

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the *Annales*

Jackie Elliott

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ENNIUS AND THE ARCHITECTURE OF THE *ANNALES*

Ennius' *Annales*, which is preserved only in fragments, was hugely influential on Roman literature and culture. This book explores the genesis, in the ancient sources for Ennius' epic and in modern scholarship, of the accounts of the *Annales* with which we operate today. A series of appendixes detail each source's contribution to our record of the poem, and are used to consider how the interests and working methods of the principal sources shape the modern view of the poem and to re-examine the limits imposed and the possibilities offered by this ancient evidence. Dr Elliott challenges standard views of the poem, such as its use of time and the disposition of the gods within it. She argues that the manifest impact of the *Annales* on the collective Roman psyche results from its innovative promotion of a vision of Rome as the primary focus of the cosmos in all its aspects.

JACKIE ELLIOTT is an Assistant Professor in Classics at the University of Colorado at Boulder. She works primarily on Roman literary history and the interaction of the epic and historiographical traditions at Rome. She has received fellowships from the American Academy in Rome and the Loeb Foundation.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales

Jackie Elliott

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales

Jackie Elliott

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

ENNIUS AND THE ARCHITECTURE OF THE *ANNALES*

JACKIE ELLIOTT

University of Colorado at Boulder



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales
 Jackie Elliott
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107027480

© Jackie Elliott 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United Kingdom by CPI Group Ltd, Croydon CR0 4YY

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Elliott, Jackie, 1973–

Ennius and the architecture of the Annales / Jackie Elliott.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02748-0

1. Ennius, Quintus Annales.
2. Ennius, Quintus – Criticism and interpretation.
3. Historical poetry, Latin – History and criticism.
4. Rome – In literature.
- I. Title.

PA6382.E44 2013

871'.0109–dc23

2012035449

ISBN 978-1-107-02748-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales

Jackie Elliott

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

*For RLS:
In gratitude and grief*

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales
Jackie Elliott
Frontmatter
[More information](#)

Contents

| | |
|---|------------------|
| <i>List of tables</i> | <i>page</i> viii |
| <i>List of abbreviations</i> | x |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | xii |
| Introduction | I |
| 1 Ennius and the annalistic tradition at Rome | 18 |
| 2 The Vergiliocentric sources and the question of the evidence: Ennius and the epic tradition of Greece and Rome | 75 |
| 3 The pre-Vergilian sources | 135 |
| 4 The <i>Annales</i> as historiography: Ennius and the invention of the Roman past | 198 |
| 5 <i>Imperium sine fine</i> : the <i>Annales</i> and universal history | 233 |
| Epilogue | 295 |
| <i>Appendixes</i> | |
| 1 <i>Triadic structure and the organisation of the text according to established scholarship</i> | 298 |
| 2 <i>The gods in the Annales</i> | 303 |
| 3 <i>The organisation of the fragments: evidence and conjecture</i> | 308 |
| 4 <i>The chronology of the sources</i> | 342 |
| 5 <i>Fragments organised by source</i> | 348 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | 559 |
| <i>Index</i> | 575 |

Tables

| | |
|--|-----------------|
| 3.1 The pre-Vergilian sources | <i>page</i> 136 |
| 3.2 The etymological, lexicographical and grammatical sources for the <i>Annales</i> | 145 |
| A1.1 Triadic structure and the organisation of the text according to established scholarship | 299 |
| A2.1 Fragments uncontroversially relating to divine intervention | 304 |
| A2.2 Fragments relating to Homerising gods without necessarily entailing direct divine intervention in the narrative | 305 |
| A3.1 Fragments attributed to a particular book by their source(s) | 309 |
| A3.2 Reasonable modern attributions to particular books | 324 |
| A3.3 Fragments we have no sound means of placing | 330 |
| A4.1 The pre-Vergilian sources for the <i>Annales</i> | 342 |
| A4.2 The post-Vergilian sources for the <i>Annales</i> | 345 |
| A5.1 Varro | 350 |
| A5.2 <i>Rhetorica ad Herennium</i> | 363 |
| A5.3 Cicero | 365 |
| A5.4 <i>Bellum Hispaniense</i> | 398 |
| A5.5 Seneca | 400 |
| A5.6 Pliny the Elder | 402 |
| A5.7 Quintilian | 403 |
| A5.8 Fronto | 407 |
| A5.9 Apuleius | 412 |
| A5.10 Gellius | 413 |
| A5.11 Festus | 428 |
| A5.12 Tertullian | 445 |
| A5.13 <i>Fragmentum de Metris</i> | 446 |
| A5.14 Sacerdos | 447 |

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales
 Jackie Elliott
 Frontmatter
[More information](#)

List of tables ix

| | | |
|-------|--------------------------------------|-----|
| A5.15 | Atilius Fortunatianus | 448 |
| A5.16 | Nonius | 451 |
| A5.17 | Donatus | 461 |
| A5.18 | Ps.-Probus | 463 |
| A5.19 | Ausonius | 466 |
| A5.20 | Charisius | 468 |
| A5.21 | Diomedes | 474 |
| A5.22 | Augustine | 478 |
| A5.23 | Servius | 480 |
| A5.24 | Macrobius | 491 |
| A5.25 | Ps.-Macrobius, <i>Exc. Bob.</i> | 499 |
| A5.26 | 'Porphyrio' | 501 |
| A5.27 | Consentius | 504 |
| A5.28 | Lactantius Placidus | 505 |
| A5.29 | Scholia Veronensia | 506 |
| A5.30 | Priscian | 507 |
| A5.31 | Scholia Bembina | 521 |
| A5.32 | Cassiodorus | 522 |
| A5.33 | <i>De Ultimis Syllabis</i> | 523 |
| A5.34 | Isidore | 524 |
| A5.35 | Servius Danielis | 527 |
| A5.36 | Paulus | 539 |
| A5.37 | <i>Brevis Expositio</i> | 543 |
| A5.38 | 'Donatian' commentary on Terence | 544 |
| A5.39 | Scholia Bernensia | 546 |
| A5.40 | Ps.-Acro | 548 |
| A5.41 | Scholia to Persius | 550 |
| A5.42 | Readers of Orosius | 553 |
| A5.43 | <i>Glossarium Philoxenum</i> | 555 |
| A5.44 | <i>Commenta Bernensia in Lucanum</i> | 556 |
| A5.45 | G. Valla | 557 |
| A5.46 | H. Columna | 558 |

Abbreviations

| | |
|---------|--|
| A | Astbury, R. (ed.) (2002) <i>M. Terentius Varronis Saturarum Menippearum Fragmenta</i> . 2nd edn. Munich |
| Arn. | von Arnim, H. (ed.) (1903–24) <i>Stoicorum veterum fragmenta</i> (4 vols.). Leipzig |
| B | Barchiesi, M. (ed.) (1962) <i>Nevio Epico: storia, interpretazione, edizione critica dei frammenti del primo epos latino</i> . Padua |
| Bl. | Blänsdorf, J. (ed.) (2011) <i>Fragmenta Poetarum Latinorum</i> . 4th edn. Berlin |
| Br. | Bremer, F. P. (ed.) (1896) <i>Iurisprudentiae Antehadrianae quae supersunt</i> (3 vols.). Leipzig |
| C | Courtney, E. (ed.) (2003) <i>The Fragmentary Latin Poets</i> 2nd edn. Oxford |
| c. | Century |
| c. | Approximate |
| Ca. | Cardauns, B. (ed.) (1976) <i>M. Terentius Varro Antiquitates Rerum Divinarum</i> (2 vols.). Mainz |
| CGL | Loewe, G. <i>et al.</i> (eds.) (1888–1923) <i>Corpus Glossariorum Latinorum</i> (7 vols.). Leipzig |
| D-K | Diels, H. and W. Kranz (eds.) (1957) <i>Die Fragmente der Varsokratiker</i> . 8th edn. Hamburg |
| dC | della Casa, A. (ed.) (1969) <i>Il Dubius Sermo di Plinio</i> . Genoa |
| FGrHist | Jacoby, F. (ed.) (1923–57) <i>Die Fragmente der griechischen Historiker</i> . Leiden |
| Fl. | Flores, E. <i>et al.</i> (eds.) (2000–9) <i>Quinto Ennio. Annali</i> (5 vols.). Naples |
| Fun. | Funaoli, G. (ed.) (1907) <i>Grammaticae Romanae fragmenta</i> . Leipzig. Repr. Stuttgart 1969 |
| G | Grilli, A. (1962) <i>M. Tulli Ciceronis Hortensius</i> . Varese |

List of abbreviations

xi

| | |
|-------|---|
| GLK | Keil, K. and H. Hagen (eds.) (1855–80) <i>Grammatici Latini</i> (8 vols.). Leipzig |
| Iord. | Iordan, H. (ed.) (1967) <i>M. Catonis Praeter librum De Re Rustica quae exstant</i> . Stuttgart. Repr. of orig. 1860 edn |
| J | Jocelyn, H. D. (ed.) (1967) <i>The Tragedies of Ennius: The Fragments</i> . Cambridge |
| K | Kaster, R. A. (ed.) (2011) <i>Macrobius, Saturnalia</i> (3 vols.). Cambridge, MA |
| M | Marx, F. (ed.) (1904–5) <i>C. Lucilii Carminum Reliquiae</i> . Leipzig |
| Ma. | Marshall, P. K. (ed.) (1990) <i>A. Gellii Noctes Atticae</i> . Repr. with corr. Leipzig |
| Mal. | Malcovati, E. (ed.) (1955) <i>Oratorum Romanorum Fragmenta</i> . 2nd edn. Torino |
| Maur. | Maurenbrecher, B. (1891) <i>C. Sallustii Crispi Historiarum Reliquiae</i> . Stuttgart. Repr. Stuttgart 1966 |
| Mi. | Mirsch, P. (1882) <i>De M. Terentii Varronis Antiquitatum Rerum Humanarum libri xxv</i> . Leipzig |
| Mo. | Monda, S. (ed.) (2004) <i>Titus Maccius Plautus. Vidularia et deperditarum fabularum fragmenta</i> . Sarsina |
| P | Peter, H. W. G. (ed.) (1906–14) <i>Historicorum Romanorum Reliquiae</i> . edn. 2. Leipzig. Repr. Stuttgart 1967, 1993 |
| R | Ribbeck, O. (ed.) (1897–8), <i>Scaenicae Romanorum poesis fragmenta</i> . edn. 2. Leipzig |
| RLM | Halm, K. (ed.) (1863) <i>Rhetores Latini minores</i> . Leipzig |
| S | Strzelecki, W. (ed.) (1959) <i>Gn. Naevii Belli Punici carminis quae supersunt</i> . Breslau |
| Se. | Semi, F. (ed.) (1965) <i>M. Terentius Varro</i> (4 vols.). Venice |
| Sk. | Skutsch, O. (1985) <i>The Annals of Q. Ennius</i> . Oxford |
| Th. | Thilo, G. and H. Hagen (eds.) (1881–1902) <i>Servii grammatici qui feruntur in Vergilii carmina commentarii</i> (3 vols.). Leipzig. Repr. Hildesheim 1986 |
| V | Vahlen, J. (ed.) (1903) <i>Ennianae poesis reliquiae</i> . 2nd edn. Leipzig. Repr. Leipzig 1928, Amsterdam 1967 |
| W | Warmington, E. H. (ed.) (1935–6) <i>Remains of Old Latin</i> (4 vols.). Cambridge, MA |
| West | West, M. L. (ed.) (1989) <i>Iambi et elegi Graeci ante Alexandrum cantati</i> . edn. 2. Oxford |

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales

Jackie Elliott

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgements

I undertook this project under the direction of Jim Zetzel, access to whose view of Roman literary history is possibly the single most intellectually formative experience I have had. In Spring 2004, he taught a seminar on Ennius, which was the greatest external impetus this project received and which provoked me to form the views that inform Chapter 1 in particular. I should say in his defence that I have no reason to think that he approves either of the proposals I make there or of any of the other hypotheses of this project. I admire and am grateful for the standard of scholarship he set for me at the outset of my studies, and I do not believe that this project could have been conceived without the stimulus that his model provided; but I am not under the illusion that I shall ever be able to meet such a standard, let alone that I come anywhere near to approaching it in this project.

The dissertation in which this project originates barely scratched the surface of the issues central to the project as it now stands: the question of how the sources for our fragments have directed their modern interpretation and the related issue of how we understand the function of genre in defining the enterprise that the *Annales* constituted. For the ability to develop those themes I am indebted to fellowships from the American Academy at Rome (2007–8) and from the Loeb Foundation (Fall 2008); to the National Endowment for the Humanities, which partially funded the American Academy fellowship; and to the Department of Classics and the College of Arts and Sciences at the University of Colorado at Boulder for allowing me to accept these fellowships in sequence. A grant from the University's Graduate Council of Arts and Humanities funded travel to and from Rome in 2008, and a grant from the Dean's Fund for Excellence allowed me to return to Rome in Summer 2010 to complete the catalogue of sources. These fellowships and grants gave me the time and the resources radically to overhaul an awkward and intellectually inchoate dissertation. I am besides this grateful to the University of Colorado's Eugene M. Kayden Research Grant and to Columbia University's Lodge Fund, which jointly bore the

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales

Jackie Elliott

Frontmatter

[More information](#)*Acknowledgements*

xiii

cost of printing the Appendixes on the sources on pp. 348–558 of the present volume.

I have a keenly felt debt to those scholars on whose time I had no call but who graciously read the project for me at my petition and greatly promoted its development: Chris Kraus and Chris Pelling read the manuscript in its entirety, and their comments pushed me in productive directions, informed my further exploration and steered me away from pitfalls; Cambridge's anonymous reader encouraged me to think through areas of weakness; Tony Woodman read the introduction and persuaded me to clarify many points; Sander Goldberg read Chapter 1 and offered conversation, advice and encouragement, for which I am most grateful; Bob Kaster read Chapter 2 on the Vergiliocentric sources and returned helpful comments, as did Alison Keith. On the basis of my offering at a conference in Manchester in 2007 and the paper that followed (Elliott 2010: 148–61), Tim Cornell and Michael Maas gave encouragement to my then incipient thoughts about the connection between universal history and Ennius' *Annales*, emboldening me to pursue the idea in the context of the book. My senior colleagues in Latin Literature at Boulder, Peter Knox and Carole Newlands, giants in my admiration and my gratitude, not only read usefully but waited and coaxed kindly while I took an inordinately long time to formulate my views and present them to the press – as did Gareth Williams, whose unfailing faith in me has meant a great deal. None of them, needless to say, is responsible for those products of my indiscipline and stubbornness that remain. I am also grateful to the eight motivated, capable and industrious participants of my Spring 2011 seminar on universal history: Reina Callier, Jen Greenberg, Ellen Honeycutt, Emily Miller, Ian Oliver, Mitch Pentzer, Sarah Teets and Courtney Tobin. They challenged my ideas and engaged productively over vast quantities of difficult material, showing no signs of tiring over the course of the long CU semester. Their stimulating company and conversation provided real support to my articulation of the argument of Chapter 5.

The time I spent finalising this project has, for reasons not entirely unconnected with it, been difficult, and this book would not have been finished without the support of friends and family. The list of names I give here does nothing to speak the gratitude I owe them: first, my parents, Michael and Margaret Elliott, my strongest allies and defenders, and my sister, Julie, whose good sense and compassion are a model I can only hope to aspire to. There is a sense in which the dedication of this book properly belongs to them, since, without them, I would certainly not have managed it. Others too: Emma Satyamurti, Tyler Lansford (to whom the idea for this

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02748-0 - Ennius and the Architecture of the Annales

Jackie Elliott

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

xiv

Acknowledgements

volume's cover illustration is due) and Douglas Arbuthnot, *animae quales neque candidiores/terra tulit, neque quis me sit devinctior alter* (Hor. *Serm.* 1.5.41–2); Amanda Smith, who confounded my expectations of the limits on one person's ability to understand and communicate with another; Jenn Wert, Lisa Jo Landsberg and Tam Spielman, whose grace, patience and strength have shown me the way; Nancy Schmidt, my brave, enduring and beloved mother-in-law; Mike Johnson (*amicus certus in re incerta cernitur*; Enn. 351 J); Federica Ciccolella; Leah Haenselman; Rachel Doriese; and finally, my grandmother, Julie Ponetz, who continues to form and strengthen me long after her own life is over.

This book is dedicated to my companion of twelve years and eventual husband, who brought me from childhood to maturity and who, for as long as I let him, stood by me as though there were no other cause on this earth. Being witness and student to his discipline, imagination, competence and integrity as an individual and as an educator has been one of the profound blessings of my life. This dedication is by no means the return he would have wanted on the years we shared, neither is it the one I would have wished to make.