

DELIBERATIVE SYSTEMS

Deliberative democracy' is often dismissed as a set of small-scale, academic experiments. This volume seeks to demonstrate how the deliberative ideal can work as a theory of democracy on a larger scale. It provides a new way of thinking about democratic engagement across the spectrum of political action, from towns and villages to nation states, and from local networks to transnational, even global systems. Written by a team of the world's leading deliberative theorists, *Deliberative Systems* explains the principles of this new approach, which seeks ways of ensuring that a division of deliberative labour in a system nonetheless meets both deliberative and democratic norms. Rather than simply elaborating the theory, the contributors examine the problems of implementation in a real world of competing norms, competing institutions, and competing powerful interests. This pioneering book will inspire an exciting new phase of deliberative research, both theoretical and empirical.

JOHN PARKINSON is Associate Professor of Public Policy in the Department of Politics and International Studies at the University of Warwick.

JANE MANSBRIDGE is Adams Professor of Political Leadership and Democratic Values in the John F. Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University.



THEORIES OF INSTITUTIONAL DESIGN

Series Editor Robert E. Goodin Research School of Social Sciences Australian National University

Advisory Editors

Russell Hardin, Carole Pateman, Barry Weingast, Claus Offe, Susan Rose-Ackerman, Keith Dowding, Jeremy Waldron

Social scientists have rediscovered institutions. They have been increasingly concerned with the myriad ways in which social and political institutions shape the patterns of individual interactions which produce social phenomena. They are equally concerned with the ways in which those institutions emerge from such interactions.

This series is devoted to the exploration of the more normative aspects of these issues. What makes one set of institutions better than another? How, if at all, might we move from the less desirable set of institutions to a more desirable set? Alongside the questions of what institutions we would design, if we were designing them afresh, are pragmatic questions of how we can best get from here to there: from our present institutions to new revitalized ones.

Theories of institutional design is insistently multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary, both in the institutions on which it focuses, and in the methodologies used to study them. There are interesting sociological questions to be asked about legal institutions, interesting legal questions to be asked about economic institutions, and interesting social, economic, and legal questions to be asked about political institutions. By juxtaposing these approaches in print, this series aims to enrich normative discourse surrounding important issues of designing and redesigning, shaping and reshaping the social, political, and economic institutions of contemporary society.

Other books in the series

Brent Fisse and John Braithwaite, Corporations, Crime and Accountability

Robert E. Goodin (editor), The Theory of Institutional Design

Itai Sened, The Political Institution of Private Property

Mark Bovens, The Quest for Responsibility: Accountability and Citizenship in Complex Organisations

Bo Rothstein, Just Institutions Matter: The Moral and Political Logic of the Universal Welfare State

Jon Elster, Claus Offe, and Ulrich K. Preuss, Institutional Design in Post-Communist Societies: Rebuilding the Ship at Sea

Adrienne Héritier, Policy-Making and Diversity in Europe: Escape from Deadlock

Geoffrey Brennan and Alan Hamlin, Democratic Devices and Desires

Eric M. Patashnik, Putting Trust in the US Budget: Federal Trust Funds and the Politics of Commitment

Benjamin Reilly, Democracy in Divided Societies: Electoral Engineering for Conflict Management

John S. Dryzek and Leslie Templeman Holmes, Post-Communist Democratization:
Political Discourses Across Thirteen Countries



Huib Pellikaan and Robert J. van der Veen, Environmental Dilemmas and Policy Design

Maarten A. Hajer and Hendrik Wagenaar (editors), Deliberative Policy Analysis: Understanding Governance in the Network Society

Jürg Steiner, André Bächtiger, Markus Spörndli, and Marco R. Steenbergen, Deliberative Politics in Action: Analyzing Parliamentary Discourse

Bo Rothstein, Social Traps and the Problem of Trust

Jonathan G. S. Koppell, The Politics of Quasi-Government: Hybrid Organizations and the Dynamics of Bureaucratic Control

Mark E. Warren and Hilary Pearse (editors), Designing Deliberative Democracy: The British Columbia Citizens' Assembly

Graham Smith, Democratic Innovations: Designing Institutions for Citizen Participation

Keith Dowding and Peter John, Exits, Voices and Social Investment: Citizens' Reaction to Public Services





DELIBERATIVE SYSTEMS

Deliberative Democracy at the Large Scale

Edited by

JOHN PARKINSON

Associate Professor of Public Policy, University of Warwick

JANE MANSBRIDGE

Adams Professor of Political Leadership and Democratic Values, John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107025394

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Deliberative systems: deliberative democracy at the large scale /
[edited by] John Parkinson, Jane Mansbridge.
p. cm. – (Theories of institutional design)
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-02539-4
1. Deliberative democracy. I. Parkinson, John, 1966– II. Mansbridge, Jane J. JC423.D3897 2012
321.8-dc23
2012013676

ISBN 978-1-107-02539-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of contributors Preface		page viii
Pr	ejace	ix
1	A systemic approach to deliberative democracy JANE MANSBRIDGE, JAMES BOHMAN, SIMONE CHAMBERS, THOMAS CHRISTIANO, ARCHON FUNG, JOHN PARKINSON, DENNIS F. THOMPSON, AND MARK E. WARREN	1
2	Rational deliberation among experts and citizens THOMAS CHRISTIANO	27
3	Deliberation and mass democracy SIMONE CHAMBERS	52
4	Representation in the deliberative system JAMES BOHMAN	72
5	Two trust-based uses of minipublics in democratic systems michael K. Mackenzie and Mark E. Warren	95
6	On the embeddedness of deliberative systems: why elitist innovations matter more YANNIS PAPADOPOULOS	125
7	Democratizing deliberative systems JOHN PARKINSON	151
References Index		173 188
		vii



Contributors

James Bohman, Danforth Professor of Philosophy and Professor of International Studies, Saint Louis University

Simone Chambers, Professor of Political Science, University of Toronto

Thomas Christiano, Professor of Philosophy and Law, University of Arizona

Archon Fung, Ford Foundation Professor of Democracy and Citizenship, John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University

Michael K. MacKenzie, Doctoral Candidate in Political Science, University of British Columbia

Jane Mansbridge, Adams Professor, John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University

Yannis Papadopoulos, Professor of Public Policy at the Institut d'Etudes Politiques et Internationales, University of Lausanne

John Parkinson, Associate Professor of Public Policy, Department of Politics and International Studies, University of Warwick

Dennis F. Thompson, Alfred North Whitehead Professor of Political Philosophy, Harvard University

Mark E. Warren, Professor of Political Science and Harold and Dorrie Merilees Chair in the Study of Democracy, University of British Columbia

viii



Preface

This volume began at a conference called *Democracy and the Deliberative Society*, held at the King's Manor, University of York, in June 2009. Supported by grants from the British Academy, and the University of York's Research Priming and Distinguished Visitors Funds, the plan was to bring together a mix of political theorists, philosophers, public policy scholars, empirical political scientists, and practitioners to explore an emerging 'macro' emphasis in deliberative democracy: the idea that deliberative democracy is as much a theory about how democratic societies work at the large scale as a set of blueprints for the design of relatively small-scale institutions.

In the event, it was one of those conferences that academics dream of. The atmosphere was one of intellectual generosity, fun, and goodwill, and that was due not only to the commitment of the invited participants but to an active, spirited audience as well. The sun shone, the debates were lively, friendships were made, and the conversation flowed.

We therefore want to begin by thanking everyone who made the York conference such a success, especially Matthew Festenstein who was one of the instigators along with John Parkinson, and Alex Bavister-Gould who conducted a literature review that gave the project a strong foundation. Behind the scenes Tom Flynn contributed both intellectually and organizationally. That everything eventually went so smoothly was largely due to the cheerful unflappability of Judith Pink.

The paper givers were superb, and while this particular volume has focused on a selection of the most theoretical papers, we want to acknowledge the important contributions made by other colleagues both during the conference and afterwards. Those others, who could not participate in this volume for a variety of reasons, include John Dryzek, Sophie

ix



X PREFACE

Duchesne, Florence Haegel, Maarten Hajer, Mathias Koenig-Archibugi, Christian List, Aletta Norval, Graham Smith, and Wytske Versteeg.

Following the conference, ideas for a book germinated for a while, until finally a proposal went to Cambridge University Press. Bob Goodin, Series Editor, was extremely generous with time and criticism, and the eventual shape of the volume and the substance of the chapters owes much to his care and attention. We also thank the anonymous referees whose comments proved invaluable in the sometimes extensive redrafting process. Some chapters are completely new, but all are much revised and much stronger as a result. John Haslam has been a supportive and enthusiastic Commissioning Editor throughout.

In between first submission and final acceptance of the proposal, a second weekend conference was held at Harvard University in December 2010 to deepen the opening theoretical statement. We thank the Ash Center for Democratic Innovation at the Kennedy School of Government for hosting and sponsoring the workshop, Bruce Jackman for administrative support, and Hollie Russon Gilman and Adriane Gelpi for assistance during the meetings. Most of the contributors to that conference have become co-authors of the introduction, and we thank them all for their enthusiastic participation. We are also grateful to David Estlund for his phone-in contributions to the first session.

Finally, we would like to thank very much those others who have helped with long discussions or quick observations over the last two years, including Selen Armityan, André Bächtiger, John Dryzek, Andrew Knops, Gerry Mackie, Simon Niemeyer, Espen Olsen, and Stefan Rummens.

So, a cast of thousands (well, dozens), in several forums over two years: a deliberative system in action.

John Parkinson and Jane Mansbridge

I would also like to thank Jane Mansbridge for all that she has done on this project. She gave generously of her time to graduate students in York, did interviews, organized the Harvard conference, and steered the collaborative writing of the introduction, all through some very busy times. It would not have come together as it has without you, Jenny. Thank you.

John Parkinson