

# Global Justice and International Economic Law

For centuries, international trade has been seen as essential to the wealth and power of nations, and defended as a system through which all could benefit. It is only recently that trade's problematic role as an engine of distributive justice has begun to be understood, due in part to globalization and the global justice debates. In this compelling new book, international legal scholar Frank J. Garcia proposes a radically new way to evaluate, construct, and manage international trade - one that is based on multiple modes of analysis and norms of economic justice as well as comparative advantage and national interest. This book examines three different ways to conceptualize the problem of trade and global justice - three "takes" on this relationship - drawn from Rawlsian liberalism, communitarianism, and consent theory. These three approaches illustrate specific issues of a general or systematic importance to the way global justice has been and should be theorized. Through these takes the book offers an alternative, pluralistic mode of arguing for global justice and highlights the unique modes of discourse we employ when engaging with global justice and their implications for how we conceptualize and argue the problem. From this analysis, Garcia suggests a new direction for trade agreements built around the possibility of truly consensual trade negotiations and the kind of international economic system they would structure.

Frank J. Garcia is a professor of law at the Boston College Law School. A Fulbright Scholar, he has lectured widely on globalization and international economic law in Europe, South America, and Asia. He has served on the executive boards of the International Economic Law and International Legal Theory Interest Groups of the American Society of International Law, and is the book review editor and an editorial board member of the Journal of International Economic Law. Garcia is the author of Trade, Inequality, and Justice: Toward a Liberal Theory of Just Trade (2003) and co-editor of Global Justice and International Economic Law: Opportunities and Challenges (with Chios Carmody and John Linarelli, 2012).





# Global Justice and International Economic Law

Three Takes

FRANK J. GARCIA

Boston College Law School





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107031920

© Frank J. Garcia 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

 ${\it Library of Congress \ Cataloging \ in \ Publication \ data} \\ {\it Garcia, Frank \ J.}$ 

Global justice and international economic law: three takes / Frank J. Garcia, Boston College Law School.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-03192-0 (hardback)

Law and globalization
 Distributive justice
 Law – Economic aspects
 Foreign trade regulation
 Title.

343.07-dc23 2012044093

ISBN 978-1-107-03192-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Kim,
who said it could be done



But suppose the issue is not to win an argument ... but to manifest for the other another way.

 ${\bf Stanley\ Cavell,}$   ${\bf \it Conditions\ Handsome\ and\ Unhandsome\ }$ 



# **Contents**

Acknowskip	Acknowledgments	
	Introduction	1
1.	Take One – International Justice, or Global Justice as the Foreign Policy of Liberal States	s 67
2.	Take Two – Globalization and the Possibility of a Global Community of Justice	137
3.	Take Three – Global Justice as Consensual Exchange: Consent, Oppression, and the Nature of Trade Itself	205
	Conclusion	273
Index		343
		vii





# **Acknowledgments**

A book like this depends on numerous conversations and on the generosity of many. I have been fortunate in my colleagues both at Boston College – Paulo Barrozo, David Deese, Vlad Perju, David Rasmussen, and Diane Ring – and beyond: Chi Carmody, Jeffrey Dunoff, John Linarelli, and Joost Pauwelyn. I want to thank in particular Sonia Rolland and Fiona Smith for their painstaking and illuminating read of the entire book in manuscript. If any errors and omissions remain, they are stubbornly mine.

I am very grateful to my editor at the Press, John Berger, for his steadfast commitment to this project, and to my anonymous readers for their comments and suggestions, which have strengthened this book.

I have also been the beneficiary of the patience and insights of the faculties and audiences at the schools kind

l ix l



## **Acknowledgments**

enough to invite me to deliver portions of this work over the past few years. I'd like to thank the faculties of the University of the Andes (Colombia), Brandeis University, the University of Bremen, Cambridge University, the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Monash University, the University of New South Wales, Oxford University, the University of Paris West Nanterre La Defense, and University College London.

Wherever I found myself in space and time, I could always count on Mark Sullivan, our International and Comparative Librarian, to find what I needed, and a small army of research assistants over the years, whose generosity, talent, and organizational skills have made this book possible. I'd like to thank in particular Dan Blanchard, Mark DeFeo, Matthew Hoisington, Joanna Kornafel, Adam Schmelzer, and Sean Wall, for whom no task was too large or too wearisome. I would also like to thank Judy Yi for the intelligent logistical support that made global work on a global project both feasible and enjoyable.

I owe a special debt of gratitude to Ms. Lindita Ciko, whose investment in and support for the project have been essential. I have been fortunate to have her as my principal research assistant for the two years during which the book really took shape, and to now count her as a collaborator and friend. Thank you, Lindita – may all professors be so blessed.

For the gift of time necessary for writing and reflection, I am grateful to Dean John Garvey, Dean Vincent Rougeau,

| x |



## **Acknowledgments**

and the Law School Annual Fund for their support. Much of that time was spent on Digby Neck in Nova Scotia, and the better part of that in the company of the bottomless cup of coffee always ready at the Petit Passage Café in East Ferry. I'd like to thank the skipper Diane, and Brenda, Patty, Theresa, and the rest of the crew for the coffee, hot breakfasts, and delicious pies that fueled many a page. All books should be written amid such hospitality and cooking.

Finally, I would like to thank my partner, Kim. For each element of this project, and in the execution of the whole, she has been the indispensable sounding board. She saw a way to put these different approaches in conversation when I could not find it. To her, with much gratitude, this book is dedicated.