480 ruling, Columbia, 143 Suchita Srivastava and Anr. v. Chandigarh Administration, India, 446-447 Supreme Tribunal of Justice (TSJ), Venezuela, SUS. See Unified System of Health Care, Brazil Sweden, 456-457 Act on Social Care, 75-76

administrative law and health care in, 66-68 Association of Gynaecologists, 66 Association of Patient Insurers, 64 care guarantee, 60-62 collective vs. individual care rights in, 75-76 complaints from individuals relating to health care in, 70-71 Compulsory Psychiatric Act, 67, 74-75 Discrimination Act, 54, 65 Equality Ombudsman, 65-66, 72-74 EU law and health care in, 68-70, 77 free choice reform, 62-63 Health and Medical Services Act (HMSA), 52, 55, 58–66 Health and Social Care Inspectorate (HSCI), 55, 70-72 health care basic features, 53-56 health care provider choice in, 64-66 health care sector growth in, 51-52 health care spending in, 51 historical legislative reluctance in, 77-78 Instrument of Government (IoG), 53, 56 international agreements, 57 legal structure, constitutional perspectives, 56-58 Lex Maria law, 71 Lex Sarah law, 71-72 litigation and health care in, 66-76 local governance and, 53-54 National Board of Health and Welfare (NBHW), 55, 70-72 Patient Injury Act, 63-64 Patient Injury Board, 63 patient needs focus in, 54 Patient Safety Act, 64-65 patients' rights reforms in, 60-66 population demographics, 51 private health insurance in, 75-76 rights to health care in, 52 shared responsibility for health care rights in, Social Democratic Party influence, 57 state health care agencies in, 55 Swedish Agency for Health and Care Services Analysis, 55-56 Swedish Social Insurance Agency, 69 towards universal right-to-health in, 74-75 Treaty of the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) and, 68–70 vulnerable groups, recent proposals, 74-75

T-760/08, Columbia, 146–149 TAC. See Treatment Action Campaign



Index 491

TAG. See Technology Appraisal Guidance,	Tutela claims, Columbia, 139–141, 144–146
England	II/1972 Health Act, Hungary, 217–218
Taiwan, 461	2001 Primary Health Care Strategy, New Zealand,
access-to-health, constitutional framework,	26
243-244	2006/2007 Health Survey, New Zealand, 27
access-to-health, constitutional interpretations,	2006 Health Insurance Act, Netherlands, 10
244-259 D (N 1 H. h. (DNHH)	HDHD C H : 1D 1 : (H
Bureau of National Health Insurance (BNHI),	UDHR. See Universal Declaration of Human
238	Rights
compulsory enrollment in, 244–248	UEBMI. See Urban Employee Basic Medical
co-payments, 240	Insurance, China
co-payments in, 240	UN CEDAW Article 12(2), 8
Employment Insurance Act, 248	UN Commission on Human Rights, 8
Enforcement Rules of the National Health	UN Committee on Economic, Social and
Insurance Act (NHI Rules), 249	Cultural Rights, 8
health care delivery system, financing, 239–241	UN Millennium Development Goal 5, 8
health care delivery system in, 238–239	Unidad de Pago por Capitación (UPC),
health care system overview, 237–243	Columbia, 136–137
health insurance utilization in, 238	Unified System of Health Care (SUS), Brazil, 319,
J. Y. Interpretation No. 472, 244–248	320–330
J. Y. Interpretation No. 473, 248–252	United Kingdom (UK). See England
J. Y. Interpretation No. 476, 248–252	United States (U.S.)
J. Y. Interpretation No. 524, 253–256	Brown v. Plata, 356
minimum presumed insurable income in,	consitutional right to health care in, 355–357
248–249, 252	Employee Retirement Income Security Act of
national health care expenditure growth in, 241	1974 (ERISA), 352
National Health Insurance (NHI),	Essential Health Benefits (EHBs), 363
constitutional interpretation, 236–237	Health Insurance Portability and
National Health Insurance Act (NHI Act),	Accountability Act (HIPAA), 352–354
237–238	health reform, renewed opportunity for right to
NHI benefit package, 241–242, 253–256	health care in, 360–365
Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act, 245	insurance fragmentation, inequitable access to
policy, law reform in, 242–243	health care in, 348–354
private insurance policies in, 240–241	judiciary role, right to health care, 355–360
Regulations for National Health Insurance	legal challenges to PPACA, 365–368
Medical Care (NHI Regulations), 253	litigation vs. legislative change in, 346
resources allocation in, 241	Medicare, Medicaid in, 348–349, 351–352
technology, 253–256	new mandated benefits, cost-sharing limits,
technology	362–364
Hungary, 26, 212	Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act
New Zealand, 26	(PPACA), 346–347, 360–369, 467–468
Taiwan, 253–256	private benefits, eligibility regulation in,
Technology Appraisal Guidance (TAG),	352-354
England, 110, 114	private rights of action limitations in, 357–360
TFEI. See Treaty of the Functioning of the	public benefits, eligibility regulation in, 351–352
European Union	public opinion consensus building for PPACA
Thiagraj Soobramoney v. Minister of Health	in, 368–369
(Kwa-Zulu Natal), South Africa, 306–307	regulatory fragmentation in, 350–354
Toronto Star, 81	right to health care in, 345
Treatment Action Campaign (TAC), South	structural fragmentation in, 348–350
Africa, 16, 309, 314–316, 465	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
Treaty of the Functioning of the European Union	(UDHR), 2, 7
(TFEU), 68–70	UPC. See Unidad de Pago por Capitación,

Columbia

TSJ. See Supreme Tribunal of Justice, Venezuela



492 Index

Urban Employee Basic Medical Insurance (UEBMI), China, 266 Urban Resident Basic Medical Insurance (URBMI), China, 266 URBMI. See Urban Resident Basic Medical Insurance, China

Van Biljon & Others v. Minister of Correctional Services and Others, South Africa, 306 Venezuela

Cruz Bermudez et al., 413
Decreto-Ley sobre Costos y Precios Justos, 404–405
expenditures on health care in, 395–396
Health and National Public Health System Act, 406–407
health care facilities in, 397

health care indicators, 395–396 health care rights litigation, amparos in, 408–420 health care system deficiencies in, 395–396

health care system regulation in, 415–416 HIV/AIDS litigation in, 413–414, 420–421 HIV/AIDS treatment in, 395 inadequate health care access in, 416–417 information on public health in, 417–419 Insurance Activity Act, 407 judicial independence in, 409–412

medical equipment lack in, 416–417 Medical Federation of Venezuela (FMV),

414–415 Misión Barrio Adentro, 400–402 1998 Health Act, 407 pharmaceutical regulation in, 420 private health care systems in, 402–405, 419 progressive constitutional regulation of right to health in, 405–406 public health system structure, functioning, 397–402 right to health justiciability in, 414–415 right to health litigation impact, 394, 420–422 social, political transformation in, 394 statutory protection of right to health in, 406–408

Supreme Tribunal of Justice (TSJ), 394–395 Venezuelan Institute of Social Security (IVSS), 402

WHO 2011 World Statistics Report, 396 VHI health-scheme, Netherlands, 191 Vincent Panikurlangara v. Union of India, 435 Vishaka v. State of Ragasthan, India, 430–431

"White Paper for the Transformation of the Health System in South Africa," 290–291 WHO 2011 World Statistics Report, Venezuela, 396 WHO Brazil report, 321 WHO Report of the Commission on

Walsh v. Pharmac, New Zealand, 41-50

VHO Report of the Commission on Macroeconomics and Health, Nigeria, 371–372

Winnipeg Regional Health Authority's Home Care program, Canada, 81 WTO, Doha Declaration, 8

Ziekendfondswet, Netherlands, 189–190 Zorgverkezeringswet, Netherlands, 1–2, 190, 196–199, 200–202