

Historical Agency and the 'Great Man' in Classical Greece

The 'great man' of later Greek historical thought is the long product of traceable changes in ancient ideas about the meaning and impact of an individual life. At least as early as the birth of the Athenian democracy, questions about the ownership of the motion of history were being publicly posed and publicly challenged. The responses to these questions, however, gradually shifted over time, in reaction to historical and political developments during the fifth and fourth centuries BC. These ideological changes are illuminated by portrayals of the roles played by individuals and groups in significant historical events, as depicted in historiography, funerary monuments, and inscriptions. The emergence in these media of the individual as an indispensable agent of history provides an additional explanation for the reception of Alexander 'the Great': the Greek world had long since been prepared to understand him as it did.

SARAH BROWN FERRARIO is Associate Professor of Greek and Latin at The Catholic University of America. She is a specialist in Greek history and literature, particularly of the fifth and fourth centuries BC.





Historical Agency and the 'Great Man' in Classical Greece

SARAH BROWN FERRARIO





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107037342

© Sarah Brown Ferrario 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Ferrario, Sarah Brown, 1974-

Historical agency and the 'great man' in classical Greece / Sarah Brown Ferrario.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03734-2

DF211.F47 2014

938.0072 - dc23 2014007600

ISBN 978-1-107-03734-2 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Ollie, the greatest little man I know.





Contents

	List of tables [page ix] Acknowledgements [x] Notes on translations, abbreviations, and transliterations [xiii]
1	The search for the 'great man' [1] 1.1 Who 'owns' history? [1] 1.2 The alchemy of Alexander [5] 1.3 'Great men' and the motion of history [11] 1.4 Structure and summary [14]
2	Man, myth, and memory under the early Athenian democracy [18] 2.1 The Tyrannicides and the symbolic vocabulary of 'greatness' [18] 2.2 Marathon and the <i>patrios nomos</i> [25] 2.3 Historical agency and the dead: Memory and the polis in the Athenian cemeteries [44] 2.4 Historical agency and the living: Ostracism and public decrees [52] 2.5 Conclusion: Ancient and modern ascriptions of agency [56]
3	Culture clash? Individuals and groups in the <i>Histories</i> of Herodotus [57] 3.1 Creating history [57] 3.2 Historical agents from Solon to Cyrus [62] 3.3 The Persian 'Constitutional Debate' and the kingship of Darius [72] 3.4 Xerxes' war [78] 3.5 Greeks and "the Greeks" in Herodotus [84] 3.6 Conclusion: Collaborative agency in Herodotus: Leonidas and Solon [101]
4	Claims to immortality: Memories of the Peloponnesian War [104] 4.1 The indispensable individual [104] 4.2 Individual and group agency in Thucydides [106] 4.3 Individuals and groups in the commemorative vocabulary of late fifth-century Athens (c. 440–396) [144] 4.4 Conclusion: The Periclean citizenship law of 451/50 and the tombstones of Athens [176]

vii



viii Contents

5	Into the fourth century: Learning one's limits, knowing one's place [179]
	 5.1 Individual commemoration in a postwar world [179] 5.2 Looking back on the Peloponnesian War: Xenophon's Alcibiades [184] 5.3 A new way of reading the historical world: Leaders and led in the <i>Anabasis</i> [190]
	5.4 Memory and the polis: Athenian commemorative practices in the earlier fourth century [201]
	5.5 Conclusion: Agency and its limits [229]
6	Out beyond Athens: Historical agency in Sparta and Thebes [230]
	6.1 History's heroes: Expanding the Athenian paradigm [230]6.2 The Spartans [234]
	6.3 The Thebans [259]6.4 Conclusion: Self-conscious history [280]
7	A 'new world order'? Philip II of Macedon [284] 7.1 "Europe has never before produced such a man" [284] 7.2 'Speaking' Greek: Philip's public image in the material evidence [290] 7.3 'Reading' Greek: Philip as historical agent in literature [312] 7.4 Conclusion: Philip's script for a new Greek world [318]
8	Alexander 'the Great' [320] 8.1 Alexander in context [320] 8.2 Alexander's personae [322] 8.3 Conclusion: Alexander's audiences [344]
9	Conclusion [346] 9.1 The 'Themistocles decree' [346] 9.2 Conclusion: Agency and 'greatness' [349]
	Bibliography [355] Index locorum [392] Subject index [395]



Tables

- 4.3 Approximate census of *IG* i³ and *IG* ii/iii² Attic epitaphs from the later fifth century BC (to c. 396), by type [page 157]
- 5.4.1 Approximate census of *IG* ii/iii² Attic epitaphs from the first half of the fourth century BC, by type (*excluding* epitaphs dated by *IG* only to the 'fourth century BC') [217]
- 5.4.2 Approximate census of *IG* ii/iii² Attic epitaphs from the first half of the fourth century BC, by type (*including* epitaphs dated by *IG* only to the 'fourth century BC') [218]
- 5.4.3 Approximate census of $IG i^3$ and $IG ii/iii^2$ Attic epitaphs from the later fifth century BC (to c. 396), by type (cf. Table 4.3) [219]
- 5.4.4 Epitaph types by percentages of *IG* corpus, later fifth (cf. Table 5.4.3) and earlier fourth (cf. Tables 5.4.1 and 5.4.2) centuries compared [221]
- 5.4.5 Topics mentioned in category 3 epitaphs of the earlier fourth century (cf. Table 5.4.2) [223]



Acknowledgements

I am most fortunate to be able to acknowledge here a great number of debts. This book began as a dissertation entitled *Towards the 'Great Man': Individuals and Groups as Agents of Historical Change in Classical Greece*, submitted to the Department of Classics at Princeton University in 2006 and now expanded and changed both in organization and in some detail, although the central arguments remain. To my supervisor, Josiah Ober, and my first reader, Michael Flower, I owe many points, both large and small, that helped me to develop and sustain this project, and the recurrences of their names in the notes and the bibliography form only the smallest recompense for the support and assistance they have given me. I also remain very grateful to my second dissertation reader, Christian Wildberg, and to others whose mentorship has shaped my work over the years, most notably Froma Zeitlin and Andrew Feldherr at Princeton, and Tim Long, Matthew Christ, and Cynthia Bannon at Indiana University, Bloomington.

The dissertation phase of this project was funded by a Graduate Prize Fellowship from the Center for the Study of Human Values at Princeton University (2003–04) and by a Fellowship from the Dolores Zohrab Liebmann Fund (2004–05); it also benefited indirectly from a Fulbright Scholarship to Greece (2001–02), a Princeton University Graduate Fellowship (1998–2003), a Marshall Scholarship from the Marshall Aid Commemoration Commission (1996–98), and a Herman B. Wells Scholarship from Indiana University (1992–96). Its transformation into a monograph was assisted by a Summer Stipend from the National Endowment for the Humanities (2008) and, most importantly, by a residential Junior Fellowship at the Center for Hellenic Studies in Washington, DC, under the directorship of Gregory Nagy (2009–10), where the leadership, staff, and fellows combined to make my year there an inordinately pleasant and profitable one.

Portions of this monograph in the same or similar form appear in the following locations:

• Material now in Chapters 5 and 6: "The Tools of Memory: Crafting Historical Legacy in Fourth-Century Greece," in Giovanni Parmeggiani, ed., Between Thucydides and Polybius: The Golden Age of Greek Historiography

x



Acknowledgements

хi

(Washington, DC: Center for Hellenic Studies, Hellenic Studies Series 64, 2014), 263–88.

- Material now in Chapters 5 and 6: "Historical Agency and Self-Awareness in Xenophon's *Hellenica* and *Anabasis*," in Fiona Hobden and Christopher Tuplin, eds., *Xenophon: Ethical Principle and Historical Enquiry* (Leiden: Brill, 2012), 341–76.
- Material now in Chapters 2, 4, and 5: "Replaying *Antigone*: Changing Patterns of Public and Private Commemoration at Athens *c.* 440–350," in Cynthia Patterson, ed., *Antigone's Answer: Essays on Death and Burial, Family and State in Classical Athens* = *Helios* 33 S (2006), 79–117.

I am grateful to all of these editors and publishers for permission to reprint, and also to the presiders, presenters, and audiences at the following conferences who offered comments on oral papers that have also contributed to the finished product:

- "Xenophon: Ethical Principle and Historical Enquiry," University of Liverpool, England (2009).
- American Philological Association (APA) Annual Meeting, Chicago, IL (2008)
- "Greek Historiography in the Fourth Century BCE: Problems and Perspectives," Università degli Studi di Bologna and Harvard University, Bologna (2007).

Those who read chapters (or the conference papers that helped to work them out), answered questions, provided advice on individual details, recommended bibliography, and advanced my thinking in conversation include, but are by no means limited to, the editors of my published pieces listed above, as well as Emily Baragwanath, Nino Luraghi, John Marincola, William McCarthy, Gregory Nagy, Ivana Petrovic, Tim Rood, Gunnar Seelentag, Melina Tamiolaki, Tarik Wareh, and Xiaoqun Wu. Special thanks go to Andrej Petrovic, who provided significant epigraphical assistance, although I of course wish to emphasize that any errors that remain – whether in that area or elsewhere – are entirely my own. I am also deeply grateful to Lilla Kopár and Leonora Neville for their ongoing wisdom and encouragement, both as colleagues and as friends.

The library staff at The Catholic University of America (CUA), especially Kevin Gunn, and the librarians of the Center for Hellenic Studies, Erica Bainbridge, Sophie Boisseau, Lanah Koelle, and Temple Wright, provided essential resources for what has proven to be a very long and wideranging project, and Beth Newman Ooi, Benjamin Lewis, and Andrew



xii Acknowledgements

Hagstrom stepped in as research assistants to check references and Greek texts in the near-final versions of the manuscript. Throughout its preparation, my colleagues in the Department of Greek and Latin at CUA, Frank Mantello, William Klingshirn, William McCarthy, and John Petruccione, have supported my work with patient mentoring, sage advice, and the judicious parceling of teaching and professional responsibilities. And at Cambridge University Press, Michael Sharp, Elizabeth Hanlon, and Gaia Poggiogalli have been invariably generous in their editorial guidance. Sincere thanks are also due to Nina Marcel for her careful copy-editing, and to Roger Bennett for the subject index.

My remaining obligations are both personal and numerous, but I will confine them here to two expressions of profound gratitude: firstly, to the members of my family, especially my most important teachers, Joseph and Nancy Ferrario, *optimis parentibus*; and lastly, to my husband Andrew Simpson and our young son Oliver, *sine quibus nihil*.



Notes on translations, abbreviations, and transliterations

Translations of ancient texts and inscriptions not otherwise acknowledged are my own; all others are cited individually as they are quoted.

Ancient Greek and Roman authors and their works are abbreviated throughout as in the *LSJ* and the *OLD*. Names of journals and periodicals are abbreviated as in *L'année philologique*. The most important exception to the standard bibliographic conventions is Christoph W. Clairmont, *Classical Attic Tombstones*, 8 vols. (Kilchberg, 1993), which is cited as "Clairmont 1993" with page numbers when reference is made to essays and introductory material, and as *CAT* with entry numbers when individual tombstones or their records are cited.

Greek names of both people and places are most often Latinized, with some exceptions where a Hellenizing transcription is in more common use, and with one particular personal indulgence ("Kerameikos" rather than "Ceramicus"). Original spellings have also been preserved in quotations from other sources.

xiii