

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

## The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands

Using a plethora of hitherto unused and underutilized sources from the Ottoman, British, and Iranian archives, *The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands* traces seven decades of intermittent work by Russian, British, Ottoman, and Iranian technical and diplomatic teams to turn an ill-defined and highly porous area into an internationally recognized boundary. By examining the process of boundary negotiation by the international commissioners and their interactions with the borderland peoples they encountered, the book tells the story of how the Muslim world's oldest borderland was transformed into a bordered land. It details how the borderland peoples, whose habitat straddled the frontier, responded to those processes as well as to the ideas and institutions that accompanied their implementation. It shows that the making of the boundary played a significant role in shaping Ottoman-Iranian relations and in the identity and citizenship choices of the borderland peoples.

**Sabri Ateş** is an assistant professor of history at Southern Methodist University in Dallas, Texas. He has published a book in Turkish entitled *Tunalı Hilmi Bey: An Intellectual from the Ottoman Empire to Modern Turkey* (2009), as well as several articles in *Comparative Studies of Asia, Africa and the Middle East* and *Iranian Studies*.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

# The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands

*Making a Boundary, 1843–1914*

SABRİ ATEŞ

*Southern Methodist University*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriates

Frontmatter

[More information](#)CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107033658](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107033658)

© Sabri Ateş 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

*A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.**Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data*

Ateş, Sabri.

The Ottoman-Iranian borderlands : making a boundary, 1843–1914 / Sabri Ateş.

p. cm.

ISBN 978-1-107-03365-8

1. Turkey – Boundaries – Iran. 2. Iran – Boundaries – Turkey.

3. Turkey – Foreign relations – Iran. 4. Iran – Foreign relations – Turkey. I. Title.

DR479.I7A84 2013

956'.015-dc23 2013004058

ISBN 978-1-107-03365-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

*For Elizabeth*

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	page x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xiii
<i>Note on Transliteration and Usage</i>	xvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xix
Introduction	I
The Nature of the Ottoman-Iranian Frontier	I
A Note on Terminology	8
Dividing the <i>Umma</i> , Defining Its Frontiers	10
Islamic Concepts of Frontier	13
Ottoman-Iranian Treaties and Frontiers	20
A Note on Sources and Methodology	26
Structure of the Book	28
I. The Kurdish Frontier and Ottoman-Qajar Relations	31
The End of the <i>Ancien Régime</i> and the Rising Capacity of States at the Borderland	34
The Administrative Organization of Ottoman Kurdistan	37
Babans between the Ottomans and Qajars	42
Tribes and Empires: The Case of Haydaran and Sipki	49
The Last Ottoman-Iranian War, 1821–1822	52
The Erzurum Treaty of 1823	54
Developments Leading to the Making of the Frontier	57
Great Power Intervention and the Making of the Boundary	64
Pacification of the Borderland: The First Phase	66
Khan Abdal and the City of Van	68
The Babans, for the Last Time	71
The Case of the City of Van and the <i>Mir</i> of Bohtan	75
Taxes, Conscriptio, Retribalization: The State Is Here to Stay	81

2.	Laying the Ground: The Concert of Zagros	86
	The Commissioners and Their Work	88
	There Was a Treaty of 1639, but Where Is It?	96
	Geopolitics and Boundary Making: The Case of Zohab/Qasr-i Shirin	100
	Shatt al-Arab, Muhammarah, and the Ka'b Tribe	108
	Imperial Decision Making	120
	Pasture Politics: Frontiers and Tribes	121
	Other Issues at the Conference	126
	The Erzurum Treaty of 1847	129
3.	The Long Journey of the First Survey Commission	139
	The Commissioners and Their Duties	142
	Creating Facts on the Ground, or Dervish Pasha's Long Detour at Kotur	146
	Finally at Work: Surveyors on the Go	149
	Locating the Boundary of Muhammarah and Shatt al-Arab	151
	Locating the Boundary of Zohab-Qasr-i Shirin	161
	Commissioners and Borderlanders: Inscribing Subjecthood on the People of the Frontier	164
	The Case of the Failis of Posht-e Kuh	166
	Using the State to Advance Local Claims: The Case of Banu Lam Sunnis for the Caliph: Claiming the Lands in the Name of Defunct Kurdish Dynasts	171
	To Which Pasture the Nomads Belong, and to Which Country the Pasture?	177
	Limits of Sectarianism: Ottoman Efforts to Lure the Sunnis	180
	The End of the Survey	183
4.	The Borderland between the Crimean War and the Berlin Congress	186
	The Crimean War and the Northern Borderland	187
	The Crimean War and Ottoman-Iranian Relations	189
	The Locals and the Localities: How to Control, Whom to Stop	197
	Forming a New Commission, Teaching the Borderlanders a Lesson	202
	Bringing the State into Local Disputes	206
	New Actors and Notions: Migration as Asylum	209
	The Commission of 1874	211
	The Russo-Ottoman War of 1877–1878 and the Transformation of Borderland Identities	213
	The End of the War: Kotur and Minor Moving into Major	221
5.	Sunnis for the Sultan: The Ottoman Occupation of Northwestern Iran, 1905–1912	229
	Justifying the Integration	232
	The Case of the Bilbas and the Beginning of the Ottoman Occupation	235



Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Contents*

ix

A Kurdish Tribe, an American Missionary, and the <i>Dekhalet</i> Petitions	246
Responses to the Occupation	255
Commissions and Claims: The 1908 Frontier Commission	260
The End of Abdulhamid II's Reign, the CUP, and the Borderland	262
Sunni Appeals to the CUP and the Impending End of the Annexation	269
The "Independent" 1911 Commission	271
Ottoman Policies in the <i>Nevahi-i Şarkiyye</i>	273
The End of the Occupation	281
6. Boundary at Last	284
Changing Power Dynamics and the Northern Borderland	
Communities	292
Exclusion of Iran from Negotiations	296
The Final Commission, 1913–1914	300
Conclusion	316
<i>Select Bibliography</i>	323
<i>Index</i>	337

## List of Illustrations

### MAPS

1. Ottoman-Iranian Borderland	<i>page</i> xxi
2. Frontier Places of Turkey and Persia	89
3. Carte de la Frontière Turco-Persane	93
4. Ancient and Modern Frontiers of Suleymanieh	101
5. The Province of Zohab	103
6. Shatt al-Arab/Muhammarah Region Map Based on Differing Claims	109
7. An Ottoman Map of the Shatt al-Arab Region	112
8. Reproduction of Turkish Map of the Turco Persian Frontier Showing Different Claims	125
9. Map of the Posht-e Kuh District	164
10. Map of Lahijan Area and the Disputed Territories	236
11. The Bilbas Country	239
12. Map of Areas Occupied by the Ottoman Forces from 1905 to 1912	274

### FIGURES

1. An Ottoman frontier fort.	23
2. The town of Qasr-i Shirin.	99
3. Baiz and Hamza Aghas.	240
4. Group of children at Savojbulagh, 1914.	257
5. British commission members 1913–14.	301
6. British commission members 1913–14.	301
7. Russian Commissioner Vladimir Minorksy with Russian officers and Iranian commission members.	302

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*List of Illustrations*

xi

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 8. Vladimir Minorsky, Iranian commissioner Ittila al-Mulk, and members of their retinue. | 303 |
| 9. Vladimir Minorsky and Mrs. Minorsky with a group of Cossacks.                         | 303 |
| 10. Ottoman and Iranian commission members.  | 304 |
| 11. Iranian commission members, 1913–14.   | 305 |
| 12. Sheikh Khaz'al's feast for commission members, January 1914.                         | 309 |
| 13. Last frontier commission camp.   | 311 |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Acknowledgments

From its birth as an idea at a small café in Greenwich Village to today, this project has been through many incarnations and, with the help of generous individuals and institutions, has dwelled in many climes. I am concerned that I will not be able to mention them all, and the list of those who rightfully deserve credit will be only partial.

During my years at New York University, I had the privilege to study with many supportive professors and friends, including Peter Chelkowski, Khaled Fahmy, Michael Gilsean, Mohammad Mehdi Khorrami, Zachary Lockman, Robert McChesney, Molly Nolan, and Ariel Salzman. I am deeply indebted to them, for their criticisms and suggestions at different stages have significantly improved my work. Thanks are also due to all my friends in the dissertation-writing group that over a long period benefited from the gracious hospitality and guidance of ever-supportive Michael Gilsean. It has also been a great pleasure to work in the Clements Department of History at Southern Methodist University, where I have found great support from my colleagues; the administrative staff; and the previous and present chairs, Jim Hopkins and Kathleen Wellman. I could not imagine a better working environment.

To my friends, I owe a special debt of gratitude. In Istanbul, Seda Altuğ, İlke Şanlıer, Yüksel Taşkın, Murat Yüksel, and Nuri Akgül opened their homes and provided me with more support than I could have hoped for. In Iran, Farshad Fazlollahi showed the best of Iranian hospitality and made my stays pleasant and most comfortable. I also thank Chista Crouther and Noushin Faghihi-Nejad for their friendship and for introducing me to Farshad and his cohort. Dr. Shervin Ziaabakhsh-Tabari, Bahar Bazgerd, their son Parham, and the Bazgerd family's warm hospitality will be long

remembered. A summer at Felor Alemohammad's was most pleasant. In Iran, I also had the good fortune of meeting Kaveh Bayat, who provided me with friendship, support, and various materials I have yet to use. Dr. Nasrollah Salehi has also gone beyond the call of duty in his continuing support and friendship and contributions to this project.

In England, Kate Fleet was most helpful during my short stay at Cambridge. In London, Faruk Hacıhafızoğlu and Zafer Yörük provided me with warm friendship and lodging. I would also like to acknowledge my deepest gratitude to Ayşe Aslan.

Tasha Darbes deserves heartfelt appreciation for the time she spent on this project in its dissertation stage, as do Edward Countryman and Rudi Matthee for their comments and suggestions on more recent iterations of the manuscript. Over the years, I have incurred many debts of gratitude to librarians and archivists, including those of the Başbakanlık Arşivi in Istanbul; the Majlis Library in Iran; the Public Records Office (Kew) and British Library–India Office in London; the libraries at NYU; and, last but not least, the libraries of SMU, specifically Billie Stowal and the ILL staff. For maps, I thank Norman Belza of SMU and Boundary Cartography. I also thank Saqi Books and John Tchalenko for letting me reproduce two maps from *Images from the Endgame*, and the Finnish Museum of Photography for its permission to reproduce some images I first saw in John Tchalenko's book. Thanks are also due Chris Seaton for allowing me to use a photograph from the Albert Wratishaw Collection.

This long adventure would have not been possible without financial support from New York University's Department of Middle Eastern and Islamic Studies, the Kevorkian Center for Near Eastern Studies, and the Graduate School of Arts and Science. My work in Turkey during the dissertation- and book-writing stages was made possible by two generous grants from the American Research Institute in Turkey. Koç University's RCAC and its staff made our stay in Istanbul an unforgettable time filled with good friends and a great work environment. I also thank SMU's Department of History and University Research Council for providing summer research support and Cambridge University's Skilleter Center for making my time in Cambridge and London possible. I also thank the reviewers of my manuscript, my editor at Cambridge Marigold Acland, and assistant editor Sarika Narula, together with Cherline Daniel of Integra-PYD, who through a very long process have been most accommodating and helpful.

My academic life would not have been possible without my mentor Ariel Salzman, who took me under her wing and has continued to be a great source of support and inspiration. Similarly Zachary Lockman, a

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgments*

xv

most insightful and generous scholar, has for many years provided immense support and mentorship. It is from him and Ariel Salzman that I learned what a daunting task it is to be an *ustad*. I only hope that I will be able to follow their examples.

Finally, my family – my parents, Suveyla and Ibrahim; my in-laws, Kathy and Dan; and the brothers, sisters, brothers- and sisters-in-law, nephews, and nieces whose care I was away from but whose warm support has always been with me. Their unconditional love, acceptance, confidence, pride, and support have given me strength to go through the daunting task of writing this book.

This book is dedicated to my love and wife, Elizabeth, who selflessly spent countless hours editing, “cut-editing,” and learning about the geographies, peoples, and histories of the Zagros and Mesopotamia while nurturing me and our daughter, Suheyla.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---



## Note on Transliteration and Usage

For reasons of simplicity and consistency, except for *ayn* and *hamza*, I have eliminated diacritical marks except when quoting from a published or secondary work or providing the title of a published book. For example, I render *dâr al-Islâm* and *thughûr* as *dar al-Islam* and *thughur*. Names and places that are rendered differently in Ottoman, Persian, and English sources present special difficulties. The goal has been to make them accessible to English speakers while following the most common international usage. In these cases, such as for the word *pasha* or Dervish, I have used the standard English spelling or Anglicized form. When this is not possible, I have followed the *New Redhouse Turkish-English Dictionary* or *Encyclopædia Iranica* sans diacritical marks. For place names, I have tried to use the most modern version, which a reader could find on contemporary maps. However, in some instances, my usage does not follow a convention but rather reflects an arbitrary selection. The present-day town of Mahabad is a good example. It is referred to as Sawj Bulaq/Savojboulagh/Savejboulagh/Saujbulagh/Soujbulakh/Sablax/Savucbulak/Savuçbulak/Savojbulagh, from which list I adapted the last one. Dates are given in the Common Era calendar, but I have also included the catalog dates of documents from the Ottoman archives. Place names on maps follow the map makers's original spellings.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-03365-8 - The Ottoman-Iranian Borderlands: Making a Boundary, 1843–1914

Sabriateş

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

---

## Abbreviations

### ABBREVIATIONS FOR THE OTTOMAN ARCHIVES (BOA)

A.	Sadaret
A.AMD	Amedi Kalemî
A.DVN	Divan-ı Hümeyun Kalemî Katalođu
A.DVN.MHM	Divan-ı Hümeyun Muhimme Kalemî
A.DVN.NMH	Nâme-i Hümeyun Katalođu
A.DVNS.MHM	Sadaret Mektubi Muhimme Kalemî
A.MKT	Mektubi Kalemî
A.MKT.MHM	Mektubi Muhimme Kalemî
A.MKT.UM	Umum Vilâyat
BEO	Bâb-ı Âli Evrak Odası
BOA	Başbakanlık (Prime Ministry) Archives
CEVDET HR	Cevdet Hariciye
HAT or HH	Hatt-ı Hümeyun
HR.SYS	Hariciye Siyasi
I.DH	İrade Dahiliye
IMM	İrade Meclis-i Mahsus
I.MSM	İrade Mesaili Muhimme
I.MVL	İrade Meclis-i Vala
MVL	Meclis-i Vâla Evrakı Hülâsa Kayıt Defterleri
Y.	Yıldız
Y.A.HUS	Sadaret Hususi Maruzat Evrakı
Y.PRK	Perakende Evrakı
Y.PRK.EŞA	Elçilik Şehbenderlik Maruzatı
Y.PRK.KOM	Perakende Komisyonlar

Y.PRK.SRN	Serkurenalık Evraki
Y.PRK.UM	Umum Vilayetler Tahrirati

## OTHER ABBREVIATIONS

AHR	<i>American Historical Review</i>
BL-IOR	British Library, Oriental and India Office Records
IJMES	<i>International Journal of Middle East Studies</i>
IMFA	Iranian Ministry of Foreign Affairs
IMoFA	Iranian Minister of Foreign Affairs
JRGS	<i>Journal of Royal Geographical Society of London</i>
KE	Kânun-u Evvel
KS	Kânun-u Sani
LP&S	India/Political/Secret (BL-IOR)
MES	<i>Middle East Studies</i>
OMD	Ottoman Ministry of Defense
OMFA	Ottoman Ministry of Foreign Affairs
OMoFA	Ottoman Minister of Foreign Affairs
OMW	Ottoman Ministry of War
PRO FO	Public Records Office, Foreign Office, Kew Gardens



MAP 1. Ottoman-Iranian Borderland  
 Made by Boundary Cartography.