

What Ifs of Jewish History

What if the Exodus had never happened? What if the Jews of Spain had not been expelled in 1492? What if Eastern European Jews had never been confined to the Russian Pale of Settlement? What if Adolf Hitler had been assassinated in 1939? What if a Jewish state had been established in Uganda instead of Palestine? Gavriel D. Rosenfeld's pioneering anthology examines how these and other counterfactual questions would have affected the course of Jewish history. Featuring essays by sixteen distinguished scholars in the field of Jewish Studies, *What Ifs of Jewish History* is the first volume to systematically apply counterfactual reasoning to the Jewish past. Written in a variety of narrative styles, ranging from the analytical to the literary, the essays cover three thousand years of dramatic events and invite readers to indulge their imaginations and explore how the course of Jewish history might have been different.

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld is Professor of History at Fairfield University.

What Ifs of Jewish History

From Abraham to Zionism

Edited by

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-03762-5 — What Ifs of Jewish History
Gavriel D. Rosenfeld
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107037625

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-03762-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

List of figures page vii

List of figure acknowledgments ix

List of contributors x

Introduction: Counterfactual history and the Jewish
imagination 1

Gavriel D. Rosenfeld

- 1 What if the Exodus had never happened? 24
Steven Weitzman
- 2 What if the Temple of Jerusalem had not been destroyed by
the Romans? 43
René Bloch
- 3 What if King Ferdinand and Queen Isabella had not expelled
the Jews of Spain in 1492? 58
Jonathan Ray
- 4 What if the “ghetto” had never been constructed? 81
Bernard Dov Cooperman
- 5 What if Spinoza had repented? 103
Eugene R. Sheppard

vi / Contents

- 6** What if Russian Jewry had never been confined to the Pale of Jewish Settlement? 123
Jeffrey Veidlinger
- 7** What if a Christian state had been established in modern Palestine? 142
Derek Jonathan Penslar
- 8** What if the Jewish state had been established in East Africa? 165
Adam Rovner
- 9** What if Franz Kafka had immigrated to Palestine? 187
Iris Bruce
- 10** What if the Palestinian Arab elite had chosen compromise instead of boycott in confronting Zionism? 215
Kenneth W. Stein
- 11** What if Musa Alami and David Ben-Gurion had agreed on a Jewish–Arab state? 238
David N. Myers
- 12** What if the Weimar Republic had survived? A chapter from Walther Rathenau’s memoir 259
Michael Brenner
- 13** What if Adolf Hitler had been assassinated in 1939? 275
Gavriel D. Rosenfeld
- 14** What if the Nazis had won the battle of El Alamein? 298
Jeffrey Herf
- 15** What if the Final Solution had been completed?: Nazi memory in a victorious Reich 311
Dirk Rupnow
- 16** What if the Holocaust had been averted? 332
Jeffrey S. Gurock
- Notes 355
- Index* 402

FIGURES

Cover: Postage stamp from the country of New Judea

1	<i>The Crossing of the Red Sea</i> (1633–4), oil on canvas, painting by Nicolas Poussin	<i>page 2</i>
2	Woodcut of Flavius Josephus from William Whiston's translation of <i>Antiquities of the Jews</i> (1737)	11
3	Israelites building the cities, page from the Barcelona Haggadah, fourteenth century	27
4	<i>Moses with the Ten Commandments</i> (1648), oil on canvas, painting by Philippe de Champagne	35
5	<i>The Destruction of the Temple of Jerusalem</i> (1638), painting by Nicolas Poussin	44
6	<i>The Sacrifice of the Old Covenant</i> (ca. 1626), oil on panel, painting by Peter Paul Rubens	48
7	Engraving of Sultan Mehmed IV of Turkey	60
8	King Ferdinand II of Aragon and Queen Isabella of Castile	66
9	View of the city of Cracow, woodcut from the <i>Nuremberg Chronicle</i> (1493) by Hartmann Schedel	86
10	<i>The Ghetto, Rome</i> (1847), engraving by S.V. Hunt, Cassell & Company	95
11	Portrait of Benedict (Baruch) Spinoza, ca. 1665	104
12	Portrait of Heinrich Heine, 1838	118
13	Portrait of Tadeusz Kościuszko (1746–1817)	130

viii / List of figures

14	Portrait of Tsar Alexander I (1777–1825) (1814), oil on canvas, painting by Baron François Pascal Simon Gerard (1770–1837)	135
15	Photograph of Chaim Weizmann	146
16	Photograph of Christian Templer settlers in Wilhelma, Palestine	149
17	Postage stamp from New Judea	166
18	Map of New Judea	183
19	Photograph of Franz Kafka, Israel's first recipient of the Nobel Prize for Literature	188
20	Photograph of Franz Kafka in Prague before his departure to Palestine in 1924	195
21	Photograph of the Arab Higher Committee featuring Haj Amin Al-Husseini	220
22	Map of armistice lines in Palestine in 1947 and 1949	232
23	Photograph of David Ben-Gurion	240
24	Photograph of Musa Alami	241
25	Portrait of Walther Rathenau by Edvard Munch (1907)	260
26	Photograph of Albert Einstein	267
27	Photograph of Georg Elser	276
28	Postage stamp of Adolf Hitler	281
29	Photograph of Haj Amin Al-Husseini with Adolf Hitler (1941)	303
30	Photograph of General Erwin Rommel in North Africa	306
31	Photograph of mannequin of Jew holding Torah scroll in the Klaus synagogue	319
32	Photograph of Nazi ideologue Alfred Rosenberg	326
33	Photograph of Hjalmar Schacht and Adolf Hitler	335
34	Photograph of the ruins of the King David Hotel, Jerusalem	346

FIGURE ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Figure 1: National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne; Figure 2: © Getty images / Culture Club; Figure 3: © The British Library; Figure 4: Courtesy of Hermitage Museum, Saint Petersburg, Russia; Figure 5: © Heritage Image Partnership Ltd. / Alamy Ltd.; Figure 6: © Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, Massachusetts, USA / Gift of William A. Coolidge / Bridgeman Images; Figure 7: © Getty images / Hulton Archive; Figure 8: © Musée Condé, Chantilly, France / Bridgeman Images; Figure 9: © Private Collection / The Stapleton Collection / Bridgeman Images; Figure 10: © Private Collection / Bridgeman Images; Figure 11: © Alamy Ltd.; Figure 12: public domain; Figure 13: © De Agostini Picture Library / A. Dagli Orti / Bridgeman Images; Figure 14: © Musée National du Chateau de Malmaison, Rueil-Malmaison, France / Bridgeman Images; Figure 15: © Getty images / Three Lions; Figure 16: Library of Congress, matpc.09278; Figure 17: author's creation / public domain; Figure 18: original artwork; Figure 19: National Library of Israel, public domain; Figure 20: © 2015 Archiv Klaus Wagenbach; Figure 21: © Getty images / Universal History Archive; Figure 22: original artwork; Figure 23: © Getty images / LIFE Picture Collection; Figure 24: public domain; Figure 25: Courtesy of the Rasmus Meyer Collection, Bergen, Norway; Figure 26: © E. O. Hoppé/Corbis; Figure 27: public domain; Figure 28: original artwork / public domain; Figure 29: © Bundesarchiv Bild 146 1987 004 09A; Figure 30: © Bundesarchiv Bild 101 1786 032 719; Figure 31: © Jewish Museum, Prague; Figure 32: © Bundesarchiv Bild 183 1985 072 3500; Figure 33: © Bpk picture agency; Figure 34: © Getty images / Hulton Archive.

CONTRIBUTORS

RENÉ BLOCH is Professor for Jewish Studies at the Institute for Jewish Studies and at the Institute for Classical Philology at the University of Bern.

MICHAEL BRENNER is Professor of Jewish History and Culture at the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich and holds the Seymour and Lillian Abensohn Chair in Israel Studies at American University in Washington.

IRIS BRUCE is Associate Professor of Linguistics and Languages at McMaster University.

BERNARD DOV COOPERMAN is Louis L. Kaplan Associate Professor of History at the University of Maryland.

JEFFREY S. GUROCK is the Libby M. Klaperman Professor of Jewish History at Yeshiva University.

JEFFREY HERF is Distinguished University Professor in the Department of History at the University of Maryland, College Park.

DAVID N. MYERS is Professor of History at the University of California, Los Angeles.

DEREK JONATHAN PENSLAR is the Stanley Lewis Professor of Israel Studies at the University of Oxford and Samuel Zacks Professor of Jewish History at the University of Toronto.

xi / List of contributors

JONATHAN RAY is the Samuel Eig Associate Professor of Jewish Studies in the Theology Department at Georgetown University.

GAVRIEL D. ROSENFELD is Professor of History at Fairfield University.

ADAM ROVNER is Associate Professor of English and Jewish Literature at the University of Denver.

DIRK RUPNOW is Professor of Contemporary History at the University of Innsbruck.

EUGENE R. SHEPPARD is Associate Professor of Modern Jewish History and Thought at Brandeis University.

KENNETH W. STEIN is the William E. Schatten Professor of Contemporary Middle Eastern History and Israeli Studies at Emory University.

JEFFREY VEIDLINGER is the Joseph Brodsky Collegiate Professor of History and Judaic Studies at the University of Michigan.

STEVEN WEITZMAN is the Abraham M. Ellis Professor of Hebrew and Semitic Languages and Literatures at the University of Pennsylvania.