

## PROMOTING THE RULE OF LAW IN POST-CONFLICT STATES

In most post-conflict states, a strong level of legal pluralism is the norm, particularly in regions of Africa and Asia where between 80 and 90 per cent of disputes are resolved through non-state legal mechanisms. The international community, in particular the United Nations, persistently drives the re-establishment of the rule of law in war-torn areas where, traditionally, customary law is prevalent. Laura Grenfell traces the international community's evolving understanding of the rule of law in such regions, and explores the implications of strong legal pluralism for the rule-of-law enterprise. Using the comparative examples of two unique case studies, South Africa and Timor-Leste, *Promoting the Rule of Law* provides insight into the relationship between the rule of law and legal pluralism. Alongside these studies, the book offers a comprehensive introduction to the conceptual framework of the rule of law in the context of approaches taken by the international community.

LAURA GRENFELL is a senior lecturer in law at the University of Adelaide, Australia, where she teaches transitional justice, human rights, comparative constitutional law and public law.





## PROMOTING THE RULE OF LAW IN POST-CONFLICT STATES

LAURA GRENFELL





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

 $www. cambridge. org \\ Information on this title: www. cambridge. org/9781107026193$ 

© Laura Grenfell 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed and bound in the United Kingdom by the MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Grenfell, Laura, 1974– Promoting the rule of law in post-conflict states / Laura Grenfell.

> p. cm. Includes bibliographical references. ISBN 978-1-107-02619-3 (Hardback)

1. Rule of law. 2. Legal polycentricity. 3. Postwar reconstruction. I. Title.

K3171.G76 2013 340'.11-dc23 2012044905

ISBN 978-1-107-02619-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Acknowledgments

## CONTENTS

vi

	PART I 1
1	Introduction 3
2	A globalised view of the rule of law and legal pluralism 14
3	The conceptual relationship between legal pluralism and the rule of law in post-conflict states 59
	PART II 91
4	'One law for one nation': how the rule of law and legal pluralism figure in South Africa's constitutional dispensation 93
5	Can the rule of law and legal pluralism assist 'the most vulnerable groups' in South Africa? 130
	PART III 181
6	Founding a legal system in post-conflict Timor-Leste 183
7	Timor-Leste's first decade of independence 214
8	Conclusion 265
	Bibliography 274 Index 316



## **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

The genesis of this book lies in my time at Human Rights Watch in September 2001 when I was first inspired to consider the position of Afghan women in attempting to gain access to justice under the complex web of legal systems operating in Afghanistan. This led me to research how other post-conflict, transitional states are promoting the rule of law where there is a situation of strong legal pluralism.

Since that time I have had the privilege of having the doctoral supervision of Professor Hilary Charlesworth at the Regulatory Institutions Network's Centre for International Governance and Justice at the Australian National University and engaging with other members of that Centre, including Professor John Braithwaite, Dr Jeremy Farrall, Dr Gabrielle Simm, Dr Susan Harris Rimmer, Dr Bu Wilson, Aderito Soares and many others. I would also like to thank Professor Kim Rubenstein and Anthony Regan from the Australian National University for their assistance.

During my research in South Africa I gained much from engaging with members of the Faculty of Law at the University of Cape Town, particularly Professors Tom Bennett, Christina Murray, Chuma Himonga, Hugh Corder and Rashida Manjoo. For my research on Timor-Leste I am grateful to those NGOs and UN staff who have given me their valuable time, in particular the staff at the JSMP, The Asia Foundation, Fokupers, Avocats Sans Frontières, and UNDP, as well as the global community of scholars on Timor-Leste.

I would also like to thank my colleagues at the Adelaide Law School. In particular I thank Professors Judith Gardam, Ngaire Naffine and John Williams as well as Margaret Castles, Anne Hewitt and Cornelia Koch. I also thank Bethany Hender and Trang Phan for their editing assistance. I am grateful for the financial support of the Fay Gale Centre for Research on Gender at the University of Adelaide. Thanks also to Professors Martin Krygier and Ann Stewart for their insights in reading an earlier version of this book and to the anonymous reviewers.

Finally I would like to thank my family, particularly Brendan Grigg and Katarina Grenfell, for all their support.