

More information

Index

Abdul Kahar bin Ahmad case, Federal Court of A.D.M Jabalpur v. Shivakant Shukla, Supreme Malaysia, 325-326 Court of India, 269-270 abortion, U.S. Supreme Court decision on, 224 administration of Dutch court system, 192-193 Academic Center of Law and Business v. Minister administrative and regulatory state, U.S., of Finance, Israeli Supreme Court, 253 access to information, Mexican Supreme Court, abandonment of substantive review of regulatory policy, 206 150-151 accommodation, in Dutch political system, endorsing administrative law-making, 206-207 183-185 federal government's taxing and spending accountability. See also political accountability, power, 207 importance of Supreme Court, 207–209 courts enforcing in Italy and judicial independence, 388-389 interstate commerce as all commerce, 205-206 judicial initiatives as way to enforce, in Italy, legitimating administrative lawmaking through federal administrative law, 200-211 and judicial review, 253 overview, 204-205 accusatorial trials, Italy, 172 administrative law Ackerman, Bruce, 262 and courts as downstream democratic active voice, constitutional politics in, 363-379 consolidators, 51 external pressures on French, 295-296 courts and judges, 375-378 fragmentation and gridlock, 371-375 and Israeli Supreme Court decisions, 258 liberals, 378-379 in traditional French judicial model, 294 overview, 363-365 Administrative Procedure Act, U.S., 210 passive voice and missing agents, 365-367 administrative review, 389-394 regime politics, 368-371 administrative tribunals, France, 297-301 activist court, Supreme Court of India as, adversarial legal advocacy, in U.S., 213 272-273. See also Indian Supreme affirmative action, U.S. Supreme Court decisions Court involving, 221–223 African Americans. See racial equality decisions, activist role conception, 3 activist states, and expanded judicial roles, U.S. Supreme Court agency, role of in constitutional politics, 363-379 407-409 Adallah v. Minister of Defence, Israeli Supreme courts and judges, 375-378 Court, 252-253 fragmentation and gridlock, 371-375 liberals, 378-379 Adallah v. Minister of Interior, Israeli Supreme Court, 253-254 overview, 363-365 adapting constitutional courts, 343-344 passive voice and missing agents, 365-367 adjudicating election in Taiwan, 55-58 regime politics, 368-371



More information

414 Index

agenda complaints about government stasis and establishment of for Mexican Supreme Court, maladministration, 13-15 cultural and religious cleavages, 15-17 national political, and lack of founding written disputes about rights and equality, 17-18 constitution in Israel, 238 disputes between political incumbents and agitation for constitutionalism, 341-342 challengers, 8-10 Agricultural Adjustment Act of 1933, U.S., 207 general discussion, 399 Akaev, Askar, 72, 84–85 intra-governmental disputes about who "Allah", ban on use by non-Muslims in Malaysia, governs, 11-13 army members, HIV-positive, Mexican Supreme allocation of powers, 11-13 Court decision on, 155 executive-legislative conflict, 11-12 Article 6-1 fair trial litigation, 296-297, 299-300, judicial-elected branch conflict, 12-13 302-304, 306-308, 309 national-subnational government conflict, 13 Article 14, Indian Constitution, 275 Article 19, Indian Constitution, 271 overview, 11 South African Constitutional Court decision Article 31, Indian Constitution, 265–267 Article 32, Indian Constitution, 274 on, 105-106 ambassador, Dutch Hoge Raad as, 195 Article 368, Indian Constitution, 267 amendments. See also specific amendments by Asia, democratization in, 45-64 adjudicating election in Taiwan, 55-58 of 1953, Dutch, 182-183 downstream democratic consolidators, 50–51 14th, U.S. Constitution, 212-213, 216 downstream guarantors, 49-50 to French constitution, 308 impeachment in South Korea, 52-55 to Indian Constitution, 265-268, 269 judicial irrelevance, 52 Islamization, constitution of Pakistan, 318-319 legacies and roles, 63-64 as unconstitutional, 387 overview, 45-47 amparo writ (juicio de amparo), Mexico picking and rejecting populist in Thailand, decision on HIV-positive army members, 155 Facultad de Atracción, using to bring cases to triggering democracy in Pakistan, 60-63 Supreme Court, 152-153 upstream triggers of democracy, 47-49 during PRI rule, 142-143 assertive decisions, willingness and ability of reform of, 148 judges to make, 5-6 role of Justice Castro y Castro in reform of, 147 assertiveness, strategic, of judges, 32-35 Andhyarujina, T.R., 279 Association for Democratic Reforms v. Union of Andrew W. Mellon Foundation John E. Sawyer India, Indian Supreme Court, 278 asylum seekers, Dutch Council of State's Seminar, 2 Anonymous v. The State of Israel, Israeli Supreme treatment of, 189 Court, 253 Attraction Power (Facultad de Atracción), anti-authoritarian movements, role of courts in Mexican Supreme Court, 152-153 audiencias públicas (public hearings), Mexican sparking, 9-10 anti-establishment religious movements, Supreme Court, 155 restriction of, 314-315 Austin, Granville, 282 anti-government judicial behavior, conditions authoritarian regimes. See also politics of courts enabling, 68–73 in democratization: semi-authoritarian apartheid era, South Africa regimes, colored revolutions in influence on Constitutional Court, 95-97 anti-authoritarian movements, role of courts in judiciary in, 97 sparking, 9-10 apostasy, Syariah courts' jurisdictional authority in Chile, constitution created by, 116–118 over, 324 constitutional judicial review in, 383 appointments, judicial downstream democratic consolidators, 50-51 downstream guarantors, 49–50 in India, 272-273, 280 and regime theory, 369-370 and legality, 349 South African Constitutional Court, 97-99 in Mexico, 138–139 arenas of political conflict, 7-18 upstream triggers of democracy, 47-49



More information

Index 415

authority, South African Constitutional Court, 102-103, 108-109 autocratic regimes, shifts to democracy from, 23-24. See also authoritarian regimes; politics of courts in democratization; semi-authoritarian regimes, colored revolutions in auto-limited judicial review, 396-397 autonomous law, 408 autonomy. See also judicial independence as goal of Mexican Supreme Court, as value of Dutch Hoge Raad, 195 avoidance tactics, in Dutch politics, 184 Azuela, Mariano, 149-150 Baker v Carr, U.S. Supreme Court, 10, 225 Bakiev, Kurmanbek, 86 Bandhua Mukti Morcha v. Union of India (BMM), Indian Supreme Court, 274 Bank Hamizrachi United v. Migdal Communal Village, Israeli Supreme Court, 34, 246-247, Bank Nationalization Act, India, 267 Barak, Aharon, 12, 244, 248 Barendrecht, Maurits, 188 Barisan Nasional (National Front) coalition, Malaysia, 322 barriers against non-democratic rule, constitutionally defined, 70 basic laws, Israel change in national perspectives regarding, 254 judicial-elected branch conflict, 12 and legal complex, 342 1969 Bergman exception, 239-241 of 1992, constitutional revolution caused by, 244-249 of 1992, overview of, 241-244 overview, 238-239 possibility of enacting new, 255 basic legal framework, Chile, 117 basic structure doctrine, India, 265-270 Golak Nath v. Union of India, 267-268 Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala, 268-269 overview, 265-267 Supreme Court support of in pre-Emergency era, 281–282 Bavli case, Supreme Court of Israel, 329-330 Baxi, Upendra, 271, 282, 283 Ben Gurion, David, 237 Bergman case, Israel, 239-241

Berlusconi, Silvio, 163, 171, 172-173 Betfair case, Dutch Council of State, 100-101 Bhagwati, P.N., 138, 272-273, 280-281 Bhe case, South African Constitutional Court, Bhutto, Benazir, 61 Bible readings in public schools, U.S. Supreme Court decision regarding, 202-203 Bihar Land Reforms Act, 265 Bill of Rights South African, 104-105 U.S. Constitution, 212-213 Bituminous Coal Act of 1937, U.S., 206-207 black money investors, in India, 275 black persons. See racial equality decisions, U.S. Supreme Court Blasphemy Law, Indonesian, 315 BMM (Bandhua Mukti Morcha v. Union of India), Indian Supreme Court, 274 BN (Barisan Nasional) coalition, Malaysia, 322 boundaries of power, constitutional, in Chile, British law, Israel's severing of ties with, 250 Brown v Board of Education, U.S. Supreme Court, 14, 33, 217-219, 355 bulk cases, Dutch court system, 192 Bumiputra (Malay ethnic group), 322 Bush v Gore, U.S. Supreme Court, 10 busing-for-balance, U.S. Supreme Court decisions involving, 220 California v Robinson, U.S. Supreme Court, canceling results of rigged elections. See contested elections, role of courts in deciding candidate selection, and fragmentation in Israel, 242-243 capacities, of courts, and changing judicial roles, 19–22, 28–30 capital punishment, South African Constitutional Court decision on, 99-100 cassation systems. See Cour de cassation, France; Dutch Hoge Raad Castillejos-Aragón, Mónica, 372 Castro y Castro, Juventino, 146-147 causal factors for changing judicial roles, 18-30 general discussion, 399-400 intra-court factors, 28-30 overview, 18-22 proximate political dynamics, 25-28 structural factors, 22-25 Central Bureau of Investigation (CBI), Indian, 277-278

More information

Index 416 Central Election Commission (CEC) civil courts, versus Syariah courts in Malaysia, Georgia, 75 323-326 Ukraine, 79-82 Civil Rights Act, U.S., 220-222 Central Government, Supreme Court of India's civil rights legislation, U.S. See also racial equality challenge of, 276-280 decisions, U.S. Supreme Court corruption and accountability cases, 277-278 breaking political roadblocks, 14 education, human rights, and affirmative criminal due process, changes in, 211-214 Civil Rights Movement, effect of Brown v Board action, 279-280 environmental policy, 278-279 of Education on, 219 judicial appointment cases, 276-277 civil society, Mexico overview, 276 avoidance of courts under PRI rule, 143 certification of constitution, South African inclusion of in Supreme Court decisions, Constitutional Court, 103-104 154-156 Cesión Gratuita de Terrenos case, Constitutional Supreme Court's attempts to reach out to, Tribunal of Chile, 124-125 153-154 CGR (Controller General of the Republic), civil society movement, South Korea, 53 Chile, 119 Civil Torts Act, Israel, 252-253 challengers and political incumbents, disputes Clal Insurance Company Ltd. v. Minister of between, 8-10 treasury, Israeli Supreme Court, 245-246 electoral conflicts in established democracies, Clayton, Cornell, 368 "Clean Hands" movement, Italy, 168-170 facilitating democratic transitions, 8-9 coherence of national judicial system, Dutch overview, 8 Hoge Raad as guardian of, 195–196 sparking anti-authoritarian movements, 9-10 collaborative policy-making role for executive. See change in judicial roles in governance, framework separation of powers conflicts, Chile for, 18-30 colored revolutions, 67-87 intra-court factors, 28-30 conditions enabling judges to decide contested overview, 18-22 elections, 68-73 proximate political dynamics, 25-28 Georgia's Rose Revolution, 74-78 structural factors, 22-25 judicial strategies and roles, overview of, 73-74 Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83–86 Union, 305 overview, 67-68 Chaskalson, Arthur, 99–100 Ukraine's Orange Revolution, 78-83 Chaudhry, Iftikhar Mohammad, 60-61 commerce, U.S. Supreme Court rulings on, Chen Shui-bian, 11, 56-58 204-206 Chile, Constitutional Tribunal of, 114-134 Commitment to Peace and Social Justice v. causes of law vs. decree rulings, 126-131 Minister of Finance, Israeli Supreme Court, constitutional boundaries of power, 116-118 constitutional review of decree authority, comparative study of courts, 2-3 competitive motivations, in French judicial evolving law vs. decree doctrine, 120-126 system, 297-301 executive-legislative battles, 11-12 competitive party system, in Mexico, 140, 144-145, history of, 116 147-148 judicial irrelevance, 52 composition and legal complex, 342 of Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, effect on decisions, 127-129 Marbury moment in, 357 nature of executive-legislative conflict, 116-119 of Italian Higher Council of the Judiciary, 166 negotiating new roles, 131-134 of South African Constitutional Court, 98-99 overview, 114-116 Conseil d'Etat, France, 295, 297-301, 302-303, 356 post-2005 law vs. decree cases, 132-134 consensus democracy. See political system, Dutch

consequential courts, 1-37

complaints about government stasis and maladministration, 13–15

cultural and religious cleavages, 15-17

Citizens to Preserve Overton Park v Volpe, U.S.

Christian Democrats, Italy, 165

Supreme Court, 210 Civil Code, Dutch, rewriting of, 188



More information

Index 417

disputes about rights and equality, 17–18	history of, 94-95
disputes between political incumbents and	judicial agency, 377
challengers, 8–10	and legal complex, 342
expanded judicial roles in governance, 3-7	Marbury moment in, 356–357
framework of influences on changing judicial roles, 18–30	overview, 93–95 rights, politics and margins of judicial power,
general discussion, 409–410	
intra-governmental disputes about who	106–109 sources of judicial power, 95–101
	strategic decisions of judges, 33–34
governs, 11–13 judicial strategies, tactics, and techniques,	strategic engagement and judicial pragmatism
3°–35	101–106
overview, 1–3	Zondi case, 17
conservatives, culture wars between liberal elites	Constitutional Court, South Korean, 9, 52-55, 34
and, 225–226	Constitutional Court, Thailand, 58–60, 354
consistency, lack of in Israeli Supreme Court	Constitutional Court, Ukrainian, 72, 82
decisions, 258	constitutional courts, and legal complex, 341-345
consolidation of constitutional courts, 343–344	agitation for constitutionalism, 341–342
consolidators, courts as downstream democratic	consolidation and adaptation, 343–344
facilitating democratic transitions, 8	defense of, 344–345
overview, 50–51	institution of, 342–343
South Korean Constitutional Court, 52–55	constitutional democracy, 351, 405–406
in Taiwan, 55–58	constitutional infrastructure, and changing
in Thailand, 60	judicial roles, 25
Constituent Assembly, India, 263	constitutional judicial review, 380-397. See also
Constitution of 1948, Italy, 164–165	constitutional revolution, Israel
Constitution of India	of administrative decisionmaking, U.S.
Article 14, 275	Supreme Court, 209–211
Article 19, 271	administrative review, 389–394
Article 32, 274	costs and benefits of, 383–384
under Emergency rule, 269	declaring constitution unconstitutional,
First Amendment, 265–267	386–387
Golak Nath v. Union of India, 267–268	of decree authority, Chile, 118–119
Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala,	external pressures on French, 295–296
268–269	general discussion, 394–397
Seventeenth Amendment, 266–267	in Italy, 164
Constitution of Malaysia, 322–323, 325–326	judicial independence, 387–389
constitution of Pakistan, Islamization	normative questions, 385
amendments to, 318–319	overview, 380–383
constitutional amendments, French, 308	proactive and reactive, 385–386
Constitutional Assembly, South Africa, 103	by South African Constitutional Court, 99–100
constitutional boundaries of power, Chile, 116–118	supplying and demanding, 384–385
Constitutional Council, France, 297–301	in traditional French judicial model, 294
Constitutional Court, Egyptian, 315–317, 344	constitutional jurisprudence, religion-taming
Constitutional Court, Georgian, 76–77	function of, 311–333
Constitutional Court, Hungarian, 1–2	effect of social and political movements on
Constitutional Court, Indonesian, 314–315, 316	judicial roles, 27
Constitutional Court, Italian, 165–166, 172, 176,	Egypt, 315–317
361–362	general discussion, 313–315, 330–333
Constitutional Court, Kuwaiti, 317–318	and interpretive creativity, 32
Constitutional Court, Kyrgyzstani, 72	Israel, 327–330
Constitutional Court, South African, 93–112	Kuwait, 317–318
composition of, 98–99	Malaysia, 321–327
disputes about rights and equality, 17–18	overview, 16, 311–313
facilitation of democratic transitions by, 9	Pakistan, 318–321



More information

418 Index

constitutional moment, 262 constitutional norms, interpretations of in French judicial system, 300-301 constitutional patriotism, South African Constitutional Court, 100-101 constitutional politics in active voice, 363-379 courts and judges, 375-378 fragmentation and gridlock, 371-375 liberals, 378-379 overview, 363-365 passive voice and missing agents, 365-367 regime politics, 368-371 Constitutional Principles, South Africa, 103-104 constitutional revolution, Israel, 233-258 aftermath, 254-258 constitutional judicial review in 2000's, 252-254 general discussion, 244-249 lack of founding written constitution, 235-238 and legal complex, 342 overview, 233-235 piecemeal constitutional construction, 238-244 reasons for, 249-251 Constitutional Tribunal, Chile, 114-134 causes of law vs. decree rulings, 126-131 constitutional boundaries of power, 116-118 constitutional review of decree authority, evolving law vs. decree doctrine, 120-126 executive-legislative battles, 11-12 history of, 116 judicial irrelevance, 52 and legal complex, 342 Marbury moment in, 357 nature of executive-legislative conflict, 116-119 negotiating new roles, 131-134 overview, 114-116 post-2005 law vs. decree cases, 132-134 constitutionalism courts as symbol of, o democracy, political fragmentation and, constitutionally defined barriers against non-democratic rule, 70 contemporary political dynamics, and changing judicial roles, 19-22, 25-28 contested elections, role of courts in deciding, 67-87 conditions enabling judges to decide, 68-73 Georgia's Rose Revolution, 74-78 judicial strategies and roles, overview of, 73-74

continuing mandamus, Indian Supreme Court, 272-274 Controller General of the Republic (CGR), Chile, 110 conversions to Judaism, Supreme Court of Israel rulings on, Syariah courts' jurisdictional authority over, cooperation of powers, Dutch Hoge Raad, 186-187 cooptation disarming religion through, 314 of powers, Dutch Hoge Raad, 195 correctional systems, U.S. Supreme Court decisions regarding, 214-215 corruption, battling, 15. See also criminal justice, Italy Corstens, Geert, 196 Cossío, José Ramón, 149-154 decision on HIV-positive army members, 155 Fundamental Rights Program, 149-150 inclusion of civil society in decisions, 155-156 judicial remedies to increase fundamental rights decisions, 2007, 152–153 judicial transparency and access to information, 150-151 legal education campaign, 151-152 and new role of Mexican Supreme Court, costs of constitutional judicial review, 383-384 Council of Grand Justices, Taiwan constitutionality of Truth Commission Act, 57 internal motivation of, 56 Interpretation No. 261, 56 Council of State (Raad van State), Dutch overview, 189-190 rivalry between highest courts, 190-191 Councils for the Judiciary, Dutch, 192-193 counsel, right to in U.S., 213 coup d'état. See colored revolutions Cour de cassation (Court of Cassation), France, 297-301, 302-303, 309, 356 Court of Cassation, Italy, 165-166 court-curbing measures taken by political leaders, 26-27 courts. See also consequential courts; judicial roles; politics of courts in democratization; specific courts by name as agents of political leaders, 3–4 comparative study of, 2-3 constitutional politics in active voice, 375-378 intra-court factors and changing roles, 19-22, 28-30 management of Dutch, 192-193

Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83-86

Ukraine's Orange Revolution, 78-83

overview, 67-68



More information

Index 419

deference, reasoned, as strategy of Constitutional

position of Dutch, 185-188 reasons for empowerment of by political Courts: A Comparative and Political Analysis, 3-4 craftsmanship, as value of Dutch Hoge Raad, creativity. See also judicial strategies; religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence of Italian courts, 176 procedural and interpretive, 30-32 criminal due process, role of U.S. Supreme Court in establishing, 211-216 criminal justice, Italy, 163-179 battling corruption and maladministration, complex relationship between courts and politics, 170-173 France and Spain as control cases, 173-175 overview, 163-164 political crisis of 1990s and further expansion of judicial power, 168-170 roles, strategies and conditions of judicialization in Italy, 175-178 transformation of Italian judicial system, 164-168 criminal procedure, and courts as downstream democratic consolidators, 51 cruel and inhuman punishments, U.S. Supreme Court decisions regarding, 214-215 cultural and religious cleavages, role of courts in resolving, 15-17 cultural liberalization, in Dutch society, 184 culture, judicial, effect on Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 129 "culture wars", and U.S. Supreme Court decisions, 225-226 Cunningham, Clark, 274 customary law, South African Constitutional Court decisions on, 107

deadlocks
legislative, 371–375
resolving in Ukraine's Orange Revolution,
78–83
death penalty, South African Constitutional
Court decision on, 99–100
decision-making procedures
ECHR pressure on ECJ, 306–308
European pressures on French, 296–297,
299–300, 302–304
decree authority in Chile, 117–119. See also law vs.
decree conflicts, Chile
defense of constitutional courts, 344–345

Tribunal of Chile, 131 deferential role conception, 3 deforestation, Indian Supreme Court decisions regarding, 279 DeFunis v Odegaard, U.S. Supreme Court, 222 deliberate passivity, Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 130-131 demand for judicial role expansion, in nautical metaphor, 20-21, 400 demarcation of local government boundaries, South African Constitutional Court decision on, 105-106 democracies, established, role of courts in electoral conflicts in, 10 democracy ethnic, in Malaysia, 322 shifts from autocratic regimes to, and changing judicial roles, 23-24 spread of, and expanded judicial roles, 405-406 democracy, compatibility of constitutional judicial review with declaring constitution unconstitutional, 386-387 general discussion, 394-395 judicial independence, 387-389 as normative question, 385 proactive and reactive review, 385-386 democracy and legality, tensions between, 349-362 constitutionalism and political fragmentation, 361-362 Marbury moments, failures, 357-359 Marbury moments, successes, 354-357 overview, 349-354 stickiness of judicial decisions, 359-361 democratic consolidators, courts as downstream facilitating democratic transitions, 8 overview, 50-51 South Korean Constitutional Court, 52-55 in Taiwan, 55-58 in Thailand, 60 democratic transitions, role of courts in facilitating, 8-9 democratization, Dutch, in 1968, 184 democratization, politics of courts in, 45-64 adjudicating election in Taiwan, 55-58 downstream democratic consolidators, 50-51 downstream guarantors, 49-50 impeachment in South Korea, 52-55 judicial irrelevance, 52 legacies and roles, 63-64 overview, 45-47



More information

420 Index

democratization, politics of courts in (cont.) picking and rejecting populist in Thailand, 58-60 triggering democracy in Pakistan, 60-63 upstream triggers of democracy, 47-49 Department of Transportation, U.S., 210 deputy legislator, Dutch Hoge Raad as, 186-187 de-registration of candidates, Kyrgyzstan, 84 dictatorship in Chile, constitution created by, 116-118 diffuse support, 403 Disengagement Act, Israel, 252 disinterestedness, as value of Dutch Hoge Raad, disputes, role of courts in resolving about rights and equality, 17-18 intra-governmental disputes about who governs, 11-13 between political incumbents and challengers, 8-10 diversity of French judiciary, internal, 297-301 division of powers. See also separation of powers conflicts, Chile and constitutional judicial review, 395 Dutch Council of State, 189-190 as necessary condition for judicial review, divorce, Supreme Court of Israel rulings on, 330 doctrinal divisions in French judiciary, 297–301 domestic interpretations of European law, 301-304 406 domestic political regime features, and changing judicial roles, 22 dominant national coalitions, in regime theory, 368-369 downstream democratic consolidators, courts as facilitating democratic transitions, 8 overview, 50-51 South Korean Constitutional Court, 52-55 in Taiwan, 55–58 in Thailand, 60 Egypt downstream guarantors, courts as overview, 49-50 in Thailand, 58-60 Dred Scott v Sandford, U.S. Supreme Court, 216 dress code, for women politicians in Kuwait, 317-318 due process in Israel, 253 role of U.S. Supreme Court in establishing, 211-216 Dutch Hoge Raad, 181–196 breaking political roadblocks, 14

characterization of Dutch political system, constitutional amendments of 1953, 182-183 cooperation of powers, 186-187 Council of State, 189-190 cultural and religious cleavages, 16 democracy, constitutionalism and fragmentation, 361 developments since early 1990s, 188-193 facing resistance, 188 general discussion, 185–186 human rights, 187–188 institutional leadership, 194–195 judicial leadership and roles in governance, 193-194 judicial-elected branch conflict, 13 and legal complex, 343 management of court system, 192-193 organizational leadership, 193-194 overview, 181-182 position of Dutch courts, 185-188 rewriting of Civil Code, 188 rivalry between highest courts, 190-191 ECHR (European Convention of Human Rights), 182-183, 187, 393-394. See also European Court of Human Rights ECJ. See European Court of Justice economic affairs, in Dutch political system, 184 economic liberalism, and expanded judicial roles, economic policy, Indian Supreme Court decisions regarding, 275-276 economy, Israeli and lack of founding written constitution, 236-237 market-based, 242 education, judicial, and regime theory, 370 education campaign, legal, by Mexican Supreme Court, 151-152 legal complex, 344 procedural creativity in, 32 religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence, 315-317 elected-judicial branch conflict over allocation of governing power, 12-13 election laws, Israel, 239-241 elections. See also electoral disputes; leaders, role of courts in choosing adjudicating in Taiwan, 55-58 conflicts in established democracies, role of courts in, 10 courts as upstream triggers of democracy, 49

changing judicial roles, 195-196



More information

Index 421

Dutch, 183-184 legislative re-districting, U.S. Supreme Court decisions on, 224-225 Western Cape case, South African Constitutional Court, 33-34 electoral disputes, 67-87 conditions enabling judges to decide, 68-73 Georgia's Rose Revolution, 74-78 judicial strategies and roles, overview of, 73-74 Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83–86 overview, 67-68 Ukraine's Orange Revolution, 78–83 electoral mandate of Congress party, questioning of by Indian Supreme Court, 269 electoral reforms, India, 278 elites, governing. See regime theory emancipation, as goal of Mexican Supreme Court, 147-149 Emergency rule, India, 10, 269-270 endorsement decisions by courts, 203 enforcement by South African Constitutional Court, 108-109 environmentalists, U.S. Supreme Court decisions involving, 209 epistolary jurisdiction, Indian Supreme Court, Equal Employment Opportunity Commission guidelines, U.S., 220-221 equality, role of courts in resolving disputes about, 17-18. See also racial equality decisions, U.S. Supreme Court Eskridge, Bill, 389-390 established democracies, role of courts in electoral conflicts in, 10. See also specific countries or courts ethnic democracy, in Malaysia, 322 ethnic segregation in schools, Israel, Europe, constitutional and administrative review in, 392-394 European Coal and Steel Community, 182 European Convention of Human Rights (ECHR), 182-183, 187, 393-394 European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) centrality of in EU legal order, 305 versus ECJ, 304-308 "fair trial" jurisprudence, 296-297, 299-300, 302-304, 306-308, 309 law of as superior to domestic law, 298 Marbury moment in, 356 European Court of Justice (ECJ)versus ECHR, 304-308 gambling law, and Dutch courts, 190-191 European fundamental rights revolution, 289-309

European pressures on European judicial system, 304-308 European pressures on French judicial system, 294-297 French pressures on European judicial system, French pressures on French judicial system, 297-301 general discussion, 308-309 judicial agency, 377 judicial-elected branch conflict, 13 and legal complex, 343-344 Marbury moment in, 356 overview, 289-292 traditional French judicial model, 292-294 European legal order, and Dutch court system, 182-183, 193, 195-196 European Union (EU), 305, 392-394 euthanasia cases, Dutch Hoge Raad, 14, 186-187 exceptional institutions, courts as, 371 executions, South African Constitutional Court decision on, 99-100 executive. See also executive-legislative conflict, Chile conflict with legislature over allocation of governing power, 11-12 external pressures on French review of, power of in Mexico in late 1990s, 146-147 review of in traditional French judicial model, 204 Executive Council of the Western Cape case, South African Constitutional Court, 105-106 executive-legislative conflict, Chile, 114-134 causes of law vs. decree rulings, 126-131 constitutional boundaries of power, 116-118 constitutional review of decree authority, 118-110 evolving law vs. decree doctrine, 120-126 nature of executive-legislative conflict, 116-119 negotiating new roles for court, 131-134 overview, 114-116 post-2005 law vs. decree cases, 132-134 expansive domestic interpretations of European law, 301-304 external influences on Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 126-131 external pressures European, on French judicial system, 294-297 French, on European judicial system, 301-304 facilitating democratic transitions, role of courts

in, 8-9



More information

422 Index

Facultad de Atracción (Attraction Power), constitutional politics in active voice, 371-375 Mexican Supreme Court, 152-153 and decisions of Constitutional Tribunal of "fair trial" jurisprudence, ECHR, 296-297, Chile, 127 299-300, 302-304, 306-308, 309, 356 democracy, constitutionalism and, 361-362 family law, Dutch, 187 and European fundamental rights revolution, Federal Court of Malaysia, 324-326 289-290 federal government. See also Central in Israel, 242-244 Government, Supreme Court of India's in Italy, 167-168, 170-173, 176-177, 178 and lack of founding written constitution in challenge of; national administrative and regulatory state, U.S. jurisdiction of in Malaysia, 322-323 as triggering changed role for Mexican national-subnational government conflict in Supreme Court, 144-145 U.S., 13 fraud, vote, exposing in Georgia's Rose federal health care law, U.S., 208 Revolution, 74-78 Federal Law of Transparency and Access to fraud in accounting crime, Italy, 172-173 freedom of vocation, Israeli basic law on Public Governmental Information, Mexico, cases involving, 244-246, 248 federalism overview, 241-244 as necessary condition for judicial review, French judicial system, 289-309 as control case for Italian judicialization of Supreme Court of Pakistan, 320-321 politics, 173-175 European pressures on European judicial female judges, in Egypt, 316–317 Ferejohn, John, 372, 389-390 system, 304–308 external pressures on, 294-297 finality, notion of in judicial systems, 349-350 financial independence, Mexican Supreme general discussion, 308-309 internal pressures on, 297-301 Court, 149 First Amendment, Indian Constitution, 265-267 judicial agency, 377 focal points for mobilization, court decisions as, judicial-elected branch conflict, 13 judicialization of governance, 285 formal law, constitutionality of in Chile, 125 legal complex, 343-344 Marbury moment in, 356 Fortuyn, Pim, 185 Foundations of Laws Act, Israel, 250 overview, 289-292 founding written constitution, lack of in Israel, pressures by on European judicial system, 235-238 301-304 traditional French judicial model, 292–294 attitudes toward judges and judicial process, 237-238 Friedman, Lawrence, 407-408 nature of national political agenda, 238 functional role of courts, 3-6 overview, 235 fundamental rights decisions, Mexican Supreme political fragmentation, 235 Court, 138-157 political timing, 236 absence of during PRI rule, 141-143 socialist political economy, 236-237 Chief Justice Genaro Góngora, 147-149 14th Amendment, U.S. Constitution, 212-213, 216 court as arena for political contestation, 154-157 Justice José Ramón Cossío, 149–154 Fox, Vicente, 145, 149, 150 fragility of judicial power, 402-409 Justice Juventino Castro y Castro, 146-147 activist states and evolving legal culture, overview, 138-141 variables triggering new role of court, 143–145 globalization and economic liberalism, 406 fundamental rights, position of Constitutional overview, 402-404 Tribunal of Chile on, 125-126 spread of constitutional democracy, 405-406 Fundamental Rights Program, Mexican Supreme fragmentation, political Court, 149-153 and changing judicial roles, 23-24, 405 judicial remedies to increase fundamental as condition enabling anti-government rights decisions, 152-153 decisions, 69-70 judicial transparency and access to and constitutional judicial review, 394-395 information, 150-151



More information

Index 423

legal education campaign, 151–152
overview, 149–150
fundamental rights revolution, European,
289–309
European pressures on European judicial system, 304–308
European pressures on French judicial system,
294–297
French pressures on European judicial system, 301–304
French pressures on French judicial system,
297–301
general discussion, 308–309
judicial agency, 377
judicial-elected branch conflict, 13
and legal complex, 343–344
overview, 289–292
traditional French judicial model, 292–294
fundamentalism. See religion-taming function of
constitutional jurisprudence
Gambelli ruling, European Court of Justice, 190
gambling law, Dutch, 190–191
Gandhi, Indira, 10, 264, 267–268, 269–270, 271
Georgia
conditions enabling anti-government decisions,
68–73
judicial framework and independence in, 69
judicial strategies and roles, 73-74
Marbury moments in, 359
Rose Revolution, 74–78
Gibson, James, 403
Gideon v Wainwright, U.S. Supreme Court,
213
Ginsburg, Tom, 4, 9, 341, 354, 363
globalization, and expanded judicial roles,
406
Golak Nath v. Union of India, Supreme Court of
India, 267–268
Góngora, Genaro, 147–149
amparo law reform, 148
financial independence and power to present
reform initiatives, 149
overview, 147–148
Gore, Albert, 402
governance, judicial activity in. See consequential
courts
governing elites. See regime theory
governing power, conflicts over allocation of,
11–13
11 15

```
South African Constitutional Court decision
    on 105-106
government
  challenge to power of by Supreme Court of
     India, 276–280
  enforcement of South African Constitutional
     Court decisions, 108-109
  limitation of courts by, under PRI rule in
     Mexico, 142
  need for compliance with Israeli basic laws of
     1992, 241
  responsiveness to courts, in South Africa, 112
  South African Constitutional Court decision
    on demarcation of boundaries, 105-106
  stasis and maladministration, complaints about,
government leaders. See political leaders
grandfather clause, Israeli basic laws, 241
Great Rabbinical Court, in Israel, 330
gridlock, legislative, 371-375
Griggs v Duke Power, U.S. Supreme Court,
    220-221
guarantors, courts as downstream
  overview, 49-50
  in Thailand, 58-60
guardian of coherence of national judicial system,
     Dutch Hoge Raad as, 195-196
Guarnieri, Carlo, 15
Harding, Andrew, 345
harmonization doctrine, Pakistan, 32, 319
health care law, U.S., 208
hegemonic preservation, 49-50, 374
hierarchical controls, in Italian judiciary, 177
High Court, Dutch. See Dutch Hoge Raad
High Court in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, 325
High Court, Israeli, 34
High Court, Taiwanese, 11, 57
high courts. See courts; judicial roles; specific
    courts by name
Higher Council of the Judiciary
  France, 174
  Italy, 166
high-stakes deadlocks, resolving in Ukraine's
    Orange Revolution, 78-83
hijab, as dress code for women politicians in
    Kuwait, 317-318
Hirschl, Ran, 16, 345, 374
Hisba Bill (NWFP Islamization bill), Pakistan,
     320-321
historical legacies of South African Constitutional
    Court, 95-97
HIV-positive army members, Mexican Supreme
    Court decision on, 155
```

executive-legislative conflict, 11-12

overview, 11

judicial-elected branch conflict, 12-13

national-subnational government conflict, 13



More information

424

Index

Hoge Raad, Dutch, 181-196 inconsistency of Israeli Supreme Court decisions, breaking political roadblocks, 14 changing judicial roles, 195-196 incumbents and challengers, disputes between, characterization of Dutch political system, 8-10 electoral conflicts in established democracies. 183-185 constitutional amendments of 1953, 182-183 cooperation of powers, 186-187 facilitating democratic transitions, 8-9 Council of State, 189-190 cultural and religious cleavages, 16 sparking anti-authoritarian movements, 9-10 democracy, constitutionalism and independence, as value of Dutch Hoge Raad, 194 fragmentation, 361 independence, financial, of Mexican Supreme developments since early 1990s, 188-193 Court, 149 independence, judicial facing resistance, 188 general discussion, 185-186 and constitutional judicial review, 387-389 human rights, 187-188 in France and Spain, 174 institutional leadership, 194-195 as goal of Mexican Supreme Court, 147–149 judicial leadership and judicial roles in Indian Supreme Court, 276-277 in Italy, 164-165 governance, 193-194 judicial-elected branch conflict, 13 results of colored revolutions, 68 and legal complex, 343 U.S. Supreme Court, 199-200 management of court system, 192-193 Indian Supreme Court, 262-286 organizational leadership, 193-194 activist, but selectively assertive court, 275-276 overview, 181-182 anti-authoritarian movements, 10 position of Dutch courts, 185-188 battle over basic structure doctrine, 265-270 rewriting of Civil Code, 188 battling corruption and maladministration, 15 rivalry between highest courts, 190-191 changing judicial roles, influences on, 30 hudood law, Malaysia, 323 corruption and accountability cases, 277-278 Hudood Ordinances, Pakistan, 320 development and expansion of PIL, reasons for, Huls, Nick, 14, 343 280-284 disputes about rights and equality, 18 human agency. See agency, role of in constitutional politics Emergency rule period, 269-270 Human Dignity and Liberty basic law, Israel, environmental policy, 275, 278–279 241-244, 248 expansion of PIL in post-1990 era, 276 human rights. See fundamental rights decisions, fragmentation and legislative gridlock, 374-375 Mexican Supreme Court; fundamental growth of PIL in 1980s, 273–274 Judges' Case, 272-273 rights revolution, European; rights Hungarian Constitutional Court, 1-2 judicial appointments, 276-277 Hussainara Khatoon v. State of Bihar, Supreme judicial-elected branch conflict, 12 legal complex, 340, 343 Court of India, 273-274 Marbury moment in, 355-356, 357 ideologies, democratic, 350-351 motives driving PIL, 280-281 immigration laws, Dutch Council of State's overview, 262-265 PIL and expansion of judicial role, overview of, interpretation of, 189 immunity from judicial investigations in Italy, 171 270-272 impeachment in South Korea, 52-55, 354 PIL and judicialization of governance, 284-286 In Re Interlinking Rivers Case, Indian Supreme PIL and opportunity structure for judicial Court, 280 power, 281-284 policy-making in education, human rights, and In re Special Reference No. 1 of 1998 (Third Judges' Case), Indian Supreme Court, 277, 282 affirmative action, 279-280 inaction, political, 373 procedural and interpretive creativity of, 31 incentives of courts, and changing judicial roles, strategic assertiveness of judges, 35

incomplete autocracies. See semi-authoritarian

regimes, colored revolutions in

19-22, 28-30

indigenous law, South African Constitutional

Court decisions on, 107 Indonesian Constitutional Court, 314–315



More information

Index 425

innovation, 30–32, 176. *See also* judicial strategies; religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence institution of constitutional courts, 342–343 institutional divisions in French judiciary.

institutional divisions in French judiciary, 297–301 institutional emancipation, as goal of Mexican

Supreme Court, 147–149 institutional leadership, Dutch Hoge Raad,

institutionalist motives, as driving PIL in Indian Supreme Court, 281–284

institutionalized sites of contestation, as condition enabling anti-government decisions, 70

insurance model of judicial power

in Europe, 394

as incentive to create Israeli constitution, 236 overview, 165

"Integral System for Tracking Judicial Files" database, Mexican Supreme Court, 152–153 integration. See racial equality decisions, U.S. Supreme Court

interest, Supreme Court of Pakistan rulings on, 319–320

interest groups, Mexican Supreme Court's attempts to reach out to, 153–154 interim relief by Indian Supreme Court, 273–274

inter-institutional dynamics, in Europe, 290. See also European fundamental rights revolution interlinking of rivers project, India, 280 internal diversity of French judiciary, 297–301 internal motivations

Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 126–131 French, towards fundamental rights, 297–301 international forces, and changing judicial roles, 22, 25

international law, and Dutch court system, 182–183, 193, 195–196. *See also* European fundamental rights revolution

international recognition of South African Constitutional Court, 100

International Society for Fair Elections and Democracy (ISFED), Georgia, 74–75, 76 interpretation, judicial constitutional, 386–387 Interpretation No. 261, Council of Grand Justices, Taiwan, 56

Interpretation No. 585, Council of Grand Justices, Taiwan, 57

interpretive creativity, 30–32. *See also* religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence

interpretive decentralization, in French judicial system, 300–301

interpretive judgments by Italian Constitutional Court, 166

interstate commerce, U.S. Supreme Court rulings on, 204–206

intra-court factors, and changing judicial roles, 28–30, 400

intra-governmental disputes about who governs, 11–13

executive-legislative conflict, 11–12 judicial-elected branch conflict, 12–13 national-subnational government conflict, 13 overview, 11

investigations

"Clean Hands" movement in Italy, 168–170 judicial, in France and Spain, 174–175 regarding shooting of Taiwanese president Chen, 57

Investment Managers' Committee v. Minister of Treasury, Israeli Supreme Court, 248 irrelevance of courts in democratization, 52 ISFED (International Society for Fair Elections

and Democracy), Georgia, 74–75, 76

Islamic law. See Shari'a

Islamization amendments, Pakistani constitution, 318–319

Israel, 233-258

aftermath of constitutional revolution, 254–258

constitutional judicial review in 2000's, 252-254

constitutional revolution, 244–249 judicial-elected branch conflict in, 12 lack of founding written constitution, 235–238 and legal complex, 342

overview, 233-235

piecemeal constitutional construction, 238–244 reasons for constitutional revolution, 249–251 religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence, 327–330

strategic decisions of judges, 34

Italian judicialization of politics, 163–179
battling corruption and maladministration, 15
complex relationship between courts and
politics, 170–173

democracy, constitutionalism and fragmentation, 361–362

France and Spain as control cases, 173–175 overview, 163–164

political crisis of 1990s and further expansion of judicial power, 168–170

roles, strategies and conditions of, 175–178 transformation of Italian judicial system, 164–168

Iyer, V.R. Krishna, 273, 281



More information

426 Index

jail conditions, U.S. Supreme Court decisions regarding, 214-215 Janata Party coalition, India, 270 Jewish state, Israel as, 327–330 Jewishness, Supreme Court of Israel definition of, 328-329 Joondeph, Bradley, 368 JSC (Judicial Service Commission), South Africa, 98 iudges agency of, 375-378 attitudes toward, and lack of founding written constitution in Israel, 237-238 influence on changing judicial roles, 28-30 procedural and interpretive creativity, 30-32 role conception of, 3 strategic assertiveness, 32-35 ways of expanding judical roles, 30 willingness and ability to act assertively, 5-6 Judges' Case (S.P. Gupta v. Union of India), Supreme Court of India, 35, 272-273, 355-356 Judges Remuneration and Conditions of Employment Act of 2001, South Africa, 98-99 judicial agency, 368-371, 378-379 judicial appointments in India, 272-273, 280 and regime theory, 369-370 South African Constitutional Court, 97-99 judicial constitutional review, 380-397. See also constitutional revolution, Israel of administrative decisionmaking, U.S. Supreme Court, 209-211 administrative review, 389-394 costs and benefits of, 383-384 declaring constitution unconstitutional, 386-387 of decree authority, Chile, 118-119 external pressures on French, 295-296 general discussion, 394-397 in Italy, 164 judicial independence, 387-389 normative questions, 385 overview, 380-383 proactive and reactive, 385-386 by South African Constitutional Court, 99-100 supplying and demanding, 384-385 in traditional French judicial model, 294 judicial constitution-making, Israel, 233-258 aftermath, 254-258 constitutional judicial review in 2000's, 252-254 constitutional revolution, overview, 244-249 constitutional revolution, reasons for, 249-251

lack of founding written constitution, 235-238 overview, 233-235 piecemeal constitutional construction, 238-244 Judicial Council, Spain, 174 Judicial Division of Council of State, Dutch overview, 189-190 rivalry between highest courts, 190-191 judicial independence and constitutional judicial review, 387-389 in France and Spain, 174 as goal of Mexican Supreme Court, 147-149 Indian Supreme Court, 276–277 in Italy, 164-165 results of colored revolutions, 68 U.S. Supreme Court, 199-200 judicial investigations, in France and Spain, 174-175 judicial irrelevance of courts in democratization, judicial leadership. See also leadership of Mexican Supreme Court and changing judicial roles, 19-22, 28-29, 30, and demand for constitutional judicial review, Dutch Hoge Raad, 193-194, 195-196 and Israeli constitutional revolution, 250 judicial majorities, shifts in, and changing judicial roles, 28-29 judicial power, 349-362. See also sources of judicial power, South African Constitutional Court democracy, constitutionalism and political fragmentation, 361-362 fragility and stability of, 402-409 and legitimacy, 402-404 Marbury moments, failures, 357-359 Marbury moments, successes, 354-357 margins of, South African Constitutional Court, 106-109 overview, 349-354 stickiness of judicial decisions, 359-361 judicial pragmatism, South African Constitutional Court, 101-106 certification judgments, 103-104 jurisdiction and authority, 102-103 overview, 101-102 rights and structure in court's jurisprudence, 104-106 judicial preview, by Dutch Council of State, 189 judicial process, attitudes toward and lack of founding written constitution in Israel, 227-228 judicial reform of 1994, Mexico, 139, 144



More information

Index 427

judicial remedies, using to increase fundamental rights decisions, 152-153 judicial roles, 1-37, 398-410. See also colored

revolutions; specific courts or countries; specific judicial roles

activist states and evolving legal culture, 407-409

complaints about government stasis and maladministration, 13-15

cultural and religious cleavages, 15-17 in democratization, 63-64

disputes about rights and equality, 17-18 disputes between political incumbents and challengers, 8-10

Dutch Hoge Raad, 193-194, 195-196 elusiveness of simple explanatory models, 398-402

expanded, in governance, 3-7

framework of influences on, 18-30

globalization and economic liberalism, 406

intra-governmental disputes about who governs, 11-13

judicial power, fragility and stability of, 402-404

judicial strategies, tactics, and techniques, 30-35

overview, 1-2

Public Interest Litigation and expansion of, in India, 270-280

spread of constitutional democracy, 405-406 trends in, 409–410

Judicial Service Commission (JSC), South Africa, 98

judicial strategies. See also Marbury moments Georgia's Rose Revolution, 74-78 Italian judicialization of politics, 175-178 Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83–86

overview, 73-74 Ukraine's Orange Revolution, 78–83 judicial transfers, control of by Indian central

government, 272-273 judicial transparency, Mexican Supreme Court, 150-151

judicial-elected branch conflict over allocation of governing power, 12-13

judicialization of politics, Italian, 163-179 battling corruption and maladministration, 15 complex relationship between courts and politics, 170-173

France and Spain as control cases, 173-175 general discussion, 175-178

overview, 163-164

political crisis of 1990s and further expansion of judicial power, 168-170

transformation of Italian judicial system,

juicio de amparo. See amparo writ, Mexico "junkyard dog" phenomenon, 383 jurisdiction

epistolary, Indian Supreme Court, 274 in politically salient areas, as condition enabling anti-government decisions,

South African Constitutional Court, 102-102

justices, appointment of. See judicial appointments

Kagan, Robert, 344, 366-367, 368, 371-372,

Kameshwar Singh v. State of Bihar, Patna High Court of India, 265

Kapiszewski, Diana, 366-367, 371-372

Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala, Supreme Court of India, 268-269, 355, 357

Kingdom of the Netherlands. See Dutch Hoge

Klug, Heinz, 9, 342, 356-357

Knesset, Israel

1969 Bergman exception, 239-241 constitutional revolution, 245

reaction to constitutional revolution, 249 reliance on judicial rulings, 240

Supreme Court's interpretation of statutes of, 234-235

Korea. See South Korea

Kuala Lumpur High Court, Malaysia, 325 Kuchma, Leonid, 71-72

Kuwait, religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence in, 317-318

Kyrgyzstan

conditions enabling anti-government decisions, 68 - 73

effect of social and political movements on judicial roles, 27–28

judicial framework and independence in, 69 judicial strategies and roles, 73-74 Tulip Revolution, 83-86

labor law, handling of by Dutch Hoge Raad, 186 Ladbrokes case, Dutch Hoge Raad, 191 land reform laws, Indian. See property rights, battle over in India

land rights, South African Constitutional Court decisions on indigenous, 107

Lasser, Mitchel de S.-O.-l'E, 343-344

Latifa Mat Zin case, Federal Court of Malaysia, 324



More information

428 Index

law vs. decree conflicts, Chile, 114-134 causes of TC rulings on, 126-131 constitutional boundaries of power, 116-118 constitutional review of decree authority, 118-119 evolving doctrine, 120-126 nature of executive-legislative conflict, 116-119 407-409 negotiating new roles for court, 131-134 overview, 114-116 post-2005, 132-134 lawmaking role Dutch Hoge Raad, 193-194 Indian Supreme Court, 279-280 lawyers. See legal complex roles, 22 leaders, role of courts in choosing, 45-64 adjudicating election in Taiwan, 55-58 downstream democratic consolidators, 50-51 downstream guarantors, 49-50 impeachment in South Korea, 52-55 judicial irrelevance, 52 legacies and roles, 63-64 overview, 45-47 picking and rejecting populist in Thailand, 349-362 triggering democracy in Pakistan, 60-63 upstream triggers of democracy, 47-49 leadership. See also judicial leadership institutional, Dutch Hoge Raad, 194-195 and Israeli constitutional revolution, 250 leadership of Mexican Supreme Court, 145-154 Chief Justice Genaro Góngora, 147-149 304 influence of, 140 Justice José Ramón Cossío, 149-154 Justice Juventino Castro y Castro, 146-147 overview, 145 results of, 157 371-375 leadership succession crises, role of courts in resolving, 8 Left coalition, Italy, 170-173 legacy of past government, and consolidation function of courts, 51 legal advocacy, adversarial, in U.S., 213 legitimacy legal aid movement, India, 271-272 legal complex, 337-346 agitation for constitutionalism, 341–342 consolidating and adapting constitutional courts, 343-344 defending courts, 344-345 and demand for constitutional judicial review, 384-385 general discussion, 338-341, 346 instituting constitutional court, 342-343 invitation to participate with Mexican Supreme Court, 151-152

Israeli, concept of Supreme Court, 254, 256 Mexican, during PRI era, 143 overview, 337-338 in Pakistan, mobilization of, 61 South Korea, 53 legal culture, and expanded judicial roles, legal decrees, constitutionality of in Chile, 125 legal education campaign, Mexican Supreme Court, 151-152 legal mobilization, lack of in Mexican Supreme Court under PRI rule, 143 legal powers of judiciary, and changing judicial legal reserve, Chile as absolute, 122-124 overview, 117 as relative, 124-126 legalistic role conception, 3 legality, administrative jurisprudence based on, legality and democracy, tensions between, constitutionalism and political fragmentation, Marbury moments, failures, 357-359 Marbury moments, successes, 354-357 overview, 349-354 stickiness of judicial decisions, 359-361 legality framework, European Court of Justice, legislation role Dutch Hoge Raad, 193-194 Indian Supreme Court, 279-280 legislative agency, and political fragmentation, legislative re-districting, U.S. Supreme Court decision regarding, 224-225 legislative-executive conflict, 11-12. See also executive-legislative conflict, Chile legislature, influence of constitutional judicial review on in Israel, 253 and changing judicial roles, 29, 402–404 as factor in decisions by Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 130-131 Indian Supreme Court focus on restoring, 283 Letreros Camineros I case, Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 123-124 leyes de base, Chile, 117 liberal constitutionalism, 365 liberal elites, culture wars between religious conservatives and, 225-226 liberal judges, 376-379



More information

Index 429

iiberaiism	Marbury v. Maaison case, O.S. Supreme Court,
economic, and expanded judicial roles, 406	360–361
in politics of legal complex, 338-339	"March 19 Shooting Truth-finding Commission",
liberalizing agenda, Supreme Court of Israel,	Taiwan, 57
328–330	margins of judicial power, South African
Limaye, Madhu, 282	Constitutional Court, 106–109
limitation clause, Israeli basic laws of 1992, 241	market-based economy, Israel, 242
Lina Joy case, Federal Court of Malaysia, 324	Mastella, Clemente, 163
litigants, role of in French versus European	Mate, Manoj, 15, 355–356, 367, 368, 372, 375–376
courts, 296–297	maximum legal reserve, Chile
local government boundaries, South African	as absolute, 122–124
Constitutional Court decision on, 105–106	overview, 117
Local Government Transition Act, South Africa,	as relative, 124–126
105–106	Meatrael Ltd. v. The Prime Minster, Israeli
"locus standi". See standing to sue	Supreme Court, 244–245
9	media
"lodo Alfano" statute, Italy, 163	
lower courts	attitude towards Israeli Supreme Court,
collaboration with Italian Constitutional Court,	255–256
176	importance of to PIL in India, 270–271
relation to Dutch Hoge Raad, 192	prosecutor exploitation of in Italy, 178
	role in judicial investigations in Italy, 169–170
Madhav Rao Scindia v. India, Supreme Court of	Mexican Supreme Court, 138–157
India, 267	absence of fundamental rights interpretation
Mahomed, Ismail, 97	during PRI rule, 141–143
majorities, shifts in judicial, and changing	as arena for political contestation, 154-157
judicial roles, 28–29	Chief Justice Genaro Góngora, 147–149
majority public opinion, U.S. Supreme Court	Justice José Ramón Cossío, 149–154
decisions conflicting with, 202-203	Justice Juventino Castro y Castro, 146–147
Makwanyane case, South African Constitutional	overview, 138–141
Court, 99–100	variables triggering new role of, 143–145
maladministration, complaints about	mild judicial review, Israeli Supreme Court,
government, 13–15	239–241
battling, 15	military dictatorship, Chile, constitution created
breaking political roadblocks, 14	by, 116–118
overview, 13–14	Miller v. Schoene, U.S. Supreme Court, 373
Malay ethnic group (Bumiputra), 322	Milliken v. Bradley, U.S. Supreme Court, 220
Malaysia	minorities, in U.S. See racial equality decisions,
legal complex, 345	U.S. Supreme Court
religion-taming function of constitutional	miscarriages of justice by Dutch Hoge Raad, 189
jurisprudence, 321–327	Mizhrachi Jews, 243
strategic decisions of judges in, 33	MK Oron v. Chairman of the Knesset, Israeli
Mamasaidov, Mahamadjan, 84	Supreme Court, 252
management of court system, Dutch, 192–193	mobilization
mandatory prayer and Bible readings in public	court decisions as focal points for, 47–49
schools, U.S., 202–203	legal, lack of in Mexican Supreme Court under
Mandela, Nelson, 105–106	PRI rule, 143
Manual of Style for Judicial Opinions, Mexican	moment, constitutional, 262
Supreme Court, 151	motivations
Mapp v Ohio, U.S. Supreme Court, 213	of courts, and changing judicial roles, 19–22,
Marbury moments	28–30
failures, 357–359	French, towards fundamental rights, 297–301
overview, 352–354	internal, Constitutional Tribunal of Chile,
and stickiness of judicial decisions, 359–361	126–131
successes, 354–357	Moustafa, Tamir, 4

More information

430 Index

The Movement for Quality Government in Israel v.

The Knesset, Israeli Supreme Court, 253

Musharraf, Pervez, 60–62

national administrative and regulatory state, U.S.,

abandonment of substantive review of regulatory policy, 206

endorsing administrative law-making, 206–207 federal government's taxing and spending power, 207

importance of Supreme Court, 207–209 interstate commerce as all commerce, 205–206 legitimating administrative lawmaking through federal administrative law, 209–211 overview, 204–205

National Front (Barisan Nasional, BN) coalition, Malaysia, 322

National Highway Traffic Safety Agency (NHTSA), U.S., 210

National Industrial Recovery Act, U.S., 204–205

national judicial system, Dutch Hoge Raad as guardian of coherence of, 195–196

National Labor Relations Act (NLRA), U.S., 204 National Labor Relations Board v Jones & Laughlin Steel Corporation, U.S. Supreme Court, 204

national political agenda, and lack of founding written constitution in Israel, 238

National Religious Party (NRP), Israel, 243 national-subnational government conflict over allocation of governing power, 13

nautical metaphor, to explain change in judicial roles, 19–22, 400–402

Nebbia v New York, U.S. Supreme Court, 206 neoconstitutionalism, 128

Netherlands. See Dutch Hoge Raad

"New Amparo Law Project", Mexican Supreme Court, 148

New Deal Supreme Court, U.S., 205–209 new democracies. *See also* colored revolutions;

Constitutional Tribunal, Chile; Mexican Supreme Court; politics of courts in democratization; South African Constitutional Court

and changing judicial roles, 409 disputes between political incumbe

disputes between political incumbents and challengers in, 8–10

NHTSA (National Highway Traffic Safety Agency), U.S., 210

Ninth Schedule, Indian Constitution, 266 Nixon, Richard, 402

NLRA (National Labor Relations Act), U.S., 204

non-democratic regimes. *See* authoritarian regimes; semi-authoritarian regimes, colored revolutions in

Nonet, Philippe, 408

non-Orthodox conversion to Judaism, Supreme Court of Israel rulings on, 328–329

non-secular polities, constitutional courts in. See religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence

non-state-approved religious organizations, 314–315

normal institutions, courts as, 371 North-West Frontier Province (NWFP), Pakistan, 320–321

NRP (National Religious Party), Israel, 243 NWFP Islamization bill (Hisba Bill), Pakistan, 320–321

oceanic metaphor, to explain change in judicial roles, 19–22, 400–402

Office of Contract Compliance, U.S., 222 Old Fort, South African Constitutional Court,

"one man-one vote" decisions, U.S. Supreme Court, 224–225

opposition

criticism of Supreme Court by after Georgia's Rose Revolution, 77–78

delivery of benefits to by judges, in cases of contested elections, 73–74

Orange Revolution, Ukraine

conditions enabling anti-government decisions, 68–73

courts as upstream triggers of democracy, 49 judicial strategies and roles, 73–74 overview, 78–83

procedural creativity during, 31

strategic decisions of judges during, 33 ordinary French courts, in French judicial

ordinary French courts, in French judicial system, 297–301

organizational leadership, Dutch Hoge Raad, 193–194

originalism, in Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 127–129

origins of South African Constitutional Court, 97–99

Orthodox stream of Judaism, 327 Osmonov, Kurmanbek, 85, 86 Otero Formula, 149

pacification politics, Dutch, 183–184 Pakistan changing judicial roles in, 64 legal complex in, 343



More information

Index 431

procedural creativity in, 32 policy-making role, Indian Supreme Court, religion-taming function of constitutional 279-280 jurisprudence, 318-321 political accountability, courts enforcing in Italy, triggering democracy in, 60-63 Palko v Connecticut, U.S. Supreme Court, 212 battling corruption and maladministration, 15 Pan-Malaysian Islamic Party (Parti Islam complex relationship between courts and Se-Malaysia, PAS), 321-322 politics, 170-173 parliamentarians, immunity from judicial France and Spain as control cases, 173-175 investigations in Italy, 171 overview, 163-164 parliamentary elections political crisis of 1990s and further expansion of Georgian, and Rose Revolution, 74-78 judicial power, 168–170 Kyrgyzstan, 83–86 roles, strategies and conditions of parliamentary government, 350-351 judicialization in Italy, 175-178 parliamentary sovereignty, decline of, 405 transformation of Italian judicial system, Parti Islam Se-Malaysia (Pan-Malaysian Islamic 164-168 Party), 321-322 political agency, of judges, 375-378 Partido Revolucionario Institucional (PRI), political agenda, and lack of founding written constitution in Israel, 238 Mexico, 141-143 partisanship of prosecutors in Italy, 178 political arenas and judicial roles, 7-18 party system. See also political fragmentation complaints about government stasis and in Italy, 167–168, 170–173 maladministration, 13-15 in Mexico, 140, 144–145, 147–148 cultural and religious cleavages, 15-17 PAS (Pan-Malaysian Islamic Party), 321-322 disputes about rights and equality, 17-18 passive voice, in constitutional politics, 363, disputes between political incumbents and challengers, 8-10 passivity of Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, general discussion, 399 intra-governmental disputes about who 130-131 past government, legacy of, and consolidation governs, 11-13 function of courts, 51 political characteristics of Marbury moments, patriotism, constitutional, South African 360-361 Constitutional Court, 100-101 political climate, and role of Indian Supreme PCO (Provisional Constitutional Order), Court, 264-265 Pakistan, 62 political crisis of 1990s, Italy, 168-170, 177-178 Peretti, Terri, 368 political dynamics, proximate, and changing personal-status law, in Israel, 329 judicial roles, 19-22, 25-28, 400 political economy, and lack of founding written Pickerill, Mitchell, 368 piecemeal constitutional construction, Israel, constitution in Israel, 236-237 political fragmentation 238-244 and changing judicial roles, 23-24, 405 1969 Bergman exception, 239-241 basic laws of 1992, 241-244 as condition enabling anti-government overview, 238-239 decisions, 69-70 PIL. See Public Interest Litigation, Supreme and constitutional judicial review, 394-395 Court of India constitutional politics in active voice, 371-375 pillars, in Dutch society, 183, 184 and decisions of Constitutional Tribunal of plebiscite of 1988, Chile, 128 Plessy v. Ferguson, U.S. Supreme Court, 216, 218 democracy, constitutionalism and, 361-362 Plonit ("Jane Doe") v. The Great Rabbinical and European fundamental rights revolution, Court, Supreme Court of Israel, 330 280-200 police forces in Israel, 242-244 Indian Supreme Court decisions regarding in Italy, 167-168, 170-173, 176-177, 178 and lack of founding written constitution in reform of, 279-280 influence of judiciary on in Italy, 167 Israel, 235 U.S. Supreme Court decisions affecting, as triggering changed role for Mexican

215

Supreme Court, 144-145



More information

432 Index

political incumbents and challengers, disputes between, 8-10 electoral conflicts in established democracies, 58-60 facilitating democratic transitions, 8-9 overview, 8 sparking anti-authoritarian movements, 9-10 political leaders and changing judicial roles, 25-27 courts as agents of, 3-4 empowering courts as independent political role of courts in breaking political roadblocks, political movements, effect on judicial roles, 27-28 216 political regime features, and changing judicial roles, 22 political roadblocks, breaking, 14 58-60 political status of judiciary, and changing judicial roles, 22 political system, Dutch, 183-185 of 1950s, 183-184 after 2002, 185 events of 1968, 184 political system, Israeli, 254-255 political timing, and lack of founding written constitution in Israel, 236 politically consequential courts, 1-37 complaints about government stasis and maladministration, 13-15 cultural and religious cleavages, 15-17 disputes about rights and equality, 17-18 disputes between political incumbents and challengers, 8-10 expanded judicial roles in governance, 3-7 framework of influences on changing judicial roles, 18-30 general discussion, 409-410 intra-governmental disputes about who governs, 11-13 judicial strategies, tactics, and techniques, 30-35 overview, 1-2 politically salient areas, jurisdiction in, 70-72 politics, constitutional. See constitutional politics in active voice politics, women in Kuwaiti, 317-318 politics of courts in democratization, 45-64 adjudicating election in Taiwan, 55-58 downstream democratic consolidators, 50-51 118-110 downstream guarantors, 49-50 impeachment in South Korea, 52-55 judicial irrelevance, 52

legacies and roles, 63-64 overview, 45-47 picking and rejecting populist in Thailand, triggering democracy in Pakistan, 60-63 upstream triggers of democracy, 47-49 politics of legal complex, 337-346 agitation for constitutionalism, 341-342 consolidating and adapting constitutional courts, 343-344 defending courts, 344-345 general discussion, 338–341, 346 instituting constitutional court, 342-343 overview, 337-338 Polygamy Case, Indonesian Constitutional Court, populist politics, Dutch, 183-185 populists in Thailand, picking and rejecting, Portalis, Jean-Etienne-Marie, 293 positive rights, 17 post-Apartheid South Africa. See South African Constitutional Court post-Communist colored revolutions, 67-87 conditions enabling judges to decide contested elections, 68-73 Georgia's Rose Revolution, 74-78 judicial strategies and roles, overview of, Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83–86 overview, 67-68 Ukraine's Orange Revolution, 78-83 post-liberal constitutionalism, South African Constitutional Court, 101 postponement-of-remedy tactics, 33-34 Pound Ordinance, South Africa, 107-108 poverty, Indian Supreme Court decisions regarding, 279 Powell, Lewis F., Jr., 222 power. See also judicial power; sources of judicial power, South African Constitutional Court constitutional boundaries of, Chile, 116-118 unexpected transfer of, legalizing in Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83-86 power relations, South African Constitutional Court decisions affecting, 106-108 power-distribution role, Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 114-134 causes of TC rulings, 126-131 constitutional boundaries of power, 116-118 constitutional review of decree authority, evolving law vs. decree doctrine, 120-126 nature of executive-legislative conflict, 116-119



More information

Index 433

negotiating new roles, 131-134	overview, 265–267
overview, 114–116	proponents theorists, 371-375
pragmatism, judicial, South African Constitutional Court, 101–106	proportionality doctrine, Israeli Supreme Court, 258
certification judgments, 103–104	prosecution, structure of in Italy, 166-167, 176
jurisdiction and authority, 102–103	prosecutors, in Italy, 172, 178
overview, 101–102	prospective overruling doctrine, Supreme Court
rights and structure in court's jurisprudence,	of India, 267
104–106	prosperity, effect on Dutch society, 184
pragmatism in Dutch political system, 183–185 prayer in public schools, U.S. Supreme Court	protective custody, Indian Supreme Court decision regarding, 273–274
decision regarding, 202–203	protest movement, Dutch, in 1968, 184
precedence of European law over conflicting	Provisional Constitutional Order (PCO),
national law	Pakistan, 62
general pressures caused by, 294–296	proximate political dynamics, and changing
targeted pressures caused by, 294–296	judicial roles, 19–22, 25–28, 400
President	"Przeworski moment", 47
Dutch Hoge Raad, 196	public hearings (audiencias públicas), Mexican
role in appointment of justices, South African	Supreme Court, 155
Constitutional Court, 98	Public Interest Litigation (PIL), Supreme Court
presidential decree authority, Chile, 117-118. See	of India, 262–286
also law vs. decree conflicts, Chile	activist, but selectively assertive court,
presidential elections. See elections; leaders, role	275–276
of courts in choosing; specific presidents by	battle over basic structure doctrine, 265–270
name	corruption and accountability cases, 277–278
PRI (Partido Revolucionario Institucional),	development and expansion of, reasons for,
Mexico, 141–143	280–284
primogeniture, South African Constitutional	Emergency rule period, 269–270
Court decisions on, 107	environmental policy, 275, 278–279
prison conditions, U.S. Supreme Court decisions	expansion of in post-1990 era, 276
regarding, 214–215	and expansion of judicial role, overview of,
prisoners, undertrial, Indian Supreme Court	270–272
decision regarding, 273–274	growth of in 1980s, 273–274
prisons in Israel, private, 253	Judges' Case, 272–273
privatization in Israel, 253	judicial appointments, 276–277
proactive constitutional judicial review, 385–386	judicial-elected branch conflict, 12
procedural creativity, 30–32. See also judicial	and judicialization of governance, 284–286
strategies procedural litigation, 296–297	motives driving, 280–281 and opportunity structure for judicial power,
Prodi, Romano, 163	281–284
progressive leadership, Mexican Supreme Court,	overview, 262–265
145–154	policy-making in education, human rights, and
Chief Justice Genaro Góngora, 147–149	affirmative action, 279–280
influence of, 140	public officials, investigation of in Italy,
Justice José Ramón Cossío, 149–154	168–170
Justice Juventino Castro y Castro, 146–147	public opinion, effect on judicial roles, 27–28
overview, 145	public prosecution, structure of in Italy, 166–167,
results of, 157	176
Property Relations between Spouses Law, Israel,	public schools, mandatory prayer and Bible
330	readings in U.S., 202–203
property rights, battle over in India, 265-270	P.U.C.L. v. Union of India, Indian Supreme
Golak Nath v. Union of India, 267–268	Court, 279
Kesavananda Bharati v. State of Kerala,	punishments, U.S. Supreme Court decisions
268–269	regarding, 214–215



More information

434

Raad van State (Council of State), Dutch overview, 189-190 rivalry between highest courts, 190-191 rabbinical court system, Israel, 329-330 racial equality decisions, U.S. Supreme Court, affirmative action, 221-223 Brown v Board of Education, 217-219 busing-for-balance, 220 Griggs v Duke Power, 220-221 overview, 216-217 racial segregation, in U.S., 14 radical religion, containment of. See religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence rational-basis review for economic policy issues, in India, 275 R.C. Cooper v. Union of India, Supreme Court of India, 267 reactive constitutional judicial review, 385-386 "reapportionment decisions", U.S. Supreme Court, 224–225 reasoned deference, as strategy of Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 131 re-districting, legislative, U.S. Supreme Court decision regarding, 224-225 reform initiatives, Mexican Supreme Court's power to present, 149 reform of 1994 in Mexico, judicial, 139, 144 Regents of the University of California v. Bakke, U.S. Supreme Court, 222 regime change. See colored revolutions; democratization, politics of courts in regime features, and changing judicial roles, 22 regime theory constitutional politics in active voice, 368-371

overview, 199–200 U.S. Supreme Court, 226–227 Regional Municipality Gazza Beach v. Knesset, Israeli Supreme Court, 252 regulatory state. See national administrative and

Indian Supreme Court, 276, 280

regulatory state, U.S. Reichman, Amnon, 367

religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence, 311–333

effect of social and political movements on judicial roles, 27

Egypt, 315–317 general discussion, 313–315, 330–333 and interpretive creativity, 32 Israel, 327–330 Kuwait, 317–318

Malaysia, 321–327

Index

overview, 16, 311–313
Pakistan, 318–321
religious and cultural cleavages, role of courts in resolving, 15–17
religious conservatives, culture wars between liberal elites and, 225–226
religious courts in Israel, 329–330
Religious Courts Law, Indonesian, 314–315
religious references, indecision regarding whether to include in Israeli constitution, 235

to include in Israeli constitution, 235 remedies, enforcement of by South African Constitutional Court, 108–109

A Republic of Statutes: The New American Constitution, 389–390 republicanism, French, 292–294

resistance

facing Dutch Hoge Raad, 188 to judicial role expansion, in nautical metaphor, 21, 400 responsive law, 408–409

Restricción a Catalíticos Rol 325 case, Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 125–126,

review, constitutional judicial. See constitutional judicial review

review of decree authority, Chile, 118–119 revolutions. See colored revolutions; constitutional revolution, Israel; European fundamental rights revolution rewriting of Civil Code, Dutch, 188

riba (usury), Supreme Court of Pakistan rulings on, 319–320

Richtersveld case, South African Constitutional Court, 107

rigged elections. See contested elections, role of courts in deciding

Right coalition, Italy, 170–173 right to counsel, in U.S., 213

Right to Information (RTI) cases, Indian Supreme Court, 278

rights. See also fundamental rights decisions, Mexican Supreme Court, fundamental rights revolution, European and administrative review, 391–392 basic laws dealing with, Israel, 241–244

cases involving, South African Constitutional
Court, 106–109
and constitutional judicial review, 306

in Dutch Hoge Raad, 187–188 Fundamental Rights Program, Mexican Supreme Court, 149–153 historical legacy of South African Constitutional Court, 96–97



More information

Index 435

in jurisprudence of South African	general discussion, 313–315, 330–333
Constitutional Court, 104–106	and interpretive creativity, 32
position of Constitutional Tribunal of Chile,	Israel, 327–330
125–126	Kuwait, 317–318
positive, 17	Malaysia, 321–327
protection of by Israeli Supreme Court,	overview, 16, 311–313
234–235, 252–254, 256–258	Pakistan, 318–321 segregation, racial, in U.S., 14. See also racial
role of courts in resolving disputes about, 17–18 triumph of in South African Constitutional	equality decisions, U.S. Supreme Court
	selection process, judicial, 369–370
Court, 99–100 rights consciousness campaign, Mexican	self government, in democracies, 350–351
Supreme Court, 153–154	self-restraint, by courts, 24
R.K. Garg v. Union of India, Indian Supreme	Selznick, Philip, 408
Court, 275	semi-authoritarian regimes, colored revolutions
roadblocks, breaking political, 14	in, 67–87
Roberts, Owen, 205	conditions enabling judges to decide contested
Roe v. Wade, U.S. Supreme Court, 224	elections, 68–73
Roh Moo-hyun, impeachment of, 53–55, 354	Georgia's Rose Revolution, 74–78
role conception, of judges, 3	judicial strategies and roles, overview of,
Roosevelt, Franklin D., 205, 217, 402-403	73-74
Rose Revolution, Georgia	Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83-86
conditions enabling anti-government decisions,	overview, 67–68
68–73	Ukraine's Orange Revolution, 78-83
judicial strategies and roles, 73-74	separation of powers
Marbury moments in, 359	and constitutional judicial review, 395
overview, 74–78	Dutch Council of State, 189–190
RTI (Right to Information) cases, Indian	as necessary condition for judicial review, 382
Supreme Court, 278	separation of powers conflicts, Chile, 114–134
rule of law. See judicial independence	causes of law vs. decree rulings, 126–131
runoff election, Ukraine, 83	constitutional boundaries of power, 116–118
Carlandarili Mildaril6 -0	constitutional review of decree authority,
Saakashvili, Mikheil, 75–76, 78	118–119
sacred law. See religion-taming function of	evolving law vs. decree doctrine, 120–126
constitutional jurisprudence Sankari Prasad v. Union of India, Indian Supreme	nature of executive-legislative conflict, 116–119
Court, 266	negotiating new roles for court, 131–134 overview, 114–116
SCC (Supreme Constitutional Court), Egypt,	post-2005 law vs. decree cases, 132–134
315–317, 344	sequence of rulings, strategic, 34
Schechter Poultry Corp v. United States, U.S.	Seventeenth Amendment, Indian Constitution,
Supreme Court, 204–205, 206, 355	266–267
schools, mandatory prayer and Bible readings in	sexual harassment, Indian Supreme Court
U.S., 202–203	decisions regarding, 279
SCI (Supreme Court of Israel), 328–330	Shapiro, Martin, 3–4
"Scottsboro Boys" case, U.S. Supreme Court, 212	Shari'a (Islamic law)
SCP (Supreme Court of Pakistan), 60-63, 318-321	in Egypt, 315–317
Scribner, Druscilla L., 372	in Kuwait, 317–318
Second Judges' Case (Supreme Court	in Malaysia, 321–327
Advocates-on-Record Ass'n v. Union of India),	in Pakistan, 318–321
Indian Supreme Court, 276–277, 282	as source of legislation, 312
secularism, promotion of by constitutional courts,	Shari'at Appellate Bench, Supreme Court of
311–333	Pakistan, 319–320
effect of social and political movements on	Sharif, Nawaz, 61
judicial roles, 27	Shas party, Israel, 243
Egypt, 315–317	Shevardnadze, Eduard, 71, 75–76



More information

436 Index

shifting values and preferences, influence on changing judicial roles, 28-29 Shinawatra, Thaksin, 58-60 shooting of Taiwanese president, reaction of courts to, 56-58 short-term political dynamics, in nautical metaphor, 400 SIDA case, France, 174 Sikri, S.M., 268 Silverstein, Gordon, 366–367, 371–372 Singh, Manmohan, 284 Snijders, Wouter, 188 social movements, effect on judicial roles, 27-28 social-egalitarian policy values, as driving PIL in Indian Supreme Court, 280-281 socialist political economy, Israel, 236-237 societal participation in Mexican Supreme Court decisions, 154-156 socio-political judicial roles, 3-6 soft judicial review by Israeli Supreme Court, 239-241 sources of judicial power, South African Constitutional Court, 95-101 early decisions and triumph of rights, 99-100 historical legacies, 95-97 international recognition, 100 Old Fort and constitutional patriotism, 100-101 origins of court and appointment of justices, overview, 95 power of court, 101 South African Constitutional Court, 93-112 composition of, 98-99 disputes about rights and equality, 17-18 facilitation of democratic transitions by, 9 history of, 94-95 judicial agency, 377 and legal complex, 342 Marbury moment in, 356-357 overview, 93-95 rights, politics and margins of judicial power, sources of judicial power, 95-101 strategic decisions of judges, 33-34 strategic engagement and judicial pragmatism, 101-106 Zondi case, 17 South Korea changing judicial roles in, 63-64 Constitutional Court in, 9 legal complex, 341 Marbury moment in, 354

sovereigntist traditions, 350-351 S.P. Gupta v. Union of India (Judges' Case), Supreme Court of India, 35, 272-273, 355-356 Spain, as control case for Italian judicialization of politics, 173-175 Special Bearer Bonds (Immunities and Exemptions) Ordinance Act, India, 275 spending power, U.S. federal government, 207 stability of judicial power, 402-409 activist states and evolving legal culture, globalization and economic liberalism, 406 overview, 402-404 spread of constitutional democracy, 405-406 standing to sue ("locus standi") U.S. Supreme Court decisions expanding, 200-210 widening of by Indian Supreme Court, 272-274, 285 stasis, complaints about government, 13-15 battling corruption and maladministration, 15 breaking political roadblocks, 14 overview, 13-14 state correctional systems, U.S. Supreme Court decisions regarding, 214-215 state law, in Malaysia, 322-323 statutory review, 389-394 Steward Machine v Davis, U.S. Supreme Court, stickiness of judicial decisions, 359-361 Stone, Harlan Fiske, 373 Stone Sweet, Alec, 285 strategic assertiveness, of judges, 32-35 strategic court, Supreme Court of India as, 272-273 strategic engagement, South African Constitutional Court, 101-106 certification judgments, 103-104 jurisdiction and authority, 102-103 overview, 101-102 rights and structure in court's jurisprudence, 104-106 strategies, judicial. See also Marbury moments Georgia's Rose Revolution, 74-78 Italian judicialization of politics, 175-178 Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83–86 overview, 73-74 Ukraine's Orange Revolution, 78-83 strike, handling of by Dutch Hoge Raad, 186 strong version of regime theory, 368-369 structural divisions in French judiciary, 297-301

structural factors, and changing judicial roles,

19-25, 399, 400-401

politics of courts in democratization, 52-55

strategic decisions of judges in, 32-33



More information

Index 437

structural method of interpretation, Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 127-129 254-258 structure, in jurisprudence of South African Constitutional Court, 104-106 252-254 Subashini case, Federal Court of Malaysia, 244-249 subnational-national government conflict, 13 substantive review of regulatory policy, 235-238 abandonment of in U.S., 206 successful constitutional judicial review, necessary conditions for. See constitutional judicial review succession crises, role of courts in resolving, 8 Sundaravej, Samak, 60 supra-national forces, and changing judicial roles, Supreme Constitutional Court (SCC), Egypt, 315-317, 344 Supreme Court Advocates-on-Record Ass'n v. Union of India (Second Judges' Case), Indian Supreme Court, 276-277, 282 Supreme Court, Georgian, 75–76, 77–78 Supreme Court, Indian, 262-286 activist, but selectively assertive court, 275-276 anti-authoritarian movements, 10 battle over basic structure doctrine, 265-270 battling corruption and maladministration, 15 changing judicial roles, influences on, 30 corruption and accountability cases, 277-278 development and expansion of PIL, reasons for, 280-284 disputes about rights and equality, 18 Emergency rule period, 269-270 environmental policy, 275, 278-279 expansion of PIL in post-1990 era, 276 fragmentation and legislative gridlock, 374-375 growth of PIL in 1980s, 273-274 Judges' Case, 272-273 judicial appointments, 276–277 judicial-elected branch conflict, 12 legal complex, 340, 343 Marbury moment in, 355-356, 357 motives driving PIL, 280-281 overview, 262-265 223-226 PIL and expansion of judicial role, overview of, PIL and judicialization of governance, 284-286 Taiwan PIL and opportunity structure for judicial power, 281-284 policy-making in education, human rights, and affirmative action, 279-280 procedural and interpretive creativity of, 31

aftermath of constitutional revolution, constitutional judicial review in 2000's, constitutional revolution, overview of, lack of founding written constitution, overview, 233-235 piecemeal constitutional construction, 238-244 reasons for constitutional revolution, 249-251 Supreme Court, Kyrgyzstani, 72, 85, 86 Supreme Court, Mexican, 138-157 absence of fundamental rights interpretation during PRI rule, 141-143 as arena for political contestation, 154-157 Chief Justice Genaro Góngora, 147-149 Justice José Ramón Cossío, 149-154 Justice Juventino Castro y Castro, 146-147 overview, 138-141 variables triggering new role of, 143-145 Supreme Court of Israel (SCI), 328-330 Supreme Court of Pakistan (SCP), 60-63, 318-321 Supreme Court, Ukrainian, 31, 33, 71-72, 79-83 Supreme Court, U.S., 199-227 breaking political roadblocks, 14 criminal due process, changes in, 211-216 cultural and religious cleavages, 16-17 electoral conflicts, resolution of, 10 influence of decisions by, 202-204 judicial agency, 376-377 and legal complex, 344 legitimacy, 402-403 legitimating national administrative and regulatory state, 204-211 Marbury moments in, 355, 357-358 Marbury v. Madison case, 360-361 national-subnational government conflict, 13 overview, 199-202 procedural and interpretive creativity of, 31 racial equality, decisions involving, 216-223 strategic decisions of judges, 33 unintended consequences of decisions, Syariah courts, Malaysia, 323-326 adjudicating election in, 11, 55-58 procedural creativity in, 32 Tajikistan, restriction of religion in, 314 targeted external pressures, on French judicial system, 296-297 taxing power, U.S. federal government, 207

TC. See Tribunal Constitucional, Chile

strategic assertiveness of judges, 35 Supreme Court, Israeli, 233–258

More information

438 Index

Thailand changing judicial roles in, 63, 64 Marbury moment in, 354 politics of courts in democratization, 58-60 theocracy, constitutional. See religion-taming function of constitutional jurisprudence Third Judges' Case (In re Special Reference No. 1 of 1998), Indian Supreme Court, 277, 282 Thirty-Ninth Amendment, Indian Constitution, timing, political, and lack of founding written constitution in Israel, 236 T.N. Godavarman v. Union of India, Indian Supreme Court, 279 Tocqueville, Alexis de, 1 tolerance, zone of, 396 Total Justice, 407–408 trade unions, handling of by Dutch Hoge Raad, training, judicial, and regime theory, 370 transfer of power, legalizing in Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83-86 transfers, judicial, control of by Indian central government, 272–273 transformative constitutionalism, South African Constitutional Court, 101 transition to democracy. See politics of courts in democratization transitional justice, 8-9. See also Constitutional Tribunal, Chile transparency, Mexican Supreme Court, 143, 150-151 trials, accusatorial, in Italy, 172 Tribunal Calificador de Elecciones case, Constitutional Tribunal of Chile, 128 Tribunal Constitucional (TC), Chile, 114-134 causes of law vs. decree rulings, 126-131 constitutional boundaries of power, 116-118 constitutional review of decree authority, evolving law vs. decree doctrine, 120-126 executive-legislative battles, 11-12 history of, 116 judicial irrelevance, 52 and legal complex, 342 Marbury moment in, 357 nature of executive-legislative conflict, 116-119 negotiating new roles, 131-134 overview, 114-116 post-2005 law vs. decree cases, 132-134 triggers of democracy, courts as

Trochev, Alexei, 27-28, 359, 374 Trop v Dulles, U.S. Supreme Court, 214 Truman, Harry S., 217-218 Truth Commission Act, Taiwan, 57 Tulip Revolution, Kyrgyzstan conditions enabling anti-government decisions, 68-73 judicial strategies and roles, 73-74 overview, 83-86 Twenty Point Programme, India, 271 Twenty-Fifth Amendment, Indian Constitution, 268 Twenty-Fourth Amendment, Indian Constitution, 268 Twenty-Ninth Amendment, Indian Constitution, 268 two-tier hierarchy of Shari'a norms, Egyptian SCC, 315-317 Tzemach v. Minister of Defence, Israeli Supreme Court, 248 Ukraine conditions enabling anti-government decisions, courts as upstream triggers of democracy, 49 judicial framework and independence in, 69 judicial strategies and roles, 73–74 Orange Revolution, 78-83 procedural creativity, 31 strategic decisions of judges, 33 unconstitutionality of constitution, 386-387 undertrial prisoners, Indian Supreme Court decision regarding, 273-274 unexpected transfer of power, legalizing in Kyrgyzstan's Tulip Revolution, 83-86 unintended consequences of U.S. Supreme Court decisions, 223-226 abortion, 224 "culture wars", 225-226 legislative re-districting, 224-225 overview, 201–202, 223–224 unions, handling of by Dutch Hoge Raad, 186 United Kingdom, Israel's severing of legal ties with, 250 United Malay National Organization (UNMO), 322 United Nations (U.N.) commitment to as incentive to create Israeli constitution, 236 UN Treaty on civil and political rights, 187 United States v. Butler, U.S. Supreme Court, 207 upstream triggers of democracy, courts as overview, 47-49

sparking anti-authoritarian movements, 9-10

overview, 47–49 in Pakistan, 60–63



More information

Index 439

in Pakistan, 60-63 sparking anti-authoritarian movements, 9-10 U.S. constitutional law, 389-390 U.S. Department of Transportation, 210 U.S. Supreme Court, 199-227 breaking political roadblocks, 14 criminal due process, changes in, 211-216 cultural and religious cleavages, 16-17 electoral conflicts, resolution of, 10 influence of decisions by, 202-204 judicial agency, 376-377 and legal complex, 344 legitimacy, 402-403 legitimating national administrative and regulatory state, 204-211 Marbury moments in, 355, 357-358 Marbury v. Madison case, 360-361 national-subnational government conflict, 13 overview, 199-202 procedural and interpretive creativity of, 31 racial equality, decisions involving, 216-223 strategic decisions of judges, 33 unintended consequences of decisions, 222-226 usury (riba), Supreme Court of Pakistan rulings on, 319-320

Valenzuela, Eugenio, 128–129
values of Dutch Hoge Raad, 194–195
Verma, J.S., 276–277
Vietnam, restriction of religion in, 314
Vineet Narain v. Union of India, Indian Supreme
Court, 277–278
Vishaka v. State of Rajasthan, Indian Supreme
Court, 279
vote fraud, exposing in Georgia's Rose
Revolution, 74–78

voting. See contested elections, role of courts in deciding; elections

Warren, Earl, 211–216 Weber v. Kaiser Aluminum & Chemical Co, U.S. Supreme Court, 221–222 welfare state, Dutch, 184 West Bank, Israel, 252-253 West Coast Hotel v Parrish, U.S. Supreme Court, Western Cape case, South African Constitutional Court, 33-34, 105-106, 356-357 white flight, 220 white supremacy. See racial equality decisions, U.S. Supreme Court Whiting, Amanda, 345 Wickard v Filburn, U.S. Supreme Court, 205-206 Winterwerp case, ECHR, 187 Witt, John Fabian, 205 women as judges in Egypt, 316-317 Kuwaiti Constitutional Court decisions regarding, 317-318 writ of inapplicability for unconstitutionality, Chile, 118-119

Yanukovych, Viktor, 78–79, 82 Yarema, Anatoly, 79 Yushchenko, Viktor, 78–82, 83

writ of protection, Chile, 119

Zaki Tun Azmi, 326–327 Zedillo, Ernesto, 144 Zondi case, South African Constitutional Court, 17, 107–108 zone of tolerance, 396