

THE RHETORIC OF FREE SPEECH IN LATE ANTIQUITY AND THE EARLY MIDDLE AGES

The early Middle Ages is not a period traditionally associated with free speech. It is still widely held that free speech declined towards the end of Antiquity, disappearing completely at the beginning of the Middle Ages, and only re-emerging in the Renaissance, when people finally learned to think and speak for themselves again. Challenging this tenacious image, Irene van Renswoude reveals that there was room for political criticism and dissent in this period, as long as critics employed the right rhetoric and adhered to scripted roles. This study of the rhetoric of free speech from c. 200 to c. 900 AD explores the cultural rules and rhetorical performances that shaped practices of delivering criticism from Antiquity to the Middle Ages, examining the rhetorical strategies in the letters and narratives of the late antique and early medieval men, and a few women, who ventured to speak the truth to the powerful.

IRENE VAN RENSWOUDE is Professor of Medieval Manuscripts and Cultural History at the University of Amsterdam, and researcher at Huygens ING, a research institute of the Royal Netherlands Academy of Arts and Sciences. She was awarded the Heineken Young Scientist Award for History for her research on free speech and censorship, and is the co-editor of several volumes, including *Strategies of Writing: Studies on Texts and Trust in the Middle Ages* (2008) and *The Annotated Book in the Early Middle Ages* (2017).

Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought
Fourth Series

General Editor

ROSAMOND MCKITTERICK

*Emeritus Professor of Medieval History, University of Cambridge, and Fellow
of Sidney Sussex College*

Advisory Editors

CHRISTOPHER BRIGGS

Lecturer in Medieval British Social and Economic History, University of Cambridge

ADAM J. KOSTO

Professor of History, Columbia University

ALICE RIO

Professor of Medieval History, King's College London

MAGNUS RYAN

University Lecturer in History, University of Cambridge, and Fellow of Peterhouse

The series *Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought* was inaugurated by G.G. Coulton in 1921; Professor Rosamond McKitterick now acts as General Editor of the Fourth Series, with Dr Christopher Briggs, Professor Adam J. Kosto, Professor Alice Rio and Dr Magnus Ryan as Advisory Editors. The series brings together outstanding work by medieval scholars over a wide range of human endeavour extending from political economy to the history of ideas.

*This is book 115 in the series, and a full list of titles in the series can be found at:
www.cambridge.org/medievallifeandthought*

THE RHETORIC OF FREE SPEECH
IN LATE ANTIQUITY AND THE
EARLY MIDDLE AGES

IRENE VAN RENSWOUDE

University of Amsterdam and Huygens ING, The Netherlands



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-03813-4 — The Rhetoric of Free Speech in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages
 Irene van Renswoude
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
 New Delhi – 110025, India
 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107038134

DOI: 10.1017/9781139811941

© Irene van Renswoude 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Renswoude, Irene van, author.

TITLE: The rhetoric of free speech in late antiquity and the early Middle Ages / Irene van Renswoude.

OTHER TITLES: Cambridge studies in medieval life and thought ; 4th ser., 115.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom : Cambridge University Press, 2019. |

Series: Cambridge studies in medieval life and thought ; fourth series, 115

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019014541 | ISBN 9781107038134

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Latin literature, Medieval and modern – History and criticism. | Christian literature, Early – Latin authors. | Freedom of speech – Europe, Western – History – To 1500.

| Freedom of speech – Religious aspects – Christianity. | Rhetoric – Political aspects. |

Rhetoric – Social aspects. | Criticism, Personal, in literature.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC PA8035 .R46 2019 | DDC 870.8/003–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019014541>

ISBN 978-1-107-03813-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03813-4 — The Rhetoric of Free Speech in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages
Irene van Renswoude
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Janneke

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03813-4 — The Rhetoric of Free Speech in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages
Irene van Renswoude
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page viii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	ix
INTRODUCTION	I
	<i>Part I</i>
I THE STEADFAST MARTYR	19
2 HILARY OF POITIERS	21
3 THE DETACHED PHILOSOPHER	41
4 AMBROSE OF MILAN	63
5 THE SILENT ASCETIC	87
EPILOGUE PART I	109
	<i>Part II</i>
6 THE FRANK HOLY MAN	127
7 GREGORY OF TOURS	131
8 THE WISE ADVISER	133
9 AGOBARD OF LYON	161
10 POPE GREGORY	180
EPILOGUE PART II	206
<i>Bibliography</i>	230
<i>Index</i>	243
	250
	274

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book grew from my doctoral thesis on late antique and early medieval truth-tellers entitled *Licence to Speak*, which I completed in 2011 at the Research Institute for History and Culture of Utrecht University. Throughout the process of turning this dissertation into a book, I had help from my own truth-tellers who sharpened my thinking, read chapters or commented on drafts and papers that served as preliminary studies. I would like to thank Mariken Teeuwen, Carine van Rhijn, Rutger Kramer, Walter Pohl, Els Rose, Irene O'Daly, Henry Mayr-Harting, Jinty Nelson, Stuart Airlie, Peter Raedts, Courtney Booker and Conrad Leyser for their advice and encouragements. I am very grateful to the anonymous CUP reviewer, whose report greatly helped me to clarify my arguments. Now that I have discovered the identity of this reviewer, I am pleased to be able to thank Richard Flower by name.

Among the colleagues and friends who supported me over the years, my gratitude goes to four people in particular, without whom I could not have written or completed this book. Mary Garrison put me on the track of free speech many years ago. She gave me a copy of Foucault's *Fearless Speech*, after which I was hooked on the topic. Her research on early medieval *parthesia* has been a source of inspiration, and I have profited immensely from her advice. Special thanks go to Mayke de Jong, my former supervisor, for her unwavering support over the years. While I wrote this book, she completed her *Epitaph for an Era*. It was a great pleasure to share the joys, and the occasional burdens, of writing with her. Rosamond McKitterick carefully read the entire manuscript and offered invaluable advice and suggestions for improvement. I cannot thank Rosamond and Mayke enough for prodding me to finalise the manuscript, when other obligations and projects got in the way. Lastly, I want to thank my long-time friend and inspiring colleague Janneke Raaijmakers. Janneke has read every version of every chapter of this book, until the very last footnote, and has been a true critic in the best sense of the word. This book is dedicated to her.

ABBREVIATIONS

- ACM* *The Acts of the Christian Martyrs*, ed. and trans. H. Musurillo, Oxford Early Christian Texts (Oxford, 1972)
- Acti e passioni* A. A. R. Bastiaensen, A. Hilhorst, G. A. A. Kortekaas, A. P. Orbán, M. M. van Assendelft (eds.), *Acti e passioni dei martiri*, Scrittori greci e latini (Milan, 1987)
- BAV [Vatican,] Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana
- BnF [Paris,] Bibliothèque nationale de France
- CCCM *Corpus Christianorum, Continuatio Mediaevalis* (Turnhout, 1966–)
- CCSL *Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina* (Turnhout, 1952–)
- CSEL *Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum* (Vienna, 1866–)
- GCS *Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller* (Leipzig, 1897; NS Berlin, 1995–)
- LCL *Loeb Classical Library* (Cambridge, MA; London, 1912–)
- MGH *Monumenta Germaniae Historica*
- AA* *Auctores antiquissimi*, 15 vols (Berlin, 1877–1919)
- Conc.* *Concilia, Legum sectio III, Concilia II*, ed. A. Werminghoff (Hanover, 1906–8)
- Epp.* *Epistulae III–VII (Epistulae merovingici et karolini aevi)* (Hanover, 1892–1939)
- SRG *Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi* (Hanover, 1871–1987)

List of Abbreviations

- SRM* *Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum*, ed. B. Krusch and W. Levison, 7 vols (Hanover, 1885–1951)
- SS* *Scriptores in folio*, 30 vols (Hanover, 1826–1924)
- NPNF-2* *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers*, second series, ed. P. Schaff and H. Wace (Peabody, 1890–)
- PG* *Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Graeca*, ed. J. P. Migne (Paris, 1857–1866)
- PL* *Patrologiae Cursus Completus, Series Latina*, ed. J. P. Migne (Paris, 1841–1864)
- RLM* *Rhetores latini minores*, ed. C. Halm (Leipzig, 1863)
- SC* *Sources Chrétiennes* (Paris, 1941–)