Music criticism has played a fundamental and influential role throughout music history, with numerous composers such as Berlioz, Schumann and Wagner, as well as many contemporary musicians, also maintaining careers as writers and critics. The Cambridge History of Music Criticism goes beyond these better-known accounts, reaching back to medieval times, expanding the geographical reach both within and beyond Europe and including key issues such as women and criticism, recordings and the story of criticism in jazz, popular music and world music. Drawing on a blend of established and talented young scholars, this is the first substantial historical survey of music criticism and critics, bringing unprecedented scope to a rapidly expanding area of musicological research. An indispensable point of reference, The Cambridge History of Music Criticism provides a broad historical overview of the field while also addressing specific issues and events.

Christopher Dingle is Professor of Music at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire. In addition to research on music criticism, he has authored/edited five books on Messiaen, including the acclaimed The Life of Messiaen (Cambridge, 2007). His realisation of the orchestration of Messiaen’s Un oiseau des arbres de Vie (Oiseau Tui) was premiered at the 2015 BBC Proms, and a critical edition of the score will be published in 2019. A book of conversations with the composer Julian Anderson is in preparation, and Dingle has also written for BBC Music Magazine for twenty-five years.
THE CAMBRIDGE HISTORY OF
MUSIC

The Cambridge History of Music comprises a group of reference works concerned with significant strands of musical scholarship. The individual volumes are self-contained and include histories of music examined by century as well as the history of opera, music theory and American music. Each volume is written by a team of experts under a specialist editor and represents the latest musicological research.

The Cambridge History of American Music
Edited by David Nicholls

The Cambridge History of Music Criticism
Edited by Christopher Dingle

The Cambridge History of Musical Performance
Edited by Colin Lawson and Robin Stowell

The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory
Edited by Thomas Christensen

The Cambridge History of World Music
Edited by Philip V. Bohlman

The Cambridge History of Medieval Music
Edited by Mark Everist and Thomas Forrest Kelly

The Cambridge History of Fifteenth-Century Music
Edited by Anna Maria Busse Berger and Jesse Rodin

The Cambridge History of Sixteenth-Century Music
Edited by Iain Fenlon and Richard Wistreich

The Cambridge History of Seventeenth-Century Music
Edited by Tim Carter and John Butt

The Cambridge History of Eighteenth-Century Music
Edited by Simon P. Keefe

The Cambridge History of Nineteenth-Century Music
Edited by Jim Samson

The Cambridge History of Twentieth-Century Music
Edited by Nicholas Cook and Anthony Pople
Contents

List of Music Examples, Figures and Tables  page ix
Notes on Contributors  x
Acknowledgements  xv

Introduction  1
CHRISTOPHER DINGLE

PART I THE EARLY HISTORY OF MUSIC CRITICISM  7

1 · Speaking of Plainsong in the Middle Ages  9
CHRISTOPHER PAGE

2 · Music Criticism in the Late-Medieval and Renaissance Era  25
STEFANO MENGOZZI

3 · Musical Discourse in Italy, 1500–1800  42
CARRIE CHURNSIDE

4 · Music Criticism in France before the Revolution  62
CHARLES DILL

5 · Music Criticism in Britain up to Burney  81
REBECCA HERISSONE

6 · German-Language Music Criticism before 1800  104
STEPHEN ROSE
PART II THE RISE OF THE PRESS 125

7 · French Music Criticism in the Nineteenth Century, 1789–1870 127
MARK A. POTTINGER

8 · Gatekeeping, Advocacy, Reflection: Overlapping Voices in Nineteenth-Century British Music Criticism 147
LEANNE LANGLEY

9 · Constructing a Musical Nation: German-Language Criticism in the Nineteenth Century 170
LAURA TUNBRIDGE

10 · Music Criticism in Nineteenth-Century Italy 190
ALEXANDRA WILSON

11 · Music Criticism in Imperial Russia 208
EMILY FREY

PART III CRITICAL INFLUENCE AND INFLUENCES 229

12 · Critiquing the Canon: The Role of Criticism in Canon Formation 231
LAURA HAMER

13 · Comparing Notes: Recording and Criticism 249
CHRISTOPHER DINGLE

14 · The Gender Paradox: Criticism of Women and Women as Critics 272
LAURA HAMER

PART IV ENTERING THE TWENTIETH CENTURY 291

15 · Music Criticism in the United States and Canada up to the Second World War 293
MARK MCKNIGHT

16 · Music Criticism in Portugal: Towards an Overview 317
PAULO F. DE CASTRO
Contents

17 · Spanish Music Criticism in the Twentieth Century: Writing Music History in Real Time 331
   EVA MOREDA RODRÍGUEZ

18 · Critical Battlegrounds in the French Third Republic 344
   DELPHINE MORDEY

19 · British Music Criticism, 1890–1945 371
   PAUL WATT

20 · Music Criticism in Norway 392
   PER DAHL

21 · Aesthetic Conservatism and Politics in German-Language Music Criticism, 1900–1945 408
   KAREN PAINTER

22 · Music Criticism in Hungary until the Second World War 424
   LYNN M. HOOKER

23 · The ‘People’ in Czech and Slovak Music Criticism 440
   KELLY ST PIERRE

PART V NEW AREAS 457

24 · Jazz Criticism in America 459
   MARK RACZ

25 · Catalysing Latin American Identities: Alejo Carpentier’s Music Criticism as a Cuban Case Study 484
   CAROLINE RAE

26 · Writing about Popular Music 502
   SIMON FRITH

27 · Working in the Cool Capitalism Complex: The Role of Critics in the World Music Field 527
   TIMOTHY D. TAYLOR
Contents

28 · Cultural Anxieties, Aspirational Cosmopolitanism and Capacity Building: Music Criticism in Singapore 542  
SHZR EE TAN

PART VI DEVELOPMENTS SINCE THE SECOND WORLD WAR 569

29 · Music Criticism in the USSR from Asafyev to Cherednichenko 571  
PETER J. SCHMELZ

30 · The Feuilleton and Beyond: Criticism in the Federal Republic of Germany and Austria after the Second World War 590  
MARK BERRY

31 · Music Criticism in Italy in the Twentieth Century 609  
RAFFAELE POZZI

32 · Wider Still and Wider: British Music Criticism since the Second World War 629  
CHRISTOPHER DINGLE

33 · Music Criticism in France since the Second World War 648  
CHRISTOPHER BRENT MURRAY

34 · Old Divisions and New Debates: Music Criticism in Post-War America 671  
SOPHIE REDFERN

POSTLUDE 693

35 · Stop the Press? The Changing Media of Music Criticism 695  
CHRISTOPHER DINGLE AND DOMINIC MCHUGH

Bibliography 707
Index 789
Music Examples, Figures and Tables

Music Examples

2.1 Dissonances rendered acceptable by underlying consonances in Johannes Boen’s *Musica*.  page 31

Figures

7.1 J. J. Grandville, ‘Les Romains échevelés à la 1re représentation d’Hernani’, 1830 lithograph, 250 x 180 mm, Maison de Victor Hugo, Paris.  page 134
33.1 Duelling critics Antoine Goléa (left) and Bernard Gavoty (right) in an uncredited photomontage for *Musica* magazine, December 1956.  665

Tables

13.1 Key traits of concert and record reviewing.  page 251
32.1 Samples of music content in *The Times*.  639
Notes on Contributors

Mark Berry is Reader in Music History at Royal Holloway, University of London. The author of Treacherous Bonds and Laughing Fire: Politics and Religion in Wagner's 'Ring', After Wagner: Histories of Modernist Music Drama from 'Parsifal' to Nono and Arnold Schoenberg, he also regularly writes musical criticism.

Paulo F. de Castro (PhD, Royal Holloway, University of London) is Associate Professor at Universidade NOVA de Lisboa (Portugal) and a researcher with a focus on intertextuality and the philosophy of music. He has written extensively on the cultural significance of twentieth-century music in France, Russia and the Iberian Peninsula.

Carrie Churnside is Senior Lecturer and Director of the Forum for Seventeenth- and Eighteenth-Century Music at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire. She works on Italian Baroque vocal music and has published on cantatas, oratorios and music printing in the period. Carrie is also on the council of the Handel Institute.

Per Dahl studied musicology, philosophy and psychology at the University of Trondheim and has been employed at the Music Conservatory in Stavanger since 1979. He has worked as a music critic (1989–2001), written programme notes (1992–2002) and is the author of books in Norwegian on aesthetics and analysis, as well as Music and Knowledge: A Performer’s Perspective (2017).


Christopher Dingle is Professor of Music at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire. In addition to research on music criticism, he has authored/edited five books on Messiaen, and a substantial book of conversations with Julian Anderson is in preparation. He has also written for BBC Music Magazine for over twenty-five years.
Notes on Contributors

EMILY FREY is Assistant Professor of Music at Brandeis University. Her articles have appeared in the Journal of the American Musicological Society, 19th-Century Music and Rimsky-Korsakov and His World, and she is currently finishing her first book, Russian Opera in the Age of Tolstoy and Dostoevsky.

SIMON FRITH, FBA is Emeritus Professor of Music at the University of Edinburgh, where he held the Tovey Chair from 2005 to 2017. He had a long career as a music journalist and was the Sunday Times's first rock critic. He chaired the judges of the Mercury Music Prize from 1993 to 2017.

LAURA HAMER works for the Open University. Her primary research interest is women in music. She is the author of Female Composers, Conductors, Performers: Musiciennes of Interwar France, 1919–1939 (2018) and the editor of The Cambridge Companion to Women in Music since 1900 (Cambridge, forthcoming).

REBECCA HERISSONE is Professor of Musicology at the University of Manchester and co-editor of Music & Letters. She works primarily on the creativity, material culture and reception of early modern English music, has published three monographs, most recently Musical Creativity in Restoration England, and was awarded the Diana McVeagh Prize for Best Book on British Music (2015) and the Westrup Prize (2007).

LYNN M. HOOKER, Associate Professor of Music at Purdue University, is the author of Redefining Hungarian Music from Liszt to Bartók (2013). She has published on music and modernism, nationalism, and popular and folk culture. Her current project addresses the role of Romani musicians in twentieth-century Hungarian music.

LEANNE LANGLEY is Lifetime Fellow at the University of London. Her work includes revisionist studies of the (Royal) Philharmonic Society, George Grove’s Dictionary of Music and Musicians, Henry J. Wood and the Proms, Thomas Beecham, the artist John Singer Sargent, the British reception of Berlioz and Schubert, and English music publishing.

DOMINIC MCHUGH is Senior Lecturer in Musicology at the University of Sheffield. He founded the website MusicalCriticism.com and is the author or editor of six books on the Broadway musical, including The Wizard of Oz: From Baum to MGM and Beyond (2018) and The Complete Lyrics of Alan Jay Lerner (2018).

MARK MCKNIGHT is Head of the University of North Texas Music Library and also teaches courses on music research and American music for the University of North Texas College of Music. His research interests include nineteenth-century
American music criticism, early American sheet music and the music of Louisiana and New Orleans.

STEFANO MENGozzi (University of Michigan) specialises in the music and music theory of the Renaissance. His chapter in this collection is part of a larger project exploring the contribution of late-medieval religious culture to the emergence of affective and text-centred musical styles in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.

DELPHINE MORDEY is an Affiliated Lecturer in Music at the University of Cambridge, and Fellow and Director of Studies in Music at Newnham College, Cambridge. Her work on late nineteenth-century French music has appeared in 19th-Century Music, Cambridge Opera Journal and Music & Letters.

EVA MOREDA RODRIGUEZ is Lecturer in Music at the University of Glasgow and the author of Music and Exile in Francoist Spain (2015) and Music Criticism and Music Critics in Early Francoist Spain (2016).

CHRISTOPHER BRENT MURRAY is a Maître de conférences in the musicology department of the Université libre de Bruxelles. A specialist on twentieth-century French and Belgian musical life, Murray co-authored Le Modèle et l’invention: Olivier Messiaen et la technique de l’emprunt (2017) with Yves Balmer and Thomas Lacôte.

CHRISTOPHER PAGE is Professor of Medieval Music and Literature in the University of Cambridge, a Fellow of the British Academy, a Fellow of the Society of Antiquaries and a member of the Academia Europaea. Until October 2018 he was Gresham Professor of Music at Gresham College, London (founded 1597).

KAREN PAINTER, Professor at the University of Minnesota, is researching music for fallen soldiers in Germany, 1914–45. A recipient of the Humboldt Fellowship and the Berlin Prize, she was visiting scholar at Harvard’s Center for European Studies (2015–16) and the École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales (2010).

MARK A. POTTINGER is Associate Professor of Music in the Visual and Performing Arts Department at Manhattan College. A recipient of the prestigious Berlin Prize in 2017, he is the author of a number of publications on the music and cultural life of nineteenth-century Europe.

RAFFAELE POZZI is Full Professor of Musicology at the Università di Roma Tre (Italy). His research focuses on the history and aesthetics of twentieth-century music. He contributed to the Enciclopedia della Musica (2001) and has published
Notes on Contributors

a book on Olivier Messiaen (2002) and several articles on Italian contemporary music.

MARK RACZ is a pianist and music educator who studied at Rutgers University and the Manhattan School of Music. Resident in the UK since 1980, he was responsible for setting up the BMus (Jazz) Programme at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire. He is currently Deputy Principal and Dean of the Royal Academy of Music.

CAROLINE RAE is Reader in Music at Cardiff University and a pianist. She has published widely on twentieth-century French music as well as on the musical writings of Alejo Carpentier, and is contributing editor of the first book on Jolivet in English, André Jolivet, Music Art and Literature (Routledge, 2019). She was made a Chevalier de l’Ordre des Arts et des Lettres in 2018.

SOPHIE REDFERN has held teaching and research positions at Liverpool Hope University, Royal Birmingham Conservatoire and the University of Sheffield. A specialist in twentieth-century American music and dance, she is the author of the forthcoming Bernstein and Robbins: The Early Ballets.

STEPHEN ROSE is Professor of Music at Royal Holloway, University of London. He specialises in German music 1500–1800, and his books include The Musician in Literature in the Age of Bach (Cambridge, 2011) and Musical Authorship from Schütz to Bach (Cambridge, 2019). He is co-editor of the journal Early Music.

PETER J. SCHMELZ is Associate Professor of Musicology at Arizona State University, Tempe. He is completing Alfred Schnittke’s Concerto Grosso No. 1 (forthcoming, 2019) and Sonic Overload: Polystylism as Cultural Practice in the Late USSR. He has begun writing a book on experimental music in the 1980s USSR.

KELLY ST PIERRE works as an Associate Professor of Musicology at Wichita State University. Her first book, Bedřich Smetana: Myth, Music, and Propaganda, was published in March 2017. Her research has also appeared in 19th-Century Music and Grove Music Online, Oxford Music Online.

SHZR EE TAN is Senior Lecturer and ethnomusicologist at the Music Department of Royal Holloway, University of London. A specialist in soundscapes of Sinophone worlds, she also researches music and migration, gender and inequality. She is currently co-editor of the journal Ethnomusicology Forum.

TIMOTHY D. TAYLOR is a Professor in the Department of Ethnomusicology at the University of California, Los Angeles. He is the author of numerous articles and books.
Notes on Contributors


Laura Tunbridge is Professor of Music at the University of Oxford. Her publications include Schumann’s Late Style (2007), The Song Cycle (2010) and Singing in the Age of Anxiety: Lieder Performances in New York and London between the World Wars (2018). She was editor of the Journal of the Royal Musical Association from 2013 to 2018.

Paul Watt is an Associate Professor of Musicology at Monash University. His research interests include musical criticism, historiography and aesthetics, popular music and biography. He is the author of The Regulation and Reform of Music Criticism in Nineteenth-Century England (2018) and Ernest Newman: A Critical Biography (2017).

Acknowledgements

It is unsurprising that the gestation of this volume, a large book with an extensive number of contributors covering an exceptionally broad range of areas, has been lengthy. I should like to thank, first and foremost, the wonderful contributors, not just for their marvellous chapters, which have taught me so much in such an engaging manner, but also for their immense patience and understanding. Secondly, I should like to thank all at Cambridge University Press, notably Vicki Cooper, who first suggested the book, Kate Brett, her successor as Music Editor, Eilidh Burrett, her Editorial Assistant, Lisa Sinclair, Podhumai Anban and Lesley Hay, as well as various others who have assisted at different points in the book’s gestation. I should also like to thank my colleagues at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire and Birmingham City University for their friendship and enthusiasm, and my institution for financial assistance with aspects of the project. Particular thanks should go to Sophie Redfern for her extensive ferreting, eagle eyes and insightful comments. Finally, nothing that I do would be possible without the love and support of my wife, Liz, and my sons, Wilfred and Nathaniel, who collectively enable me to remember what is truly important.