The Use of Force and International Law

*The Use of Force and International Law* offers an authoritative overview of international law governing the resort to force. Looking through the prism of the contemporary challenges that this area of international law faces, including technology, sovereignty, actors, compliance and enforcement, this book addresses key aspects of international law in this area:

- the general breadth and scope of the prohibition of force
- what is meant by ‘force’
- the use of force through the UN and regional organisations
- the use of force in peacekeeping operations
- the right of self-defence and the customary limitations upon this right
- forcible intervention in civil conflicts
- the controversial doctrine of humanitarian intervention.

Suitable for advanced undergraduate and postgraduate students, academics and practitioners, *The Use of Force and International Law* offers a contemporary, comprehensive and accessible treatment of the subject.

**Christian Henderson** is Professor of International Law at the University of Sussex. He is co-editor-in-chief of the *Journal on the Use of Force and International Law* and is a member of the International Law Association’s Committee on the Use of Force.
The Use of Force and International Law

Christian Henderson

University of Sussex
CONTENTS

Introduction

PART I The Prohibition of the Threat or Use of Force

1 The General Breadth and Scope of the Prohibition of the Threat or Use of Force
   Introduction
   1 Historical Attempts at Regulating the Use of Force in International Affairs
   2 The Sources of the Contemporary Prohibition of the Threat or Use of Force
      2.1 The Text of Article 2(4)
      2.1.1 Lack of Express Mention of Exceptions to the Prohibition
      2.1.2 'against the territorial integrity or political independence of any state'
      2.1.3 'or in any other manner inconsistent with the purposes of the United Nations'
      2.1.4 The Subjects of the Prohibition: 'International Relations'
      2.2 The Peremptory Status of the Prohibition
         2.2.1 The Prospects for Normative Change
         3 The 'Threat' of Force
         4 Accountability, State Responsibility and Responses to a Threat or Use of Force
            4.1 Reparations
            4.2 Countermeasures
            4.3 Self-Defence
            4.4 Institutional Involvement: The UN Security Council and Regional Organisations
            4.5 Courts and Tribunals
               4.5.1 The Actions of States
               4.5.2 The Actions of Individuals: The Crime of Aggression
vi  Table of Contents

4.6 Commissions of Inquiry 39
5 Questioning the Continued Relevance and Effectiveness of the Prohibition 40
Conclusion 48
Suggested Further Reading 49

2  The Meaning of ‘Force’ 50
Introduction 50
1 The Principle of Non-Intervention 51
2 The Type of ‘Force’ Envisaged in Article 2(4) 52
3 What Is ‘Armed Force’? 55
3.1 Is the Actual Use of a Weapon Required? 57
3.1.1 Conventional Weapons 57
3.1.2 Non-Conventional Weapons 59
3.2 The Indirect Use of Armed Force 60
4 The ‘Gravity’ Element of a Use of Force 62
4.1 Distinguishing ‘Use of Force’, ‘Armed Attack’ and ‘Aggression’ 63
4.1.1 ‘Armed Attack’ 63
4.1.2 ‘Aggression’ 64
4.2 ‘Minimal’ Uses of Force and the Possible Existence of a De Minimis Threshold 65
4.2.1 Distinguishing ‘Law Enforcement’ and the ‘Use of Force’: The Relevance of ‘International Relations’ 68
4.2.1.1 Foreign Individuals or Groups 69
4.2.1.2 Foreign Marine Vessels 71
4.2.1.3 Foreign Civil Aircraft 72
4.2.2 Targeting Individuals, Vessels and Aircraft as a Proxy for Another State 73
4.2.3 Conclusion 74
5 The Mens Rea Element of the Use of Force 75
5.1 Distinguishing General Motives for Action and Intention 76
5.2 Mistake 77
5.3 Discerning Hostile Intent 78
Conclusion 79
Suggested Further Reading 81

PART II  The Use of Force in the Context of Collective Security 83

3 The Use of Force under the Auspices of the United Nations 85
Introduction 85
1 The Maintenance of International Peace and Security: The Division of Competence within the United Nations 87
1.1 The Security Council 87
1.2 The General Assembly 90
1.3 The Secretariat

2 The Forcible Powers of the Security Council in the UN Charter

2.1 Article 39: The ‘Gateway’ Provision to Chapter VII

2.1.1 Threats to the Peace

2.1.2 Breaches of the Peace and Acts of Aggression

2.2 Envisaged Measures under Chapter VII

2.3 Limits to the Forcible Powers of the Security Council

3 The Chapter VII Powers of the Security Council to Use Force in Practice

3.1 The Cold War Era (1945–89)

3.2 The Post–Cold War Era (1989– )

3.2.1 The Development of the ‘Authorisation’ Method

3.2.2 Subsequent Practice in the Use of the Authorisation Method

3.2.3 Concerns Regarding the Authorisation Method

3.2.4 The General Assembly and the Use of Force

4 Chapter VIII and the Authorisation of ‘Regional Organisations’

4.1 The African Union

4.2 The North Atlantic Treaty Organization

Conclusion

Suggested Further Reading

4 Issues in Relation to Authorisation by the United Nations Security Council

Introduction

1 Striking the Balance between Unilateralism and Multilateralism

2 The Revival of Past Authorisations

2.1 The Mandate Contained within Resolution 678 (1990)

2.2 The Concept of ‘Material Breach’ in the Practice of the Security Council

2.3 The Authority to Determine a ‘Material Breach’ and the Consequences

2.4 The Legacy of the Revival Argument

3 Determining the Breadth and Scope of an Authorisation

3.1 Libya (2011)

3.1.1 Assistance to Opposition Forces

3.1.2 Regime Change

3.2 Côte d’Ivoire (2011)

4 The Doctrine of ‘Implied’ Authorisation

4.1 Unilateral Enforcement of the ‘Collective Will’ of the UN Security Council

4.1.1 Iraq (1991–2002)

4.1.2 Kosovo (1999)

4.1.3 Assessing Claims to Unilaterally Enforce the ‘Collective Will’

4.2 Retrospective Authorisation or Approval

4.2.1 Liberia (1990–7)

4.2.2 Sierra Leone (1996–9)
## Table of Contents

4.2.3 Assessing Claims of Retrospective Authorisation or Approval 153

5 Implementing the ‘Responsibility to Protect’ 154

5.1 Enforcement of the Secondary Responsibility to Protect 155

5.2 R2P: Old Wine in New Bottles? 158

5.2.1 Darfur (Sudan) (2003–) 159

5.2.2 Libya (2011) 160

5.2.3 Syria (2011–) 163

Conclusion 164

Suggested Further Reading 166

5 United Nations Peacekeeping and the Use of Force 167

Introduction 167

1 Attempting to Define UN Peacekeeping 169

2 The Legal Basis for UN Peacekeeping Operations 170

3 The Basic Principles of UN Peacekeeping 173

3.1 Consent of the Parties 173

3.2 Impartiality 174

3.3 Non-Use of Force Except in Self-Defence 174

4 Peacekeeping Operations: 1945–89 176

4.1 UNEF I (1956–67) 176

4.2 ONUC (1960–4) 178

4.3 Other Notable Cold War Peacekeeping Operations 179

5 Peacekeeping Operations: 1990–2017 180

5.1 UNPROFOR (1992–5) 181

5.2 UNOSOM II (1993–5) 182

5.3 UNAMSIL (1999–2005) 184

5.4 UNAMID (2007–) 185

5.5 MONUC (2000–10) and MONUSCO (2010–) 185

5.6 MINUSMA (2013–) 187

6 The Evolution in the Use of Force by UN Peacekeeping Operations 189

6.1 The Evolution in the Legal Basis for the Use of Force 190

6.1.1 Personal Self-Defence 190

6.1.2 (Self-)Defence of the Mandate 190

6.1.3 Authorisation by the UN Security Council 192

6.2 Reconciling the Provision of ‘Robust’ Security Council Mandates with the ‘Trinity’ of Peacekeeping Principles 193

6.2.1 Non-Use of Force, Except in Self-Defence and Defence of the Mandate 193

6.2.2 Consent 195

6.2.3 Impartiality 196

6.3 Peace Observation, Peacekeeping, Peace Enforcement, or War Fighting? 197

Conclusion 199

Suggested Further Reading 201
PART III The Use of Force in Self-Defence

6 General Aspects of the Right of Self-Defence

Introduction

1 The Concept of an ‘Armed Attack’
1.1 The Perpetrators of an Armed Attack
1.2 The Targets of an Armed Attack
1.3 Issues of Proof
1.4 The Mens Rea Element: Does an Armed Attack Need to Be Intended?

1.5 A Gravity Threshold Distinguishing ‘Armed Attacks’ from ‘Uses of Force’

1.5.1 Problems with a Gravity Threshold
1.5.1.1 Fixing the Threshold
1.5.1.2 The Threshold in the Practice of States
1.5.2 Gravity and the ‘Accumulation of Events’ Theory

2 The Customary Requirements of Necessity and Proportionality

2.1 Necessity
2.2 Proportionality

2.2.1 Proportionality and the ‘Accumulation of Events’ Theory

3 Armed Reprisals
4 The Protection of Nationals Abroad

4.1 Attacks on Nationals as an Armed Attack
4.2 The Protection of Nationals and the Requirement of Necessity

4.2.1 Attacks or Threats to Nationals by the Government
4.2.2 Attacks or Threats to Nationals that the Government Is Either Unwilling or Unable to Prevent

4.2.3 Operations to Extract Nationals

5 The Right of Collective Self-Defence

5.1 The Nature of Collective Self-Defence
5.2 The Regulation of the Right of Collective Self-Defence

6 The Role of the UN Security Council

6.1 The Reporting Requirement
6.2 The ‘Until Clause’

Conclusion

Suggested Further Reading

7 Preventative Self-Defence

Introduction

1 Intercepting an Armed Attack
2 Anticipating an Armed Attack: The Concept of ‘Imminence’

2.1 The Academic Debate: ‘Expansionists’ v. ‘Restrictionists’
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.3 International Human Rights Law</td>
<td>342</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Further Reading</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### PART IV Forcible Intervention in Situations of Civil Unrest

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9 Consent to Intervention and Intervention in Civil Wars</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Identifying Authority to Consent</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 The General Framework: Governments and Non-State Actors</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Effective Control</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Recognition</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 The Principle of Self-Determination</td>
<td>360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Intervention in Civil Wars</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 The ‘Negative Equality’ Principle</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The Purpose-Based Approach</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Counter-Intervention</td>
<td>368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 The Form of the Consent or Invitation to Intervene</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 The Limits of the Provided Consent or Invitation to Intervene</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>377</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Further Reading</td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10 The Doctrine of Humanitarian Intervention</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>379</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 The UN Charter and Humanitarian Intervention</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Humanitarian Intervention as a Circumstance Precluding Wrongfulness</td>
<td>385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Humanitarian Intervention in the Practice of States</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Cold War</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Post-Cold War: From Iraq to Kosovo</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1 Iraq (1991–2002)</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2 ECOWAS Intervention in Liberia (1990)</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.3 ECOWAS Intervention in Sierra Leone (1997–8)</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4 Kosovo (1999)</td>
<td>393</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.4.1 Humanitarian Intervention in the Aftermath of Operation Allied Force</td>
<td>396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Humanitarian Intervention and the Responsibility to Protect</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 The Civil War in Syria and Humanitarian Intervention</td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Further Reading</td>
<td>407</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Concluding Remarks**

**Index**

© in this web service Cambridge University Press  www.cambridge.org