

THE RIGHT TO HEALTH AT THE PUBLIC/PRIVATE DIVIDE

Through a comparative global study of countries from all continents representing a diversity of health, legal, political, and economic systems, this book explores the role of health rights to advance greater equality through access to health care. Does pursuing a right to health care promote equality, or does it in fact advance the opposite result? Does inserting the idea of "the right to health" into health systems allow the reinsertion of public values into systems that are undergoing privatization? Or does it allow for private claims to be rearticulated as "rights," in a way that actually reinforces inequality? This volume includes studies from countries such as the United States, the United Kingdom, Brazil, Canada, the Netherlands, China, and Nigeria, as well as authors with expertise regarding both the legal and health systems of their countries, making this a seminal study that allows readers to see the differing role of rights in various health systems.

Colleen M. Flood is a Professor and Canada Research Chair at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, and is cross-appointed to the School of Public Policy and the Institute of Health Policy, Management, and Evaluation.

Aeyal Gross is an Associate Professor in Tel-Aviv University's Faculty of Law. He is also a Visiting Reader at the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London.





The Right to Health at the Public/Private Divide

A GLOBAL COMPARATIVE STUDY

Edited by

COLLEEN M. FLOOD

University of Toronto, Faculty of Law and The School of Public Policy

AEYAL GROSS

Tel-Aviv University, Faculty of Law





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107038301

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

The right to health at the public/private divide : a global comparative study / Colleen M. Flood, University of Toronto, Faculty of Law; Aeyal Gross, Tel-Aviv University, Faculty of Law.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03830-1 (hardback)

Medical care – Law and legislation.
 Right to health. I. Flood, Colleen M., editor of compilation.
 Gross, Aeyal, editor of compilation.

K3601.R525 2014

362.1-dc23 2013042458

ISBN 978-1-107-03830-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Contributors		page ix
Ack	nowledgments	xvii
	oduction: Marrying Human Rights and Health Care Systems: ntexts for a Power to Improve Access and Equity Colleen M. Flood and Aeyal Gross	1
	PART I: NATIONAL PUBLIC HEALTH SYSTEMS (TAX FINANCED)	
1.	Litigating a Right to Health Care in New Zealand Joanna Manning	19
2.	The Right to Health in Sweden Anna-Sara Lind	51
3.	Litigating Health Rights in Canada: A White Knight for Equity? Colleen M. Flood	79
4.	Promoting Access and Equity in Health: Assessing the National Health Service in England Christopher Newdick	107
	PART II: SOCIAL HEALTH INSURANCE SYSTEMS	
5.	Colombia's Right-to-Health Litigation in a Context of Health Care Reform Everaldo Lamprea	131



vi	Contents	
6.	The Right to Health in Israel between Solidarity and Neoliberalism Aeyal Gross	159
7•	Health Care Access in the Netherlands: A True Story André den Exter	188
8.	Addressing Equity in Health Care at the Public-Private Intersection: The Role of Health Rights Enforcement in Hungary Mária Éva Földes	208
9.	Lending a Helping Hand: The Impact of Constitutional Interpretation on Taiwan's National Health Insurance Program, Health Equity, and Distributive Justice Y. Y. Brandon Chen	236
	PART III: MIXED PRIVATE/PUBLIC SYSTEMS	
10.	Health Rights at the Juncture between State and Market: The People's Republic of China Christina S. Ho	263
11.	The Role of Rights and Litigation in Assuring More Equitable Access to Health Care in South Africa Lisa Forman and Jerome Amir Singh	288
12.	Provision of Health Care Services and the Right to Health in Brazil: The Long, Winding, and Uncertain Road to Equality Mariana Mota Prado	319
13.	A Vision of an Emerging Right to Health Care in the United States: Expanding Health Care Equity through Legislative Reform Allison K. Hoffman	345
14.	The Legal Protection and Enforcement of Health Rights in Nigeria Remigius N. Nwabueze	371
15.	Litigating the Right to Health in Venezuela: A Nonjusticiable (?) Right in the Context of a Deficient Health Care System Oscar A. Cabrera and Fanny Gómez	394



	Contents	vii
16.	Right to Health: Addressing Inequities through Litigation in India Anand Grover, Maitreyi Misra, and Lubhyathi Rangarajan	423
Conclusion: Contexts for the Promise and Peril of the Right to Health Colleen M. Flood and Aeyal Gross		451
Inda	py	481





Contributors

Oscar A. Cabrera is the Executive Director of the O'Neill Institute for National and Global Health Law and Visiting Professor of Law at Georgetown University Law Center. In Venezuela, Oscar worked as an Associate at a Venezuelan law firm (d'Empaire Reyna Bermúdez). After earning his LLM at the University of Toronto, he worked as a Research Associate with Professor Colleen M. Flood, at the University of Toronto, Faculty of Law, and the Institute of Health Services and Policy Research (CIHR-IHSPR). Oscar has worked on projects with the World Health Organization, the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, and the Campaign for Tobacco-Free Kids, among other organizations. His research interests focus on health and human rights, sexual and reproductive rights, global tobacco litigation and health systems law and policy. Oscar holds a law degree from his home country of Venezuela (Universidad Católica Andrés Bello, Caracas) and a LLM, with concentration in Health Law and Policy, from the University of Toronto (he was awarded a Canadian Institutes of Health Research Health Law and Policy Fellowship to attend this program).

Y. Y. Brandon Chen is an SJD candidate at the University of Toronto, Faculty of Law. He is currently a Vanier Canada Graduate Scholar and a Canadian Institutes of Health Research Fellow in Health Law, Ethics and Policy. Between 2012 and 2013, he was also named a Lupina Senior Doctor Fellow in the Comparative Program on Health and Society. Y. Y. holds a BSc from Emory University as well as MSW and JD degrees from the University of Toronto. He worked at the Canadian Civil Liberties Association from 2010 to 2011 as a Law Foundation of Ontario Public Interest Articling Fellow and was called to the Bar of Ontario in 2011. Y. Y.'s current research explores the intersection of global justice with health law and policy and examines topics such as medical tourism and international migrants' health care entitlement in developed countries.



X

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-03830-1 - The Right to Health at the Public/Private Divide: A Global Comparative Study Edited by Colleen M. Flood and Aeyal Gross Frontmatter More information

Contributors

André den Exter is a Lecturer in Health Law at the Institute of Health Policy and Management, Erasmus University Rotterdam, the Netherlands. Since returning to Erasmus University Rotterdam in 2008, his research has focused on international and European health law. The title of his dissertation was "Health Care Law-making in Central and Eastern Europe: Review of a Legal-Theoretical Model" (EUR 2002). His research topics include health care and human rights, access to health care, EU law and health care, and pharmaceutical law. Recent publications include International Trade and Health Care: In Search of Good Sense (2011) and Human Rights and Biomedicine (2010), both of which André edited. He has authored 150 other book contributions and articles.

Colleen M. Flood is a Professor and Canada Research Chair at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto, and is cross-appointed to the School of Public Policy and the Institute of Health Policy, Management, and Evaluation. From 2006 to 2011 she served as the Scientific Director of the Canadian Institute for Health Services and Policy Research. Her primary areas of scholarship are in comparative health care law and policy, administrative law, public/private financing of health care systems, health care reform, and accountability and governance issues more broadly. She is the author or editor of seven books, including multiple new editions: Data, Data, Everywhere: Access and Accountability? (editor) (2011); Canadian Health Law and Policy (4th edition) (coedited with J. Downie and T. Caulfield) (2011); Administrative Law in Context (2nd edition) (coedited with Lorne Sossin) (2012); Exploring Social Insurance: Can a Dose of Europe Cure Canadian Health Care Finance? (coedited with Mark Stabile and Carolyn Tuohy) (2008); Just Medicare: What's In, What's Out, How We Decide (editor) (2006); Access to Justice, Access to Care: The Legal Debate over Private Health Insurance (coedited with Kent Roach and Lorne Sossin) (2005); and International Health Care Reform: A Legal, Economic and Political Analysis (2000).

Mária Éva Földes holds a PhD and a Master of Arts degree from Central European University, Hungary, and an International Master degree from the University of Leuven, Belgium. Her research interests include the influence of European integration on health policy and health systems, social determinants of health, regulation of medicinal products and medical devices, health-related rights of vulnerable groups, and healthy ageing. Since March 2014 she has been working as postdoctoral researcher at the University of Vienna's Institute for European Integration Research, Austria. Between 2010 and 2013 she worked as researcher at the University of Tilburg, the Netherlands, Faculty of Law, and Tilburg Law and Economics Center. Before moving to the Netherlands in 2010, she worked in Hungary for the Open Society Institute's Public Health Program where she coordinated a project promoting the health rights of vulnerable groups in Central and Eastern Europe with specific focus on the Roma minority.



Contributors

Lisa Forman is the Lupina Assistant Professor at the Dalla Lana School of Public Health and Director of the Comparative Program on Health and Society at the Munk School of Global Affairs at the University of Toronto. Her research focuses on the contribution of international human rights law to remediating global health inequities, focusing on access to medicines in low- and middle-income countries and the post-2015 health development agenda. She has written widely on the right to health, access to medicines, trade-related intellectual property rights, human rights impact assessment, and global health policy, and she is coeditor of Access to Medicines as a Human Right: Implications for Pharmaceutical Industry Responsibility (2012). Lisa qualified as an attorney of the High Court of South Africa, with a BA and LLB from the University of the Witwatersrand. Her graduate studies include a Masters in Human Rights Studies from Columbia University and an SJD from the University of Toronto's Faculty of Law.

Fanny Gómez is an Adjunct Professor of Law at Georgetown University Law Center and a Human Rights Specialist with the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights (IACHR). Previously she was an independent consultant for Human Rights Watch and worked with the Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network in drafting model legislation on violence and discrimination against women in Sub-Saharan Africa. In 2009–2010, she participated in the Women's Law and Public Policy Fellowship Program at the Georgetown University Law Center. Her scholarly and research interests include women's human rights, sexuality and human rights, sexual and reproductive rights and health law, and the inter-American human rights system. She has lectured on these subjects at the Georgetown University Law Center and the Bloomberg School of Public Health at Johns Hopkins University. Fanny holds a law degree from the Andres Bello Catholic University in Caracas, Venezuela, and an LLM, with concentration in international law, from McGill University.

Aeyal Gross is a member of the Faculty in Tel-Aviv University's Faculty of Law. He is also a Visiting Reader at the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) in the University of London. He holds an LLB from Tel-Aviv University (1990) and an SJD from Harvard Law School (1996). In 1998 he was awarded the Diploma in Human Rights from the Academy of European Law, European University Institute, in Florence. Aeyal serves as a member of the Board of the Association for Civil Rights in Israel. He also served as a Research Fellow at the Institute of Advanced Legal Studies at the University of London, as a Visiting Fellow at the Stellenbosch Institute for Advanced Studies in South Africa, and as a Joseph Flom Global Health and Human Rights Fellow at Harvard Law School. Additionally he taught as a visiting lecturer at Columbia University and the University of Toronto.

Anand Grover is a senior advocate practicing in the Supreme Court of India; the Director of the Lawyers Collective, India; and the UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Health.



xii Contributors

Christina S. Ho is an Associate Professor of Law at Rutgers University, having joined the faculty in 2010 from the O'Neill Institute for National and Global Health Law at Georgetown University Law Center, where she was a Senior Fellow and Project Director of the China Health Law Initiative. She was previously Country Director and Senior Policy Advisor for the Clinton Foundation's China program. During the Clinton administration she worked on the Domestic Policy Council at the White House and later led Senator Hillary Rodham Clinton's health legislative staff. Her teaching and research interests include administrative law and health law and policy. Christina received her AB magna cum laude from Harvard College, an MPP from Harvard's John F. Kennedy School of Government, and JD cum laude from Harvard Law School.

Allison K. Hoffman is Assistant Professor of Law at the UCLA School of Law. Her work focuses on U.S. health care law and policy. She currently teaches health care law and policy, torts, and a seminar on health insurance and reform. Allison is a Faculty Associate at the UCLA Center for Health Policy Research. Her research explores the role of regulation and the welfare state in promoting health and wellbeing. She received her AB summa cum laude from Dartmouth College and law degree from the Yale Law School, where she was submissions editor for the Yale Journal of Health Policy, Law, and Ethics. She previously practiced health care law at Ropes & Gray, LLP, where she counseled academic medical centers, insurers, pharmaceutical companies, and private equity firms on a wide range of health care regulatory matters. She has also provided strategic advice to health care companies and to nonprofit organizations and foundations as a management consultant at the Boston Consulting Group and the Bridgespan Group. Immediately prior to joining the faculty at UCLA, she was a Fellow at Harvard Law School's Petrie-Flom Center for Health Law Policy, Biotechnology, and Bioethics.

Everaldo Lamprea is a Professor at Los Andes Law School, Bogotá. He received his LLB from Los Andes Law School. Additionally, he completed a JSM and a JSD at Stanford Law School. In 2011 he coordinated a team at Colombia's Constitutional Court in charge of analyzing health-related public policy and regulation. His current research focuses on the regulation of public services and on how this interacts with socioeconomic rights adjudication in developing countries, with a focus on the regulation of health systems.

Anna-Sara Lind, LLD, is a Senior Lecturer of Public Law at Uppsala University, Sweden. Her research interests focus on fundamental rights in a national as well as in a European constitutional context and how these rights are communicated between these levels. Her latest articles have focused on the constitutional dimension of the right to health and the social rights of illegal immigrants in the European Union. Her current research projects deal with integrity rights and social security law, respectively. Although being quite different in comparison, these projects have



Contributors xiii

some points in common. One is the constitutional dimension of the national legal order being tested and challenged by international law and/or EU law and how the power of lawmaking is fragmented between several constitutional actors. Another point is the possibility for the individual to be able to access and be part of the realization of their stated rights.

Joanna Manning is Associate Professor at the Faculty of Law, University of Auckland, where she teaches and has published widely on issues of health law, policy, ethics, torts, and accident compensation. She is a contributing author to *Medical Law in New Zealand* (2006), which won the Legal Research Foundation's J. F. Northey Annual Book award for 2006, and, most recently, the editor of *The Cartwright Papers*: Essays on the Cervical Cancer Inquiry 1987–88 (2009). She was the consumer representative on the Medical Practitioners Disciplinary Committee for close to ten years. Formerly she worked as a prosecuting lawyer.

Maitreyi Misra is a Research Officer to Mr. Anand Grover, UN Special Rapporteur on the Right to Health. She is also managing the Global Health Rights Project, a Lawyer's Collective initiative. She has also worked on the Global Health and Human Rights Database Project, a Lawyer's Collective initiative in collaboration with the O'Neill Institute. She completed her LLM at the New York University School of Law in 2011 and was a Student Fellow at the Association for Civil Rights in Israel, Tel Aviv, before she joined Mr. Grover.

Christopher Newdick is a barrister and the Professor in Health Law at the University of Reading. He is an Honorary Consultant to National Health Service (NHS) health authorities and a member of the South Central Priorities Committee, which makes difficult decisions about the cost and affordability of new treatments in the NHS. He has given evidence to the House of Commons Health Committee, written position papers for the NHS Confederation and the NHS National Prescribing Centre, and was an expert witness to the National Inquiry into the Mid-Staffordshire NHS Foundation Trust (2011). His book, Who Should We Treat? Rights, Rationing and Resources (2nd ed.) (2005) considers the law, ethics, economics, and politics of health care rationing and builds on work over many years developing understanding of the macro – or public health – ethics that are fundamental to the legitimacy of health care systems.

Remigius N. Nwabueze is a Senior Lecturer at the Southampton School of Law, having joined the faculty in 2005 from an Assistant Professor position at the Faculty of Law, University of Ottawa. His research focuses on law, ethics, and the regulation of biomedical research in developing countries, especially African countries. His doctoral thesis focused on the conceptual and theoretical challenges to property law posed by biomedical technologies. He has published more than thirty-four articles and book chapters on these subjects as well as presenting at national and international conferences. His book, *Biotechnology and the Challenge of Property* (2007),



xiv Contributors

stemming from his doctoral work, is considered pathbreaking. Remigius is internationally recognized as a leading authority on law relating to biotechnology, dead bodies and body parts, and the ethics of biomedical research in developing countries. His publications have gained international recognition, and one was recently cited by the U.S. Court of Appeals, Second Circuit, in *Abdullahi v Pfizer*, *Inc.*, 562 F.3d 163 (2nd Cir. CA, 2009), a case concerning the clinical trial of Trovan in Nigeria by Pfizer in 1996. Remigius received his LLB from the University of Nigeria in 1991, LLMs from the University of Lagos and the University of Manitoba, and his SJD from the University of Toronto.

Mariana Mota Prado is an Associate Professor at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto. Her scholarship focuses on law and development, regulated industries, and comparative law. Her recent publications include a book (coauthored with Michael Trebilcock) entitled What Makes Poor Countries Poor? Institutional Determinants of Development. A Brazilian national, she regularly teaches intensive courses at Getulio Vargas Foundation in Rio de Janeiro, and she often collaborates with Brazilian scholars on projects related to institutional reforms in Brazil. Mariana received her LLB from the University of Sao Paulo and her LLM and JSD from Yale.

Lubhyathi Rangarajan is currently a Junior Consultant for the High Level Committee at the Ministry of Tribal Affairs, government of India. She was previously Guest Faculty at National Law School, Bengaluru, teaching human rights and international humanitarian law. In 2013 she graduated with a LLM in International Law from the University of California, Berkeley, School of Law, before which she was a Researcher for the Global Health Rights Project – a Lawyer's Collective initiative. She was also a practicing lawyer before the Bombay High Court while employed with Vidhii Partners, Mumbai. Her areas of interest include human rights and social justice.

Jerome Amir Singh (BA, LLB, LLM, MHSc, PhD) is Head of Ethics and Law at the Centre for the AIDS Programme of Research in South Africa, Nelson R. Mandela School of Medicine, University of KwaZulu-Natal (UKZN). He is also Adjunct Professor in the Dalla Lana School of Public Health Sciences and Joint Centre for Bioethics at the University of Toronto, Canada, and Course Director for Bioethics at Howard College School of Law, UKZN. He is a Senior Bioethics Researcher at the Sandra Rotman Centre, Toronto, Canada, where he advises the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation on ethical, social, and cultural issues. He currently serves on several research bodies, including the International Research Ethics Board of Médecins Sans Frontières, the Research Ethics Committee of the South African Human Sciences Research Council, and the Scientific Advisory Board of the Aurum Institute of Health Research. He is an ad hoc consultant to the World Health Organization, and is a member of the Critical Path for TB Drug Regimens high-level Advisory Panel. He is the Co-Chair of the HIV Prevention Trial Network's



Contributors

χV

Ethics Working Group, and serves as a Special Advisor to the Biomedical Research Ethics Committee of the Nelson Mandela School of Medicine. He is an elected Founding Member and inaugural Co-Chair of the South African Young Academy of Science (SAYAS). He has previously served as the Co-Director of the Ethical, Social, and Cultural Issues Advisory Services to the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation's Grand Challenges in Global Health Initiative, as a member of the World Health Organisation's Ethics Task Force on TB Management, the U.S. NIH's African Data and Safety Monitoring Board, the Health Law Advisory Committee to the South African Law Reform Commission, and as a Rapporteur for UNAIDS. He is an invited member of the International Association for Humanitarian Medicine, and he was a previous guest faculty member of the International Committee of Military Medicine.





Acknowledgments

We would like to thank the people who helped us convene such a fabulous group of scholars and facilitated our rich discussions and the production of this manuscript. In Toronto, thanks go to Bryan Thomas, Lorian Hardcastle, and Arthur Wilson who served as research managers over this time and helped us with our due diligence in locating the best possible contributors, organizing workshops and meetings, researching, editing and formatting papers, and so forth. Colleen M. Flood benefited from the support of both the Canadian Institutes of Health Research and the Canada Research Chair program.

In Tel Aviv, thanks to Sharon Bassan who served as research assistant and manager and helped in research, editing, and formatting, and to Michal Locker-Eshed who facilitated our workshop at Tel-Aviv University on behalf of the Minerva Center for Human Rights. Thanks to Professor Shai Lavi, director of the Minerva Center, and to Professor Daphane Barak-Erez, Dean of the Law School, and to Tel-Aviv University for their support of the Tel Aviv workshop. Aeyal Gross benefited from invaluable funding and support from the Israel National Institute for Health Policy Research and from the Joseph H. Flom Global Health and Human Rights Fellowship at Harvard Law School. At Harvard he is grateful to the Human Rights Program, which hosted him during the Fellowship, and in particular to its academic director Mindy Roseman and to his co-Fellow Alicia Ely Yamin. Special thanks also go to Dean Hanoch Dagan at Tel-Aviv University for supporting Aeyal's research leave, which allowed him to pursue the Fellowship and this project. We also thank John Berger and the team at Cambridge University Press for their fabulous work and support through the production of this manuscript.

It proved enormously challenging to convene the group of scholars we identified as having the requisite skills, but nonetheless this has been a fantastic project to work on – we have not always agreed on everything, but the debates have been rich and exciting. We would like to thank our eighteen authors for their superb contributions and we hope you enjoy reading their scholarship as much as we did.

A final note of thanks and love to our respective partners; first, Matthew, who kept calm and cool and provided huge amounts of support through the birth and first year of Conor as we simultaneously finished this manuscript; and to Ofer, who endured many hours of work spilling into nights and weekends.

xvii