

Making Foreigners

This book reconceptualizes the history of U.S. immigration and citizenship law from the colonial period to the beginning of the twenty-first century by joining the histories of immigrants to those of Native Americans, blacks, women, Asian Americans, Latino Americans, and the poor. Kunal Parker argues that during the earliest stages of American history, being legally constructed as a foreigner, along with being subjected to restrictions on presence and movement, was not confined to those who sought to enter the country from the outside, but was also used against those on the inside. Insiders thus shared important legal disabilities with outsiders. It is only over the course of four centuries, with the spread of formal and substantive citizenship among the domestic population, a hardening distinction between citizen and alien, and the rise of a powerful centralized state, that the uniquely disabled legal subject we recognize today as the immigrant has emerged. This book advances new ways of understanding the relationship between foreignness and subordination over the long span of American history.

Kunal M. Parker is a Professor of Law and Dean's Distinguished Scholar at the University of Miami School of Law. His first book, Common Law, History, and Democracy in America, 1790–1900: Legal Thought before Modernism, was published by Cambridge University Press in 2011.





New Histories of American Law

Series Editors

Michael Grossberg, Indiana University Christopher L. Tomlins, University of California, Berkeley

New Histories of American Law is a series of bold, synthetic, and path-breaking interpretive books that will address the key topics in the field of American legal history, written by the leaders of the field, and designed for scholars and students throughout universities, colleges, and law schools.

Other Books in the Series

Laura F. Edwards, A Legal History of the Civil War and Reconstruction: A Nation of Rights

Elizabeth Dale, Criminal Justice in the United States, 1789–1939 Jack P. Greene, The Constitutional Origins of the American Revolution Barbara Young Welke, Law and the Borders of Belonging in the Long Nineteenth Century United States





Making Foreigners

Immigration and Citizenship Law in America, 1600–2000

KUNAL M. PARKER

Professor of Law University of Miami School of Law





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107698512

© Kunal M. Parker 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data Kunal M. Parker, 1968–

Making foreigners: immigration and citizenship law in America, 1600–2000 / Kunal M. Parker, Professor of Law, University of Miami School of Law.

pages cm. – (New histories of american law)

Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-03021-3 (hardback) –

ISBN 978-1-107-69851-2 (pbk.)

1. Citizenship – United States – History. 2. Emigration and immigration law – United States – History. 1. Title.

KF4700.P39 2015 342.7308'2-dc23 2015005349

ISBN 978-1-107-03021-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-69851-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments		page 1x
I	Introduction	I
2	Foreigners and Borders in British North America	22
3	Logics of Revolution	50
4	Blacks, Indians, and Other Aliens in Antebellum America	81
5	The Rise of the Federal Immigration Order	116
6	Closing the Gates in the Early Twentieth Century	148
7	A Rights Revolution?	185
8	Conclusion and Coda	221
Bibliographic Essay		231
Index		245





Preface and Acknowledgments

The special powerlessness of the immigrant has its source, we are wont to think, in the fact that the foreigner comes from elsewhere. The foreigner's origins outside the community supposedly make it possible and permissible for the community to deny his or her claims upon it. An entrenched constitutional tradition in the United States undergirds this view. Political theorists have offered elaborate arguments defending it.

My own particular experience of the powerlessness of the immigrant seeking admission led me to wonder exactly what it is about an individual's coming from elsewhere that makes it possible to deny his or her claims on the community. I turned to the archives, if not for definitive answers, then at least for ways to transcend my own experience by learning about the experiences of others. What I discovered was that the experience of foreignness – and of the powerlessness associated with it – has never been unique to those coming from outside the United States. Over the centuries, Americans have named and treated like foreigners not only immigrants from outside the country, but also Native Americans, blacks, Latino Americans, Asian Americans, women, the poor, and political minorities. Designation as foreign is not a function of coming from the territorial outside. It is a political strategy that has been used inside *and* outside the country and to multiple ends.

The *Making Foreigners* of the title of this book focuses attention on the multiple processes of rendering foreign that have been at work



Preface and Acknowledgments

vis-à-vis outsiders *and* insiders over the long span of American history. On the one hand, it is an exhortation to immigrants to recognize the parallels between their experiences and the experiences of those "on the inside." On the other hand, it is an exhortation to those "on the inside" to recognize the foreigners they have once been (and might still be) so as to rethink their relationship to those "on the outside." In this vein, as I see it, the cover image – a stark photograph of a room at San Francisco's Angel Island immigration station – deconstructs notions of "inside" and "outside" insofar as the room likely served not only for the exclusion of outsiders, but also for the ejection of insiders. As I will argue in this book, if the former was the experience of Asian immigrants, the latter could be the experience of Asian Americans.

Making Foreigners is intended to be a concise work covering four centuries of U.S. immigration and citizenship law. Accordingly, even as it builds upon the work of multiple scholars, it is deliberately very lightly footnoted. The reader is urged to consult the bibliographic essay at the end of the book for a guide to the sources and literatures I have relied upon.

If the history recounted in Making Foreigners can be dark, my opportunity to thank those who have helped me in the writing of this book fills me with elation. First and foremost, I wish to thank an extraordinary (and extraordinarily generous) group of friends and scholars who took the time to read an earlier version of the manuscript in its entirety and to offer me extensive, engaged, and pointed comments. David Abraham, Linda Bosniak, Charlton Copeland, David Fitzgerald, Jon Goldberg-Hiller, Tracy Devine Guzmán, David Johnson, Anil Kalhan, Linda Kerber, Erika Lee, Renisa Mawani, Mae Ngai, Aziz Rana, Rebecca Sharpless, Stephen Siegel, and Barbara Welke all gave me written or oral comments that have made this a far stronger book than it was before they looked at it. Renisa Mawani, Charlton Copeland, Tracy Devine Guzmán, and Barbara Welke went even further: they had endless conversations about the manuscript with me, read earlier and later versions, helped with title and cover image choices, and talked me through the glitches. Tracy in particular devoted valuable time she could not possibly have had to helping me with a Spanish translation of a talk based on the book and ended up doing an entire translation of the talk herself. To Renisa, Charlton, Tracy, and Barbara: my most profound thanks. I recognize what you



Preface and Acknowledgments

have done for me and hope to repay you in kind soon. Jim Caras also gets special thanks for hearing me out repeatedly as the book neared completion.

Other friends and colleagues with whom I discussed ideas in or about the book, or who looked at parts of the manuscript, or who served as commentators on presentations drawn from the book are Kathryn Abrams, David Ambaras, Susan Bandes, Al Brophy, Bettye Collier-Thomas, George Cozonis, Laura Edwards, Mary Anne Franks, Shannon Gayk, Stephen Halsey, Isabel Jaramillo, Daniel Kanstroom, Clayton Koppes, Sophia Lee, Lisa Levenstein, Patricia McCoy, Bernadette Meyler, Jessica Morris, Brenna Munro, Ileana Porras, Jedediah Purdy, Lucy Salyer, Christopher Schmidt, Camille Serchuk, Yasmin Solomonescu, Karen Tani, Allison Brownell Tirres, Lea Vandervelde, Leti Volpp, and Nan Woodruff.

I would also like to thank the editors of the New Histories of American Law series, Michael Grossberg and Christopher Tomlins, as well as the outside readers for Cambridge University Press, for their comments. Chris has been a good friend, supporter, and collaborator for many years. He has always been available to answer questions along the way and has done so with alacrity and insight. Debbie Gershenowitz, Dana Bricken, and Diane Aronson at Cambridge University Press in New York offered comments and shepherded the book through the production process. Mary Becker and the team at Newgen provided excellent copyediting and production services. I would also like to express my profound appreciation to Dean Patricia White and the University of Miami School of Law for valuable research support and significant funding for conferences, research assistants, and research and writing time. In Miami, my research assistants over the years (Zachary Hammond, Eamon Welch, Christina Margolles, and Adam Weiss), my assistant Tara Lora, and Barbara Cuadras and Nery Ruiz at the library provided essential help. This book was completed during a year's leave at the National Humanities Center in Research Triangle Park, North Carolina. I am grateful to the National Humanities Center for providing me a congenial environment in which to bring this project to a close. At the Center, Karen Carroll provided invaluable copyediting help, and Brooke Andrade and Sarah Harris accommodated my book and article requests unhesitatingly.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org

xi



xii Preface and Acknowledgments

I have presented versions of this book at multiple venues: the University of Minnesota Law School, Duke Law School, the National Humanities Center, Wake Forest University, Cleveland-Marshall College of Law, Oberlin College, the American Legal History Annual Meeting, the University of Iowa College of Law, the Law and Society Annual Meeting, the Universidad de los Andes, the Chicago Legal History Roundtable, and Cornell Law School. I would like to thank audiences at each of these venues for their questions and comments.

Finally, I would like to thank my family. Special thanks to my mother, Nanda Parker, for telephonic and electronic support and occasional prodding to get this book done.