

## Index

access to justice, 24, 30

Florence Access to Justice Project Baxi, Pratiksha, 340 (India), 338 in Colombia, 36, 361, 369-374, 391, 401, Bellavista, 149, 151 Bilchitz, David, 30, 321 in India, 35, 330, 331, 334, 336, 338-343, bill of rights, 26, 45, 46, 78 345, 351, 355-358 in South Africa, 35, 301, 304-323, 325, Buddhism, 18, 28, 230 acción de tutela, 36, 64-66, 68, 85, 138, 139, 141, 142, 149, 250, 255-258, 259, 270-273, 279, 314, 365, 366, 371, 374-383, 385, 386, 390-392, 394, 397 capitalism, 179 acción pública de inconstitucionalidad, 365, 371, 375, 384, 390, 394 356 acciónes populares y de grupo, 36, 264, 269, 364, 365, 375 Advisory Committee on the Fundamental Chayes, Abram, 104, 119 Rights of Citizens and Minorities Choudhary, Sujit, 102 (India), 216 African National Congress, 301, 304 civil tradition, 5 All-India Muslim Personal Laws Board, 233 Colombia amicus curiae, 191, 349, 350 Andhra Pradesh Hindu Religious and Charitable Endowments Act of 1969 South Africa, 25-26 (India), 220 apartheid, 27, 44, 49, 163, 164, 171, 174, 175, 179, 294, 300, 302, 304, 305, 324, 325 recognition of cultural minorities in, Aspatwar, Bipin, 35 28-29

Baxi, Upendra, 17, 107, 108, 122, 346 Bourdieu, Pierre, 36, 147, 370, 393 transmutation effect, 147 Budlender, Geoff, 307, 308, 310, 311 Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Cappelletti, Mauro, 338, 339, 341, 351, Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation (South Africa), 303 Christianity, 25, 28, 34, 171, 179, 215, 231 Claassens, Aninka, 180, 181, 206 as a multicultural state, 243-244 as geographically, economically, and culturally distinct from India and unrealized accomodation and

baseMjondolo, Abahlali, 303

403



404 INDEX

Colombia (cont.) case C-175/09, 264 unrealized commitment to liberal case SU-039/97 (Uwa case), 254, 255, 258 democracy in, 27 case T-129/11, 270 unrealized economic justice in, 27-28 case T-153, 129, 130, 132-134, 145, 147, Colombian Commission of Jurists, 259 149-156 colonialism, 163, 164, 171, 174, 179 case T-652/98, 258-259 Communal Land Rights Act of 2004 case T-652/98 (Urrá case), 254, 255 (South Africa), 206 case T-769/09, 270 Community Law Centre (South Africa), constitutional jurisdiction of, 374-377 fundamental rights, 389 Constitution of Colombia of 1886, 135 fundamental rights by connection, Constitution of Colombia of 1991, 26, 27, doctrine of, 65 30, 34, 47, 48, 50, 64, 92, 93, 136, 244, judicial activism, 373, 380, 383, 398 246, 250, 261, 277, 361, 362, 365, 366, judicial review of legal norms, 382-389 369, 375, 390, 394, 395 mínimo vital, doctrine of, 67 as a multicultural Constitution, 245 principle of legal certainty, 391 as a tool for social change, 401-402 revisión, 365 bill of rights, 32, 137 social impact of, 398-401 socioeconomic rights, jurisprudence on, conflict between individual rights and self-government rights of cultural 64-68 minorities, 246 special relationship of subjection conflict between the principle of political between State and inmate, doctrine of, unity and the self-government rights 146, 159 of cultural minorities, 246 structural cases, 385, 387, 388, 398-400 fundamental constitutional rights, 64 unconstitutional state of affairs, doctrine of, 32, 66, 68, 86, 92, 129, 130, 132-134, tension between cultural diversity and cultural unity, 34, 245, 246 140-145, 148, 149, 386, 398, 399 Constitutional Court of Costa Rica, 313, Constitution of India of 1949, 26, 27, 30, 47, 50, 64, 81, 92, 93, 96, 212, 215 315 bill of rights, 47, 336 amparo case, 313, 315 fundamental rights guarantees, 332 Constitutional Court of Germany, 3 Constitutional Court of South Africa, 18, preamble, 336 21, 29-31, 33, 35, 68, 74, 76, 87, 294, Constitution of South Africa of 1996, 18, 26, 27, 30, 33, 47, 49, 50, 69, 92, 93, 164, 295, 305, 306, 316, 323, 324, 326, 353 170, 182, 293, 305 Alexkor Ltd v. Richtersveld Community, bill of rights, 49, 68, 78, 166, 183, 188, 183-186 200, 221 Bernstein v. Bester, 308 as transformative, 167, 170 Bhe v. Magistrate Khayalitsha, 178-179, fundamental values of, 196 194, 197-203 Constitution of the United States, 46, 52 Court Registry, 313, 314, 315 Constitutional Court of Colombia, 18, 21, Government of the Republic of South 29, 30, 32, 34, 36, 66, 67, 76, 129, 130, Africa v. Grootboom, 69-71, 320 134, 138, 146, 153, 247, 248, 313, 361, Gumede v. President of the RSA, 194, 365, 367, 372, 380 203-205 case C-030/08, 264 judicious avoidance, 319



INDEX 405

Mabena v. Letsoale, 183, 188-191 Mabena v. Letsoalo, 187-188 Mazibuko and others v. City of Johannesburg and others, 72, 88, 321 Minister of Health v. Treatment Action Campaign, 70, 75 Occupiers of 51 Olivia Road, Berea Township and 197 Main Street Johannesburg v. City of Johannesburg, 89, 319 reasonableness approach, 69, 70, 71, 72, Residents of the Joe Slovo Community, Western Cape v. Thubelisha Homes and others Homes, 322 Sv. Vermaas, 306, 307, 309, 311 Shilubana v. Nwamitwa, 183, 188 socio-economic rights, jurisprudence on, 68 - 74Tongoane v. National Minister for Land and Agricultural Affairs, 195, 205-208 constitutionalism, 23, 29, 31, 41, 43, 44, 78, 94, 395 in India, 330 of the Global North, 29, 43, 45, 78 of the Global South, 29, 31, 41-43, 45, 60, 76, 78, 80, 93, 94 contemporary sociology of law, 19 Convention 169 of the International Labor Organization, 250, 252, 268, 276-278 Convention against Racial Discrimination, Cornell, Driscilla, 190, 192 corrective justice, 35, 249, 289 Council of State of Colombia, 381, 382, 389-393, 397 crosscutting social and economic inequalities in South Africa, 177-182 cultural diversity, 26, 29, 30 in Colombia, 28, 173, 244, 245, 285 in India, 28, 34, 216-219, 222, 228, 232, 237, 241, 242 in South Africa, 28-29, 33, 164, 169, 170, 172, 176, 182, 192, 193, 195–197, 203,

cultural integrity, right to, 35, 248, 249, 274, 282, 285 cultural minorities, 3, 28, 30, 34, 35, 245-247, 249, 251-256, 260, 262, 263, 265-267, 269, 273, 274, 276, 277, 279, 282, 284, 285, 287-289 customary law, 33, 164, 165, 167, 168, 170-173, 175-179, 182-191, 193-195, 197-205, 208-210 Declaration on the Rights of Man and of the Citizen, 45 Directive Principles of State Policy (India), 60, 96, 106-108, 336-338, 341 distributive justice, 30, 31, 41, 42, 47, 48, 51, 76, 77, 79, 80, 87, 92, 94, 288, 391, 402 Dworkin, Ronald, 8 economic justice, 27, 42, 43, 46, 76, 93, 169, 337 economic, social, and cultural rights in Colombia, 49, 64, 130, 131, 133–135, 137, 139–141, 144, 145, 147, 148, 159 Effective Operator, assumption of, 13, 15 Emberá-Katío, 258, 259, 272 emergency, state of (India), 96, 101, 107 estado social de derecho, 362, 366-369, 380, 389, 392 European Convention on Human Rights, European Court of Human Rights, 3, 23, Airey v. Ireland, 308, 311 Extension of Security of Tenure Act (South Africa), 309 forcibly displaced persons, 144, 149 free school of law, 19 fundamental rights, 2, 43 in Colombia, 36, 66, 85, 87, 135, 137, 142, 144, 151, 152, 278, 364–367, 371, 378, 380, 382, 385–387, 389, 392, 398–400

208, 209



> 406 **INDEX**

fundamental rights (cont.) of prisoners in Colombia, 140, 145, 156 subject to immediate application, 138, 139 violation of, 32, 66, 148, 157 García, Mauricio, 372 Garth, Bryant, 339, 341, 351 gender equality, 33, 164, 165, 170, 172, 176, 182, 188, 189, 191, 195, 196, 200, 206, 208, 217 Global North, 7, 8, 12, 14, 18-20, 30, 42, 43, 51, 54, 55, 74 Global South, 5-8, 11, 13, 14, 16, 18, 19-21, 29, 30, 41, 44, 45, 51, 53–55, 80 Gurusmany, Menaka, 35 habeas corpus, 344 Hindu Commissioner for Religious and Charitable Endowments, 220, 223 Hinduism, 19, 25, 28, 34, 215, 228, 229, 231, 232, 239, 240

Hindu Personal Law, 219, 231 Hobbes, Thomas, 2 Hoexter, Cora, 325 Hunter, Claire, 102

importance argument, as a basis for constitutional social rights, 53 India, 34, 65, 355 as a federal polity, 232-233 as geographically, economically, and culturally distinct from Colombia and South Africa, 25-26 judicialization of politics in, 126 poverty in, 47, 62, 118, 333 religious, linguistic, and ethnic diversity in. 211-213 unrealized accomodation and recognition of cultural minorities in, 28 - 29unrealized commitment to liberal democracy in, 27

unrealized economic justice in, 27-28

institutional blockage, 32, 129, 153, 156-158, 387, 394 Inter-American Court of Human Rights, 256, 275 intercultural equality, 35, 249, 289 internally displaced persons, 66-67, 86 International Labor Organization, 250 Islam, 34, 215, 231, 236, 240 Iturralde, Manuel, 36 Jaganath Temple Act of 1955 (India), 220 Jainism, 28, 230 Judaism, 231 judicial activism in Colombia, 135, 366, 367, 370-372, 389, 390, 393, 394, 396, 399, 400 in India, 31, 95, 97, 98, 101-104, 123,

individual autonomy, 217, 283

130, 139, 365, 366, 394 Kant, Immanuel, 2 Klare, Karl, 325

Kwazulu Act (South Africa), 203

judicial review, 3, 51, 54, 88, 98, 107, 123,

329

in South Africa, 326

judicial behavior, 122-126

La Modelo, 149, 151 laïcité, 216 Land Claims Court of South Africa, 309, 310, 324, 325 Nkuzi Development Association v. Government of the Republic of South Africa, 309 The Richtersveld Community and The Government of the Republic of South Africa and Others, 310 Land Reform (Labour Tenants) Act (South Africa), 309 Law 5 of 1992 (Colombia), 268 Law 70 of 1993 (Colombia), 250

Law and Development, 8 Law and Economics, 8



INDEX 407

legal field, concept of, 36, 148, 370, 389, 390, 392, 393, 397, 398, 401, 402 legal formalism, 9, 14, 17, 19, 325, 366-370, 371, 382, 383, 389, 393, 396–398, 401 legal monism, 246 legal pluralism, 163, 167, 208, 246 legal positivism, 19 legal realism, 10 legitimacy argument, as a basis for constitutional social rights, 52, 53 liberalism, 33 living law, concept of, 33, 165, 166, 177, 180-183, 185-188, 192, 193, 197, 199, 200, 202, 205-207 lobola, 179, 186, 187 Locke, John, 2 locus standi, 35, 97, 331, 340, 343, 345, 357, Madras Bigamy and Divorce Act of 1949 (India), 220 Madras Religious and Charitable Endowments Act of 1951 (India), 220 Mbatha, Likhapha, 180 Mehta, Pratap Bhanu, 100, 107, 108, 336, 347, 348 Merry, Sally Engle, 181 Michelman, Frank, 51, 52 migrant labor, 171, 179 Mill, John Stuart, 2 minimum core, 59, 62, 69, 77, 93, 318 Mnini, Sindiso, 181

modern constitutionalism, 1-5, 11, 12, 20,

multicultural liberal pluralism, 34, 249,

Muslim Personal Law Board (India), 237

22, 23, 29, 30

280-287

285-287

multiculturalism, 216

Montesquieu, Charles, 2, 79 multicultural liberal monism, 34, 248,

Natal Code (South Africa), 203

Muslim Personal Law (India), 237

Nathdwara Temple Act of 1959 (India), 220 National Constitutional Assembly of Colombia, 362, 363 National Indigenous Organization of Colombia, 259 National Penitentiary and Prison Institute of Colombia, 151, 153, 157 National Planning Department of Colombia, 151, 153, 155 natural rights, 106 Ncgobo, Sandile, 200-202 negative rights, 56, 146 new constitutionalism, 42, 43, 51, 76, 77, 94, 366-372, 380, 389, 393-397, 401, 402 new law (nuevo derecho), 355, 361-368 Ngubane, Sizani, 180 Nino, Carlos Santiago, 17 Nozick, Robert, 4 Nyamu-Musembi, Celestine, 181, 209

participation, right of, 269, 274 Personal Law of the Muslims, 235 personal laws of minority communities (India), 218, 219, 232, 235, 237 Pithouse, Richard, 302 pluralistic multicultural liberal model, 249, political unity, principle of, 34, 246, 247 positive rights, 56, 146 prior consultation, 263 administrative consultations, 255, 273 as a consequence of the alliance between academia and social organizations, 278-279 as adaptable to the context, 275–276 as based on international law, 276-278 as fundamental right, 256-263 as justified by multicultural liberal

as justified by multicultural liberal pluralism, 249, 287–289 as justified by procedural liberal monism, 249, 285–287

monism, 249, 281-285



408 INDEX

prior consultation (cont.) Sabel, Charles F., 119 constitutional principles guiding the Sachs, Albie, 17 process of, 260-263 Sathe, S. P., 100, 107, 122, 336 for administrative and legislative secularism, 216 measures, 264-270 self-government, right of, 34, 35, 245-249, legislative consultations, 255, 273 269, 274 process of, 267-269 separation of powers, doctrine of, 3, 23, 27, 31, 43, 77, 78, 80, 81, 92, 93 right to, 34, 35, 247-250, 252-263, 266, 267, 269, 270, 273-283, 285-290 in Colombia, 32, 84-87, 92, 129-131, 142, territorial consultations, 273 367, 369, 382, 391, 393, 399, 400 three stages of the jurisprudence on the in India, 81-84, 123, 330, 336, 348 right to, 34 in South Africa, 79, 87-91 veto, right to, 34, 123, 249, 255, 256, 263, Shankar, Shylashri, 31 270-279, 283, 286, 287 Sikhism, 28, 230 violation of right to, 256, 257, 259, 265, Simon, William H., 119 271, 272, 274 Smith, Adam, 58 procedural liberal monism, 34, 249, 280, social rights, 31, 49, 52, 64, 66, 82, 85, 87, 285, 287-289 90, 91, 95, 101, 104–107, 128, 129, 324, proceso ejecutivo, 373 356, 367, 371, 374, 392, 401 production well, assumption of, 12 Society, Work and Development Institute protected geographical indication, (South Africa), 303 assumption of, 12 socioeconomic rights, 3, 26, 30, 31, 41, 43, public interest litigation, 108, 112, 113, 331, 45, 47, 50, 51, 54, 56, 59, 60, 91–93, 318 341-348, 350-352, 355, 356, 358 content of, 57, 59, 60, 75-77, 91, 93 in Canada, 46 Ouran, 236 in Colombia, 18, 32, 65, 67, 68, 75, 81, 84-87, 157, 369, 377-380, 382, 390-392, Rawls, John, 4, 52 397, 402 Recognition of Customary Marriages Act in India, 31, 32, 61, 63, 81-84, 97, 99, 106, of 1998 (South Africa), 186, 193, 195, 203 in South Africa, 35, 50, 68, 70-72, 74, 75, religious diversity, 218 81, 87-90, 298, 302, 314-319, 321, 323, 325, 326 religious minorities, 22, 33, 113, 247 right to education, 50, 98, 111, 112, 115, in the constitutions of the Global North, 119, 125, 332 54 cases in the high courts of India, in the constitutions of the Global South, 55, 56 113-116 cases in the Supreme Court of India, in the United States, 46, 51 109-113, 119-120 justiciability of, 22, 47, 74, 105, 316 in South Africa, 49 realization of, 78, 79, 92, 93 Roach, Kent, 104, 119 South Africa, 17, 50, 70, 74, 75, 78, 87, 91, Rodríguez, César, 372 170, 171, 173, 175, 179, 181, 195, 203, Rousseau, Jean Jacques, 2 293, 296, 298, 300-305, 311, 314, 324,

326

Roux, Theunis Roux, 317, 324, 325



**INDEX** 409

as geographically, economically, and culturally distinct from Colombia and India, 25-26 unrealized accomodation and recognition of cultural minorities in. 28-29 unrealized commitment to liberal democracy in, 27 unrealized economic justice in, 27–28 South African Law Reform Commission, Special Marriage Act of 1954 (India), 219 Special Rapporteur on Human Rights of Indigenous People, 256, 275 structural poverty, 298-304 sufficiency threshold, concept of, 58, 62 Sunstein, Cass, 74 Supreme Court of Appeal of South Africa, 184, 190, 294–296, 306, 319 Mthembu v. Letsela, 184 Supreme Court of Colombia, 381, 382, 389-395, 397 Supreme Court of India, 18, 21, 29-31, 33, 35, 63, 75, 81, 83, 96, 104, 118, 119, 214, 221, 223, 226, 234, 235, 326, 329-332,

334, 339, 340, 342, 347, 350, 352, 354, 357, 359 A.A. Haja Muniuddin v. Indian Railways, 357 Abdul Jalil & Ors. v. State of UP & Ors., basic structure of the Constitution. doctrine of, 330 Chenchu Ram Reddy & Anr v. Government of Andhra Pradesh & Ors., 223 Common Cause Reg Soc v. Union of India, 103

Consumer Education & Research Centre v. Union of India, 354 epistolary jurisdiction of, 35, 97, 348-352 essential practice test, 234 experimentalist approach of, 119

Francis Coralie Mullin v. The Administrator, 61 freedom of religion, 33 Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala (Fundamental Rights case), 60-61, 106-107 M.H.Quereshi & Ors. v. The State of Bihar, 234 Mahant Sri Jagannath Ramanuj Das v. The State of Orissa & Anr, 223 Manohar Joshi v. Nitin Patil, 238 Master Shikhar Gupta v. Govt. of NCT of Delhi and Ors., 111 Minerva Mills Ltd. v. Union of India, 107, 337 Mohd. Asif Khan and Ors.v. Navyug School and Ors., 112 Narmada Bachao Andolan v. Union of India, 82–83 Olga Tellis v. Bombay Municipal Corporation, 61-63 People's Union for Democratic Rights v. Union of India, 346, 347 PUCL v. Union of India, 63-64, 75 pulic interest litigation cell, 352–355 Ramesh Y.Prabhu v. Prabhakar K.Kunte, 238 Randhir Singh v. Union of India, 354 right to food cases, 61, 63, 120, 121 right to health cases, 116-118 S. Govind Menon v. Union of India, 224 S.P. Gupta v. Union of India, 97, 335 self-perception of, 334-336 ShantiStar Builders v. Narayan K Totame, 61-62 Sheela Barse v. State of Maharashtra, 349 socioeconomic rights, jurisprudence on, State of Haryana v. Darshana Devi, 356

State of Uttaranchal v. Balwant Singh

Sunil Batra II v. Delhi Administration,

Sunil Batra v. Delhi Administration, 349

Chaufal, 351

349, 350



410 INDEX

Supreme Court of India (cont.)

Unnikrishnan v. State of AP, 99, 109

Vineet Narain v. Union of India, 103

Vishaka v. State of Rajasthan, 103

Supreme Court of Justice of Colombia, 381, 389

Supreme Court of South Africa

Bhe v. Magistrate Khayalitsha, 188

Occupiers of 51 Olivia Road, Berea

Township and 197 Main Street

Johannesburg v. City of Johannesburg, 89–90

Supreme Court of the United States, 3, 23

Tatane, Andries, 303

Taylor, Charles, 4
Temple Entry Authorization Act of 1947
(India), 220
Tribe, Laurence, 8

United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for Treatment of Prisoners, 350 untouchability, practice of, 219, 226 Uprimny Yepes, Rodrigo, 85, 372 Urrá, 258 Uwa, 256, 257

Wilson, Stuart, 321

Zulu law, 203