

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CARTELS, MARKETS AND CRIME

This study of the normative justification for the use of criminal sanctions as a means of cartel control goes beyond the historical and economic viewpoints by adding a normative evaluation of anti-cartel regimes and analysing cartel control in the USA, Europe and the UK. The analysis is unique in seeking to establish why, in a liberal society, criminal sanctions should apply to individuals who participate in this sort of activity. Although cartels have been rhetorically likened to theft and fraud, there are significant differences. Notwithstanding these differences, *Cartels, Markets and Crime* presents an argument for the criminalisation of economic collusion, and, with this argument in mind, analyses the regimes of the US, EU and UK and considers the possibility of global convergence.

BRUCE WARDHAUGH is a lecturer at the School of Law, Queen's University Belfast, where his research interests include competition law and WTO law.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

THE CAMBRIDGE ANTITRUST AND COMPETITION LAW SERIES

Series Editors:

Maheer M. Dabbah, Chair, Competition Law and Policy and Director of the Inter-disciplinary Centre for Competition Law and Policy (ICC), Queen Mary, University of London

Barry Hawk, Professor of Law and Director of the Fordham Competition Law Institute, Fordham University School of Law; Senior Counsel, Labruna Mazziotti Segni

Board members:

Dr Werner Berg, Partner, Crowell & Moring LLP

Professor Claus-Dieter Ehlermann, WilmerHale

Professor Alan Fels, The Australia and New Zealand School of Government

Professor Eleanor Fox, New York University, New York

Professor Frederic Jenny, Cour de Cassation, Paris

Mr Paul Lasok QC, Monckton Chambers, London

Professor Mitsuo Mitsushita, Nagashima, Ohno & Tsunematsu, Tokyo, Japan;

Professor Emeritus, University of Tokyo

Dr David E. Tadmor, Partner, Tadmor & Co. Law Offices, Tel Aviv, Israel; former

Director General of the Israel Antitrust Authority

Dr Cento Valjenovski, Managing Partner, Case Associates, London

Publications within the Series consider various legal, economic and political developments related to competition law and policy. They also consider the application of competition law and policy in sector-specific as well as cross-sector contexts and deal with policy questions ranging from the formation and adoption of competition law and policy (whether at national, regional or international level) to those dealing with enforcement, and the connection between law and competition in the market place. The Series also accommodates different analytical and interdisciplinary viewpoints, such as law and economics; law and political science; law and economic geography-driven perspectives.

The Series includes publications designed to cater for academic demands as well as practitioner publications catering for the continuously evolving needs of regulators, policy-makers, and practitioners, in particular lawyers and economists (who increasingly provide advice on regulatory questions).

The editorial board of the Series welcome proposals by authors and editors who are interested in contributing to the Series through: academic monographs; revised PhD theses of high quality; practitioner texts and collections; and edited volumes.

List of books in the series:

Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion *Bruce Wardhaugh* 9781107036307

Merger Control Worldwide (two-volume set) *General editors: Maheer M. Dabbah and Paul Lasok QC* 9780521195096

Greening EU Competition Law and Policy *Suzanne Kingston* 9781107003026

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

A Principled Approach to Abuse of Dominance in European Competition Law *Liza
Lovdahl Gormsen* 9780521767149

International and Comparative Competition Law *Maher M. Dabbah* 9780521516419

The International Dimension of EU Competition Law and Policy *Anestis
S. Papadopoulos* 9780521196468

Anti-Cartel Enforcement Worldwide (three-volume set) *General editors: Maher
M. Dabbah and Barry E. Hawk* 9780521897211

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CARTELS, MARKETS AND CRIME

A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation
of Economic Collusion

BRUCE WARDHAUGH



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion
Bruce Wardhaugh
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107036307

© Bruce Wardhaugh 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by CPI Group Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Wardhaugh, Bruce, 1960–

Cartels, markets and crime : a normative justification for the criminalisation
of economic collusion / Bruce Wardhaugh.

pages cm. – (The Cambridge antitrust and competition)

ISBN 978-1-107-03630-7

1. Cartels – Europe – History. I. Title.

HD2757.5.W37 2014

338.8'7–dc23

2013016197

ISBN 978-1-107-03630-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication,
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

To Jen and Jay

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

CONTENTS

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i>	xiv
<i>Preface</i>		xv
<i>Acknowledgements</i>		xvi
<i>Table of cases</i>		xvii
<i>Table of treaties, statutes and legislative instruments</i>		xxvii
Introduction	1	
0.1 Cartels and calls for their criminalisation	1	
0.2 Cartels and their effects	4	
0.2.1 Defining cartels	4	
0.2.2 The economic effect of cartels	7	
0.3 An outline of this work	11	
1 A normative approach to the criminalisation of cartel activity	18	
1.1 Liberalism and the harm to others justification of the criminal law	18	
1.1.1 Harm (generally) and criminalisation	18	
1.1.2 Mill and the harm to others principle	19	
1.1.3 Protected harms	22	
1.1.4 Rawls' 'veil of ignorance' and the choice of social institutions	26	
1.2 An outline of a liberal theory of the limits to criminal law	33	
1.3 Cartel harms: an analysis	37	
1.3.1 Raising the price of goods as a prohibited harm	37	
1.3.2 Creating deadweight loss as a prohibited harm	40	
1.3.3 Creation of social waste as a prohibited harm	41	
1.3.4 Stunting the development of new products and processes as a prohibited harm	42	
1.3.5 Exacerbation of X-inefficiency as a prohibited harm	43	
1.4 Harm to the institution of distributive justice as the justification for criminalising cartel activity	43	

1.5 Conclusion: an extension and two caveats	48
2 Corporate responsibility, agency and the advantages of vicarious liability	52
2.1 Introduction	52
2.2 The agency problem in corporate action and control	54
2.3 Attribution rules: principles of corporate liability	56
2.4 Identification, <i>Tesco</i> and a historical mistake	57
2.4.1 The development of the doctrine	57
2.4.2 <i>Tesco's</i> flaw	65
2.5 Alternative models of corporate liability	67
2.5.1 Aggregation	67
2.5.2 Corporate fault and/or corporate culture	69
2.5.3 Vicarious liability	71
2.6 The objective of corporate liability: deterrence beyond tort	75
2.7 A model corporate criminal liability regime	79
2.7.1 Agency, monitoring and liability: attribution rules	80
2.7.2 Vicarious liability: with or without a due diligence defence	83
2.8 Conclusion	87
3 Closing the deterrence gap: individual sanctions	89
3.1 Introduction	89
3.2 A model of deterrence	90
3.3 Deterrence and cartel activity	92
3.3.1 Probability of cartel detection	93
3.3.2 Cartel overcharges	93
3.3.3 Cartel duration	94
3.3.4 Implications for cartel deterrence	95
3.4 Bankruptcy and the consequences of optimally deterrent fines	95
3.4.1 Bankruptcy considerations	95
3.4.2 The existing fine regime as under-deterring	97
3.5 Filling the deterrence gap with individual criminal liability	101
3.6 Conclusion	103
4 The American experience of cartel control: values and effectiveness	106
4.1 Introduction	106
4.2 Natural law and morality: the nineteenth-century background	108

CONTENTS xi

4.3	Pre-Sherman Act values: the states and Congress	114
4.3.1	Nineteenth-century public policy	114
4.3.2	Early state antitrust regimes	114
4.3.3	The Congressional background	120
4.4	Protection of consumer surplus: judicial interpretation of the Sherman Act	125
4.4.1	Early days: literalism or realism	125
4.4.2	<i>Standard Oil</i> : per se and the rule of reason	132
4.4.3	<i>Appalachian Coals</i> : a Depression-era outlier	136
4.4.4	Per se rules against price-fixing	138
4.4.5	Sensitivity to economic reality	147
4.5	Efficacy and enforcement: other strands to the American System	157
4.5.1	Private (civil) enforcement	158
4.5.2	Certainty of punishment	162
4.5.3	Leniency programmes	162
4.6	Conclusions: American values	165
5	The European experience	168
5.1	Introduction	168
5.2	A tale of two cities: Washington and Freiburg	170
5.2.1	The influence of Washington	172
5.2.2	The influence of Freiburg	175
5.3	Completing the market: the early days of European competition policy	181
5.3.1	Market Integration as a goal of competition policy	182
5.3.2	Economic crisis and litigation failure: a reformulation of competition policy	190
5.3.3	Economic analysis, modernisation and the shift to consumer welfare	193
5.3.4	Is consumer welfare the sole standard?	197
5.4	Conclusion	204
6	Cartel control in the UK: the failure of supplementary criminalisation	211
6.1	Introduction	211
6.2	The UK regime: 1880–1936	213
6.2.1	The rise of marketplace liberalism	213
6.2.2	Mill's liberal influences	216
6.3	The economic downturn of the 1930s: cartels as industrial policy	220
6.3.1	Economic downturn: the coal industry as an example	220
6.3.2	Other industries	223

6.4	Post-war: the Monopolies and Restrictive Trade Practices Commission, the Restrictive Trade Practices Act and Court	224
6.4.1	Post-war internationalisation	225
6.4.2	The post-war UK regime	227
6.5	The British reception of European reform	231
6.5.1	Reforming the regime	231
6.5.2	The attempt at criminalisation	234
6.5.3	The failure of criminalisation	240
6.6	The 2012 reforms	242
6.6.1	Calls for consultation	242
6.6.2	The Reform Bill	244
6.7	Conclusion: tolerance and ad hocery – the failure of supplementary criminalisation	247
7	Internationalisation and transplantation	253
7.1	Introduction	253
7.2	Convergence: goals and types	254
7.2.1	Types of convergence	254
7.2.2	Convergence, legal values and norms	257
7.3	Anglo-American values of antitrust	259
7.3.1	Introduction	259
7.3.2	American values	260
7.3.3	European values	261
7.3.4	British values	263
7.4	Competing values at the global level	265
7.4.1	Hofstede's results	265
7.4.2	Difficulties with 'top-down' convergence	267
7.4.3	Regional agreements as an alternative	269
7.4.4	Global 'bottom-up' convergence	271
7.5	Resource allocation, institutional credibility and national priorities	276
7.5.1	Resource allocation as a global problem	276
7.5.2	Resource allocation and competing demands	278
7.6	Corporate governance and cartel control	280
7.6.1	The nature of the problem	280
7.6.2	Individual criminal liability	281
7.7	Collectivist values and individual responsibility	284
7.7.1	Hofstede's insight <i>redux</i>	284
7.7.2	Collectivist values and legal norms	285
7.8	Global convergence of corporate governance	286
7.9	Cartel control, convergence and good practice	288

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion
Bruce Wardhaugh
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CONTENTS xiii

Conclusion	297
8.1 The normative background to cartel criminalisation	297
8.2 A pragmatic justification for cartel criminalisation	302
8.3 Scepticism about the expansion of criminalisation: the US, EU and UK regimes examined	304
8.4 Scepticism about internationalisation	310
<i>Bibliography</i>	316
<i>Index</i>	335

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion
Bruce Wardhaugh
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

FIGURES

Figure 1 Welfare losses from monopoly *page* 7
Figure 2 Loss from productive inefficiency 10

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

PREFACE

At the time that this work went to the publisher (January 2013), the Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Bill (part of which was intended to reform the UK's competition regime) was still subject to Parliamentary consideration. The Bill was expected to receive Royal Assent in the spring of 2013. Accordingly, the discussion of reforms to the UK regime reflects the provisional nature of this legislation.

This work refers to the Articles of the various European Treaties in the way they are numbered in the Treaties. This should present no confusion to those familiar with the topic. It has also relied upon Commission Decisions (and other European materials) in authentic languages, when there is no authentic English version. I have consulted French, German and Dutch versions, though citing the French text. Unless otherwise attributed, all translations are mine.

When a work which has been reprinted over time (e.g. Locke's *Second Treatise*) is cited, citations to chapters and sections are provided, avoiding page numbers. This facilitates users of other editions to find the relevant passage. The exception to this is Mill's *On Liberty* where an authoritative text exists, and to which I refer.

The terms 'antitrust law' and 'competition law' are used interchangeably, though strictly speaking the former is American terminology. This allows for a bit of variation in my vocabulary.

All web references were verified on 30 January 2013.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many people have assisted me in the production of this work. Parts of this work have appeared in print previously. In particular, some of the Introduction and Chapter 1 appear as part of my article 'A Normative Approach to the Criminalisation of Cartel Activity' in *Legal Studies* (2012), and part of Chapter 3 appeared as 'Closing the Deterrence Gap: Individual Liability, the Cartel Offence and the BIS Consultation' in *The Competition Law Journal* (2011).

Prior to publication, I presented versions of the *Legal Studies* article at the Socio-Legal Studies Annual Meeting in Brighton in 2011 and the Society of Legal Scholars Meeting in Cambridge, also in 2011. Part of Chapter 2 was presented at the Socio-Legal Studies Association Annual Meeting in Leicester in 2012 and at the 2012 Society of Legal Scholars meeting in Bristol. Parts of Chapter 4 were presented at the University of East Anglia/Centre for Competition Policy Conference in June of 2012. I wish to thank all who commented on these papers (including anonymous reviewers), and in particular Jonathan Galloway, Andreas Stephen, Angus MacCulloch, Bill Kovacic, Christopher Brown and Morten Hviid. The usual disclaimers apply.

I would also like to thank my wife, Jennifer, who assisted in checking references and proof reading. Of course, all errors are mine alone.

My greatest debt is to my family, Jennifer and Jason, who tolerated my work and endured my absence from them (physically, mentally and at times spiritually) during the writing of this book. I doubt I would have accomplished this task without their support, for which I thank them.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF CASES

Canada

- Canadian Dredge and Dry Dock v. The Queen* [1985] 1 SCR 662, 19 DLR (4th) 314, 19 CCC (3d) 1 57
- Irving Paper Limited v. Atofina Chemicals Inc.* (2009) 99 OR (3d) 358 (Ont SC) 161
- Pro-Sys Consultants Ltd et al. v. Microsoft Corporation et al., Sun-Rype Products Ltd et al. v. Archer Daniels Midland Company et al., and Samsung Electronics Co Ltd et autres v. Option Consommateurs et autres* SCC Docket Numbers 34282, 342823 and 34617 (heard 17 October 2012) 255
- R v. Sault Ste Marie* [1978] 2 SCR 1299, 85 DLR (3d) 161, 40 CCC (2d) 353

European Union

Commission Decisions

- Electrical and Mechanical Carbon and Graphite Products* (C.36.490) [2002] OJ L100/1 96
- Case COMP/39406 – Commission Decision of 28.1.2009 relating to a proceeding under Article 81 of the Treaty and Article 53 of the EEA Agreement (Case COMP/39406 – *Marine Hoses*) [2008] OJ C122/01 101
- Case COMP/B/37.766 – Summary of Commission Decision of 18 April 2007 relating to a proceeding under Article 81 of the Treaty establishing the European Community (Case COMP/B/37.766 – *Dutch Beer Market*) [2008] OJ C122/01 101
- Bathroom Fittings* 23 June 2010, IP/10/790 (non-confidential version not yet available) 96
- Case COMP/39839 *Telefónica and Portugal Telecom*; IP/11/1241, 25.10.2011 (non-confidential version not yet available) 199

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xviii

TABLE OF CASES

Commission Decisions

- Commission Decision of 23 September 1964 relative à une procédure au titre de l'article 85 du traité (IV-A/00004-03344 *Grundig-Consten*) [1964] OJ 23/2545 182–4, 205–6
- Commission Decision of 16 July 1969 relative à une procédure au titre de l'article 85 du traité (IV/26.623 – *Entente internationale de la quinine*) [1969] OJ L192/5 182, 184–5, 189, 206
- Commission Decision of 24 July 1969 relative à une procédure au titre de l'article 85 du traité CEE (IV/26.267 – *Matières colorantes*) [1969]? OJ L195/11 182, 184–7, 189, 206
- Décision de la Commission, du 16 décembre 1971, relative à une procédure au titre de l'article 85 du traité de la CEE (IV/324 – *Vereeniging van Cementhandelaren*) 72/22/CEE [1972] OJ L13/34 189
- Commission Decision of 29 April 1994 relating to a proceeding under Article 85 of the EC Treaty (IV/34.456 – *Stichting Baksteen*) 94/296/EC [1994] OJ L131/15 190, 198, 207
- Commission Decision of 24 January 1999 relating to a proceeding under Article 81 of the EC Treaty and Article 53 of the EEA Agreement (Case IV.F.1/36.718 – *CECED*) [2000] OJ L187/47 198, 204, 207
- Commission Decision of 7 June 2000 relating to a proceeding pursuant to Article 81 of the EC Treaty and Article 53 of the EEA Agreement (Case COMP/36.545/F3 – *Amino Acids*) [2000] OJ L152/24 196
- Commission Decision of 21 November 2001 relating to a proceeding pursuant to Article 81 of the EC Treaty and Article 53 of the EEA Agreement (Case COMP/E-1/37.512 – *Vitamins*) [2003] OJ L6/1 196
- Commission Decision of 5 December 2001 relating to a proceeding pursuant to Article 81 of the EC Treaty and Article 53 of the EEA Agreement (Case COMP/E-1/36 604 – *Citric Acid*) [2002] OJ L239/18 196
- Commission Decision of 3 December 2003 relating to a proceeding under Article 81 of the EC Treaty and Article 53 of the EEA Agreement (Case C.38.359 – *Electrical and mechanical carbon and graphite products*) [2004] OJ L125/49 96
- Summary of Commission Decision of 21 February 2007 relating to a proceeding under Article 81 of the Treaty establishing the European Community (Case COMP/E-1/38.823 – *Elevators and Escalators*) (notified under document number C(2007) 512 final) [2008] OJ C75/10 4

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF CASES

xix

*EU – Courts**Court of Justice*

- Cases 56 & 58/64 *Consten SaRL and Grundig-Verkaufs-GmbH v. Commission* [1966] ECR 299, CMLR 418 182–4, 200, 205, 206, 261–2, 292–3
- Case 5/69 *Völk v. Vervaecke* [1969] ECR 295 187
- Case 41/69 *ACF Chemiefarma NV v. Commission* [1970] ECR 661 182
- Case 45/69 *Boehringer Mannheim v. Commission* [1970] ECR 769 182
- Cases 48, 49, 51–57/69 *ICI v. Commission, BASF v. Commission, Bayer v. Commission, Geigy v. Commission Sandoz v. Commission, Francolor v. Commission, Cassella v. Commission, ACNA v. Commission* [1972] ECR 619 185, 187, 191
- Case 6/72 *Europemballage Corporation and Continental Can Company Inc v. Commission* [1973] ECR 215 202
- Case 8/72 *Vereeniging van Cementhandelaren v. Commission* [1972] ECR 977 189
- Case 27/76 *United Brands v. Commission* [1978] ECR 305 186
- Case 22/78 *Hugin Kassaregister AB v. Commission* [1979] ECR 1869 187
- Cases 100–103/80 *Musique Diffusion Francaise SA v. Commission* [1983] ECR 1825 187
- Case 240/83 *Procureur de la République v. ADBHU* [1985] ECR 531 203
- Cases 25 & 26/84 *Ford Werke AG v. Commission* [1985] ECR 2725 187
- C-89/85, C-104/85, C-114/85, C-116/85, C-117/85 and C-125–9/85 *Ahlström Oy et al v. Commission* [1988] ECR 5193 (“*Woodpulp I*”) 191
- C-89/85, C-104/85, C-114/85, C-116/85, C-117/85 and C-125–9/85 *Ahlström Oy et al v. Commission* [1993] ECR I-1307 (“*Woodpulp II*”) 191
- C-137/92 *P Commission v. BASF et al* [1994] ECR I-2555 191
- C-185/93 *Bundesanstalt für den Güterfernverkehr v. Gebrüder Reiff* [1993] ECR I-5801 187
- C-233/94 *Federal Republic of Germany v. European Parliament* [1997] ECR I-2441 203
- C-126/97 *Eco Swiss China Time Ltd v. Benetton International NV* [1999] ECR I-3055 203
- C-379/99 *PreussenElektra AG on the Interpretation of Article 30 of the EC Treaty* [2001] ECR I-2159 203
- C-453/99 *Courage Limited v. Crehan* [2001] ECR, I-6297 203, 192
- C-295–289/04 *Vincenzo Manfredi v. Lloyd Adriatico Assicurazioni* [2006] ECR I-6619, 5 CMLR 17 292

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

XX

TABLE OF CASES

- C-289/04P *Showa Denko KK v. Commission* [2006] ECR I-5859 203
 C-308/04P, C-308/94 *SGL Carbon v. Commission* [2006] ECR I-5977 203
 C-468/06 to C-478/06 *Sot. Lelos kai Sia EE et al. v. GlaxoSmithKline AVEE* [2008] ECR I-7139 203
 C-501, C-513, C-515 and C-519/06 *GlaxoSmithKline Services v. Commission* [2009] ECR I-9291 199–200
 C-360/09 *Pfleiderer v. Bundeskartellamt* NYR (14 June 2011) 243, 250, 291
 C-496/09 *Italy v. Commission* NYR (17 November 2011) 202

General Court/Court of First Instance

- T-30/91 *Solvay et al v. Commission* [1995] ECR II-1775 191
 T-83/91 *Tetra Pak International SA v. Commission* [1994] ECR II-755 203
 T-25/95 *Cimenteries CBR v. Commission* [2002] ECR II-491 6
 T-62/98 *Volkswagen AG v. Commission* [2000] ECR II-2707 187
 T-68/99 *Società Italiano Vetro et al v. Commission* [1992] ECR II-1552 191
 T-342/99 *Airtours v. Commission* [2002] ECR II-2585 192
 T-310/01 *Schneider Electric SA v. Commission* [2002] ECR II-4071
 (*Schneider/Legrand*) 192
 T-502 and T-80/02 *Tetra Laval v. Commission* [2002] ECR II-4381
 (*Tetra Laval/Sidel*) 192
 T-217/03 and T-245/03 *FNCBV et al v. Commission* [2006] ECR II-4987 203
 T-25/04 *González y Díez SA v. Commission* [2007] ECR II-3121 203
 T-69/04 *Schunk GmbH and Schunk Kohlenstoff-Technik GmbH v. Commission* [2008] ECR II-2567 203

Germany

- Reichgericht, Urteile von 4. Februar 1897 (Sächsischen Holzstoff Fabrikanten Verband)* 38 RGZ 155 170, 171
Pfleiderer v. Bundeskartellamt 51 Gs 53/09 AG Bonn (18 January 2012) 243

United Kingdom*England*

- Attorney General of Australia v. Adelaide Steam Ship Co Ltd* [1913] AC 781 215
Attorney General v. Associated Newspapers Ltd and News Group Newspapers Ltd [2011] EWHC 418 (Admin) 57

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF CASES

xxi

- British Airways Board v. Laker Airways Ltd* [1985] AC 58 219
- Christian and Others v. The Queen (Pitcairn Islands)* [2006] UKPC 47,
[2007] 2 AC 400 [2007] 2 WLR 120 246
- Director General of Fair Trading v. Pioneer Concrete (UK) Ltd and
Another* [1995] 1 AC 456, [1994] 3 WLR 1249 (HL) (aka *In re
Supply of Ready Mixed Concrete (No. 2)*) 74, 230
- H L Bolton (Engineering) Co Ltd v. T J Graham & Sons Ltd* [1957] 1 QB
159 60–2, 64
- I B v. The Queen* [2009] EWCA Crim 2575 212, 240
- In re Supply of Ready Mixed Concrete* [1992] QB 213 (CA) 74
- Jones v. North* (1875) LR 19 EQ 426 215, 219
- Lennard's Carrying Company Ltd v. Asiatic Petroleum Company Ltd*
[1915] AC 705 58–9, 64
- Meridian Global Funds Management Asia Ltd v. Securities Commission*
[1995] 2 AC 500 (PC) 64
- The Mogul Steamship Company, Limited v. McGregor Gow & Co., and
Others* [1891] AC 25 (HL) 215, 217–18, 219
- National Grid Electricity Transmission PLC v. ABB Ltd et al.* [2012]
EWHC 869 (Ch) 243
- North Western Salt Co. Ltd v. Electrolytic Alkali Co. Ltd* [1913] 3 KB
422 215, 219
- Norris v. The Government of the United States of America* [2008] UKHL
16 214, 219, 251, 264, 265, 290, 309
- Pharmaceutical Society v. The London and Provincial Supply Association
Ltd* (1879–80) LR 5 AC 857 57, 73
- R v. H M Coroner for East Kent, ex parte Spooner* (1989) 88 Cr App R 10
(CA) 69
- R v. Huggins* (1730) 93 ER 518, 2 Ld Raym 1574 (KB) 73
- R v. Hyam* [1997] Crim LR 439 (CA) 238
- R v. ICR Haulage Ltd* [1944] 1 All ER 691 (CA) 60
- R v. George and others* (Southwark Crown Court, May 2010) 212,
240–2
- R v. George and others* [2010] EWCA Crim 1148, [2010] 1WLR 2676
212, 240–2
- R v. Ghosh* [1982] QB 1053 (CA) 238, 241, 246, 276, 309
- R v. Majeed, Butt, Asif and Amir* (Southwark Crown Court, 3 November
2011) 46
- R v. P & O European Ferries (Dover) Ltd* [1991] 93 Cr App R 72
(CCC) 66

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxii

TABLE OF CASES

- R v. Robertson* [2006] EWCA Crim 1289 (CA) 238
- R v. Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (Respondent) ex parte Kehoe (FC) (Appellant)* [2005] UKHL 48, [2006] AC 42 218
- R v. Whittle, Allison and Brammar* [2008] EWCA Crim 2560 212, 240
- Rawlings v. General Trading Co* [1921] 1 KB 635 215, 219
- Tesco Stores Ltd v. Brent London Council* [1993] 2 All ER 718 (QB) 73–4
- Tesco Supermarkets Ltd v. Natrass* [1972] AC 153 13, 53–4, 57, 61–7, 80, 81, 83, 87, 281, 282
- Re Yarn Spinners Agreement (No. 1)* [1959] 1 WLR 154, [1959] 1 All ER 299 (RTCP) 230
- Office of Fair Trading and Competition Appeal Tribunal Decisions*
- Price-fixing of Replica Football Kit (Case CP/0871/01)* 1 August 2003 99
- Tobacco (Case CE/2596–03)* 15 April 2010 99
- Tesco Stores Ltd, Tesco Holdings Ltd and Tesco Plc v. Office of Fair Trading* [2012] CAT 31 268

United States

- Abbott Laboratories v. Durrett* 746 So 2d 316, 1999–1 Trade Cases P 72,559 (Ala 1999) 126
- Albrecht v. Herald Co* 390 US 145, 88 S Ct 869 (1968) 150
- American Needle, Inc. v. National Football League et al* 560 US 183, 130 S Ct 2201 (2010) 155
- Appalachian Coals, Inc. v. United States* 288 US 344, 53 S Ct 471 (1933) 136–8, 140–3, 212, 305
- Arizona v. Maricopa County Medical Association* 457 US 332, 102 S Ct 2466 (1982) 149–51
- AT&T Mobility LLC v. Concepcion et ux.* (2011) 563 US ____, 131 S Ct 1740 (April 27, 2011) 161
- Board of Trade of the City of Chicago v. United States* 246 US 231, 38 S Ct 242 (1918) 135–6, 147, 165
- Broadcast Music v. Columbia Broadcasting Systems* 441 US 1, 99 S Ct 1551 (1971) 147
- Brunswick Corporation v. Pueblo Bowl-O-Mat Inc et al* 429 US 477, 97 S Ct 690 (1977) 160

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF CASES

xxiii

- California Dental Association v. Federal Trade Commission* 526 US 756, 119 S Ct 1604 (1999) 155–6
- Chicago Professional Sports Limited Partnership v. National Basketball Association* 961 F 2d 667 (CA 7 1992) 155
- City of Chicago v. Morales* 527 US 41, 119 S Ct 1849 (1999) 5
- Connolly v. Union Sewer Pipe Co* 184 US 540, 22 S Ct 431 (1902) 118–19
- Coperweld Corp v. Independence Tube Corp* 467 US 752, 104 S Ct 2731 (1984) 138
- Dr Miles Medical Company v. John D Park and Sons Co* 220 US 373, 31 S Ct 370 (1911) 134, 156
- Eastman Kodak Company v. Image Technical Service Inc* 504 US 451, 112 S Ct 2072 (1992) 144
- Fashion Originators' Guild of America v. Federal Trade Commission* 312 US 457, 312 US 668, 61 S Ct 703 (1941) 138, 143
- Federal Trade Commission v. Indiana Federation of Dentists* 476 US 447, 98 S Ct 2009 (1986) 155
- Grenada Lumber Co et al v. State ex rel Attorney General* 217 US 433, 30 S Ct 53 (1910) 116
- Hannover Shoe v. United Shoe Machinery Corporation* 392 US 481, 88 S Ct 2224 (1968) 160, 255
- Illinois Brick Co v. Illinois* 431 US 720, 97 S Ct 2061 (1977) 160, 255
- In Re Corrugated Container Antitrust Litigation* 643 F 2d 195 (CA5 1981) 160
- In Re SGL Carbon Corporation, Debtor* 200 F 3d 154 (CA3 1999) 56
- In Re NASDAQ Market-Makers Antitrust Litigation* 184 FRD 506 (SDNY 1999) 159, 161
- International Harvester Co v. Missouri* 234 US 199, 34 S Ct 859 (1914) 119
- International Salt Co v. United States* 332 US 392, 68 S Ct 12 (1947) 144
- Jefferson Parish Hospital Dist No 2 v. Hyde, Jefferson Parish Hosp Dist No 2 v. Hyde* 466 US 2, 104 S Ct 1551 (1984) 153
- Kiefer-Stewart Co v. Joseph E Seagram & Sons Inc* 340 US 211, 71 S Ct 259 (1951) 150
- Kimbrough v. United States* 552 US 85, 128 S Ct 558 (2007) 70
- Law v. National Collegiate Athletic Association* 134 F 3d 1010 (CA10 1998) 155
- Leegin Creative Leather Products Inc v. PSKS Inc d b a Kay's Kloset and Kay's Shoes* 551 US 877, 127 S Ct 2705 (2007) 5, 135, 165

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxiv

TABLE OF CASES

- Missouri v. Frye* 566 US ____ (21 March 2012) 162
- Morris v. Ameritech Illinois* 337 Ill App 3d 40, 271 Ill Dec 411, 785 NE 2d 62 (1st Dist 2003) 72
- Munn v. Illinois* 94 US 113, 4 Otto 113 (1876) 121
- National Collegiate Athletic Association v. Board of Regents of the University of Oklahoma* 468 US 85, 104 S Ct 2948 (1984) 149, 151–5
- National Society of Professional Engineers v. United States* 435 US 679, 98 S Ct 1355 (1978) 153, 155
- New York Central and Hudson River Railway Co v. United States* 212 US 481, 29 S Ct 304 (1909) 71
- Northern Pacific Railway Co. v. United States* 356 US 1, 78 S Ct 514 (1958) 144–5, 150, 158, 165, 260, 305
- Old Monastery Co. v. United States* 147 F 2d 905 (CA4 1945) cert denied 326 US 734 (1945) 72
- Panama Refining Co. v. Ryan* 293 US 388, 55 S Ct 241 (1935) 140
- Pennsylvania Sugar Refining Co. v. American Sugar Refining Co* 166 F 254 (CA2 1908) 126
- Pepper v. United States* 562 US ___, 131 S Ct 1229 (2 March 2011) 70, 162
- Reiter v. Sonotone Corp* 442 US 330, 99 S Ct 2326 (1979) 154, 165, 260
- Richardson v. Buhl* 6 LRA 457, 77 Mich 632, 43 NW 1102 (Mich SC 1889) 122, 123
- Schechter Poultry Corp v. United States* 295 US 495, 55 S Ct 837 (1935) 221
- Standard Oil Co. of California v. United States* 337 US 293, 69 S Ct 1051 (1949) 144
- Standard Oil Co. of Indiana v. United States*, see *United States v Standard Oil Co of Indiana*
- Standard Oil Co. of New Jersey v. United States* 221 US 1, 31 S Ct 504 (1911) 132–4, 143–5, 154, 156
- Standard Oil Co. of Indiana v. Missouri* 218 Mo 1, 116 SW 902 (SC Mo 1908), 224 US 270, 32 S Ct 406 (1911) 45, 116
- State ex inf Crow v. Armour Packing Co.* 173 Mo 356, 73 SW 645 (1903) 117
- State ex re Astor v. Schlitz Brewing Co.* 104 Tenn 715, 59 SW 1033 (Tenn SC 1900) 118
- Straight Side Basket Corporation v. Webster Basket Co* 4 F Supp 644 (WDNY, August 14, 1933) 138
- Taylor v. Blanchard* 13 Allen 370, 95 Mass 370, 1866 WL 6386 (Mass SC 1866) 114

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TABLE OF CASES

XXV

- Tigner v. Texas* 310 US 141, 60 S Ct 879 (1940) 119
- Timken Roller Bearing Co. v. United States* 341 US 593, 71 S Ct 971 (1951) 145
- United States v Addyston Pipe and Steel Co.* 85 F 271 (1898), 175 US 211, 20 S Ct 96 (1899) 131–2, 145
- United States v. Aluminum Co. of America* 148 F 2d 416 (CA2 1945) 262
- United States v. American Radiator and Standard Sanitary Corporation* 433 F 2d 173 (CA3 1970) 73
- United States v. Andreas* 216 F 3d 645 (CA7 2000) 107
- United States v. Arnold, Schwinn and Co. et al* 388 US 365, 87 S Ct 1856 (1967) 51
- United States v. Automated Medical Laboratories Inc* 770 F 2d 399 (CA4 1985) 72
- United States v. Bank of New England* 821 F 2d 844 (CA1 1987), cert denied 484 US 943 (1987) 67
- United States v. Booker* 543 US 220, 125 S Ct 738 (2005) 70, 162
- United States v. Brown University* 5 F 3d 658 (CA3 1993) 155
- United States v. Carroll Towing Co. Inc.* 159 F 2d 169 (CA2 1947) 56
- United States v. Carter* 311 F 2d 934 (CA6 1963), cert denied 373 US 915 (1963) 72
- United States v. E C Knight Co.* 156 US 1, 15 S Ct 249 (1895) 125, 129, 132
- United States v. Hilton Hotels* 467 F 2d 1000 (CA9 1972), cert denied 409 US 1125 (1973) 72
- United States v. Joint Traffic Association* 171 US 505, 19 S Ct 2 (1898) 131, 134
- United States v. Lopez* 514 US 549, 115 S Ct 1624 (1995) 126
- United States v. Sealy Inc* 388 US 350, 87 S Ct 1847 (1967) 145
- United States v. Socony-Vacuum Oil* 310 US 150, 60 S Ct 811 (1940) 140
- United States v. Standard Oil Co. of Indiana* 155 F 305 (N D Ill 1907), reversed *Standard Oil Co. of Indiana v. United States* 164 F 376, 90 CCA 364 (CA 7 1908) cert denied *United States v. Standard Oil Co.* 212 US 579, 29 S Ct 689, 53 L Ed 659 (1909) 45–6
- United States v. Sun-Diamond Growers Of California* 138 F 3d 961 (DCCA 1998) 72
- United States v. Swift and Company* 196 US 375, 25 S Ct 276 (1905) 117
- United States v. Topco Associates Inc* 405 US 596, 92 S Ct 1126 (1972) 145–7, 151, 305

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
 the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion
 Bruce Wardhaugh
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

United States v. Trans Missouri Freight Association 53 F 440 (1892), 58 F
 58 (1893), 17 S Ct 540 (1897) 126, 131
United States v. Trenton Potteries Co. 273 US 392, 47 S Ct 377 (1927)
 138–40, 150, 157, 304
United States v. Twentieth Century Fox Film Corporation 882 F 2d 656
 (CA2 1989) 72
United States v. United Shoe Machinery Corporation 110 F Supp 295 (D
 Mass 1953), aff'd, 347 US 521 (1954) 160, 262
United States v. Van Schaick et al 134 F 592, 602 (CCNY 1904) 73
Verizon Communications v. Law Offices of Curtis V Trinko 540 US 398,
 124 S Ct 872 (2004) 165, 289, 304
Wabash, St Louis and Pacific Railway v. Illinois 118 US 557, 7 S Ct 4
 (1886) 120–1
Waters-Pierce Oil Co v. State 48 Tex Civ App 162, 106 SW 918 (Tex Civ
 App 1907), 212 US 86, 29 S Ct 22 (1909) 115–16
West v. Randall 2 Mason 181, 29 Fed Cas 718 (CCDRI 1820) 161

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
 the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion
 Bruce Wardhaugh
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

TABLE OF TREATIES, STATUTES AND LEGISLATIVE INSTRUMENTS

Treaties

European

Consolidated versions of the Treaty on European Union and the
 Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union [2010] OJ
 C85/1 5, 13, 97, 174, 180, 193, 194, 200, 203
 Protocol No. 27 on the internal market and competition, [2008] OJ
 C115/309 202
 Treaty of Lisbon amending the Treaty on European Union and the
 Treaty establishing the European Community, signed at Lisbon, 13
 December 2007 [2007] OJ C306/1 197, 200–4, 207, 306–9

Other

Havana Charter of the International Trade Organization in the Final Act
 and Related Documents of United Nations Conference on Trade and
 Employment held at Havana, Cuba from November 21, 1947 to
 March 24, 1948, available at: [http://www.wto.org/english/docs_e/
 legal_e/havana_e.pdf](http://www.wto.org/english/docs_e/legal_e/havana_e.pdf) 225–6
 North American Free Trade Agreement 32 ILM 289, 605 (1993) 256, 270

Statutes

Canada

Competition Act RS 1985 c C-34 5, 255, 270
 (Ontario) Class Proceedings Act 1992 SO 1992 c 6 161

England and Wales

Coal Act 1938 223, 224
 Coal Industry Nationalisation Act 1946 223

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xxviii TREATIES, STATUTES AND LEGISLATIVE INSTRUMENTS

- Coal Mines Act 1930 212, 220
- Companies Act 2006 55
- Company Directors Disqualification Act 1986 102
- Competition Act 1980 230–1
- Competition Act 1998 96, 102, 212, 231–3, 236, 243, 245, 247
- Competition Act 1998 (Determination of Turnover for Penalties) Order
2000 (SI 2000/309) (as amended by the Competition Act 1998
(Determination of Turnover for Penalties) (Amendment) Order
2004 (SI 2004/1259)) 96
- Enterprise Act 2002 3, 15, 101, 102, 211, 233, 234, 238–9, 244, 247,
249, 252, 264–5, 294, 309, 311
- Enterprise and Regulatory Reform HC Bill 2012–13 Bill 61 xv, 16,
244–50, 264–5, 289–90, 309–10
- Import Duties Act 1932 224
- Insolvency Act 1985 56
- Landlord and Tenant Act 1954 60
- Merchant Shipping Act 1894 58
- Monopolies and Restrictive Practices Act 1948 212, 227
- Police and Criminal Evidence Act 1984 237
- Regulation of Investigatory Powers Act 2000 237
- Trade Descriptions Act 1968 61, 64

United States

- Antitrust Criminal Penalty Enhancement and Reform Extension Act
(ACPERA) Pub L No. 108–237, § 213, 118 Stat 666, 667 (2004)
codified 15 USC § 1 162–3
- Clayton Act 15 USC § 12–22, 19 USC §§ 52–53 3, 143–4, 158–9, 221,
261, 268
- Comprehensive Crime Control Act of 1984 Pub L 98–473, 98 Stat 1976, S
1762 162
- Currency Transaction Reporting Act 31 USCA §§ 5311–22 67
- Interstate Commerce Act (Ch 104, 25 Stat 379 February 4, 1887) 120
- National Industrial Recovery Act (1933) 48 Stat 195, 221
- Sherman Act 15 USC §§ 1–7 1, 3, 5, 14, 72–3, 97, 107, 115, 118, 120,
122–5, 128–9, 131–3, 138–40, 142–8, 150–7, 159, 165, 205, 211, 221,
227, 236, 255, 259–62, 268, 270, 283, 289, 304–7
- Tennessee, Antitrust Statute, Acts 1897 Chapter 94 117
- US Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 28 USCA 160–1

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

TREATIES, STATUTES AND LEGISLATIVE INSTRUMENTS xxix

Other Jurisdictions

- Australia, Commonwealth Criminal Code Act 1995 69–70
- France, Code de Commerce 5
- Germany, Gesetz gegen Wettbewerbsbeschränkungen (GWB) (Act against Restraints of Competition, ARC) 5, 179
- Hong Kong, Ordinance No. 4 of 2012 259
- Indonesia Law, 5 of 1999 259
- Ireland, Competition Act 2002 315
- Mexico, Ley Federal De Competencia Económica 270

EU – Regulations

- Regulation No. 17 First Regulation implementing Articles 85 and 86 of the Treaty, OJ 21/02/1962 pp. 0204 – 0211, English special edition: Series I Chapter 1959–1962 p. 0087 181, 195, 205, 231, 268
- Council Regulation (EC) No. 1/2003 of 16 December 2002 on the implementation of the rules on competition laid down in Articles 81 and 82 of the Treaty [2003] OJ L1/1 193–5, 232, 243, 256
- Council Regulation (EC) No. 139/2004 of 20 January 2004 on the control of concentrations between undertakings (the EC Merger Regulation) [2004] OJ L24/1 193

EU – Guidelines and Notices

- Guidelines on the method of setting fines imposed pursuant to Article 23(2)(a) of Regulation No. 1/2003 (2006/C 210/02) [1996] OJ C210/2 96, 195
- Commission notice on immunity from fines and reduction of fines in cartel cases [1996] OJ C298/17 101, 163, 194, 196
- Commission notice on the non-imposition or reduction of fines in cartel cases [1996] OJ C207/4 163, 194
- Guidelines on the method of setting fines imposed pursuant to Article 15(2) of Regulation No. 17 and Article 65(5) of the ECSC Treaty [1998] OJ C9/3 195
- Commission notice on immunity from fines and reduction of fines in cartel cases [2002] OJ C45/3 101, 163, 194–6
- Commission notice on the co-operation between the Commission and the courts of the EU Member States in the application of Articles 81 and 82 EC [2004] OJ C104/54 194

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03630-7 - Cartels, Markets and Crime: A Normative Justification for
the Criminalisation of Economic Collusion

Bruce Wardhaugh

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

XXX TREATIES, STATUTES AND LEGISLATIVE INSTRUMENTS

Commission notice on cooperation within the Network of Competition
Authorities [2004] OJ C 101/43 194

Guidelines on the application of Article 81(3) of the Treaty [2004] OJ
C101/97 204

Commission notice on Immunity from fines and reduction of fines in
cartel cases [2006] OJ C298/17 101, 163, 196