The tale of the onstage fight between *prime donne* Francesca Cuzzoni and Faustina Bordoni is notorious, appearing in music histories to this day, but it is a fiction. Starting from this misunderstanding, *The Rival Sirens* suggests that the rivalry fostered between the singers in 1720s London was in large part a social construction, one conditioned by local theatrical context and audience expectations, and heightened by manipulations of plot and music. This book offers readings of operas by Handel and Bononcini as performance events, inflected by the audience’s perceptions of singer persona and contemporary theatrical and cultural contexts. Through examining the case of these two women, Suzanne Aspden demonstrates that the personae of star performers, as well as their voices, were of crucial importance in determining the shape of an opera during the early part of the eighteenth century.

Suzanne Aspden is a lecturer in the Faculty of Music at the University of Oxford. As a leading Handel scholar, she has made numerous appearances on BBC radio and television, and has been the co-editor of *Cambridge Opera Journal* since 2009. Her research interests include opera and identity politics in music, and she has been awarded a number of fellowships in the USA, UK and India. She has published articles in *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, *Musical Quarterly, Journal of the Royal Musical Association* and *Cambridge Opera Journal*, and is co-editor, with Michael Burden, of a forthcoming book on Cavalli’s *Erismena*. 
Volumes for Cambridge Studies in Opera explore the cultural, political and social influences of the genre. As a cultural art form, opera is not produced in a vacuum. Rather, it is influenced, whether directly or in more subtle ways, by its social and political environment. In turn, opera leaves its mark on society and contributes to shaping the cultural climate. Studies to be included in the series will look at these various relationships including the politics and economics of opera, the operatic representation of women or the singers who portrayed them, the history of opera as theatre, and the evolution of the opera house.

Published titles

Opera Buffa in Mozart’s Vienna
Edited by Mary Hunter and James Webster

German Opera: From the Beginnings to Wagner
John Warrack

Johann Strauss and Vienna: Operetta and the Politics of Popular Culture
Camille Crittenden

Opera and Drama in Eighteenth-Century London: The King’s Theatre, Garrick and the Business of Performance
Ian Woodfield

Opera Liberalism, and Antisemitism in Nineteenth-Century France: The Politics of Halévy’s La Juive
Diana R. Hallman

Three Modes of Perception in Mozart: The Philosophical, Pastoral, and Comic in Così fan tutte
Edmund J. Goehring

Landscape and Gender in Italian Opera: The Alpine Virgin from Bellini to Puccini
Emanuele Senici

Aesthetics of Opera in the Ancien Régime, 1647–1785
Downing A. Thomas

The Puccini Problem: Opera, Nationalism, and Modernity
Alexandra Wilson

The Prima Donna and Opera, 1815–1930
Susan Rutherford

Opera and Society in Italy and France from Monteverdi to Bourdieu
Edited by Victoria Johnson, Jane F. Fulcher, and Thomas Ertman

Wagner’s Ring Cycle and the Greeks
Daniel H. Foster

When Opera Meets Film
Marcia J. Citron

Situating Opera: Period, Genre, Reception
Herbert Lindenberger

Rossini in Restoration Paris: The Sound of Modern Life
Benjamin Walton

Italian Opera in the Age of the American Revolution
Pierpaolo Polzonetti
Opera in the Novel from Balzac to Proust
Cormac Newark

Opera in the Age of Rousseau: Music, Confrontation, Realism
David Charlton

The Sounds of Paris in Verdi’s La traviata
Emilio Sala

The Rival Sirens: Performance and Identity on Handel’s Operatic Stage
Suzanne Aspden
The Rival Sirens
Performance and Identity on Handel’s Operatic Stage

Suzanne Aspden
For my parents
CONTENTS

List of figures | x
List of music examples | xi
List of tables | xiii
Acknowledgements | xiv

Introduction | 1

1 The character of the actress | 15
2 'Heroick Virtue’ in Rodelinda and Astianatte | 68
3 Identification and illusion in Alessandro and Admeto | 138
4 Balancing power in Riccardo primo | 178
5 Senesino and the crisis of heroic masculinity | 207

Conclusion: the ornamental voice | 245

Bibliography | 263
Index | 284
FIGURES

2.1 Anon, Astianatte (London, 1727), iii. ix–xii, pp. 67, 68, 71. © The British Library Board, shelfmark: 11714.aa.20 | 112
2.2 Anon, Astianatte (London, 1727), iii. xvi, p. 76. © The British Library Board, shelfmark: 11714.aa.20 | 133
3.1 Frontispiece, Epistle from S—a S—a to S—a F—a [8 March 1727]. © The British Library Board, shelfmark: 11630.h.62 | 154
4.1 G. F. Handel, scena ultima, Riccardo primo (London, 1727), f.141r © The British Library Board, autograph manuscript, GB-Lbl RM.20.c.2 | 191

While every effort has been made, it has not always been possible to identify the sources of all material used, or to trace all copyright holders. If any omissions are brought to our notice, we will be happy to include the appropriate acknowledgements on reprinting.
### Music Examples

   - Giovanni Bononcini, ‘Spera che questo cor’, Astianatte (London, 1727), bb.21–28. | 34
3.1 G. F. Handel, Alessandro (London, 1726), 11.i. | 144
xii  |  Music examples

      bb.1–11.  |  172
5.1  G. F. Handel, ‘Mi credi infedele’, *Siroe* (London, 1727), bb.18–36.  |  226
5.3  G. F. Handel, ‘Deggio morire, o stelle’, *Siroe* (London, 1727), bb.5–9.  |  233
## TABLES

Table I: Operas in which Faustina and Cuzzoni appeared, London 1726–8 | 9
Table 1.1: Operatic roles taken by Faustina, Cuzzoni and Senesino, London 1726–8 | 51
Table 2.1: Cuzzoni’s arias as Andromaca in *Astianatte* | 101
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book has been over ten years in the making, since an idea formed during work on another project grew too large to be contained in the two articles originally intended. I am grateful to several institutions for providing funding to help me pursue my research: Robinson College, Cambridge, on whose postdoctoral research fellowship I began this project; the Huntington Library, Los Angeles, Beinecke Library, Yale, and Houghton Library, Harvard, all of which provided fellowships (from a year to a month in duration) allowing me to pursue this and other work; the Arts and Humanities Research Council, which gave matching funding for a term’s research leave to finish writing up the book. Oxford University’s John Fell Fund provided money towards the cost of music editing, as did the Music Faculty at Oxford.

The advice and suggestions of colleagues and students at the various institutions at which I’ve worked and presented research over the past ten years – Cambridge, Yale, Southampton, Oxford – have been invaluable. I have also benefitted from feedback on conference presentations or guest lectures at the American Musicalological Society annual meeting in Seattle, the universities of Leeds, Manchester, Auckland, King’s College London, and Victoria University of Wellington. The ever-helpful staff of Cambridge University Library, the British Library and, most of all, the Bodleian Library and Oxford’s Music Faculty Library deserve particular thanks, especially Peter Ward-Jones, Jenny McParland, and Martin Holmes of the Bodleian and Music Faculty Libraries, and Andra Patterson of the British Library. I must also thank Thomas Daggett and John Traill, who transcribed the music examples for me. I am grateful to my commissioning editor, Vicki Cooper, for persisting with her interest in this project and for her care and judgement in managing it through to publication, and to her team and my copy editor, Sara Peacock.

Recalling the debts accrued over such a lengthy period of creation is to trace the outline of a career through friendships forged. Handelians and scholars of eighteenth- and seventeenth-century opera, many of whom I am privileged to count as friends, have shared their expertise in different ways. Terence Best commented on an early draft of chapter 4, while he was working on the HHA critical edition of Riccardo primo. Michael Burden, Donald Burrows, Ellen Harris, Richard G. King, Lowell Lindgren, Suzana Ograjenšek, John H. Roberts, Ellen Rosand and Ruth Smith have all given advice or made suggestions in response to conference presentations or in
email correspondence; and I have also benefitted from their published research (and discussion about it), as well as that of Andrew Jones. The denizens of the eighteenth-century list c18-l@lists.psu.edu, were unfailingly helpful on matters pertaining to the broader cultural and theatrical life of the period. Melania Bucarelli, Wendy Heller, Berta Joncus and Reinhard Strohm have been especially supportive of this project at various stages, and their wise words – published and otherwise – have been of great assistance in shaping my research. Wendy Heller also generously shared her work on Handel’s *Admeto* with me in advance of its publication and offered illuminating comment on an earlier form of chapter 3. For this chapter I also benefitted from the editorial advice of Mary Ann Smart and Emanuele Senici; the chapter is a revised version of ‘The “Rival Queans” and the Play of Identity in Handel’s *Admeto*’, published in *Cambridge Opera Journal* 18 (2006), 301–31, © Cambridge University Press, reproduced with permission. Some of the material in chapter 4 will also appear in conference proceedings for the 2002 conference *Händel e il dramma per musica* under the title ‘Identità in scena sul palco lirico londinese: Faustina Bordoni versus Francesca Cuzzoni’. I am fortunate indeed that Reinhard Strohm, Roger Parker, John H. Roberts and Art Groos read all or nearly all of the manuscript; I hope the book does justice to their advice, though any errors are, of course, my own.

Other friends and colleagues, while not working in the field, have provided support, encouragement and advice: Davinia Caddy, Suzie Clark, James Davies, Emma Dilllon, Matthew Head, Karen Henson, Elizabeth Hudson, Elizabeth Eva Leach, Nick Mathew, Michael Suarez, Dean Sutcliffe, Peter Walls. Claudia Chierichini, Alex Rehding, Alberto Sanna and Emanuele Senici also provided assistance with translation queries from time to time, although any translations not otherwise referenced are my own. Particular thanks must go to Roger Parker, the ideal doctoral dissertation supervisor who remains a mentor and friend. I have benefitted from his wisdom throughout the process of research and writing, and am grateful that he has made time to read and comment on various iterations of the chapters here.

I am especially grateful to my family, here and in New Zealand, for their patient support. My partner, Alistair, has put up with a seemingly interminable project with great good humour. I am particularly grateful to my parents, for their faith in me throughout my academic career, and for their support. I dedicate this book to them.