

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention

Don E. Scheid

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE ETHICS OF ARMED HUMANITARIAN INTERVENTION

The question of military intervention for humanitarian purposes is a major focus for international law, the United Nations, regional organizations such as NATO, and the foreign policies of nations. Against this background, the 2011 bombing in Libya by Western nations has occasioned renewed interest and concern about armed humanitarian intervention (AHI) and the doctrine of responsibility to protect (RtoP). This volume brings together new essays by leading international, philosophical, and political thinkers on the moral and legal issues involved in AHI, and contains both critical and positive views of AHI. Topics include the problem of abuse and needed limitations, the future viability of RtoP and some of its problematic implications, the possibility of AHI providing space for peaceful political protest, and how AHI might be integrated with post-war justice. It is an important collection for those studying political philosophy, international relations, and humanitarian law.

DON E. SCHEID is Professor of Philosophy, Emeritus, at Winona State University. He is co-editor (with Deen K. Chatterjee) of the anthology *Ethics and Foreign Intervention* (Cambridge, 2003).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention

Don E. Scheid

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention

Don E. Scheid

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE ETHICS OF ARMED
HUMANITARIAN
INTERVENTION

DON E. SCHEID



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention
 Don E. Scheid
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107610675

© Cambridge University Press 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

The ethics of armed humanitarian intervention / edited by Don E. Scheid.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03636-9 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-61067-5 (pbk.)

1. Humanitarian intervention—Moral and ethical aspects. 2. Just war doctrine. 3. Intervention (International law) I. Scheid, Don E., editor of compilation.

JZ6369.E74 2014

172'.4—dc23

2013041797

ISBN 978-1-107-03636-9 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-61067-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>Notes on contributors</i>	page vii
<i>Preface and acknowledgments</i>	xi
<i>List of abbreviations and acronyms</i>	xii

PART I Intervention and debate 1

1	Introduction to armed humanitarian intervention	3
	DON E. SCHEID	
2	Revisiting armed humanitarian intervention: a 25-year retrospective	26
	GEORGE R. LUCAS, JR.	
3	The responsibility to protect and the war in Libya	46
	TZVETAN TODOROV, TRANSLATED BY KATHLEEN A. JOHNSON	
	PART II Moral perspectives	59
4	The moral basis of armed humanitarian intervention revisited	61
	FERNANDO R. TESÓN	
5	All or nothing: are there any “merely permissible” armed humanitarian interventions?	78
	NED DOBOS AND C.A.J. COADY	
6	Judging armed humanitarian intervention	95
	HELEN FROWE	
7	Bombing the beneficiaries: the distribution of the costs of the responsibility to protect and humanitarian intervention	113
	JAMES PATTISON	
	PART III Ideas and reconsiderations	131
8	The costs of war: justice, liability, and the Pottery Barn rule	133
	MICHAEL BLAKE	

- 9 Armed humanitarian intervention and the problem of
abuse after Libya 148
LUKE GLANVILLE
- 10 The responsibility to protect and the problem of
regime change 166
ALEX J. BELLAMY
- 11 Law, ethics, and the responsibility to protect 187
MICHAEL W. DOYLE
- 12 Responsibility to protect and the language of crimes:
collective action and individual culpability 209
JENNIFER M. WELSH
- 13 Post-intervention: permissions and prohibitions 224
BRIAN OREND
- 14 Rethinking responsibility to protect: the case for human
sovereignty 243
DAVID RODIN
- Select bibliography* 261
Index 274

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention

Don E. Scheid

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTRIBUTORS

ALEX J. BELLAMY is Professor of International Security at the Griffith Asia Institute/Centre for Governance and Public Policy, Griffith University, Queensland, Australia. He is also Non-Resident Senior Adviser at the International Peace Institute, New York, United States. He is co-editor of the journal *Global Responsibility to Protect*, and he serves on the editorial board of the journal *Ethics & International Affairs*. His recent books include: *Massacres and Morality: Mass Killing in an Age of Civilian Immunity* (2012); *Global Politics and the Responsibility to Protect: From Words to Deeds* (2011); *Understanding Peacekeeping*, 2nd edn., with Paul D. Williams and Stuart Griffin (2010).

MICHAEL BLAKE is Professor of Philosophy and Public Affairs at the University of Washington, in Seattle, Washington, United States. He is Director of the Program on Values in Society. Recent publications include: *Justice and Foreign Policy* (2013); “We Are All Cosmopolitans Now,” in Gillian Brock (ed.), *Cosmopolitanism versus Non-cosmopolitanism: Critiques, Defenses, Reconceptualizations* (2013); and “Does International Law Make a Moral Difference? The Case of Preventive War,” in Deen K. Chatterjee (ed.), *The Ethics of Preventive War* (2013).

C.A.J. (TONY) COADY is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Melbourne, Victoria, Australia. Professor Coady’s books include: *Morality and Political Violence* (2008); *Messy Morality: The Challenge of Politics* (2008); *Terrorism and Justice*, co-editor with Michael O’Keefe (2003); and *Testimony: A Philosophical Study* (1992).

NED DOBOS is Lecturer in Applied Ethics at the University of New South Wales, Canberra, Australia. He is also an Adjunct Fellow at the Centre for Applied Philosophy and Public Ethics at Charles Sturt University. He is the author of *Insurrection and Intervention: The Two Faces of Sovereignty* (2012). Other publications include: “International Rescue and Mediated Consequences,” *Ethics & International Affairs* (2012); and “On Altruistic War and National Responsibility: Justifying Humanitarian Intervention to Soldiers and Taxpayers,” *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice* (2010).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention

Don E. Scheid

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

MICHAEL W. DOYLE is the Harold Brown Professor of International Affairs, Law, and Political Science at Columbia University, New York, United States, and the Chair of the UN Democracy Fund. Professor Doyle's major works include: *Liberal Peace: Selected Essays* (2012); *Striking First: Preemption and Prevention in International Conflict*, with commentaries (2008); *Making War and Building Peace: United Nations Peace Operations*, with Nicholas Sambanis (2006); and *Ways of War and Peace* (1997).

HELEN FROWE is Director at the Stockholm Centre for the Ethics of War and Peace and a Wallenberg Academy Fellow, Department of Philosophy, Stockholm, Sweden. Previously, she was a Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Kent, UK. Her publications include: *The Ethics of War and Peace: An Introduction* (2011); "Self-defence and the Principle of Non-Combatant Immunity," *Journal of Moral Philosophy* (2011); "The Justified Infliction of Unjust Harm," *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society* (2009); and "A Practical Account of Self-Defence," *Law and Philosophy* (2009).

LUKE GLANVILLE is a fellow in the Department of International Relations at the Australian National University, Canberra, Australia. He is a co-editor of the quarterly journal *Global Responsibility to Protect*. His most recent book is *Sovereignty and the Responsibility to Protect: A New History* (2014). His other recent publications include: "The Myth of 'Traditional' Sovereignty," *International Studies Quarterly* (2013); "Intervention in Libya: From Sovereign Consent to Regional Consent," *International Studies Perspectives* (2013); "The Responsibility to Protect Beyond Borders," *Human Rights Law Review* (2012).

KATHLEEN A. JOHNSON is a freelance translator and editor for translation agencies in the United States, United Kingdom, Austria, France, Germany, and Portugal. She has done extensive translation work in a number of fields, including: legal and commercial documents, construction reports and specification documents, World Health Organization reports and environmental studies, newspaper and magazine articles. Her translations of a more literary nature include: Francine Muel-Dreyfus, *Vichy and the Eternal Feminine* (2001); Philippe de la Genardière, "Lesson of the Incipits," *Review of Contemporary Fiction* (Summer 1988); and Philippe Boyer, "Topographies," *Review of Contemporary Fiction* (Summer 1988).

GEORGE R. LUCAS, JR. holds the "Distinguished Chair in Ethics" in the Vice Admiral James B. Stockdale Center for Ethical Leadership at the US Naval Academy (Annapolis, MD). He is also Professor of Ethics and Public Policy at the Graduate School of Public Policy at the Naval Postgraduate School in Monterey, California. His most recent book is *Anthropologists in Arms: The Ethics of Military Anthropology* (2009), and he has a commissioned work on military ethics in preparation. Other publications include: "Industrial Challenges of Military Robotics," *Journal of Military Ethics* (December 2011); and "The Strategy of Graceful Decline," *Ethics & International Affairs* (Summer 2011).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention

Don E. Scheid

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

ix

BRIAN OREND is Director of International Studies and Professor of Philosophy at the University of Waterloo in Canada. He has been Distinguished Visiting Professor of Human Rights at the University of Lund, Sweden. He is best known for his book, *The Morality of War* (2006; revised 2nd edn. 2013) and its emphasis on post-war justice. His other books include: *Introduction to International Studies* (2012); *On War: A Dialogue* (2009); and *Human Rights: Concept and Context* (2002).

JAMES PATTISON is Senior Lecturer in Politics at the School of Social Sciences, University of Manchester, UK. His book, *Humanitarian Intervention and the Responsibility to Protect: Who Should Intervene?* (2010), was awarded a Notable Book Award in 2011 by the International Studies Association. He recently published *The Morality of Private War: The Challenge of Private Military and Security Companies* (2014) and edited the four-volume *Humanitarian Intervention* (2013). His other recent publications include: "The Legitimacy of the Military, Private Military and Security Companies, and Just War Theory," *European Journal of Political Theory* (2012); and "The Ethics of Humanitarian Intervention in Libya," *Ethics & International Affairs* (2011).

DAVID RODIN is Senior Research Fellow at the University of Oxford in the UK where he directs the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law, and Armed Conflict. He is also Senior Fellow at the Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs in New York, United States. He is a regular lecturer at the UK Joint Services Command and Staff College where he provides ethics training for senior officers. He is co-director of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law, and Armed Conflict. His first book was *War and Self-Defense* (2005), and his other publications include: "Terrorism and Torture," in John Skorupski (ed.), *The Routledge Companion to Ethics* (2010); *Just and Unjust Warriors: The Moral and Legal Status of Soldiers*, co-editor with Henry Shue (2008); and *Preemption: Military Action and Moral Justification*, co-editor with Henry Shue (2007).

DON E. SCHEID is Emeritus Professor of Philosophy at Winona State University in Minnesota, United States. Recent publications include: "Replies to Commentaries" (Exchange: Don Scheid on Indefinite Detention of Mega-Terrorists), *Criminal Justice Ethics* (April 2011); "Indefinite Detention of Mega-Terrorists in the War on Terror," *Criminal Justice Ethics* (April 2010); and *Ethics and Foreign Intervention*, co-editor with Deen Chatterjee (2003).

FERNANDO R. TESÓN is the Tobias Simon Eminent Scholar at Florida State University College of Law in Florida, United States. He is a permanent visiting professor at Universidad Torcuato Di Tella, Buenos Aires, Argentina. His publications include: *Rational Choice and Democratic Deliberation*, with Guido Pincione (2006); *Humanitarian Intervention: An Inquiry into Law and Morality*, 3rd edn. (revised) (2005); and *A Philosophy of International Law* (1998).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention

Don E. Scheid

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

X

NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

TZVETAN TODOROV is Honorary Director of Research at the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique in Paris, France. He is the author of 30 or more books, translated into many languages. Among his many publications translated into English are: *The Totalitarian Experience* (2011); *The Fear of Barbarians* (2010); *Torture and the War on Terror* (2009); *The New World Disorder: Reflections of a European* (2005); *Hope and Memory: Lessons from the Twentieth Century* (2003); and *Imperfect Garden: The Legacy of Humanism* (2002).

JENNIFER M. WELSH is Professor and Chair in International Relations at the European University Institute in Florence, and co-director of the Oxford Institute for Ethics, Law, and Armed Conflict. She is an editorial board member for the journals *Ethics & International Affairs* and *Global Responsibility to Protect*, and for the Cambridge University Press BISA series on International Relations. Professor Welsh is the author, co-author, and editor of several works on international relations, the evolution of the Responsibility to Protect, and the ethics of military force. Among recent publications are: *Just and Unjust Military Interventions: European Thinkers from Vitoria to Mill*, co-editor with Stefano Recchia (2013); "Who Should Act? Collective Responsibility and the Responsibility to Protect," in Andy Knight and Frazer Egerton (eds.), *The Routledge Handbook on the Responsibility to Protect* (2012); and "Implementing the 'Responsibility to Protect': Where Expectations Meet Reality," *Ethics & International Affairs* (Winter 2010).

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03636-9 - The Ethics of Armed Humanitarian Intervention

Don E. Scheid

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The 2011 bombing in Libya by Western nations occasioned renewed debate and concern about armed humanitarian intervention and the doctrine of “Responsibility to Protect” (RtoP). This book is a collection of chapters on many of the important moral and legal issues involved. All the chapters are original contributions, written specifically for this volume. The chapters are by leading international thinkers from Australia, Canada, France, the United Kingdom, and the United States.

The question of military intervention for humanitarian purposes has become a major focus for international law, the United Nations, regional organizations such as NATO, and the foreign policies of nations. The chapters reflect the latest ideas of the authors on this timely international issue – one that continues to evolve in the quest for reasonable global governance.

A number of the chapters present perspectives on the moral rationale for armed humanitarian intervention (AHI). Others focus on normative aspects of the practice – including critical views of AHI, the problem of abuse and needed limitations, the future viability of RtoP and some of its problematic implications, the possibility of AHI providing space for peaceful political protest, and how AHI might be integrated with post-war justice.

I wish to thank all the authors for their contributions to this volume and, in some cases, their work on revisions. Special thanks go to Hilary Gaskin of Cambridge University Press and to her assistant, Anna Lowe, for their advice, patience, and valuable help in the preparation of this volume. I am especially grateful to my wife, Dr. Mary Ann Scheid, for her support – and quiet tolerance during episodes of absentmindedness or grouchiness.

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AHI	armed humanitarian intervention
AU	African Union
BRICS countries	Brazil, Russia, India, China, South Africa
CDF	Canadian Defence Force
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency (US)
DDE	doctrine of double effect
ECOWAS	Economic Community of West African States
EU	European Union
GA	General Assembly (UN)
G-8	Group of Eight (governments of eight countries: Canada, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, Russia, UK, United States; also represented is the European Union)
G-77	Group of 77 (at the UN, a loose coalition of developing countries)
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICISS	International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ISAF	International Security Assistance Force (Afghanistan)
KFOR	Kosovo Force (NATO-led international peacekeeping force responsible for establishing a secure environment in Kosovo, beginning in June 1999)
KLA	Kosovo Liberation Army
LTTE	Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam
MOOTW	military operations other than war
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO	non-governmental organization
NTC	National Transition Council (of Libya)
ROE	rules of engagement
RPF	Rwandan Patriotic Front
RtoP or R2P	Responsibility to Protect
SC	Security Council (UN)
UAE	United Arab Emirates

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

xiii

UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNAMIR	United Nations Assistance Mission in Rwanda
UNDUTCHBAT	United Nations Dutch battalion
UNOCI	United Nations Operation in Côte d'Ivoire
UNPROFOR	United Nations Protection Force
UNSC	United Nations' Security Council
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (Soviet Union)