

ENGAGING WITH C. H. DODD ON THE GOSPEL OF JOHN

C. H. Dodd's *Historical Tradition in the Fourth Gospel*, published in 1963, marked a milestone in New Testament research and has become a standard resource for the study of John. Historically, biblical scholars have concentrated on the Synoptic Gospels: Matthew, Mark and Luke. However, Dodd's book encouraged scholars to take John seriously as a source for the life of Jesus. This volume both reflects upon and looks beyond Dodd's writings to address the implications, limitations and potential of his groundbreaking research and its programmatic approach to charting a course for future research on the Gospel of John. Leading biblical scholars demonstrate the recent surge of interest in John's distinctive witness to Jesus, and also in Dodd's work as the harbinger of advancements in the study of the Fourth Gospel. This volume will be invaluable to all those studying the New Testament, Johannine theology and the history of the early Church.

TOM THATCHER is Professor of Biblical Studies at Cincinnati Christian University. His books include *Jesus in Johannine Tradition* (2000), *Why John Wrote a Gospel* (2006), *What We Have Heard from the Beginning* (2007), and *John, Jesus, and the Renewal of Israel* (with Richard Horsley, 2013).

CATRIN H. WILLIAMS is Senior Lecturer in New Testament Studies at the University of Wales Trinity Saint David. She is the author of *I am He: The Interpretation of 'Anî Hû' in Jewish and Early Christian Literature* (2000), and co-editor of *John's Gospel and Intimations of Apocalyptic* (with Christopher Rowland, 2013).



ENGAGING WITH C. H. DODD ON THE GOSPEL OF JOHN

Sixty Years of Tradition and Interpretation

TOM THATCHER AND CATRIN H. WILLIAMS





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107035669

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data
Engaging with C.H. Dodd on the Gospel of John: sixty years of tradition
and interpretation / edited by Tom Thatcher and Catrin H. Williams.

pages cm ISBN 978-1-107-03566-9

Dodd, C. H. (Charles Harold), 1884–1973.
 New Testament scholars–England.
 Bible. John–Criticism, interpretation, etc.
 Thatcher, Tom, 1967– editor of compilation.

BS2351.D6E54 2013 226.5'06092-dc23 2013003648

ISBN 978-1-107-03566-9 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Epigraph

[W]hatever theologians may say, it is the plain duty of the historian to make use of every possible source of information in the effort to learn the facts about an historical episode which on any showing was a significant and influential one.

[In the case before us,] it is not axiomatic that the Synoptic account is better based than the Johannine.

[Indeed,] to assume that the Synoptic picture is exhaustive or exclusive would be to beg the very question we are discussing.

[For] even the boldest flights of Johannine theology have a firm starting point in the tradition . . .

[and] where John is to all appearance composing most freely, there is, sometimes at least, an older tradition behind him.

But is there such a thing as an historical tradition in the gospels at all?

Quotations from C. H. Dodd, *Historical Tradition in the Fourth Gospel*: 2, 139 n. 2, 87, 161, 334, 1.



Contents

List of contributors		page ix
I	The semeiotics of history: C. H. Dodd on the origins and character of the Fourth Gospel <i>Tom Thatcher</i>	I
PAR	RT I: APPROACHING THE PROBLEM: REFLECTIONS ON DODD'S CONTEXT AND METHOD	
2	C. H. Dodd as a precursor to narrative criticism <i>R. Alan Culpepper</i>	31
3	Progress and paradox: C. H. Dodd and Rudolf Bultmann on history, the Jesus tradition, and the Fourth Gospel <i>Craig R. Koester</i>	49
4	Symbolism in John's Gospel: an evaluation of Dodd's contribution Jan van der Watt	66
5	C. H. Dodd on John 13:16 (and 15:20): St John's knowledge of Matthew revisited <i>Gilbert Van Belle and David R. M. Godecharle</i>	86
6	John and the rabbis revisited Catrin H. Williams	107
7	Characters who count: the case of Nicodemus	126

vii



viii Contents

VIII	Comenis	
PART II: HISTORY AND TRADITION IN THE FOURTH GOSPEL		
8	C. H. Dodd, the historical Jesus, and realized eschatology <i>Urban C. von Wahlde</i>	149
9	Historical tradition(s) and/or Johannine redaction? A reflection on the threefold repetition of Pilate's statement 'I find no guilt in him' (John 18:38b; 19:4, 6) Hellen Mardaga	163
IO	Incidents dispersed in the Synoptics and cohering in John: Dodd, Brown, and Johannine historicity Paul N. Anderson	176
II	Reflections on a footnote John Ashton	203
12	The anointing in John 12:1–8: a tale of two hypotheses Wendy E. S. North	216
13	Eucharist and Passover: the two 'loci' of the liturgical commemoration of the Last Supper in the early church <i>Michael Theobald</i>	231
PART III: FUTURE DIRECTIONS		
14	The Fourth Gospel and the founder of Christianity: the place of historical tradition in the work of C. H. Dodd <i>John Painter</i>	257
Index		285



Contributors

- PAUL N. ANDERSON is Professor of Biblical and Quaker Studies at George Fox University, Newberg, Oregon.
- JOHN ASHTON is Emeritus Fellow of Wolfson College and was formerly Lecturer in New Testament Studies at the University of Oxford.
- JAIME CLARK-SOLES is Associate Professor of New Testament at Perkins School of Theology, Southern Methodist University, Dallas.
- R. ALAN CULPEPPER is Dean of the McAfee School of Theology at Mercer University, Atlanta.
- DAVID R. M. GODECHARLE is a doctoral student in New Testament Studies at the Tilburg School of Catholic Theology.
- CRAIG R. KOESTER is Professor of New Testament at Luther Seminary, St Paul, Minnesota.
- HELLEN MARDAGA is Assistant Professor of New Testament at the Catholic University of America, Washington.
- WENDY E. S. NORTH is an Honorary Research Fellow at the University of Durham, having previously taught at the University of Hull.
- JOHN PAINTER is Professor of Theology at St Mark's School of Theology, Charles Stuart University, Canberra.
- TOM THATCHER is Professor of Biblical Studies at Cincinnati Christian University.
- MICHAEL THEOBALD is Professor of New Testament at the Catholic Theological Faculty, University of Tübingen.
- GILBERT VAN BELLE is Professor Ordinarius of New Testament at the Catholic University of Leuven.

ix



.

List of contributors

- URBAN C. VON WAHLDE is Professor of New Testament at Loyola University of Chicago.
- JAN VAN DER WATT is Professor of Source Texts of Judaism and Christianity at Radboud University of Nijmegen.
- CATRIN H. WILLIAMS is Senior Lecturer in New Testament Studies at the University of Wales Trinity Saint David.