

Index

academia and academics, 125. See also advertising and advertisements economists' capture in pharmaceutical industry, 156, 158 academic advisory boards, 463 in radio industry, 182, 183, 201, 203, 204 business interests influence on, 133, 138, tobacco industry and, 348 139, 142, 146 advocacy. See also proxy advocacy careers outside of, 125, 131 focus on degree of capture, 21 contemporary capture scholarship, 5, 6 patient advocacy, 170 cultural capture and, 97 agency action, 118, 413, 438. See also agency information needs and, 141 inaction; by specific agency; judicial limits of capture in, 125 OIRA administrators and, 443, 444 across-the-board investigations of, 412 pro-business bias in tenure, 138 adaptiveness in, 337, 340, 351, 352 publication process in, 132, 133 agency responsiveness to public Act for the Protection of the Lives of Miners comment, 314 in the Territories (1891), 215 conditional forbearance and, 209 Adams, Charles Francis, 42, 43, 44 Congress and president as supervisors of, administrative law, 334, 405, 412, 442, 443, 397, 404, 406, 407 453. See also cost-benefit analysis; influence capture model for, 118 judicial review; notice and comment legal challenges to, 404, 405 media coverage and, 211, 225, 236, 458 administrative law doctrine, 411 interest groups taking advantage of, 75, 77 OIRA review of, 421 OIRA administrators and, 443 overzealous action by career employees, preventing capture and, 460 rate of diminishing returns to investment, political and legal constraints on, 333 political principals and, 211 Administrative Law Judge (ALJ), 368 principal-agent relationships and, 208, Administrative Procedure Act (1946), 293, 399, 449 public interest and, 334 adulteration public salience and, 226 new legal concepts in, 340, 341, 342 regulatory delay and, 218 Advanced Notice of Proposed Rulemaking responsiveness to industry interests, 209 (ANPRM), 302, 303 unreviewable agency action, 412 defined, 294 agency authority, 215, 260, 331, 471 adversarialism, 132, 236, 393 of FDA, 170 of FRC, 183 as capture prevention, 246 contentiousness and, 331 of OIRA, 425



476 Index

agency authority (cont.) of MSHA, 217 of OPIC, 372, 373 of USMB, 216 of USMB, 216 pattern of, 217 oil spills and, 260 proxy advocacy and, 368 agency autonomy, 120, 460, 463 agency disbanding, 53 of CDC, 355 of MMS, 241, 248, 280 partial autonomy from external actors, agency inaction, 364, 453, 464. See also 333, 360, 361 agency action; judicial review vs. expertise, 103 as detrimental to public interests, 421, agency capture, 59, 176, 245, 305, 329 agency coordination and, 437 difficulties in legal challenges to, 399, 404, ambiguity on distinction between influence vs. capture in, 300 retrospective review by OIRA and, 421, areas of, 297 447, 448, 449, 450 centralized review and, 420, 429 AIDS crisis, 163 coal mining and, 210 CDC and, 353 defined, 292, 294, 296, 300 FDA and, 163, 164 difficulty measuring public interest and, alternative explanations, 225 conditional forbearance and, 211 from interest groups, 296, 426, 428 for banking regulation capture, 93 game theory model of, 60 for capture, 62 lack of evidence for widespread, 297, 301 for corrosive capture of FDA, 164 mechanisms of, 209 of MMS capture, 55, 57 of MSHA by mining industry, 219 soft pressures as, 93 PDUFA as cause of FDA, 164 American Medical Association, 206 policing of, 406 American State Administrators Project public interest capture theory and, 427 (ASAP), 306, 321 public participation in rulemaking and, Americans for Financial Reform (AFR), 92 anticompetitive regulation, 456, 457 rulemaking process and, 293, 295, 317, coal industry and, 402 319, 323 FRC and, 179 two-prong test for sub-population antiregulatory bias, 164 influence, 295, 298, 300, 301, 319, 320, Obama Administration and, 421, 447 antitrust, 414 agency coordination, 257, 259, 437, 438, 439 antitrust enforcement, 146 agency creation, 50, 53, 55, 114, 348, 422 antitrust litigation, 148 game theory model of, 108 FTC and, 54 of Bureaus of Ocean Energy Management apolitical role of CDC, 356 and Environmental Enforcement, 255 appointments, 101, 116, 208, 450 of CDC, 351 labor union influence on OIRA, 435 of CFPB, 84 of senior officers at OIRA, 442, 444 of Consumer Participation Program presidential appointment of senior (NAIC), 383 officers, 397, 407, 421, 423, 429, 431 of Energy Task Force, 278 arbitrage, 18, 155, 472 of FRC, 183, 184 asprin, 330, 354, 355 of FTC, 53 asymmetrical influence, 95, 130 of generalist agencies, 421 auditing, 251, 255 of ICC, 54 experience in, 253 FOGRMA act and, 249 of intervenor program, 394 of MMS, 241, 247, 248, 249, 252, 256, of MMS, 260, 261 257, 272, 291 of oil and gas tax, 262, 268



> Index 477

auto insurance, 375, 376, 381, 382, 395 autonomy partial autonomy from external actors, 333, 360, 361 Ayres, Ian, 369 Bailey Amendment, 158, 160 banking regulation, 18, 52, 53, 72, 74, 367, 389, 472 capture of, 93 consumer protection and, 84 bans, 103, 108, 112, 115 on discretionary clauses, 374, 390, 391 barriers to entry, 70, 401, 413, 452, 456. See also entry-barrier capture advocacy for based on empirically weak capture definitions, 10 industry newcomers and, 7 medical devices, 171 Becker, Gary, 31 behavioral biases, 76 debiasing strategies, 98 explanations for, 86 spectrum of behavior, 76, 77 status and, 85, 86 behavioralism behavioral psychology, 93 capture theory and, 28 Bernstein, Marver, 27, 28, 49, 153, 154 boundary manipulations, 18, 155 jurisdictional boundaries and, 154 Braithwaite, John, 369 bribes, 62, 75, 116, 365 at MMS, 239 implicit bribes, 18, 63, 403 Brown & Williamson litigation, 347 Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives (ATF), 463 Bureau of Indian Affairs (BIA), 254 Bureau of Land Management (BLM), 250 Bureau of Mines (USBM), 216 Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, 255 Bureau of Safety and Environmental Enforcement, 256 bureaucracy, 316 administrative agencies and, 431 bureaucrat hypothesis, 427, 448 bureaucratic capacity, 100, 108 bureaucratic capture, 100, 101, 208, 210 bureaucratization, 51, 53

bureaucratic drift, 14, 62, 101 as exongenous, 101 Bush Administration, 67 deregulation and, 17, 154 energy policy of, 278 mining accidents during, 224, 234, 236, 237 business interests influence, 14, 296 big business and corporations advantage during rulemaking survey, 318 electorally sanctioned pro-business governance, 210 government interests as foil to, 320 in academic research and publishing, 133, 138, 139, 142, 146 in notice and comment period, 298 in preproposal stage, 299 in rulemaking, 175, 298, 304, 313, 323 in rulemaking (across rule stages), 313, 314, 315 in rulemaking (correlation analysis), 315, 316, 317 in rulemaking (participation rates), 298, 309, 311, 312, 313, 320 incentives to cater to, 125 public interest advocate activity and, 298 subpopulation participation influence on, 320 California Department of Insurance (CDI), Charles Quackenbush and, 378 California Public Participation Plan (CPPP), 367, 371, 376, 388, 393, 394 basic operations of (1993-2010), 377 rate filings and, 377, 380 reimbursement and, 377 capacity, 358 bureaucratic capacity, 100, 108 consumer representatives and, 366 detecting systemic risks and, 100 food safety and, 337, 338 for independent policy innovation, 333 sector, 99

impartiality of, 295



478 Index

capacity (cont.) capture theory, 22, 24, 425. See also Chicago to bolster bureau reputation, 333 School; economic theory of regulation; tobacco regulation and, 348 Stigler, George vs. agency autonomy, 103 assumptions in historical development of, 33, 34, 36, 38 capital requirements, 72, 85, 88 capitalism, 26, 27, 32 behavioralism and, 28 capture. See also agency capture; corrosive classical tradition and, 39 capture; cultural capture; diagnosing contemporary capture scholarship, 5 capture; economists' capture; corporate liberal synthesis and, 30 entry-barrier capture; mechanisms of critique of current relevance of, 3, 5, 9, 10, capture; preventing capture; strong 11, 23, 24, 25, 34, 36, 38, 292, 297, 324 capture; weak capture history and historical evidence and, 6, 37 administrative capture, 19 history as test of theory in, 176 alternative explanations for banking Huntington's and Bernstein's critiques of regulation capture, 93 regulatory commissions, 26, 27, 28, 29, as exogenous, 101 bureaucratic capture, 100, 101, 208, 210 ideological critique of in 60s and 70s, 29, cognitive regulatory capture, 76, 78 30, 31 ideological pessimism in, 31 criticism and assumptions about, 1, 2, 4, 5, 8, 9, 10 in Jacksonian era, 40 damage caused by, 1, 4, 470 intellectual history of, 26 deep capture, 74, 78 James Madison on faction influence and, defeasible models for, 14, 15, 61 39, 40 lack of clear capture definition in, 13, 292 defined, 13, 60, 73, 296, 300, 401, 425, 426 high stakes of, 469 life-cycle theory of regulatory information capture, 77, 93, 366 commissions and, 49, 50 legislative capture, 59 need for new scholarship on, 68, 174, 176, limited vs. pervasive, 11, 22, 454 464 need for new scholarship on, 3, 5, 9, 10, new perspectives on, 455, 458 11, 21, 174, 175, 292, 297, 323, 324, 464 observational equivalence and, 460 new perspectives on, 455, 458 origin of in political science and public of financial regulation, 74 administration, 26 plausibility vs. proof in causal claims of, 4 progressive regulatory reformers, 37, 38 protection without capture, 64 public choice era in, 31 public interest as alternative explanation public interest capture theory, 31, 32, to, 58 role of history in study of, 179 regulatory capture theory, 29 simplistic models of, 5, 8, 9, 10, 11 simplistic models of, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 452 spectrum of remedies to, 459 theories at odds with industry, 125 careers and careerism, 81, 83, 119, 127. See static analysis of, 55, 56 also unethical activity successful, 2 transparent retrospective review and, 445 agency action by career employees, 427, capture by degree, 11, 19, 21, 57, 454, 455, 428 capture vulnerability and, 127 457 cultural capture of FDA and, 153 career incentives, 124 economists' capture and, 130 conflict avoidance and, 91 lack of nuance in capture scholarship, 9 economists' capture and, 131 of MMS, 240 in academia, 132, 133, 139 patterns of regulatory decision making information needs and, 141 OIRA administrators and, 442 and, 63 outside academia, 125 social handicaps, 150



Index 479

probusiness bias in academic tenure and,	dangers of, 214
138	historical development of coal mining,
cartelism, 15, 52, 55	212, 213
case studies, 3	mining deaths and, 50
on capture prevention, 363, 460, 462	coalitions, 327, 333, 352, 362
on Harvard economists' capture, 142	bootleggers and Baptists coalition, 427
on public health agencies, 328, 336	broad coalition of broadcast spectrum
causal inference, 8, 16, 66	oppostion, 180
research strategies, 67	enacting coalition, 217
Stigler's standards of, 8	of bipartisan support of tobacco
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention	regulation, 347
(CDC), 328	public health agency mobilization of,
AIDS crisis and, 353	333
apolitical role of, 356, 357	strange-bedfellows, 163
asprin risks and Reye's syndrome and,	Coastal Zone Management Act, 257
330, 353, 354, 355	coercion, 46
H1N1 outbreak and, 349	private coercion, 26, 45, 48, 455
historical progression of, 351, 352	cognition
lead poisoning and, 355	cognitive biases, 77, 86, 88, 92
relationship networks of, 350, 352	cognitive dissonance, 94
use of expertise and legal authority of,	cognitive regulatory capture, 76, 78
349, 350, 352	cultural capture as change in regulatory,
centralized review, 420, 421, 424, 429, 473.	165
See also judicial review; Office of	collaboration, vs. capture, 283, 286
Information and Regulatory Affairs;	collective action problem, 365, 426,
retrospective review	435
agency capture and, 420, 421, 429	critique of, 91
cost-benefit analysis and, 421, 423	logic of collective action, 403
Executive Order 12,291 and, 422	relationship networks and, 91
special interest influence and, 421	collusion, 55, 459
checks and balances, 48	Laffont-Tirole collusion model, 460
in nineteenth century regulatory	command and control regulation, 370
commissions, 44	commenters
Chicago School, 6, 26, 29, 31, 51, 443	analysis of commenter influence by
circuit breakers, 107	rule-making stages, 313, 314, 315
citations, 220, 227	commenter preference, 304, 315
contestation of, 219, 220	commenter preference results, 314
citizen suit, 413, 415	commenter success, 304
Civil Aeronautics Board (CAB), 14	competition. See also barriers to entry;
civil society, 331, 332, 333, 335, 338, 345,	entry-barrier capture
348, 359, 361, 440	among regulators as capture prevention,
Clean Air Act, 405	459
clientele groups, 321, 322	capture as stunting, 1
Clinton Administration, 271, 423	in radio broadcasting, 177
Reinventing Government initiative, 271,	vs. democracy, 47
272, 278	complex policy environments, 95, 100, 102,
tobacco regulation during, 347	458, 460, 468
Coal Act (1969), 216	game theory model of, 103
coal mining and industry, 212, 401, 402. See	policy implementation and, 101
also mining accidents; mining safety	sources of expertise and information in,
regulation	100



480 Index

complexity, 75, 327, 437 insurance industry influence and, 366, complex hierarchies, 208 367, 387, 395, 396 in cost-benefit analysis, 442 key features of, 395, 396 monitoring for influence capture and, 118 summary of, 388 of finance, 95 Consumer Financial Protection Bureau (CFPB), 84 of insurance regulation, 370 compliance, 7, 221, 222, 223, 274, 341 consumer information, 367, 373, 384 compliance costs, 221, 223 Consumer Participation Program (NAIC), concentrated control, 185 367, 371, 384, 389, 392, 396 conditional forbearance, 209, 210, 222, 225, ambiguous role of consumer 236, 237 representatives in, 384, 385 empirical analysis of in MSHA, 211 creation of, 383 confirmation bias, 116 evaluation of, 385 conflict avoidance, 50, 91 influence of on health insurance, 384, conflict of interest, 49, 58, 59, 149, 457 385, 386, 394, 395 between mining companies and labor consumer pressure, 52, 161 unions, 210 Consumer Watchdog (CW), 379, 382, 383 in MMS disbanding, 240 dominance of, 394 conformity, 81, 82, 90 excessive intervention of, 394 Congress, 53, 453 health insurance rate regulation and, 383 as supervisor of agencies, 397, 404, 406, intervenor compensation and, 379, 380 407 Pay As You Drive (PAYD) regulations contradictory mandates of, 437 and, 382 energy policy and, 279 rate filings and, 379, 380 Consumers' Research (CR), 157 lobbying of, 469 mining regulation and, 215, 216 contaminant and contamination MMS budget changes and before and CDC and, 353 HACCP rule and, 358 after revenue receipts decision, 265, 266 oversight of MMS appropriations, 257, incidents of, 357 258, 260, 261, 262, 263, 264, 268, 269 USDA and, 341 preventing capture through oversight of, content analysis of DOT rules, 294, 298, 303, 305 471, 473 roll call votes on FDA reform measures. contestation, 395 of financial and banking deregulation, 72 158, 159 congressional hearings of mining violations, 220 MMS employee testimony by function, rates of contestation as evidence, 226 corporate liberal synthesis, 30 259 of MMS budget changes and Revenue corrosive capture, 16, 18, 154, 365, 426, 452 Management appearances, 263, 264 alternative explanations for FDA, 164 as reflection of influence, 21 on Offshore and Revenue Management divisions of MMS, 257, 258, 259, 260, cultural capture and, 155 261, 263 entry-barrier capture as replacing, 456 constitutionalism, 41, 47 lack of academic discussion on, 154 mechanisms of, 155 constitutional design, 418 constructive engagement, 322 of FDA, 70, 153, 164, 171, 455 consumer empowerment programs, 97, 339, strong corrosive capture, 16, 415 363, 371, 453, 473. See also proxy corruption, 13, 38, 39, 44, 48, 456 advocacy; tripartism Charle Francis Adams on, 42, 43, 44 as counterweight to narrow interests, 462 in early twentieth century, 41 capture prevention and, 366, 462 institutional corruption, 40, 58 diffuse interests and, 426, 462 institutional vs. public, 58



Index 481

legislative corruption, 455 of railroad economics, 42, 43	MMS capture as explanation for, 240, 245 National Commission on the BP
cost-benefit analysis, 434, 453	Deepwater Horizon Oil Spill and
at OIRA, 439, 440	Offshore Drilling, 245
centralized review and, 421, 423	defeasible models, 12, 14, 15, 61
Executive Order 12,291, 423	delegation, 101, 334
of government intervention, 402	decision to, 331
standardization of, 440	empirical work on, 98
transparency of, 440	informational approach to, 100
costs	of state authority to private actors, 329
concentrated costs, 359	democracy, 12, 23, 359, 453
offsetting costs, 289	as context for agencies' alliances with civil
Council on Wage and Price Stability, 422	societies, 331
courts. See judicial review	democratic majority as measure of public
cozy ties, 91, 244, 245, 284, 471	interest, 13
Crandall Canyon disaster (2007), 224, 231,	inertia in political institutions of, 8
236	median voter preferences and, 402
cultural capture, 18, 62, 63, 69, 77, 79, 452,	special interest influence and, 455
456, 468	vs. economic competition, 31, 38, 46, 47
as alternative explanation, 93	Department of Transportation (DOT) rules,
as byproduct of human interactions, 95	293, 294, 302
as mechanism of capture, 20, 80	American State Administrators Project
corrosive capture and, 155	data, 306, 321
defined, 20, 79	content analysis from, 294, 298, 303, 306
financial regulatory behavior and, 94, 95	data from, 294, 302
negotiated rulemaking and, 96	officials of as capture preventers, 175,
non-testability of, 80	295, 324, 462
of FDA, 153, 164, 166	rule selection from, 302
of MMS, 284	rule topics and agencies, 309
preventing, 95, 96	subpopulation commenters perception of
cultural dynamics, 432	success of influence, 318
	subpopulation commenters perception
data	on business interests influence in
aggregate-level data, 10	rulemaking, 318, 319
cross-national datasets, 8	subpopulation influence across rule
from DOT rules during rulemaking, 294,	stages, 313, 314, 315
301, 302, 306	subpopulation influence correlations
on mining accidents on MSHA	across rule stages, 315, 316, 317
enforcement behavior, 226	subpopulation influence over state
public opinion on oil and gas production,	officials of, 321
285	subpopulation participation, 309, 311,
death, of miners, 214	312
debiasing strategies, 98	telephone survey of commenters on, 294,
deep capture, 74, 78	305
Deep Water Royalty Relief Act (1995), 273,	two-prong capture test results, 306, 309,
280	312, 315, 319, 320, 322, 323
DeepStar Research Project, 275	deregulation, 5, 10, 16, 20, 25, 32, 54, 62, 64,
Deepwater Horizon oil spill, 1, 174, 240, 243,	73, 74, 75, 453, 465
470	as capture prevention, 459
alternative explanations for, 240, 241	as corrosive capture, 21
energy policy following, 282	cultural capture and, 153



482 Index

of public health agencies, 335 deregulation (cont.) deregulation movement, 53 problems with capture inferences, 63, 358 two-prong test for influence vs. control during Bush Administration, 17 FDA and, 162 and, 292 of financial markets, 73 diffuse interests, 210, 426, 462 capture prevention and, 462 of homeowners policy forms, 372 presidents favoring, 94 disclosure undermining of public interests and, 70 consumer disclosures, 385 despotism, 46 disclosure on label ingredients developing economies, 12 requirements, 156 devil's advocates, 93, 98, 453, 463 disclosure requirements, 128, 148 diagnosing capture, 61, 177, 289, 470 expert witnesses testimonies and, 147 agency capture during rulemaking and, information disclosure requirements, 440 293, 298, 317, 319 of data, 147 bureaucratic capture, 210 on scope of coverage and underwriting by collaborating with political and public OPIC, 376 preferences and, 282 summary disclosure, 441 elections and electoral process and, 67 discretion, 75, 100, 360, 472 empirical approach to, 457, 465 discretionary clauses, 376 in policy choice, 100 evidentiary standards for, 8, 15, 20, 22, 24, 57, 210, 300 prosecutorial discretion, 399 experimental techniques for, 67 discrimination gold standard for, 14, 15, 63 against low-income drivers, 382 industry vs. public interests in, 62, 63 in employment, 53 inferential strategies and, 67 in insurance, 372 judicial review and, 410, 463 distributional analysis, 423, 424 measuring of public vs. industry interests distributive politics, 13 and, 67, 402 Dodd-Frank financial reform bill, 84, 99 median voter preferences and, 402, 403 domestic security, 330 misdiagnosis and mistreatment of drug abuse, 242 capture and, 3, 22, 64, 173, 402, 454, Drug Amendments (1962), 162 drug lag, 162 misdiagnosis from weak evidentiary dynamic analysis, 56 standards for, 21 misdiagnosis of FRC, 173 E. coli, 332, 338, 340, 341 misdiagnosis of industry influence in, economic models of interest group politics, 173, 210 misdiagnosis of MSHA, 174 economic theory of regulation, 52, 176, 177, need for understanding mechanisms of 190, 206, 425 economies of scale, 104, 105, 251 capture and, 68 of cultural capture of FDA, 166 economists' capture, 69, 130, 456 of DOT during rulemaking, 294, 295, career concerns and, 131 employment opportunities outside of FDA via traditional capture theory, academia and, 131 153, 166, 169, 171 expert testimony by economists and, 126, of FRC, 204 132, 133 of MMS, 240, 241, 242, 244, 245, 247, factors preventing, 125, 126, 144, 151 255, 257, 267, 270, 282 media scrutiny and, 145 monetary considerations and, 139 of MMS (misdiagnosis), 174, 240, 241, 247 probusiness bias in publication process of MSHA, 226, 236 and, 133



Index 483

probusiness bias in tenure and, 138 publication process and, 125, 126, 132,	energy policy, 174, 212, 241, 257, 283, 289. See also Deepwater Horizon oil spill;
133	Minerals Management Service; oil and
relationship networks and, 143	gas production
reputational capital and, 124	after Exxon Valdex oil spill, 252, 270, 271
shaming of expert witnesses and, 147	Deep Water Royalty Relief Act (1995), 273
efficiency, 74, 148, 251, 291, 446	Energy Task Force and, 278, 279
elections and electoral process, 17, 67, 94, 209, 430	national economic and energy policy goals, 251
deregulation through, 154	offshore oil and gas policy, 241
electorally sanctioned probusiness governance, 210	public opinion after <i>Deepwater Horizon</i> oil spill, 281
Electoral College, 429, 430	public opinion on, 281, 292
embedded information, 108, 109, 110, 111,	Reinventing Government initiative and,
113, 123	271
ability to use, 114	shift from environmental protection in,
assumptions about, 106	286
incentive to acquire independent	statutes of, 279, 280
information and, 110	enforcement, 212
optimal use of, 109	judicial review of, 413
outcomes under, 110	transparency in, 424
payoffs from, 110, 117, 118, 121	entrepreneurial efforts, 351
preference for, 121	entry-barrier capture, 17, 24, 154, 170, 171
proximity learning and, 122	corrosive capture as replacing, 456
empirical analysis, 8, 60, 61, 174, 465. <i>See also</i> content analysis; regression	Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act of 1938 and, 156, 157
analysis; statistical analysis	lack of evidence for FDA, 153, 166, 169,
absence of capture and, 62	171
detection and measurement of capture	pharmaceutical regulation and, 155
and, 15, 457	environmental crises and disaster, 53, 240,
of bias in executive compensation	405. See also Deepwater Horizon oil
publications, 133, 134, 135, 136	spill; energy policy; mining accidents;
of conditional forbearance in MSHA, 211	oil spills
of influence vs. control, 293	capture and, 2, 471
of legislative capture, 58	capture and, 2
of MSHA response to mining accidents,	dolphin killings and, 108, 145
211, 212, 220, 222, 223, 224	mining regulation and, 210, 471
of MSHA response to mining accidents	environmental organizations, 145, 278
(Bush Administration), 224, 234, 237 of MSHA response to mining accidents	environmental protection, 241, 248, 251, 287, 448
(Obama Administration), 224, 234, 237	public opinion on, 281
of tripartite structures, 370	Environmental Protection Agency (EPA),
on influence, 451	24, 84, 411, 438, 449
on preventing capture, 452, 455	inefficiency of, 473
on rulemaking and agency capture, 298	Massachusetts v. EPA and, 405
patterns of regulatory decision making	environmental regulation, 7, 20, 53, 84, 257,
and, 63	259, 271, 274, 280, 293
Stigler and, 8	ethics, 146, 208, 210, 288, 468. See also
two-prong test for influence in agency	bribes; corruption; revolving door;
capture, 295, 300, 301	unethical activity
endogenous information, 101	institutional and interpersonal ethics, 89



484 Index

evidentiary standards, 15, 20, 22, 24, 57, 64, providing a consumer perspective to 207, 210. See also diagnosing capture; regulators, 390 empirical analysis; history and scientific expertise, 162, 330, 335, 360, historical evidence 463 for agency decision making, 96 scientific expertise of FDA, 162 misdiagnosis of capture through weak, 21 technical expertise, 330, 331, 335, 356, need for clear standards and counterfactual in, 67 vs. autonomy in complex policy need for confirming and disconfirming environments, 102, 103 evidence, 177 wage premium on, 102 statistical evidence for FDA capture, 166, expertise rent (source of capture), 111, 113, 169, 171 114, 115, 116, 119, 120 executive compensation, 126, 131, 139 large, 117 statistical analysis of downloaded papers external actors, 331, 338 CDC and, 355, 356 from SSRN, 133, 135, 136, 137, 140 executive control, 420, 422, 453 partial agency autonomy from, 333, 361 as supervisor of agency actions, 397, 404, extreme policy, 110 Exxon Valdez oil spill, 252, 259, 263, 270 limited authority in agencies and, 398 Executive Office of the President (EOP), factions, 30, 39, 40, 48 431, 432 defined, 11 executive orders, 439, 440 false confidence, 207 false consciousness, 62 Executive Order 12,044, 422 Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Executive Order 12,291, 422, 423 Executive Order 12,839, 271 Control Act (2009), 328, 348 Executive Order 12,866, 272, 423 Fannie Mae, 1, 147, 472 fatalism, 3, 5 Executive Order 12866, 413 Executive Order 13,132, 439 favoritism, 83 Executive Order 13,563, 424, 444 Federal Deposit Insurance Corporation Executive Order 13,610, 447 (FDIC), 72 regulatory discretion of, 472 on rulemaking, 438 Federal Meat Inspection Act (1906), 331, exogenous expertise, 101 exogenous shocks, 223, 237, 239, 361 337, 341 Federal Oil and Gas Management Act, 260 exogenous variation, 226 expected utility, 109, 221 Federal Oil and Gas Royalty Management experimentation Act (FOGRMA), 249 Federal Radio Commission (FRC) for diagnosing capture, 67 in broadcasting, 193, 194 amateur radio operators testimonies, 43 expert testimonies, 126, 132, 133, 147 as case study of misdiagnosed capture, expertise, 66, 69, 102 173, 457 academic, 132, 133, 147, 456 creation of, 183, 184 disconfirming evidence of capture in bureaucratic expertise as exogenous, 101 CDC's use of, 349, 350, 352 1927 decision, 178, 180, 182, 204, 207 diverse and independent as capture historical record of hearings of, 178 preventive, 453, 462, 463 history as test of theory in, 177, 183 game theory model of, 103, 104, 105 overview of broadband expansion in financial regulation, 102 decision, 179 need for in consumer empowerment public hearings of (March-April 1927), programs, 394 185, 186 radio broadcasters testimonies, 44 political science scholarship on, 100, radio engineers testimonies, 42



Index 485

radio listeners organization testimonies,	Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act of, 348
radio manufacturers testimonies, 43	Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act and, 156
unpopularity of broadband expansion	gatekeeping power of, 152
proposal, 186	industry opposition to reform efforts of,
Federal Reserve, 72, 74, 84, 472	157, 158
cognitive bias in regulatory decision	medical devices and, 171
making, 76, 78	nutritional and dietary supplements and
federal thrifts, 18, 155	171
Federal Trade Commission (FTC), 158	post-1938 developments in, 161
creation of, 53	problems with tobacco regulation
federalism, 440	considerations, 344
financial crisis (2007–2009), 1, 5, 62, 73, 93,	review times for drug approval, 166, 171
472	scale of regulation by, 152
non-materialist theories of capture and,	scientific uncertainty on tobacco risk, 345
reforms after, 99	statistical evidence for FDA entry-barrie
regulatory failures preceding, 468, 472	capture, 166, 169, 171
Financial Industry Regulatory Authority	Surgeon General report on tobacco and,
(FINRA), 107	345
financial regulation, 104, 107	tobacco industry's legal defense against,
capture of, 74, 93	346, 347
complexity of policy domains in, 100	tobacco regulation and, 327, 343
congressional debate over, 92	food safety, 336, 361
cultural capture and, 94, 95	as regulatory sucess, 2
expertise and, 102	CDC and, 328
financial reforms post-financial crisis,	foodborne illness patterns since HACCP
99	342
financial sector influence over, 77	HACCP rules for pathogen regulation
group identification and, 83, 84	and, 327, 338, 339, 342
monitoring of for systemic risks, 99	meat and poultry inspection by FSIS, 33
on late fees, 71	pathogen contamination as central
public interest and, 73, 74, 75	concern of, 338
relationship networks and, 91	public concern over post-E. Coli
status and, 87, 88	outbreak, 338, 357
firm-agency antagonism, 113 first mover advantage, 223	publicity campaign on adulterated foods 156
Food and Drug Administration (FDA), 152,	responsibility between government and
343. <i>See also</i> food safety; public health	industry and, 338
agencies	Food Safety Inspection Service (FSIS), 336,
AIDS crisis and, 163, 164	341
alliances with interest and women's	Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act (1938), 156
groups, 157	331, 344
cancer drugs and, 163	passage of, 161
congressional roll call votes on reform	forebearance. See conditional forbearance
measures, 158	fraud
corrosive capture and, 70, 153, 164, 171,	financial, 4, 99
455	in advertising, 156
cultural capture of, 153	Freddie Mac, 1, 472
deregulation and, 162	free rider problem, 365, 436
Drug Amendments of 1962 and, 162	functionalism, 15, 16
0	



false conclusions and confidence, 207

486 Index

game theory model, 58, 103, 120, 459

of agency capture, 60 FRC broadcast spectrum restrictions and, of influence capture, 116 of legislative capture, 59 FRC hearing transcripts as, 186 of relationship between mining historical development of coal mining, 212, 213 regulatory agencies and fiirms, 220, 221, 222 historical myopia, 48 policy expertise model, 105 historical orthodoxy, 30 gatekeeping power, 152 intellectual history of capture theory, General Federation of Women's Clubs (GFWC), 157 of corrupt railroad economics in early gold standard for diagnosing capture, 15 twentieth century, 42, 43 government failure, xi, 51, 425, 465 of industry influence, 27, 42 government interests, 305, 309, 310, 317, of mining safety regulation, 215 of MMS capture, 240 318. See also Department of Transportation (DOT) rules on miner deaths, 214 government intervention, 31, 402 on public health agency capture, 335 opposing of, 146 role of in study of regulatory capture and political economy, 179 government watchdog groups, 461 grandfathering, 348 scholars of regulation and Great Recession, 99 administration, 35 Greece, 150 Home Ownership and Equity Protection group identification, 77, 79, 80, 81, 91, Act (1994), 74 97 housing bubble, 73, 78, 97 human capital, 101, 124, 125, 129 conformity and, 82 financial regulation and, 83, 84 academic, 125 group identification experiments and, 81, Huntington, Samuel, 26, 27, 28, 153, 154 ideological influences, 76, 415 harmonization, 438 ideological pessimism, 31 Harvard Business School, 142, 149 immigration, 330, 413 Hazard Analysis Critical Control Point reforming immigration, 326 (HACCP), 327, 338, 339, 356 Immigration Reform and Control Act foodborne illness patterns (1986), 328post-implementation of, 342 impartiality, 27, 295, 362 implementation, 101 management and performance standards of, 342 implementation variance, 109 health insurance, 384, 385, 386, 395 incumbent firms, 4, 116, 452, 456 Consumer Watchdog and, 383 independent experts, 453 independent regulatory authority, 100 health insurance reform, 384 heuristic models, 212, 220 Indian tribes, royalty collection and, 258, hierarchical political control, 225, 236, 237, 260 individualism, 19 high frequency trading, 107 industry influence, 22, 28, 57, 65, 119, 175, 211, 225, 394, 396, 470, 473 history and historical evidence, 173. See also capture theory; evidentiary standards; as cause of capture, 426 Federal Radio Commission asymmetrical, 130 as test of theory, 176, 177, 207 benefits of, 118 capture theory and, 37 checks on, 12 corruption in early twentieth century, 41 consumer empowerment programs and,

367, 374, 396

early capture scholarship and, 6



Index 487

consumer representatives of NAIC and, judicial review as leveling interest group, 385, 386 409, 434, 464 cultural capture and, 95 inferential strategies, 57, 67 economists' capture and, 69 exaggerated claims of capture and, 3 empirical analysis of, 212 problems with capture inferences, historical examples of, 27 industry-wide coordination, 155 influence, 13. See also business interests misdiagnosis of capture from, 64 influence; industry influence; interest MMS and, 245 groups; public interest; public interest motive and 16 groups need for careful research on, 3, 5, 11 agency capture and, 300 of financial sector over financial as problem in democracy and, 455 regulation, 77 asymmetrical influence, 95, 144 patterns of regulatory decision making beliefs on capture by, 2 and, 63 centralized review and, 421 political context and, 237 corrosive capture and, 21 proxy advocacy and, 368 disparities in, 146 repeated interaction with and, 18 during rulemaking, 294, 298, 309, 311, 312, 313, 319, 320, 322, 433 vs. public interests, 68 Industry Influence in Regulatory Agencies during rulemaking (across rule stages), 313, 314, 315 (Quirk), 3 industry interests, 1, 11, 20, 61, 128, 141 during rulemaking (correlation analysis), action and intent in pursuing policy and, 315, 316, 317 during rulemaking (on agency heads and 14, 15, 20, 73 consumer empowerment programs and, state DOT officials), 321 395 economy of influence, 58 cultural capture and, 63 empirical work on, 451 defined, 14 historical examples of, 27, 42 forbearance and, 208 ideological influences, 75, 76 game theory model of, 59, 60 influence capture, 118, 295 in continuation of regulatory system by, influence capture model, 116, 117 institutional protections against, 464 meat industry oppostion to HACCP, 357 mechanisms of, 75, 92, 96, 126, 208 need for careful research on influence of, monitoring for, 118 21 need for research on, 3, 5, 11, 21 non-random assignment of, 66 non-rational forms of, 76 opposition to USDA pathogen standards of career staff on appointees, 432 by, 340 of factions, 39, 40, 48 overstating of influence of, 457 of financial sector over financial public health agencies offsetting of, 327, regulation, 78 329, 331 of industry representatives, 92 vs. public interests, 426 of public interest organizations, 428 inefficiency, 46, 296, 394, 396. See also of state DOT officials, 295, 324 Mineral Management Service; OIRA and, 434 regulatory failures proxy advocacy and, 368, 369 bureaucrat hypothesis and, 427 public health agencies and, 335 public opinion and, 61 in game theory model, 108 of markets, 97 publics lack of mechanisms for, 368 of OSHA and EPA, 473 vs. control, 293 inequality, 48, 146, 382, 460 weak capture and, 12 in insurance, 372 worry over radio industry, 185



488 Index

information, 433 Consumer Participation Program; asymmetrical, 65, 105, 325 Consumer Watchdog; Texas Office of autonomous sources of in complex policy Public Insurance Counsel as state-level regulation, 366 environments, 102 beneficial sharing of between industry auto insurance, 375, 376, 381, 382 and agencies, 95 consumer empowerment programs and, competing sources of administrative 97, 366, 367, 387 rulemaking, 307 health insurance, 383, 384, 385, 386, 395 cost of, 297, 433 influence over regulatory outcomes and, cost of independent, 114 370 dependency of regulators on regulated proxy advocacy in, 390 for, 124 intensity of oversight, 222 embedded information, 106, 108, 109, intent, 61, 73, 176, 426 110, 111, 113, 114, 117, 118, 121, 122, capture diagnoses and, 62 defined, 14 endogenous information, 101 interest groups industry-specific information, 128 agency capture and, 296, 426 information capture, 77, 93, 365 as cause of capture, 426 information disclosure requirements, 441 asymmetrical influence among, 130 information needs, 141 economic models of politics of, 9 information overload, 441 history of influence of, 23 information technology revolution, 164 presidential power as reduction in, 436 informational account of regulation, 66 public health agencies and, 335 informational approach to delegation, public health policies and, 357 100 retrospective review and, 445 media and, 145 rise of diffuse interests, 427, 462 political science scholarship on, 100, 101 taking advantage of administrative law by, scientific, 61 75, 77 technical information, 328 women's groups, 156 innovation, 440 internal validity, 67 International Offshore Oil and Gas Law amateur innovation in radio, 193 capture as stunting, 1 Conference 247 in the financial sector, 95 Interstate Commerce Act, 6 of CDC, 350 Interstate Commerce Commission (ICC), pharmaceutical innovation, 162 26, 27, 33, 50 capture of, 54 policy innovation, 331, 333, 336, 362 policy innovation by public health intervenor compensation, 395 agencies, 328, 329, 336 Consumer Watchdog and, 379, 380 policy innovation by USDA, 339, 340, 342 intervention process, 379 intervention process, 377, 379, 383 regulatory innovation, 272 inspecting and inspections, 267, 275 is-ought difficulty, 10 at MMS, 254, 291 FOGRMA requirements for, 249 Jack-in-the-Box E. coli outbreak, 338, 357 Jim Walter Resources No. 5 accident, 224 meat inspection, 337, 338 of mines by MSHA, 218 journalism and journalists RIK investigation and, 288 muckraking, 41, 44, 461 judicial controls, 398, 406, 407, 408, 419 training program for, 276 institutional corruption, 40, 58 judicial review, 29, 364, 453 institutional design, 40 across-the-board investigation and, 420 insurance industry and regulation. See also adjudication and, 400 California Public Participation Plan; aggrieved parties and, 415

© in this web service Cambridge University Press



Index 489

as capture prevention, 401, 404, 406, 408, limited capture 410, 463 vs. pervasive capture, 7, 12, 22, 454 as cost on change, 404 Linowes Commission, 248, 250, 253 as leveling of playing field, 408, 433, 463 lobbying, 38, 141, 157, 211, 469 basic outline of, 398 during rulemaking, 301 diverse interest groups and, 405 ex-parte, 299 failure to detect capture by, 410 for policy change by business interests, judicial authority and, 407 316 legal challenges to non-status quo agency industrial lobbies, 462 action and, 404, 405 influence tactics, 295 limits on standing and, 414, 416 profitability and, 130 merits-based test, 409 of agency action vs. legislative action, 401 Madison, James, 34, 39, 40 of selective enforcement patterns, 414 majoritarianism, 428 revision of, 417, 418 Mammoth Mine explosion (1891), 215 standards of review in, 399, 400 management, xv, 245, 253, 260, 272, 290 unreviewable agency action and, 412 management-based regulations in jurisdiction, 250, 328, 331, 344, 436, 437 HACCP, 342 FDA tobacco regulation and, 327, 344, marasmus, 18, 27, 33 346 market behavior, 350 federal over submerged lands in OCSLA, market efficiency theory, 125 251 Martimort, David, 55 jurisdictional boundaries, 17, 154 Massachusetts v. EPA, 404, 413, 449 of CDC vs. FDA and EPA, 349 material self-interest, 75, 76, 77, 79, 80, 81, Kolko, Gabriel, 30 vs. irrational decision-making, 77 Koop, C. Everett, 345 measurement, 302, 403. See also diagnosing capture, evidentiary standards for labor unions, 14, 435 measurement errors, 65 mining companies and, 210 of public interest, 13, 297 laissez-faire, 34 meat inspection, 337, 338, 340, 358 of MMS, 246 mechanisms of capture, 18, 79, 126, 403. See large-firm advantage, 458 also bribes; revolving door lead poisoning, 355 asymmetries and, 130 learning effect, 122 behavioral biases and, 76, 77 career concerns, 127, 131, 139 legal authority, 360, 361 of CDC, 352 difficulty in identifying, 93 of USDA, 339 economic incentives in, 124 legal retaliation, 18, 404 expertise as, 456 for legislators, 403 threats of, 63 game theory model of, 59, 60 legislative capture, 19, 59 legislative corruption, 455 group identification and, 80, 81, 82 legitimacy, 238, 462 information and, 128 of regulatory review, 420 material self-interest and, 75 need for deeper understanding of, 68, 69 technical competence and, 463 licensing need for research on, 57 protection without capture and, 64 of agency capture, 209 Stigler's regressions on, 65 of corrosive capture, 155 Life Cycle of Regulatory Agencies (essay, of cultural capture in financial regulation, Martimort), 55 94.95 life-cycle theory of regulation, 50, 53 of cultural capture of FDA, 164, 165



490 Index

mechanisms of capture (cont.) empirical analysis of response to mining of economists' capture, 130 accidents by publicity level (Obama of FDA, 153 Administration), 224, 234, 237 of MMS by oil and gas industry, 240 enforcement and inspection process of, one-sided participation in regulation 218, 226, 227 and, 365 inspector noncompliance and, 219 pro-business bias in publication process media coverage of (1999-2010), 227 and, 133 misdiagnosis of capture of, 174 pro-business bias in tenure and, 138 publicity level of and agency response to relationship networks and, 80, 89, 90, 91, Jim Walters, 229, 236 129, 209 publicity level of and agency response to rulemaking and, 293, 295, 298 Sago, 211, 218, 231, 234 status and, 80, 85, 86, 87 response to Crandall Canyon, 231, 236 unethical activity as, 240 response to Upper Big Branch, 211, media coverage and publicity, 461 234 adverse for tobacco industry, 349 revolving door at, 220 agency behavior and, 455 MINER Act (2006), 218, 237 as political pressure, 387, 392, 393, 395 Minerals Management Service (MMS), 1, economists' capture and, 145 457. See also energy policy; Offshore informing of citizens by, 453 Energy; Revenue Management initiative on adulterated foods by FDA, allegations of lack of influence of 156 scientists at, 244 of dolphin killings, 108 as clear case of capture, 239, 241, 243, of mining accidents, 174, 224, 225, 236 244, 245, 247, 257 of MMS failure, 244 collaborative approach to regulating by, of MSHA post-mining accidents, 227, 231 240, 241, 245, 246, 247, 248, 250, 275, of scandals, 4 276, 278 preventing capture and, 145, 461 congressional oversight of appropriations publicity radio stations, 201 of, 257, 258, 260, 261, 262, 263, 268, median voter preferences, 402, 403 medical devices, 171 correlation between geographical Medical Loss Ratio (MLR) regulation, 386, location and core functions in, 252, 393 Medicare, 206 creation of, 241, 248, 249, 255, 256, Mine Act (1977), 217, 218 Mine Data Retrieval System, 226 DeepStar Research Project and, 275 Mine Enforcement and Safety difficult inter-agency coordination and, Administration (MESA), 217 254, 255 Mine Safety and Health Administration disbanding of, 240, 248 (MSHA), 458. See also coal mining and employee testimony by function at industry; mining accidents; mining Congressional hearings, 264 safety regulations FOGRMA and, 249 agency capture accusations, 219 gift exchange and unethical behavior by conditional forbearance and, 209, 211, employees of, 239, 240, 242, 243, 468 225, 236, 237 misdiagnosis of capture of, 174, 240, 241, creation of, 217 247, 267, 270 empirical analysis of response to mining negotiated rulemaking in, 272 accidents by publicity level, 211, 212, OIG investigations of, 241, 242, 243, 244, 220, 222, 223, 224 245, 247, 257 empirical analysis of response to mining organizational design of, 252 accidents by publicity level (Bush outwardly conflicting missions of, 240, Administration), 224, 234, 237 241, 246, 247, 248



Index 491

percentage of MMS employees in empirical analysis of, 220, 221, 222 Colorado and Louisiana (Sept. 2008), historical development of, 215 Mine Act (1977) and, 217, 218 political and public preferences influence MINER Act (2006) and, 218 on, 282 policy response to accidents in 1891, 215 real budget by function over time, 262, policy response to accidents in 1910, 216 263 policy response to accidents in 1940, 216 Reinventing Government initiative and, public interest as counterfactual in, 210 regulatory success of, 214 monitoring relationship networks with oil and gas industry personnel in, 91, 244, 245, for influence capture, 118 of financial sector, 99 relative budget changes and before and Monongah Nos. 6 and 8 explosion, 216 after revenue receipts decision, 265, mortgages, 18, 73, 74 muckraking, 41, 44 relative budget changes and Revenue Management appearances before Nash equilibrium, 120, 122, 221 Congress, 263, 264 National Association of Insurance reorganization of, 241, 248, 249, 250, 251, Commissioners. See Consumer 252, 253, 254, 255, 257 Participation Program Subcommittee on Royalty Management National Cancer Institute (NCI), 145 report (2007) and, 254 National Commission on the BP Deepwater theories of failure of, 240, 241, 245, 247, Horizon Oil Spill and Offshore 248 Drilling, 245 mining accidents, 210, 214 national constituency decline in, 214 as reducer of influence, 436 impact of Crandall Canyon on MSHA OIRA administrators and, 430 presidential responsiveness to, 420, 428, action, 231, 236 impact of Jim Walters Resources No. 5 on 429, 430, 434 MSHA action, 231, 236 National Energy Policy Development impact of Sago on MSHA action, 211, Group, 278 218, 231, 234 negotiated rulemaking, 285, 300, 463 impact of stock prices on affected and cultural capture and, 96 unaffected mining companies, 227, negotiated settlements, 391 228, 229 negotiations, good faith, 392 impact of Upper Big Branch on MSHA neoliberalism, 25, 32 action, 211, 231, 234 new governance, 369, 370, 384 media coverage of MSHA (1999-2010) Nirvana fallacy, 51 notice and comment, 293, 294, 298, 299, and, 228 301, 305, 311, 376, 377, 433, 453, 460 MSHA enforcement process following, 223 business interest participation in, 298 policy responses to in 1891, 215 public participation in, 368, 370 policy responses to in 1910, 216 Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (NPRM), policy responses to in 1969, 216 293, 294 publicity level and agency response to, nutritional and dietary supplements, 171

> Obama Administration, 278, 291 antiregulatory bias and, 421, 447 appointments of, 423 mining accidents during, 224, 234, 238 MMS and, 244, 246, 257 retrospective review and, 421, 444

mining safety regulation, 162, 209, 210. See

Act for the Protection of the Lives of

Miners in the Territories (1891), 216

also Mine Safety and Health

Administration

Coal Act of 1969, 216



492 Index

Occupational Safety and Health Offshore Energy (MMS), 252, 283, 286, 289. Administration (OSHA), 7 See also Minerals Management Service; OCSLA. See Outer Continental Shelf Lands Revenue Management awards and support for, 276 Office of Federal Housing Enterprise collaborative approach to regulating by, Oversight, 472 275, 276, 278 Office of Information and Regulatory congressional hearings on, 257, 258, 259, Affairs (OIRA), 364, 421, 453. See also 260, 261, 263 centralized review; presidential power correlation between geographical iustification location and core functions in, 252, academic and nonprofit work of administrators, 443 difficult inter-agency coordination and, administrative law background of 254, 255 administrators, 443 employees of, 253 agency capture and, 421 funding levels of, 277 annual report to Congress by, 449 increased responsibilities of in response anti-capture role of, 97, 421, 425, 428, to Exxon Valdez spill, 260, 263, 270 429, 434, 450, 464 OCSLA and, 252 regulatory strategy changes in response to appointment process of administrators at, 442, 444 mid-90s energy policy and, 274 benefits of generalist perspective of, 434, relative budget changes and appearances 435, 436 before Congress, 264, 265 coordination role of, 437, 438 relative budget changes before and after cost-benefit analysis and, 439, 440 revenue receipts decision, 266, 267, detractors and defenders of, 424 279 educational and employment relative budget changes in, 263 responsibilities of, 251 background of admistrators, 442 institutional features of, 434 statutes pertaining to, 279, 280 overview of, 422 Subcommittee on Royalty Management political insulation and, 432, 434 report (2007) and, 254 presidential proximity and, 431, 432 oil and gas industry private sector and, 444 DeepStar Research Project and problems with presidential power defense collaboratory efforts with MMS, 275, and, 429, 430, 431, 434 public disclosure of reviews and, 447 MMS capture and, 240, 241, 242, 244, 245, 247, 257, 267 retrospective review and, 445, 446 relationship networks with MMS review of agency inaction and, 447, 448, employees and, 91, 244, 245, 284 449, 450 standardization of retrospective review oil and gas production, 241, 247, 251, 285, and, 446 289, 291. See also Deepwater Horizon oil Office of Inspector General (OIG), 241, 242, spill; energy policy; Minerals 243, 244, 245, 247, 257 Management Service Office of Management and Budget (OMB), after Exxon Valdex oil spill, 252 423 average water depth in Gule of Mexico, Office of the Comptroller of the Currency 273, 274 (OCC), 17, 71 congressional hearings on, 259 intervention in Smiley v. Citibank of, 72 Deep Water Royalty Relief Act (1995) preemption of state regulation and, 154 and, 273 Office of Thrift Supervision (OTS), 17, DeepStar Research Project and, 275 expansion of, 279 72 preemption of state regulation and, 154 growth of in early 90s, 273



Index 493

International Offshore Oil and Gas Law Conference, 246 moratorium on, 271 on Indian lands, 258, 259, 260 policies of, 270 Oil Pollution Act (1990), 270, 280, 285 oil spills, 1, 4, 174, 246, 278, 281, 426. See also Deepwater Horizon oil spill Exxon Valdez, 252, 260, 263, 270 Offhore Energy (MMS) and, 260 optimal target, 111, 123 organizational design, 287 organizational entrepreneurs, 328 Outer Continental Shelf Lands Act (1953), over-regulation, 450 oversight, 460. See also Congress; Minerals Management Service division of responsibility for, 459 of CDC, 352 participation domination, 301, 312 partisanship, 356 passivity, 50, 324 patent medicine industry, 156 pathogen contamination HACCP rule and, 339 rates of infection post-HACCP rule and, pathogen testing, 358 patient advocacy, 170 Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act (ACA), 384, 385, 386 Pattern of Violations (POV) designation, Pay As You Drive (PAYD) regulations, 381 penalties, 219

lack of statistical evidence on entry-barrier capture of FDA, 166, 169, measuring of drug submissions and firm mergers in, 168 measuring of firm size and, 168 weak capture and, 171 Philip Morris, 348, 357, 358 plausibility, vs. proof, 4, 166 pluralist politics, 327, 358 policy. See also complex policy environments; energy policy; statutes expertise advantage and, 119 extreme policy, 110, 118 industry intent and action in, 73 initiatives built to fail, 329 innovation in the financial sector, 95 intensity of citizen preference and, 403 judicial review and, 406 neoliberal policies, 25 of new governance and tripartism, 369, 370 policy cycle, 51 policy expertise model, 105 policy implications of strong and weak capture, 455 policy innovation, 331, 336, 359 policy innovation by public health agencies, 328, 329, 333, 336, 362 policy innovation by USDA, 339, 340, 342 policy innovation of CDC, 350 policy mediation, 438 policy outcomes with proximity learning, policy responses after regulatory failures, policy responses of CDC to H1N1 pandemic, 349 policy salience, 211 policymaking not driven by private interests, 329 prescriptions based on overly simplified models of capture, 9, 10, 12, 20 prescriptions for capture for agency officials, 73 prescriptions for diagnosing capture, 67 prescriptions for industry influence, 238 prescriptions for preventing capture, 2, 459, 460, 467 prescriptions for preventing capture via anti-trust enforcement, 146

periodization, 36

pervasive capture

CDC and, 355

in, 156, 158

lack of credible evidence on, 454

vs. limited capture, 7, 12, 22, 454

Drug Administration

entry-barrier capture and, 155

capture of FDA by, 153

pharmaceutical industry and regulation, 70,

Control and Prevention; Food and

evidence of entry-barrier vs, corrosive

FDA governing of fradulent advertising

167. See also Centers for Disease



494 Index

policy (cont.) reelection and, 430 prescriptions for preventing capture via responsiveness to electoral constituency OIRA review, 450, 464 and, 429 prescriptions for preventing cultural preventing capture, 2, 5, 11, 21, 22, 151, 451, capture, 96 458 proximity learning effect and, 115 access to data for academics and, 125 reasons for difficulties in changes to, 8 administrative state creation and, 23 rulemaking and, 293 adversarial regulatory bodies and, 246 shift in from public to special interests in agency coordination process and, 438 diagnosing capture, 14, 15, 20 agency-level strategies for, 453 soft pressures and, 93 awareness of the risk of, 150 political climate, 174, 210, 211, 237, 274 case studies of, 173, 363, 460, 462 antiregulatory of 80s and 90s, 164 congressional oversight and, 471, 473 political economy, xxi, 33, 60, 66, 330, 357, consumer empowerment programs and, 97, 366, 462 constraints of, 141 debiasing strategies and, 98 of insurance regulation, 370 deregulation and, 459, 465 role of history in study of, 176, 179 devil's advocates and, 96, 98, 453, 463 political insulation, 46, 432, 434 diffuse interests and, 462 political parties, 158, 446 diverse and independent expertise and, centralized review and, 420 175, 462, 463 political pressure, 367, 369, 390, 437 division of power and oversight media coverage as, 386, 392, 393 responsibilities and, 459, 460 political retaliation, 18, 403, 410 economists' capture and, 125, 126, 144 threats of, 63 empirical research on governmental positivism, 38 regulatory failure and, 465 power empirical work on, 451, 455 countervailing power, 370 fatalism on, 3 dividing power across multiple generalist institutions and, 436 regulators, 459 judicial review and, 401, 404, 405, 406, gatekeeping power of FDA, 152 408, 409, 411, 417, 460, 463 police power, 45, 46 media coverage and, 145, 461 separation of power, 101, 459 negotiated rulemaking and, 96 pragmatism, 38 of financial industry, 95, 96 predation by regulation, 7 OIRA and, 97, 421, 428, 429, 434, 436, 446, 450, 464 predatory lending practices, 99 preference rent (source of capture), 111, public participation in rulemaking and, 113, 114, 119, 120 298, 460 pre-proposal stage, 293, 294, 299, 301, 302, research on past successes in, 452 310 research on strategies for, 459 ANPRM and, 294 social media tools and, 324 business interests influence in, 299 state DOT officials and, 295, 324 Prescription Drug User Fee Act (PDUFA), subnational agency officials and, 175, 163, 165 321, 324, 462 presidential control over agencies. See timing of, 470 executive control; executive orders; traditional capture theory and, 425 presidential power justification unrecognized capacity of, 453 presidential power justification, 428, 431, price regulation, 381 principal-agent relationship, 208, 209, 362 433, 436 capture prevention and, 428 private actors, 329 problems with, 429, 430, 431, 432, 434 private good, 401, 413



Index 495

private interests, 436 privatization, 25 privileging, 17 of producers over consumers, 17, 154 procedural rights, 389, 394, 395 professionalization of the social sciences, 38 profitability, 130, 209 of radio broadcasting, 178, 182 progressive regulatory reformers, 37, 38, 44 progressivism, 30 prompt letters, 449 Proprietary Association (PA), 157 prosecutorial discretion, 399 protection without capture licensing and, 64 protectionism, 54, 60 proxies, 94, 95, 98, 297 proximity, 78, 96 proximity learning, 113, 115, 122 policy outcomes from assumptions about, 115 proxy advocacy, 366, 367, 389, 390. See also consumer empowerment programs; Texas Office of Public Insurance Administrative Law Judges and, 369 as independent consumer counsel, 368, criteria for effective, 367 decline in influence of, 390 forms of, 368 in insurance regulation, 390 industry influence in utilities regulation and, 368 procedural rights for, 391 vs. tripartism, 392, 393, 396 psychology and economics, 80 cognitive psychology and behavioral economics, 76 group identification experiments and, 81, relationship network experiments, 89 public choice economics, 11, 14, 30, 31, 41, 59, 296, 344, 421, 425 median voter preferences and, 402, 403, 417, 419 public concern, 358 public good, 176 public health agencies, 61, 327, 463. See also Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco and

Firearms; Centers for Disease Control and Prevention; Food and Drug Administration; U.S. Department of Agriculture autonomy in, 356 case studies of, 328, 336 changing public health context and, 328 diagnosing capture of, 336 high stakes of decisions of, 359 importance of, 326 institutional and legal constraints on, 332, 333 legal authority of, 331, 360, 361 partial autonomy in, 360, 361 policy innovation in, 328, 329, 331, 334, 336, 362 reputational capital of, 359 scientific and technical expertise in, 330, 331, 360 Public Health Service Act, 331 public interest, 41, 61, 62, 426 agency action and, 334 agency inaction and, 422, 448 as alternative explanation to capture, 58 as counterfactual, 58, 60, 64, 210 business interests and, 296 career employees advancement of own views of, 427 concern over tobacco and, 347 defeasible models of, 14, 15, 61 defined, 13, 402 deregulation and, 70 diagnosing capture and, 63 financial deregulation and, 73, 74, 75 game theory model of, 59, 60 gatekeeping power of FDA and, 152 in tobacco regulation, 345 intensity of preference and, 403 measuring, 13, 67, 297, 402 median voter preferences and, 402 pessimism about goverment protection of, 31 political parties differing conceptions of, 210 public health agencies and, 175 public health concerns and, 330 public interest capture theory, 31, 32, 427 Republican approach to, 61, 62, 210 strong capture as violation of, 11 strong vs. weak capture, 454



496 Index

public interest (*cont.*) radio engineers testimonies at FRC technocratic and scientific approach to, hearings, 187, 192 radio listeners testimonies at FRC weak capture and, 12 hearings, 194 public interest groups, 378. See also radio manufacturers testimonies at FRC consumer empowerment programs; hearings, 190 Radio Broadcast (journal), 177, 180, 182, tripartism influence of, 428 201 rulemaking influence (across rule stages), radio broadcasters, 180 ambivalent opposition of, 182, 205 313, 314, 315 rulemaking influence (correlation opposition to broadband expansion of, analysis), 315, 316, 317 177 rulemaking influence and, 313, 433 self-interest of, 197 rulemaking participation and, 297, 298, radio interest organizations, 190, 205 305, 309, 311, 312 testimonies of at FRC hearings, 187 vulnerability to capture of, 369 radio listeners organizations, 174, 181, public opinion, 225, 289 on energy policy, 280, 281 rate filings, 388, 391 CPPP and, 377 public power, 33 public scrutiny, 225, 421 CW and, 379, 380 OPIC and, 371, 374 of expert testimonies, 126 public sector salaries, 119 rate suppression, 381 public utilities, 371, 380 rate suppression, 390 publication process rational actors, 76, 80 economists' capture and, 125, 126, rational ignorance theory, 127 reciprocity, 89 empirical analysis of bias in, 133, 134, reform, 34, 42, 145 135, 136 capture as undercutting, 2 reform in to prevent economists' capture, denuciation of progressive, 30 126, 149, 151 FDA food and drug law reform, 157, Pure Food and Drugs Act (1906), 156 158 financial, 84, 92, 99 Ouackenbush, Charles, 378 health insurance reform, 384 quantitative evidence, 57, 63, 306 immigration, 326 on rulemaking and agency capture, 298 in governance of publication process, 126, 149, 151 Radio Act (1927), 183, 184 need for diagnosing of capture before, radio and broadcasting industry. See also 174, 460 Federal Radio Commission of FDA by AIDS activists, 163 advertising and advertisements in, 182, of insurance rates, 376 183, 201, 203, 204 of judicial review, 417 broad opposition to spectrum expansion of MMS, 246, 248, 257 of Revenue Management, 261 and, 180, 186 chaos and overcrowding of frequencies in of strong capture, 12 1925, 184 progressive, 37, 38, 41, 42, 44 concerns over concentrated control, 185 regression analysis, 166, 314 early federal broadcast regulation, 6 duration regressions for new molecular FRC public hearings on (March-April entities, 167 1927), 185, 186 of DOT rules, 306 radio broadcasting testimonies at FRC of foreign versus domestic firm effects,

hearings, 197



Index 497

probit analyses of three votes on rent-seeking, 18, 63, 160, 168, 169, 170 S.5/Bailey Amendment, 159 empirical problems in exisiting regulated industry, 13, 52, 55, 447 scholarship, 64 defined, 14 reporting requirements, 105, 314 imbalances in participation and, 365 Republican approach to public interest, 61, intent and action and, 14 62, 210 Regulating Business by Independent reputational capital, 90, 392 Commission (Bernstein), 49 economists' capture and, 124 Regulation of Entry (article, Djankov), 10 of CDC, 351, 352, 355 regulatory agencies. See also agency action; of public health agencies, 330, 359 agency capture; agency creation; by shaming of expert witnesses and, 147 specific agency retrospective review, 364, 421, 447, 453, 464 as complex hierarchies, 208 administrative capture and, 447 regulatory community, 90 anti-capture and, 450 regulatory failures, 10, 13, 154, 173, 422 Executive Order 13, 563 (Obama damage caused by, 1, 470 Administration), 444 in lead-up to financial crisis, 467, 472 OIRA's role in, 444, 446 misguided policy responses following, oversight by political parties and, 445 systematic approach in, 446 need for empirical study of, 465 transparency in, 445 of MMS, 174, 239, 240, 241, 245 Revenue Management (MMS), 242, 251, of USGS, 249 252, 288. See also Minerals regulatory outcomes, 22, 73, 79, 104, 107, Management Service; Offshore Energy 391, 452 congressional hearings on, 257, 258, 259, game theory model of, 103 260, 261, 263 influence of insurance industry on, correlation between geographical 371 location and core functions in, 252, 254 payoffs and, 112 difficult interagency coordination and, proxy advocates and, 391 254, 255 public interests groups and, 369 employees of, 253 versus ultimate outcomes, 98 funding levels of, 262 regulatory success, 2, 173, 175, 343, 357 reforms of, 259 relative budget changes and appearances of mining regulation, 215 of Offshore Energy of MMS, 270 before Congress, 263, 264, 266 regulatory zeal, 224 relative budget changes before and after reimbursement, 367, 370, 377, 379, 382 revenue receipts decision, 265, 266 CPPP and, 376 relative budget changes in, 263 Reinventing Government initiative, 271, reorganization of, 261, 262 272, 278 RIK Program investigation, 242 relationship networks, 77, 79, 80, 89, 90, 91, royalty collection on behalf of Indian 92, 93, 97, 129 tribes, 258, 260 benefits of, 95 statutes pertaining to, 279, 280 between oil and gas workers and MMS Subcommittee on Royalty Management employees, 91, 244, 245, 284 report (2007) and, 254, 255 between the president and OIRA, 429 review time, 167 CDC and, 350, 352 revolving door, 19, 69, 90, 91, 149, 155, 329, 403, 443, 452, 468, 470 collective action problem and, 91 economists' capture and, 143 at FDA, 164 experiments in, 89, 90 at MSHA, 220 FCC Commissioners and, 66 principal-agent relationships in agencies in financial regulation, 83, 93, 96 and, 208, 209



498 Index

Reye's syndrome, 354, 355, 356 generic drug scandal, 345 Royalty in Kind (RIK) Program, 242 in financial industry, 80 rulemaking, 378, 436. See also commenters; Schechter Poultry decision, 334 Department of Transportation (DOT) scientific expertise, 62, 162, 335, 360, 463 rules; notice and comment; in public health agencies, 330, 331 pre-proposal stage initial lack of on tobacco, 344 administrative agencies and, 431 of FDA, 162 Advanced Notice of Proposed Securities and Exchange Commission Rulemaking (ANPRM) and, 294 (SEC), 72, 107, 472 agency capture and, 294, 295, 298, 300, self-aggrandizement hypothesis, 427, 448 317, 319, 323, 460 self-conception, 83 group identification and, 87 APA Act and, 293 business interest influence in, 298, 299 separation of power, 106, 459 Consumer Watchdog participation in, shaming of expert witnesses, 126, 146, 147 381, 382 signaling behaviors, 87 distributional effects of, 438 simple models, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 8, 9, 452 importance of, 293 policy prescriptions and, 9, 10 negotiated rulemaking, 272, 300, 463 social comparison theory, 87 Notice of Proposed Rulemaking (NPRM) social identity theory, 82 and, 293, 294 social influence. See behavioral bias; cultural OPIC and, 375, 376 capture; group indentification; procedural rights for proxy advocates relationship networks; reputational and, 391 capital social media tools, 324 quantitative evidence on participation and influence, 298 Social Science Research Network (SSRN), stages of, 293 134 subpopulation influence across rule solvency regulation, 385, 387, 394 stages, 313, 314, 315 sovereignty, 46 subpopulation influence and, 294, 298, special interest groups. See industry influence; influence; interest groups; subpopulation influence correlation public interest groups analysis, 315, 316, 317 stage change, 304, 313, 314, 315, 321 subpopulation influence over state stakes, 356, 362 agency heads, 321 state power, 333, 471 subpopulation participation and, 309, contestation of state legitimacy, 363 311, 312 delegation of to private actors, 329 federal agency dependence on rule safety regulation, 53, 293, 437. See also food implementation and, 322 safety; mining safety regulation in insurance regulation, 366, 376, 377 of deep water drilling, 174 in public utility rates, 368 pre-Civil War, 35 influences on rules and regulations of, Sago Mine disaster (2006), 211, 218, 224, 326 pre-emption of state regulation, 17, 72, 231, 234 Salazar, Ken (Secretary of the Interior), 240, 154 248, 255, 257, 270 state bans on discretionary clauses, 374 salmonella, 338, 340 state coastal zone management plans, 258 infection rates post-HAACP, 342 state DOTs and, 323 sanitation violations, 329, 337, 338, 341 static analysis, 55, 56 statistical analysis, 7. See also content scandal, 4, 43 accounting scandals around 2001-02, analyis; empiricial analysis; quantitative analysis; regression analysis



Index 499

	association versus causation, 16	of consumer protection against banking,
	of executive compensation papers	72 -f FDA 157 172 229 221 242 247
	downloaded from SSRN, 135, 136, 137,	of FDA, 156, 162, 328, 331, 343, 347
	of EDA approval decisions 166	of mining regulation, 215, 217, 218
	of FDA approval decisions, 166	of public health agencies, 331, 334, 337,
	of indicators of MSHA regulatory performance, 226, 227	361 of USDA 337 338 330 340 341 342
	-	of USDA, 337, 338, 339, 340, 341, 342 Order 3299 for MMS reorganization, 248,
	of intervenor compensation requests, 376 of intervenor compensation requests	255, 270
	(CPPP), 377	statutory framework for OPIC, 371
	of intervenor compensation requests	super-statutes, 58, 62
	(CW), 379, 380	violation of, 208
	of MMS budget changes and Revenue	statutory capture. See legislative capture
	Management hearing appearances, 263,	stereotypes, 85
	264	Stigler, George, 6, 10, 12, 16, 24, 26, 33, 51,
	of MMS budget changes before and after	52, 153, 154, 176
	revenue receipts decision, 265, 266	empirical analysis argument of, 8
	of OPIC activities, 374, 375	licensing regressions of, 65
	of OPIC rate filings, 374, 388	regressions on trucking weight limits, 65
	of pharmaceutical drug submissions and	Stiglerian capture, 20, 31, 153, 155, 166,
	mergers, 168	401, 452
	of pharmaceutical firm size, 168	stock prices, 227, 228
	of subpopulation influence across DOT	flash crash in, 107
	rule stages, 313, 314, 315	strange-bedfellows coalition, 163
	of subpopulation influence correlations	strategic communication, 113
	across rule stages, 315, 316, 317	strong capture, 11, 12, 153, 171, 295, 402
	of subpopulation participation in DOT	as violation of public interest, 11
	rulemaking, 309, 311, 312	financial regulation and, 100
	of U.S. vs. non-U.S. pharmaceutical firm	lack of credible evidence on, 454 of MSHA, 225, 236
	size, 168 on mining deaths, 214	
	two-prong test for DOT capture results,	policy implications for, 455 strong corrosive capture, 15
	306, 309, 312, 315	vs. weak, 11, 454
sta	atus, 79, 80, 84, 85, 86, 93	substitution effect, 229
-	experiments in, 85	sulfanilamide tragedy, 158, 161
	financial regulation and, 87, 88	summary disclosure, 441
	signaling behaviors and, 87	Sunset Report, 374
sta	atus quo, 45, 50, 112, 404, 405, 418	Sunstein, Cass (OIRA Administrator), 445
	protection of, 404	Superfund, 461
sta	atutes, 66, 293, 307, 328, 422. See also by	supply and demand, 52
	specific act or law; executive orders;	surveys
	judicial review	of American State Administrators Project
	energy policy statutes pertaining to	(ASAP), 306, 321
	Offshore Energy or Revenue	of public commenters during DOT rules,
	Management, 279	294, 305, 317, 318
	financial regulation and, 95	on business interests influence in
	game theory model of statutory capture,	rulemaking, 318, 320
	59	on businesses interests participation in
	gestation of, 49	rulemaking, 298
	of consumer protection, 366, 373, 376,	on probusiness bias in academia, 136 swine flu, 354, 355, 360
	.11.1	399 LIG. 11Us J.J4s J.J.Js J.UU



500 Index

symmetric position, 92 sympathy, 89 systemic illegality, 411 systemic risks in financial sector, 99 tautological analysis, 8, 160 technical expertise, 335, 352, 463 in public health agencies, 330, 331 need for in consumer empowerment programs, 394 of CDC, 356 technocrats, 444 technocratic approach to public interest, technological developments, 473 emerging technologies for offshore environments, 241, 275, 276 in coal extraction, 213 technology-based regulation, 342 test of theory history as, 176, 177 Texas Department of Insurance (TDI), 371, 374 deregulation of homeowners' policy forms, 372 dispute with State Farms over overcharges, 375 Texas Office of Public Insurance Counsel (OPIC), 366, 371, 388 evaluation of, 373 primary responsibilities of, 372, 373 rate filings and, 371, 374 rulemaking and, 375, 376 statutory framework for, 339 thalidomide tragedy, 161 Theory of Economic Regulation (essay, Stigler), 6, 26 think tanks, 443, 444 threats, 63 tobacco industry, 61, 328, 343 advertising regulation in, 348 changing social norms and, 359 legal defense of against FDA regulation of, 346, 347 scientific uncertainty on health impacts and, 344 transparency in cost-benefit analysis, 440 in enforcement actions, 424 in retrospective review, 445

criteria for effective, 367, 370 critiques of, 393 design principles for, 394 NAIC program and, 384 new governance and, 369, 370 vs. proxy advocacy, 392, 393, 396 trust trust and loyalty of career staff, 432 trust game, 90 weakening of public trust in government, 2, 5 U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA). See also food safety; public health agencies foodborne illness patterns post-HACCP, 342 HACCP codification, 77 HACCP rules for pathogen testing, 327 innovation in HACCP implementation, 339, 340, 342 legal authority of, 339 legal challenges to HACCP, 341 meat industry interest and, 357 opposition to pathogen-testing requirements of, 340 problematic meat inspection scheme of, 337, 338 U.S. Geological Survey (USGS), 249 under-regulation, 450, 451. See also agency inaction; deregulation of drug approval, 167 unethical activity, 377 of MMS employees, 239, 240, 242, 243, United Medicine Manufacturers of America (UMMA), 157 United Mine Workers of America, 210 University of Chicago Initiative on Global Markets (IGM), 136 Upper Big Branch disaster (2010), 231, 234 veto power, 296, 406 vulnerability to capture, 98, 470. See also

tripartism, 96, 366, 367, 369, 397. See also

Consumer Participation Program

California Public Participation Plan;

transparency requirements, 423



Index 501

MMS and, 245 need for awareness of, 150 of economists, 125, 126 of public interest groups, 369 public health agencies and, 470

weak capture, 12, 103, 154, 174, 300 financial regulation and, 100

in pharmaceutical regulation, 171
policy implications for, 455
public interest and, 12
vs. strong, 11, 454
welfare economics, 11, 14, 83
Why Have the Socialists Been Winning
(essay, Stigler), 33
women's groups, 156, 157