

Disasters and the American State

Disasters and the American State offers a thesis about the trajectory of federal government involvement in preparing for disaster, shaped by contingent events. Politicians and bureaucrats claim credit for the government's successes in preparing for and responding to disaster, and they are also blamed for failures outside of government's control. New interventions have created precedents and established organizations and administrative cultures that accumulated over time and produced a general trend in which citizens, politicians, and bureaucrats expect the government to provide more security from more kinds of disasters. The trend reached its peak when the Federal Emergency Management Agency adopted the idea of preparing for "all hazards" as its mantra. Despite the rhetoric, however, the federal government's increasingly bold claims and heightened public expectations are disproportionate to the ability of the federal government to prevent or reduce the damage caused by disaster.

Patrick S. Roberts is an associate professor in the Center for Public Administration and Policy (CPAP) in the School of Public and International Affairs at Virginia Polytechnic and State University (Virginia Tech). He is the associate chair and program director for CPAP, Northern Virginia. Roberts holds a PhD in government from the University of Virginia and spent two years as a postdoctoral Fellow, one at the Center for International Security and Cooperation at Stanford University and one at the Program on Constitutional Government at Harvard University. He spent 2010-2011 as the Ghaemian Scholar-in-Residence at the University of Heidelberg Center for American Studies in Germany. He has also been a reporter for the Associated Press. Roberts's work has been published in a variety of scholarly and popular journals including Studies in American Political Development, Public Administration Review, Journal of Policy History, Political Science Quarterly, Publius, Presidential Studies Quarterly, Administration & Society, Public Organization Review, National Affairs, Policy Review, American Interest, and USA Today. His research has been funded by the National Science Foundation, the United States Naval Laboratories, the Federal Emergency Management Agency, and the Social Science Research Council.





Disasters and the American State

How Politicians, Bureaucrats, and the Public Prepare for the Unexpected

PATRICK S. ROBERTS

Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University





Cambridge UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107025868

© Patrick S. Roberts 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Roberts, Patrick S., 1975-

Disasters and the American state: how politicians, bureaucrats, and the public prepare for the unexpected / Patrick S. Roberts, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University. pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02586-8 (hardback)

1. Disaster relief – Government policy – United States. 2. Emergency management – Government policy - United States. 3. Civil defense - United States. I. Title.

HV555.U6R625 2013

363.34'70973-dc23 2013000570

ISBN 978-1-107-02586-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of Figures Acknowledgments		page vi
2.	The Origins of the Disaster State, 1789–1914	16
3.	Civil Defense and the Foundations of Disaster Policy, 1914–1979	41
4.	The Rise of Emergency Management and FEMA, 1979–2001	70
5.	Terrorism and the Creation of the Department of Homeland	
6.	Security, 1993–2003 "Where the Hell Is the Army?": Hurricane Katrina Meets the	113
	Homeland Security Era	127
7.	Administrative Evil and Elite Panic in Disaster Management	146
8.	Government's Increasing Role in Disaster Management	174
Bibliography		195
Index		215



Figures

2.1.	Selected major U.S. natural disasters from 1755 to 1920	<i>page</i> 18
3.1.	Organization of federal disaster functions, 1950–2010	51
3.2.	Civil defense appropriations from 1952 to 1982	60
4.1.	Major disaster declarations from 1953 to 2007	76
4.2.	Presidential disaster spending by year from 1953 to 2008	77
4.3.	Presidential disaster declarations by year from 1950 to 2009	77
4.4.	Presidential disaster declarations by type from 1953 to 2009	78
4.5.	Percentage of declaration requests turned down between 1953 and 2009, by administration	79
4.6.	Tone of major newspaper editorials' coverage of FEMA from 1982 to 2008	89
4.7.	Major professional emergency management associations and their founding dates	93
4.8.	Growth of emergency management higher education programs from 1983 to 2004	95
4.9.	Federal Emergency Management Agency administrators	98
4.10.	Interview summary	99
8.1.	Population growth in major U.S. cities from 1870 to 1990	183
8.2.	Billion-dollar disaster losses from 1980 to 2009	184
8.3.	Natural-disaster-related deaths from 1920 to 2009	185
8.4.	Major Atlantic hurricane damages from 1900 to 1995	186

vi



Acknowledgments

Long before social media shout-outs, the acknowledgments section of a book was the place to publicly recognize friends and colleagues who have been enormously helpful, and this section is no exception. My interest in the federal government's expanding role in disaster management began while I was a graduate student at the University of Virginia, writing a dissertation under the guidance of James Ceaser, Sidney Milkis, Eric Patashnik, and Edmund Russell. My interest in disasters and security organizations deepened during a formative year as a postdoctoral Fellow at Stanford University's Center for International Security and Cooperation, under the guidance of Scott Sagan, Lynn Eden, and Charles Perrow, and with the encouragement of my fellow CISAC Fellows. I began writing this manuscript during my year as a Fellow in the Program on Constitutional Government at Harvard University under the supervision of Harvey C. Mansfield, Jr., and Shep Melnick. I appreciate their gracious hospitality, and I also benefited from the spirited criticism of Paul Peterson and the government department's American Politics workshop. Steve Kelman kindly allowed me to observe his course on public management, which challenged some of my notions about the civil service.

I completed the bulk of the manuscript during a memorable year as the Ghaemian Scholar in Residence at the Heidelberg Center for American Studies at the University of Heidelberg in Germany. I am grateful to the faculty and staff including Manfred Berg, Mischa Honeck, Dorothea Fischer-Hornung, Detlef Junker, Günter Leypoldt, Wilfried Mausbach, Dietmar Schloss, Anja Schüler, and Martin Thunert for making the HCA a shining example of what a scholarly community can be. Many other staff members, students, and friends made my stay both enjoyable and productive. Not least, I thank the HCA's dedicated benefactors, including Soheyl Ghaemian, for providing support for a year of research, writing, and transatlantic exploration.

vii



viii

Acknowledgments

I have accrued many debts to the faculty, staff, and students at Virginia Tech, which has been my home since graduate school. The Center for Public Administration and Policy and the School of Public and International Affairs have been stimulating communities for research and teaching. My colleagues Brian Cook, Matt Dull, Laura Jensen, Gerry Kearns, Anne Khademian, and John Rohr commented on parts of the manuscript.

Notions and arguments that found their way into this manuscript have been presented at conferences and invited talks on two continents. My arguments benefited from comments and criticism at meetings of the American Political Science Association, the Midwest Political Science Association, the Western Political Science Association, the Policy History Conference, and the Academy of Management. Over the past few years, I presented my research on disaster and security organizations at the University of Heidelberg; the Peace Research Institute Frankfurt; the Congressional Research Service; the City University of New York Graduate Center; Grand Valley State University; Harvard University; Boston College; Virginia Tech's Blacksburg and Alexandria campuses; the Annual Natural Hazards Research and Applications Workshop organized by the University of Colorado, Boulder's, Natural Hazards Center; the FEMA Emergency Management Institute; and the Transatlantic Dialog at Bocconi University organized by the American and European public administration societies. The dynamic community of disaster researchers across social science, natural science, and engineering fields encouraged me to go beyond the confines of my own discipline. The Next Generation of Hazards and Disasters Researchers Fellowship, sponsored by the National Science Foundation, was particularly helpful – and challenging – and I owe thanks to my mentor there, Tom Birkland.

A number of people read and commented on parts of the manuscript in its earliest stages. Among those who were generous in receiving my ideas, taking them seriously, and steering me in the right direction or at least away from the most wrong directions are: Ben Bateman, Tom Birkland, Wayne Blanchard, Dan Carpenter, Andrew Coffey, Don Critchlow, Bill Cumming, Gareth Davies, Daniel DiSalvo, Lynn Eden, Saunji Fyffe, Holly Goerdel, Laura Helper-Ferris, Ruth Homrighaus, Kevin Kosar, Marc Landy, Eli Lehrer, Jerry Passannante, Charles Perrow, Claire Rubin, Andrew Schlewitz, Susan Sterett, Paul Stockton, Rick Sylves, Karen Till, and Gary Wamsely. Parts of chapter 7 appear in the article "Discrimination in a Disaster Agency's Security Culture," in the May 2013 (45:4) issue of *Administration & Society*.

At the final stages of the manuscript's development, a number of friends, colleagues, and critics were generous enough with their time to read the manuscript and point out sections where I could buff and polish sentences and in a few cases refinish chapters. Jaimy Alex, Frank Blazich, Robert Cole, Alexander Hamilton, Elvin Lim, Andrew Novak, Barry Pump, Vikram Raghavan, Rob Saldin, Anim Sampong, Travis St. Clair, and Kris Wernstedt deserve special thanks for this task. Meaghan Dee and the FourDesign team transformed my rudimentary figures into informational graphic art.



Acknowledgments ix

At Cambridge University Press, Lew Bateman's patient stewardship of the manuscript was vital to ensuring its publication. Lew and the reviewers and editors at Cambridge have been a pleasure to work with. Throughout the project and during several household moves, I benefited from the support, encouragement, and sometimes gentle prodding of my family, my mom, dad, grandmother, Donna, Ann, and Stuart. I would like to thank everyone mentioned immensely.