

The Promise and Limits of Private Power

Promoting Labor Standards in a Global Economy

This book examines and evaluates various private initiatives to enforce fair labor standards within global supply chains. Using unique data (internal audit reports and access to more than 120 supply chain factories and 700 interviews in fourteen countries) from several major global brands, including Nike, Hewlett Packard, and the International Labor Organization's Factory Improvement Programme in Vietnam, this book examines both the promise and the limitations of different approaches to improving working conditions, wages, and working hours for the millions of workers employed in today's global supply chains. Through a careful, empirically grounded analysis of these programs, this book illustrates the mix of private and public regulation needed to address these complex issues in a global economy.

Richard M. Locke is Class of 1922 Professor of Political Science and Management, Deputy Dean of the Sloan School of Management, and Head of the Political Science Department at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT). His current research focuses on improving labor and environmental conditions in global supply chains. Working with leading firms such as Nike, Coca-Cola, and Hewlett Packard, Locke and his students have been showing how corporate profitability and sustainable business practices can be reconciled. Locke is the author of *Working in America* (with Paul Osterman, Thomas Kochan, and Michael Piore, 2001), *Employment Relations in a Changing World Economy* (with Thomas Kochan and Michael Piore, 1995), and *Remaking the Italian Economy* (1995, 1997). He was awarded the Jamieson Prize for Excellence in Teaching in 2008 and the MIT Class of 1960 Teaching Innovation Award in 2007. Locke was named a 2005 Faculty Pioneer in Academic Leadership by The Aspen Institute.





Cambridge Studies in Comparative Politics

General Editor

Margaret Levi University of Washington, Seattle

Assistant General Editors

Kathleen Thelen Massachusetts Institute of Technology Erik Wibbels Duke University

Associate Editors

Robert H. Bates Harvard University
Gary Cox Stanford University
Stephen Hanson The College of William and Mary
Torben Iversen Harvard University
Stathis Kalyvas Yale University
Peter Lange Duke University
Helen Milner Princeton University
Frances Rosenbluth Yale University
Susan Stokes Yale University
Sidney Tarrow Cornell University

Other Books in the Series

Ben W. Ansell, From the Ballot to the Blackboard: The Redistributive Political Economy of Education

Leonardo R. Arriola, Multi-Ethnic Coalitions in Africa: Business Financing of Opposition Election Campaigns

David Austen-Smith, Jeffry A. Frieden, Miriam A. Golden, Karl Ove Moene, and Adam Przeworski, eds., Selected Works of Michael Wallerstein: The Political Economy of Inequality, Unions, and Social Democracy

Andy Baker, The Market and the Masses in Latin America: Policy Reform and Consumption in Liberalizing Economies

Lisa Baldez, Why Women Protest: Women's Movements in Chile

Stefano Bartolini, *The Political Mobilization of the European Left*, 1860–1980: *The Class Cleavage*

Robert Bates, When Things Fell Apart: State Failure in Late-Century Africa Mark Beissinger, Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet State Nancy Bermeo, ed., Unemployment in the New Europe

Carles Boix, Democracy and Redistribution

Carles Boix, Political Parties, Growth, and Equality: Conservative and Social Democratic Economic Strategies in the World Economy

Catherine Boone, Merchant Capital and the Roots of State Power in Senegal, 1930–1985

Continued after the Index





The Promise and Limits of Private Power

Promoting Labor Standards in a Global Economy

RICHARD M. LOCKE

Massachusetts Institute of Technology





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107670884

© Richard M. Locke 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Locke, Richard M., 1959-

The Promise and limits of private power: promoting labor standards in a global economy / Richard M. Locke.

p. cm. - (Cambridge studies in comparative politics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-03155-5 (hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-67088-4 (paperback)

1. Industrial relations. 2. International business enterprises – Management.

3. Globalization. I. Title.

HD6961.L63 2013

331.12'042-dc23 2012044106

ISBN 978-1-107-03155-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-67088-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To my mother, Franca Franzaroli, who taught me about the value of work and the dignity of Labor.





Contents

Acknowleagments		page xi
Ι	The Rise of Private Voluntary Regulation in a Global	
	Economy	I
2	The Promise and Perils of Private Compliance Programs	24
3	Does Private Compliance Improve Labor Standards?	
	Lessons from Nike	46
4	Capability Building and Its Limitations	78
5	Alternative Approaches to Capability Building: A Tale of	
	Two Nike Suppliers	105
6	Are We Looking in the Wrong Place?: Labor Standards and	_
	Upstream Business Practices in Global Supply Chains	126
7	Complements or Substitutes?: Private Power, Public Regulation, and the Enforcement of Labor Standards in	
	Global Supply Chains	156
	Conclusion: Collaboration, Compliance, and the	
	Construction of New Institutions in a World of Global	
	Supply Chains	174
Bibliography		183
Index		205

ix





Acknowledgments

Throughout the world, millions of people, both young and old, work long hours, under harsh conditions and for low wages, to make the goods most readers of this book consume every day. These workers' citizenship rights are frequently violated, and their health, because of long work hours and hazardous working conditions, is often compromised. This book seeks to understand what, if anything, can be done to promote labor justice for these workers. Through an analysis of several private voluntary initiatives promoted by global corporations, lead suppliers/contract manufacturers, labor-friendly nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), and international organizations such as the International Labor Organization (ILO), this book sheds light on both the promise and the limitations of private power in enforcing labor standards for the millions of people employed in global supply chains. The central finding of this book is that working conditions and labor rights can only be promoted in our global economy through a mix of both private and public regulation. Private voluntary regulation is important in redressing labor abuses in global supply chain factories, but it is not enough. Without the support and legitimacy of government regulation, these private initiatives will produce only limited and often unsustainable improvements. In the chapters that follow, I illustrate how this is already taking place, notwithstanding significant resistance by powerful interests operating at different points of most global supply chains.

This book has a long history. It began ten years ago, through a series of conversations with my then MIT colleague Dara O'Rourke, while I was working on a teaching case about Nike and alternative conceptions of corporate responsibility. Although I had done work on labor politics before, I had never studied global supply chains and private voluntary regulation. Dara was an excellent mentor, and his enthusiasm for the topic was infectious. Trying to convince global corporations such as Nike to work with me, share their factory audit reports, and facilitate visits to their suppliers was not easy. It took years

хi



xii Acknowledgments

and many conversations and visits to corporate headquarters. But the time and effort paid off and as a result, what began as a case study evolved over the years into a full-fledged research project involving the collection, coding, and analysis of thousands of factory audit reports; more than 700 interviews with company managers, factory directors, NGO representatives, and government labor inspectors; as well as field research in 120 factories in 14 different countries. As such, the project evolved from a study of one company (Nike) in a particular industry (athletic footwear) to a research project covering several global corporations competing in different industries, with different supply chain dynamics, and operating across numerous country boundaries.

Throughout this trajectory, I was fortunate to work with a terrific group of graduate students and wonderful colleagues who diligently (and patiently) commented on the various constituent pieces of this larger research project. I was also fortunate to collaborate with a number of company managers, NGO representatives, union leaders, and even government agents who opened up their offices and factories and shared incredible amounts of original data. Without this generosity and openness, this book could never have been written.

Let me first thank the amazing group of students who worked with me as research assistants for this book. These include Matt Amengual, Akshay Mangla, Monica Romis, Alberto Brause, Fei Qin, Hiram Samel, Ben Rissing, Timea Pal, Jonathan Rose, Jennifer Andrews, Dinsha Mistree, Rushan Jiang, Salo Coslovsky, Alonso Garza, Gustavo Setrini, Greg Distelhorst, and Seth Pipkin. I hope that these students learned as much from me as I did from them. Several of these students (Matt, Akshay, Monica, Greg, Alberto, Fei, Timea, Hiram, and Ben) did more than simply assist me in the research but also collaborated as intellectual partners and coauthors on several papers that were written as part of this larger research project. Three of these papers have been published, and sections of these papers, with the permission of the different journals, appear in Chapters 2, 3, and 5. I would like to thank the Industrial and Labor Relations Review, Politics and Society, and the Review of International Political Economy for both publishing the original papers and allowing me to use excerpts of those papers for this book.

This project also benefited from the tireless support and patient feedback from a truly special group of colleagues, both at MIT and elsewhere. Special thanks to Lucio Baccaro, Kristin Forbes, Simon Johnson, Don Lessard, Eleanor Westney, Bob McKersie, Paul Osterman, Judith Tendler, Michael Piore, Ed Steinfeld, Ben Ross Schneider, Kathy Thelen, Jens Hainmueller, Bob Gibbons, David Singer, Rebecca Henderson, John Sterman, Susan Silbey, Mari Sako, John Ruggie, Michael Hiscox, Chuck Sabel, Hau Lee, Peter Gourevitch, Dara O'Rourke, Archon Fung, Khalid Nadvi, Stephanie Barrientos, Gay Seidman, Jonathan Zeitlin, Roberto Pires, Andrew Schrank, Tim Bartley, Gary Herrigel, Gary Gereffi, Jill Ker Conway, Layna Mosley, and David Weil. I would like to offer special thanks to Suzanne Berger, Josh Cohen, Tom Kochan, and Margaret Levi, who read and commented on multiple drafts of the manuscript



Acknowledgments xiii

and encouraged me along the many years of this project, especially when I could not see how the various pieces fit together into anything resembling a coherent whole. Thank you for your help, your friendship, and especially for showing me how academics can make a real difference in the world.

I would also like to express my appreciation to the many participants at the various workshops, seminars, and conferences where different parts of this project were presented and discussed. These include participants at seminars and workshops at Bocconi University, Brown University, Duke University, Harvard University, MIT, New York University, Oxford University, Rutgers University, Stanford University, the University of Pennsylvania, the University of Wisconsin–Madison, and at the annual meetings of the Academy of International Business (2008), the Society for the Advancement of Socio-Economics (2008, 2010, 2011, 2012), the American Sociological Association (2008), and the American Political Science Association (2010, 2011). I am especially indebted to participants at the Seattle Seminar book workshop held at the University of Washington in January 2012, who provided excellent advice on how to revise the book manuscript. Special thanks to Josh Cohen, Margaret Levi, Aseem Prakash, John Alquist, Jennifer Noveck, and Anne Greenleaf for their close reading of and advice on an earlier version of this book manuscript. Thanks also to the anonymous reviewers who read the earlier manuscript for Cambridge University Press and to Lewis Bateman and Margaret Levi for their patience and support as I revised the manuscript and transformed it into the book it is today.

In addition to my academic colleagues and friends, I would like to thank various managers of the companies I studied, as well as leaders of several NGOs, who together both facilitated access to the hundreds of factories my students and I visited throughout the world as well as helped us make sense of the reality of working conditions in global supply chains: Maria Eitel, Hannah Jones, Dusty Kidd, Kelly Lauber, Caitlin Morris, Mark Loomis, Jeremy Prepscius, Charlie Brown, Catherine Humboldt, Mike McBreen, Steve Castellanos, Marcela Manubens, Judy Glazer, Scott Nova, Auret van Heerden, Ed Potter, Jorge Perez-Lopez, Dan Rees, and Linda Yanz. Financial support for this research was provided by the William and Flora Hewlett Foundation, the Alfred P. Sloan Foundation, and the MIT Sloan School of Management Dean's Innovation Fund. I would also like to thank Anita Kafka and Adriane Cesa for their help with preparing the final manuscript and Nausicaa Renner and Jim Haba for their help copyediting the manuscript.

Aside from the academic, financial, and organizational support I received from various colleagues and institutions throughout the many years of research and writing of this book, I could never have completed this project without the support of my family – my children, Juliana and Nate, who tolerated endless lectures about factory conditions and labor standards in developing countries; and my partner Zairo Cheibub, who patiently acquiesced to many working weekends and canceled vacations and also encouraged me throughout the



xiv

Acknowledgments

process by reading drafts, asking hard questions, and prodding me to finish the book. Finally, I would like to thank my mother, Franca Franzaroli. Although she still complains that I did not become a doctor or even a businessman, her own career and life have been an inspiration for me. I dedicate this book to her