

Responding to Global Poverty

The extent and severity of global poverty are among the most profoundly disturbing aspects of our world, but it is one thing to recognize the problem and another to establish who, if anyone, is responsible for doing something about it and what they might sensibly do. Christian Barry and Gerhard Øverland explore well-established philosophical arguments for the moral responsibility of affluent individuals in the developed world to address poverty abroad. They explore the bases of claims such as that the affluent are killing the poor abroad through trade policies, or that the affluent can easily assist the poor by contributing to NGOs or state-administered aid programmes. They also consider not only what the affluent ought to do for the poor but also what the poor can do if the affluent fail in their responsibilities. Their book will appeal to readers in ethics, political philosophy and public policy.

Christian Barry is Professor of Philosophy at the Australian National University. His publications include (with Sanjay Reddy) *International Trade and Labor Standards: A Proposal for Linkage* (2008) and many journal articles.

Gerhard Øverland was Professor of Philosophy at the University of Oslo. He published widely in moral theory and philosophy of war.



Responding to Global Poverty

Harm, Responsibility, and Agency

Christian Barry

Australian National University, Canberra

Gerhard Øverland

University of Oslo, Oslo





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107031470

© Christian Barry and Gerhard Øverland 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Barry, Christian, author.

Responding to global poverty: harm, responsibility, and agency / Christian Barry, Australian National University, Canberra, Gerhard Overland, Australian National University, Canberra.

New York : Cambridge University Press, 2016. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

LCCN 2016015470 | ISBN 9781107031470

LCSH: Poverty – Moral and ethical aspects. | Humanitarianism. | Economic assistance.

LCC BJ53 .B37 2016 | DDC 362.5/8-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016015470

ISBN 978-1-107-03147-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	Preface	page vii
1	Introduction: Assistance-based and Contribution-based Responsibilities to Address Global Poverty	1
Part I	Assistance-based Responsibilities	9
2	Assistance-based Responsibilities	11
3	The Implications of Failing to Assist	30
4	Assistance-based Responsibilities in the Real World	50
Part II	Contribution-based Responsibilities	77
5	The Doing, Allowing and Enabling Distinction	79
6	Giving Rise to Cost and the Doing, Allowing, Enabling Distinction	96
7	The Feasible Alternatives Thesis: Pogge on Contribution-based Responsibilities to the Poor	122
Part II	I Implications of Contribution	149
8	Contribution-based Responsibilities and Trade	151
9	The Implications of Contributing to Global Poverty	173
10	Assuming Responsibility for Harm	195
11	Contribution-based Responsibilities and Overdetermination	220
	Bibliography Index	244 256

 $\underline{\textcircled{c}} \ \text{in this web service Cambridge University Press}$



Preface

We've had a lot of help in writing this book. Its chapters were discussed at seminars at the Australian National University (ANU), University of Melbourne, Charles Sturt University, University of Adelaide, University of Queensland, the Australasian Association for Philosophy, University of Oslo, New York University, City University of New York, The New School University, Rutgers University, the American Philosophical Association (Pacific Division), Carnegie Council for Ethics in International Affairs, University of Frankfurt, Humboldt University, University of Brasilia, Federal University of Rio de Janeiro, University of Sao Paulo, University College Dublin and Trinity College Dublin. We are grateful to those institutions for the opportunity to present our work in progress and to the audiences for all the good questions they put to us.

We've benefited from discussions of this material with Arash Abizadeh, Jelena Belic, Geoff Brennan, Gillian Brock, Mark Budolfson, Michael Clemens, Daniel Butt, Garrett Cullity, Álvaro de Vita, Tom Dougherty, Toni Erskine, David Estlund, Cécile Fabre, Luara Ferracioli, Rainer Forst, Christel Fricke, Helen Frowe, Sakiko Fukuda-Parr, Pablo Gilabert, Bob Goodin, David Grewal, Stefan Gosepath, Alan Hájek, Jesse Hambly, Sarah Hannan, Matt Hanser, Siba Harb, Robert Hockett, Josef Holden, Keith Horton, Robert Huseby, Alison Jaggar, Aaron James, Simon Keller, Benjamin Kiesewetter, Robert Kirby, Avery Kolers, Eszter Kollar, Niko Kolodny, Ten-Herng Lai, Chad Lee-Stronach, Matthew Liao, Kasper Lippert-Rassmussen, Christian List, Catherine Lu, Kate Macdonald, Terry Macdonald, Tori McGeer, Emily McTernan, Darrel Moellendorf, Jeremy Moss, Mirjam Mueller, Alan Patten, Philip Pettit, Jed Purdy, Theron Pummer, Sanjay Reddy, Massimo Renzo, Sam Rickless, Matthias Risse, Alexandra Roginski, Joel Rosenthal, Carolina Sartorio, Amartya Sen, Jeremy Shearmur, Peter Singer, Jiewuh Song, Kai Spiekermann, Katie Steele, Uwe Steinhoff, Anne Stilz, Victor Tadros, Emmeline Taylor, Larry Temkin, Patrick Tomlin, Suzanne Uniacke, Laura Valentini, Katja Vogt, Jeremy Waldron, Alec Walen, and Lea Ypi.

vii



viii Preface

the Research Council of Norway.

We've also been fortunate to have research assistance over the years from Stephanie Collins, Robert Kirby, Alejandra Mancilla, Richard Reid and Helen Taylor. Anne Gelling has made substantial editorial improvements to the entire manuscript. Our editor at Cambridge University Press, Hilary Gaskin, has been very patient with us and made many important suggestions regarding the structure of the book. I gratefully acknowledge financial support from the Australian Research Council and

My colleagues Geoff Brennan, Keith Dowding, Bob Goodin and Fiona Jenkins made me feel most welcome when I first arrived at the ANU, and helped make it an exciting and professionally transformative place. Alan Hájek, Kim Sterelny and Daniel Stoljar have offered me a great deal of mentoring and support over the years. Thomas Pogge supervised both of our PhDs – mine at Columbia and Gerhard's at the University of Oslo, and some of the ideas in the book grew out of conversations with him.

Lina Eriksson, Ole Koksvik, Matt Lindauer, Holly Lawford-Smith, R. J. Leland, David Wiens and Scott Wisor have been postdoctoral fellows during the writing of this book, and I've learned a lot from our work together. R. J. and Matt have been very generous in offering comments on the entire manuscript in its late stages. Jeff McMahan, Kit Wellman and Leif Wenar have been sturdy friends and supporters through the years, and commented in detail on various parts of this manuscript. In recent years my work has benefited a great deal by collaborating closely with Seth Lazar and Nic Southwood, my colleagues in the Centre for Moral, Social and Political Theory. Many of the ideas in the book have been sharpened through discussions with our close friend Bashshar Haydar. My parents Hillary Barry and Peter Babcox have been amazingly supportive, as always.

My co-author, Gerhard Øverland, passed away in October 2014 after a struggle with a fast-developing form of cancer. Several of the chapters in the book were completed or written after his death. I've done my best to include only ideas we developed together, though the final product is no doubt somewhat different from what it would have been had he remained with us. It was very painful indeed to lose such a close friend and inspiring person and collaborator. I miss him greatly and dedicate this book to his memory.

CHRISTIAN BARRY