

THE SUBJECT OF VIRTUE

An Anthropology of Ethics and Freedom

The anthropology of ethics has become an important and fast-growing field in recent years. This book argues that it represents not just a new subfield within anthropology but a conceptual renewal of the discipline as a whole, enabling it to take account of a major dimension of human conduct which social theory has so far failed adequately to address.

An ideal introduction for students and researchers in anthropology and related human sciences.

- Shows how ethical concepts such as virtue, character, freedom and responsibility may be incorporated into anthropological analysis
- Surveys the history of anthropology's engagement with morality
- Examines the relevance for anthropology of two major philosophical approaches to moral life

JAMES LAIDLAW is a Lecturer in the Division of Social Anthropology, and Fellow of King's College, at the University of Cambridge.



NEW DEPARTURES IN ANTHROPOLOGY

New Departures in Anthropology is a book series that focuses on emerging themes in social and cultural anthropology. With original perspectives and syntheses, authors introduce new areas of inquiry in anthropology, explore developments that cross disciplinary boundaries, and weigh in on current debates. Every book illustrates theoretical issues with ethnographic material drawn from current research or classic studies, as well as from literature, memoirs, and other genres of reportage. The aim of the series is to produce books that are accessible enough to be used by college students and instructors, but will also stimulate, provoke, and inform anthropologists at all stages of their careers. Written clearly and concisely, books in the series are designed equally for advanced students and a broader range of readers, inside and outside academic anthropology, who want to be brought up to date on the most exciting developments in the discipline.

Series editorial board

Jonathan Spencer, University of Edinburgh Michael Lambek, University of Toronto



The Subject of Virtue

An Anthropology of Ethics and Freedom



JAMES LAIDLAW

University of Cambridge





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107697317

© James Laidlaw 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by CPI Group Ltd, Croydon CRo 4YY

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Laidlaw, James.

The subject of virtue: an anthropology of ethics and freedom / James Laidlaw. pages cm. – (New departures in anthropology)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02846-3 (hardback)

1. Anthropological ethics. I. Title.

GN33.6.L35 2013

306.4 – dc23 2013016198

ISBN 978-1-107-02846-3 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-69731-7 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLS for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Even the term 'science of morality', considering what it describes, is much too arrogant and offends *good* taste – which always tends to prefer more modest terms. We should sternly admit to ourselves *what* will be required in the long term, *what* the only right course is for the moment: that is, to gather the material, establish the concepts, and organize the abundance of subtle feelings and distinctions in the area of values, as they live, grow, procreate, and perish; and perhaps we should also attempt to illustrate the more frequently recurring forms of this living crystallization – in preparation for a *taxonomy* of morals.

Friedrich Nietzsche (1998 [1886]: 74)

We need to free ourselves of the sacralisation of the social as the only instance of the real and stop regarding the essential element of human life and human relations – I mean thought – as so much wind. Thought does exist, both beyond and before systems and edifices of discourse. It is something that is often hidden but always drives everyday behaviours. There is always a little thought even in the most stupid institutions; there is always thought even in silent habits.

Michel Foucault (2000 [1981]: 456)

Were it possible that a human creature could grow up to manhood in some solitary place, without any communication with his own species, he could no more think of his own character, of the propriety or demerit of his own sentiments and conduit, of the beauty or deformity of his own face. All these are objects which he cannot easily see, which naturally he does not look at, and with regard to which he is provided with no mirror which can present them to his view. Bring him into society, and he is immediately provided with the mirror which he wanted before. It is placed in the countenance and behaviour of those he lives with, which always mark when they enter into, and when they disapprove of his sentiments; and it is here that he first views the propriety and impropriety of his own passions, the beauty and deformity of his own mind . . . Bring him into society, and all his own passions will immediately become the causes of new passions.

Adam Smith (1976 [1790]: 110-11)





Contents

Acknowledgements		page viii
1	Beyond the science of unfreedom	1
2	Virtue ethics: Philosophy with an ethnographic stance?	47
3	Foucault's genealogy and the undefined work of freedom	92
4	The 'question of freedom' in anthropology	138
5	Taking responsibility seriously	179
6	The reluctant cannibal	213
References		225
Index		254

vii



Acknowledgements

My thanks to all who have read earlier versions of all or parts of this book, discussed some of the ideas in it, made comments and suggestions, or just listened patiently to me discoursing about the topic. The latter notably includes undergraduate and graduate students in Social Anthropology at Cambridge over the past several years, whose perceptive and searching reactions and responses to my lectures and supervisions have shaped this book quite profoundly.

Working on this project over the past few years has been immeasurably enriched by the intellectual companionship of Matei Candea, Joanna Cook, Nicholas Evans, Paolo Heywood, Caroline Humphrey, Jonathan Mair, and Soumhya Venkatesan. Our reading-group meetings, and these friends' unfailing generosity in reading and commenting on drafts of the work in progress, have been the source of many fruitful ideas and protection against many errors.

Also formative was an interdisciplinary seminar on 'Ethics at the Intersection of Philosophy and Anthropology' held during my term as Mellon Fellow with the Cambridge University Centre for Research in the Arts, Social Sciences, and Humanities (CRASSH). I am grateful to all the participants in the seminar, to the Centre's inexhaustibly enthusiastic Director, Simon Goldhill, and especially to my co-organizer Hallvard Lillehammer: our regular discussions and deepening collaboration on the project of conceiving a productive dialogue between anthropology

viii



Acknowledgements

and moral philosophy have become one of my most treasured intellectual pleasures in recent years.

During the year in which it was finally written, several opportunities to present parts of this book in draft were exceptionally helpful. Delivering a Munro Lecture at the University of Edinburgh was hugely enjoyable, and I am grateful to Jacob Copeman, Ian Harper, and Jonathan Spencer for their kind invitation, and to everyone in the Anthropology Department at the University for their hospitality. Tanya Luhrmann characteristically chose exactly the right moment to propose me for a Visiting Fellowship at the Stanford Humanities Center, and was also characteristically thoughtful in organizing both a wonderfully stimulating workshop while I was there, and also for me to be otherwise left largely in peace to write, except for our meals together when I had the bracing pleasure of explaining what I was doing to surely one of the sharpest vagueness-detectors in the discipline. Thanks to a generous invitation from Joel Robbins, Joe Hankins, and Rupert Stasch, I was able to present part of a chapter and to participate in some hugely enjoyable discussions in the Anthropology Department at the University of California, San Diego. And finally, a week spent at Rice University afforded the opportunity to present three draft chapters, in a lecture and two intense workshops with a brilliant group of graduate students. James Faubion and Alexander Regier provided penetrating comments on the writing, and the most fabulously warm hospitality. And William Düll also memorably introduced me to the singular pleasure of running in the heavy wet air of a Houston summer.

Among those to whom I am grateful for reading parts of the text or for comments, suggestions, and enlightening discussion are Allen Abramson, Michael Banner, Susan Bayly, Morgan Clarke, Martin Holbraad, Timothy Jenkins, Magnus Marsden, Perveez Mody, David Owens, Anand Pandian, Charles Stafford, Rupert Stasch, and Olaf Zenker. Joel Robbins kindly read and commented alike with sympathy and penetration on

ix



Acknowledgements

much of the penultimate draft. As series editors, Michael Lambek and Jonathan Spencer have been wonderfully supportive.

King's College and the Social Anthropology Division at Cambridge University are incomparably stimulating and supportive institutions, and working with colleagues in both is an inestimable privilege and pleasure. And to Peter, *sine qua non*, my thanks and love.