

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02639-1 - The Anthropology of Intentions: Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Anthropology of Intentions

How and to what extent do people take into account the intentions of others?

Alessandro Duranti sets out to answer this question, showing that the role of intentions in human interaction is variable across cultures and contexts.

Through careful analysis of data collected over three decades in US and Pacific societies, Duranti demonstrates that, in some communities, social actors avoid intentional discourse, focusing on the consequences of actions rather than on their alleged original goals. In other cases, he argues, people do speculate about their own intentions or guess the intentions of others, including in some societies where it was previously assumed they avoid doing so. To account for such variation, Duranti proposes an “intentional continuum,” a concept that draws from phenomenology and the detailed analysis of face-to-face interaction.

A combination of new essays and classic re-evaluations, the book draws together findings from anthropology, linguistics, and philosophy to offer a penetrating account of the role of intentions in defining human action.

ALESSANDRO DURANTI is Distinguished Professor of Anthropology at the University of California, Los Angeles.

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02639-1 - The Anthropology of Intentions: Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02639-1 - The Anthropology of Intentions: Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

The Anthropology of Intentions

Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02639-1 - The Anthropology of Intentions: Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti

Frontmatter

[More information](#)



University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107652033

© Alessandro Duranti 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Duranti, Alessandro.

The anthropology of intentions : language in a world of others / Alessandro Duranti.

pages cm

ISBN 978-1-107-02639-1 (Hardback) – ISBN 978-1-107-65203-3 (Paperback)

1. Anthropological linguistics. 2. Language and culture. 3. Intention. I. Title.

P35.D857 2014

306.44'089–dc23 2014023513

ISBN 978-1-107-02639-1 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-65203-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of figures</i>	<i>page</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		xi
1 Rethinking anti-intentionalism	1	
1.0 Introduction	1	
1.1 Reopening a dialogue that never took off	2	
1.2 Self and other	5	
1.3 Ethnopragmatics	6	
1.4 Themes, issues, and intellectual connections	7	
1.5 Title and expectations	8	
2 Intentions in speaking and acting: the Standard Theory and its foes	11	
2.0 Introduction	11	
2.1 The Standard Theory: Grice, Austin, and Searle	11	
2.1.1 The speech act of promising	12	
2.1.2 Searle's five types of speech acts and the notion of "direction of fit"	14	
2.1.3 Searle's model of intentionality	16	
2.1.4 Searle's notions of Network and Background: capturing implicit cultural knowledge	17	
2.2 The role of intention in defining "action"	19	
2.2.1 Unintended consequences and the practical engagement with the world	20	
2.3 Michelle Rosaldo's critique of speech act theory	22	
2.4 Brentano's and Husserl's use of intentions	25	
2.5 Criticism of Husserl's use of intentionality as the foundation of meaning-making	27	
2.5.1 Husserl's "passive synthesis" and "streaming living present" in the unpublished manuscripts	29	
2.6 A different theorist of speech as action: Ludwig Wittgenstein	30	
2.7 The meaning of <i>intention</i> and <i>intending</i>	31	
2.7.1 Translating <i>intention</i> : an exercise in Samoan ethnopragmatics	33	
2.8 Not giving up on intentions	38	
2.9 Alternative "western" ways	40	
3 The avoidance of intentional discourse: a Samoan case study	43	
3.0 Introduction	43	
3.1 Avoidance of making explicit intentions and motivations	44	
3.1.1 The 1978–79 project: Samoan language acquisition and socialization	45	
3.1.2 The Laboratory of Comparative Human Cognition: neo-Vygotskian perspectives	46	

3.2	A brief introduction to the Samoan <i>fono</i> as a speech event and a social drama	48
3.3	Unintended consequences: Loa's case, April 7, 1979	51
3.3.1	Loa's defense	60
3.3.2	The relevance of positional roles	62
3.4	Absolute liability, cultural preference, and empirical evidence	63
3.4.1	Causes, reasons, and sources	64
3.5	Conclusions	67
4	The invention of promising in the Samoan translation of the Bible	69
4.0	Is promising a human universal?	69
4.0.1	<i>Promise</i> and <i>promising</i> in English	71
4.1	The invention of promising	72
4.1.1	Searching for promising in Samoan texts and dictionaries	75
4.2	Samoan translation of English <i>promise</i> in dictionaries	77
4.3	Challenges in the translation of the Bible into Samoan	80
4.3.1	Translations for the Christian notions of "soul" and "spirit"	84
4.4	Translations of <i>promise</i> in the Bible	88
4.4.1	Differences between translations of <i>promise</i> in the Old and New Testaments	90
4.5	Promises in non-Christian Samoan texts	92
4.6	The case of the word <i>māvaega</i>	95
4.7	Promises, oaths, and public announcements	96
4.8	Conclusions	98
5	Intentionality and truth, revisited	101
5.0	Introduction	101
5.0.1	Anthropological thinking and writing	101
5.1	Truth as correspondence between the mind and the world	104
5.2	Intentionality as a relation between the mind and the world	107
5.3	The reconstructionist model of interpretation	107
5.4	Some problems with goals, plans, and intentions-to-do	109
5.5	Code-related limits on speaker's intentions	111
5.5.1	An example of how a genre constrains what a speaker can say	114
5.5.2	Audience co-participation in shaping intentions	118
5.5.3	Culture-specific constraints on introspection and responsibility	120
5.5.4	Multiplicity of goals	121
5.6	Problems with the truth-functional model	123
5.6.1	Truth and turn-taking	125
5.7	Truth and affect	128
5.8	Truth and metacommunication	130
5.9	Truth and action	131
5.10	Conclusions	133
6	Speaker intentions and the role of the audience in a political campaign in the US	135
6.1	The discovery of what we mean	135
6.2	The Capps-for-Congress Campaign	137
6.3	When the audience has a different take	137
6.3.1	Controlling unintended humor	138
6.3.2	Can one attack without "being mean"?	144
6.4	Conclusions	148

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02639-1 - The Anthropology of Intentions: Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Contents

vii

7 A dialogue on intentions	151
WITH TEUN A. VAN DIJK AND T. JASON THROOP	
7.0 Introduction	151
7.1 November 1, 2004: from van Dijk to Duranti	151
7.2 November 2, 2004: from Duranti to van Dijk	152
7.3 November 2, 2004: from van Dijk to Duranti	154
7.4 November 8, 2004: from Duranti to van Dijk	158
7.5 November 9, 2004: from van Dijk to Duranti	163
7.6 November 16, 2004: from Throop to Duranti (and van Dijk)	167
7.7 November 16, 2004: from van Dijk to Throop and Duranti	171
7.8 Conclusions	173
8 Opacity of other minds: local theories revisited	175
8.0 Introduction	175
8.1 Levels of argumentation	176
8.2 Opacity of other minds as a problem	179
8.3 Contextual variation and inconsistencies in the ethnographic accounts	179
8.4 Examining spontaneous interaction	180
9 Intentions and their modifications: a lesson from Husserl	187
9.0 Introduction	187
9.1 Husserl's intentionality and the relationship with the modification of attention	187
9.2 Phenomenal modifications: the constitution of linguistic acts	188
9.3 Intentional modifications	189
9.3.1 Instigating intentional modifications in jazz students	192
9.4 The "natural attitude"	197
9.5 The "theoretical attitude"	198
9.5.1 The theoretical attitude in talk to and by children	201
9.6 Modifications and their role in socialization	206
10 A sense of the other: from intentionality to intersubjectivity	209
10.0 Introduction	209
10.1 Beyond individual intentions in human action	210
10.2 Searle's notion of "collective intentionality"	212
10.2.1 The "Background" and the "Horizon"	215
10.2.2 People in the park	217
10.2.3 The paradox of collective action: more planning, less pro-social behavior	218
10.3 Socially distributed cognition and extended minds	219
10.4 Following rules	221
10.5 Spontaneity and improvisation	222
10.5.1 Naturalizing intentions	223
10.5.2 Embodied intentions: jazz improvisation	223
10.6 Husserl's theory of perception as anticipation of the viewing of an Other	228
10.7 Our everyday understanding of others	230
10.8 Conclusions	231
11 The intentional continuum	233
11.0 Introduction	233
11.1 The meaning of intentions and their uses	233
11.1.1 Matching theory with some ethnographic and linguistic data	235
11.2 The "intentional continuum"	238

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02639-1 - The Anthropology of Intentions: Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

viii Contents

11.3 Hypo-cognition of intentions and hyper-cognition of perlocutionary effects	240
11.4 The performance of interdependence	241
11.5 Individuals, social coordination, and social control	242
<i>Appendix A: Transcription conventions for English examples</i>	243
<i>Appendix B: Transcription conventions and abbreviations used in the Samoan examples</i>	245
<i>Notes</i>	248
<i>References</i>	267
<i>Index</i>	293

Figures

2.1 The same Subject (A) can be directed toward the same Object (G) through two different intentional acts: looking and worrying.	page 26
3.1 Orators (on the left) and a chief (on the right) during a <i>fono</i> (photo by A. Duranti, Falefā, `Upolu, Western Samoa, 1988)	49
3.2 Map of section of Anoama`a East where Falefā is located, in the Atua district, of which Lufilufi is considered the capital and historical center (adapted from Krämer 1902: 704–705)	52
3.3 Three types of <i>fono</i> in Falefā, each defined by the number of participating subvillages (from Duranti 1981a: 40)	54
4.1 Title page of 1887 edition of the <i>Tusi Paia</i> , the Samoan translation of the Bible, a collaborative effort by George Pratt, Henry Nisbet, and others	83
5.1 Truth as correspondence between mind and world	105
5.2 Interpretation as correspondence between a proposition and a state-of-affairs	105
5.3 Two possible relations between a proposition and the state-of-affairs it describes	107
5.4 The same Subject (A) can be directed toward the same Object (G) through different intentional acts, e.g., admiration, fear	108
6.1 Walter Capps speaking to a group of supporters in Paso Robles, California, November 15, 1995, saying “How do I know that?”	139
6.2 Walter Capps speaking in San Luis Obispo, November 15, 1995, saying “How do we know we’re gonna win?”	141
6.3 Walter Capps speaking at Hancock College, Santa Maria, November 15, 1995, saying “I think the reason we’re gonna win . . .”	143
6.4 Walter Capps speaking on the campus of the University of California, Santa Barbara, November 15, 1995, saying “this super-charged political rhetoric that . . .”	149
9.1 The same Subject (A) is directed toward the same Object (G) at time t1 in the intentional act of admiration and at time t2 in the intentional act of fear	191

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02639-1 - The Anthropology of Intentions: Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

x	List of figures	
9.2	The rabbit-duck figure discussed in Wittgenstein (1958: 194)	191
9.3	George Bohannon (on the right) interacting with the students in his Jazz Combo	
	Class on February 10, 2003, saying “Hearing what J. J. has played on his tune”	194
9.4	While listening to the song “Cain and Abel” with his students, on April 23, 2003, Sherman Ferguson points out that the drummer in the recording, Jeff “Tain” Watts, is “interactive with [the other players]”	195
9.5	While driving, Walter Capps turns slightly to the left to look at the side of the road	200
10.1	Dr. Bobby Rodriguez, trumpet player, conductor and instructor, demonstrates with left hand and left foot how to keep time while playing	227

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02639-1 - The Anthropology of Intentions: Language in a World of Others

Alessandro Duranti

Frontmatter

[More information](#)

Acknowledgments

First, among my intellectual partners, comes Elinor Ochs. The few papers we co-authored do not do justice to the many ways in which our work is intertwined and interdependent. Whether or not we are aware of it, we keep thinking-with and thinking-along one another even when we do not talk about what we are reading or writing, which is rare. Our life journey together has always been rich in discoveries and rewarding in surprises.

On most Saturday mornings I go on a bike ride along the beach with my friend Chuck Goodwin. We always stop at the same café in Venice and discuss as many topics as we can fit within an hour or so, including the just observed intentionality and intersubjectivity of bikers and pedestrians on the bike path. I am very grateful to Chuck for his interactive listening and generous intellect.

Over the last few years I have been fortunate to teach with Jason Throop with whom I share a love for philosophy. Our seminar on intersubjectivity has allowed us to read or reread some of our favorite authors and discuss them with anthropology students whose questions and comments keep us honest in our interpretations and speculations.

My interest in creativity and collaboration, two topics that intersect with intentionality and deserve a book of their own, has been nourished by my interactions with Kenny Burrell, the Director of the UCLA Jazz Program and legendary guitar master, and with all the other extraordinary musicians who have come to make music and talk about it in the course “The Culture of Jazz Aesthetics” that Kenny and I have taught four times since 2002.

I have also greatly benefited from sitting in two of John McCumber’s courses at UCLA. The exposure to his deep knowledge of European continental philosophy has enriched my understanding of the roots of some of the problems I have been writing about, some of which I discuss in this book.

The transcripts of the Samoan recordings are the product of many collaborations across time and space, starting in Samoa in 1978–1979 and continuing over the years in Samoa (in 1981, 1988, 1999, 2000) as well as in the US. Most recently, I have relied on email to ask for help and advice from my friend Rev. Fa`atau`ola Mauala and his two daughters Oikoumeni and Rossana, who have been most generous with their time and their insights. Ultimately,

xii Acknowledgments

however, the Samoan utterances and their translations that you will find in this book are my responsibility. I have done my best to be faithful to what people said and how they have said it in the recordings. And I have tried to incorporate as much as possible of the cultural glosses that the people of Falefā or Samoans in the US offered while listening to the recordings with me or on their own. But any linguistic token is always open to yet another interpretation and I am sure that even more variants from those I heard are possible in both the transcription and the translation offered in this book. Since all of the original data presented here are now digitized as either audio or video files, it might be possible for others in the future to continue where I have left off in the interpretive process.

The project on the successful 1995–1996 political campaign of Walter Capps (1934–1997) was made possible by the collaborative support of his extended family and members of his campaign staff. More specific acknowledgments are found in Chapter 6.

I am very thankful to Rachel George, who read with care and a critical spirit several drafts of each chapter, always asking challenging questions while helping me make my style as accessible as possible. I also benefited tremendously from comments on earlier drafts of one or more chapters by Ken Cook, Anna Corwin, Hadi Deeb, and Dan Zahavi. Alice Mandell and Josiah Chappel carefully inspected the original biblical texts in Hebrew and Greek respectively to help me understand certain lexical choices made by the missionaries in translating the Old and New Testament into Samoan. The staff at the Mitchell Library, New South Wales, helped me identify and let me have full access to the original letters and other manuscripts by George Pratt, Henry Nisbet, and other missionaries who went to Samoa in the eighteenth century and wrote in their journals or to one another about their Bible translation work.

Many other people have contributed to this book by making me aware of issues and different perspectives. Among them I am particularly grateful to Don Brenneis, Penny Brown, Mike Cole, Aurora Donzelli, Steve Feld, Bill Hanks, Larry Hyman, Marco Iacoboni, Elizabeth Keating, Steve Levinson, Marcyliena Morgan, Sherry Ortner, Mariella Pandolfi, Justin Richland, Joel Robbins, Alan Rumsey, Manny Schegloff, Bambi Schieffelin, Bradd Shore, Teun van Dijk, and Scott Waugh. A special recognition goes to two very original thinkers and fearless intellectual explorers who are, together with their mother, my dearest supporters: David Ochs Keenan and Marco Leonard Ochs Duranti.

Finally, I am grateful to the staff members in the office of the deans of the UCLA College of Letters and Science whose help in running the division of social sciences has made it possible for me to continue to be engaged in my own research and writing over the last five years.

This book is dedicated to the memory of my parents, Rossana Biccheri and Ivio Duranti, who supported me in every enterprise, including my intellectual pursuits, always with unconditional love and visible signs of appreciation.