

THE EXTERNAL ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

This collection of essays comprehensively and systematically analyses the various instruments and innovative approaches through which the EU is forging its external environmental policy, and the legal implications of its multifaceted practice on international environmental law. It explains the legal and institutional framework for EU external action in relation to the environment and sustainable development, identifying the changes introduced and challenges posed by the Lisbon Treaty. It explores key tools and approaches in defining and implementing EU external environmental policy with regard to a broad range of environmental issues, as well as linkages with trade and human rights. It also assesses the reciprocal influences between the development and operation of EU environmental law and of international environmental law.

ELISA MORGERA is a lecturer in European Environmental Law and Director of the Master's Programme in Global Environment and Climate Change Law at the University of Edinburgh School of Law. She has published extensively about EU and international law on biodiversity, environmental governance and corporate environmental accountability.





THE EXTERNAL ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

EU and International Law Perspectives

Edited by ELISA MORGERA





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107023826

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed and bound in the United Kingdom by the MPG Books Group

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

The external environmental policy of the European Union: EU and international law perspectives / edited by Elisa Morgera.

pages cm
Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-02382-6

Environmental law – European Union countries.
 Environmental policy – European Union countries.
 Environmental law, International.
 Morgera, Elisa, editor of compilation.

KJE6242.E98 2012 333.7094-dc23 2012011811

ISBN 978-1-107-02382-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



A Riccardo, senza tante parole





CONTENTS

List of contributors page x
Acknowledgements xii
Table of treaties xiii
List of abbreviations xviii

Introduction
ELISA MORGERA

- The EU Legal and Institutional Framework after
 Lisbon
 9
- 1 The formalities and substance of EU external environmental competence: stuck between climate change and competitiveness 11
 HANS VEDDER
- 2 Coherence and EU external environmental policy 33

 MARISE CREMONA
- The post-Lisbon institutions and EU external environmental policy 55

 CHAD DAMRO
- The EU's representation in multilateral environmental negotiations after Lisbon 76

 MATTHIAS BUCK
- 5 A Member State's perspective on the post-Lisbon framework for the EU's representation in multilateral environmental negotiations 96

 JOLYON THOMSON

vii



viii	CONTENTS

II Insights into EU Practice 113

- 6 Climate change in EU external relations: please follow my example (or I might force you to) 115

 KATI KULOVESI
- EU external action on forests: FLEGT and the development of international law 149
 ANNALISA SAVARESI
- 8 Environmental integration in EU trade policy: the Generalised System of Preferences, trade Sustainability Impact Assessments and Free Trade Agreements 174

 BOK ŽVELC
- 9 Environmental integration in EU development cooperation: responding to international commitments or its own policy priorities? 204

GRACIA MARÍN DURÁN

10 The trajectory of EU biodiversity cooperation: supporting environmental multilateralism through EU external action 235

ELISA MORGERA

The EU and International Environmental Law 261

- 11 The human rights dimension of environmental protection in EU external relations after Lisbon 263
 - DANIEL AUGENSTEIN
- 12 The EU and the compliance mechanisms of multilateral environmental agreements: the case of the Aarhus Convention 287

 ANTONING ALI
- Joint responsibility between the EU and Member States for non-performance of obligations under multilateral environmental agreements 304

ANDRÉ NOLLKAEMPER



CONTENTS

ix

14 Controversial aspects of the interaction between international and EU law in environmental matters: direct effect and Member States' unilateral measures 347

RICCARDO PAVONI

Conclusions 378

ELISA MORGERA

Bibliography 384 Index 402



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

PROF. ANTONINO ALI is Professor of International Law at the Faculty of Law and Director of the Master's Degree in European and International Studies at the School of International Studies of the University of Trento, Italy.

DR. DANIEL AUGENSTEIN is Assistant Professor of Legal Philosophy at Tilburg University, The Netherlands.

MR. MATTHIAS BUCK works at the Multilateral Environmental Agreements, Processes and Trade Issues Unit of DG Environment, European Commission.

PROF. MARISE CREMONA is Professor of European Law, Head of the Law Department and Co-director of the Academy of European Law at the European University Institute, Florence, Italy.

DR. CHAD DAMRO is Senior Lecturer in Politics and International Relations at the School of Social and Political Science, and Co-director of the Europa Institute, University of Edinburgh, UK.

DR. KATI KULOVESI is Adjunct Professor in Climate Law at the Law Department of the University of Eastern Finland.

DR. GRACIA MARÍN DURÁN is Lecturer in International Economic Law and Director of the LLM Programme in International Economic Law at the University of Edinburgh School of Law, UK.

DR. ELISA MORGERA is Lecturer in European Environmental Law and Director of the Master's Programme in Global Environment and Climate Change Law at the University of Edinburgh School of Law, UK.



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

xi

PROF. ANDRÉ NOLLKAEMPER is Professor of Public International Law and Director of the Amsterdam Center for International Law at the Faculty of Law of the University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands.

PROF. RICCARDO PAVONI is Professor of International Law at the Faculty of Law of the University of Siena, Italy.

MS. ANNALISA SAVARESI is PhD Fellow at the Faculty of Law, University of Copenhagen, Denmark.

MR. JOLYON THOMSON OBE is a Senior Lawyer in the International and EU legal team, UK Department for Environment Food and Rural Affairs.

PROF. HANS VEDDER is Professor in European and Economic Law and Co-director of the Groningen Centre for Energy Law, Faculty of Law of the University of Groningen, The Netherlands.

MR. ROK ŽVELC works at the Multilateral Environmental Agreements, Processes and Trade Issues Unit of DG Environment, European Commission



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book came about thanks to the encouragement and support I received from Douglas Brodie, Drew Scott, Chad Damro, Alan Boyle and Niamh Nic Shuibhne at the University of Edinburgh School of Law in organising a workshop on 4–5 February 2011 on the environmental dimensions of the EU's external relations after Lisbon. The workshop was hosted by the Europa Institute, and brought together academics specialising in international and EU law, practitioners from the European Commission and the UK government, and PhD and LLM students. It was funded by the Jean Monnet Centre for Excellence of the Europa Institute, the UN Environment Programme-funded project on Environment and Human Rights (hosted by the Scottish Centre of International Law) and the Edinburgh University School of Law. Shirley Fraser provided excellent support in preparing the workshop.

I am greatly indebted to Gracia Marín Durán, who first introduced me to the legal complexities of EU external relations, greatly contributed to the inception and development of this project and continues to generously share her views on EU law, and to Marise Cremona for her invaluable suggestions on the conception of the workshop and this collection. In addition, I am also very thankful to Kati Kulovesi and Annalisa Savaresi who provided comments and suggestions on different parts of the book, and to all the workshop speakers that enthusiastically participated in this project. I further gratefully acknowledge the financial support provided by the Christie Law Fellowship (awarded to me in 2009/2010) and the excellent and good-humoured editorial assistance of Louisa Parks and Riccardo Beltrame.

Finally, my deepest gratitude and affection to my family and friends who continue to encourage me in work, and distract me from it, in perfect proportion.

Elisa Morgera

xii



TABLE OF TREATIES

International treaties

1944	Convention on International Civil Aviation 143, 327		
1946	International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling 111		
1950	Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 263–4, 333–4		
1966	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 272		
1969	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties 100, 328–9		
1969	International Convention on Civil Liability for Oil Pollution Damage 304		
1971	Ramsar Convention on Wetlands of International Importance 237, 249		
1971	UN Convention on International Liability for Damage Caused by Space Objects (Outer Space Liability Convention) 308, 319		
1972	Convention for the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (World Heritage Convention) 237		
1973	International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships (MARPOL Convention) 353–6, 363, 365		
1973			
1974			
1976	Convention for the Protection of the Mediterranean Sea against		
	Pollution (revised in Barcelona in 1995 as the Convention for		
	the Protection of the Marine Environment and the Coastal		
	Region of the Mediterranean) 352		
1979	Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild		
	Animals (CMS) 180, 237		



xiv	TABLE OF TREATIES	
1979	Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution 41, 104	
1981	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights 267–9	
1982	UN Convention on the Law of the Sea (UNCLOS) 305, 308, 315–18, 325, 329–30, 335, 337, 351, 354–5, 363, 372, 375, 377	
1986	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties between States and International Organizations or between International Organizations 328	
1987	Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer (Montreal Protocol) 119, 142, 179–82, 321, 341	
1989	Basel Convention on the Control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and their Disposal (Basel Convention) 50, 85, 102, 179–82, 216, 219, 229, 264, 363	
1991	Convention on Environmental Impact Assessment in a Transboundary Context 264	
1992	Convention on Biological Diversity (CBD) 107, 151, 167, 179, 182, 205, 218, 221, 223, 229, 241–5, 247–51, 257, 321, 350–1, 355	
1992	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) 24–6, 69, 106, 115, 118–48, 157–67, 173, 180–1, 183, 219, 221, 227, 229, 244, 257, 321	
1992	North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) 195	
1993	North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation 193	
1993	Council of Europe Convention on Civil Liability for Damage resulting from Activities Dangerous to the Environment 275	
1994	Convention to Combat Desertification in Countries Experiencing Serious Drought and/or Desertification, Particularly in Africa (UNCCD) 218, 221, 229, 244	
1994	Energy Charter Treaty 330	
1994	International Tropical Timber Agreement (ITTA 1994) 151	
1996	International Convention on Liability and Compensation for Damage in Connection with the Carriage of Hazardous and Noxious Substances by Sea 305	
1997	Kyoto Protocol to the UNFCCC (Kyoto Protocol) 18, 25–8, 116–35, 141–7, 158, 180–2, 227, 321, 326, 328, 337, 340, 343	
1998	Rotterdam Convention on Prior Informed Consent for Certain Hazardous Chemicals and Pesticides (Rotterdam Convention) 46–53, 85, 180, 197, 216, 219, 229	
1998	Protocol to the Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution on Persistent Organic Pollutants (Aarhus Protocol) 41, 340	



TABLE OF TREATIES

ΧV

- 1998 Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters (Aarhus Convention) 6, 155, 227, 264, 271, 287–303, 330, 340, 356–60, 363, 376, 382
- 1998 Council of Europe Convention on the Protection of the Environment through Criminal Law 275
- 1999 Protocol to the 1979 Convention on Long-range Transboundary
 Air Pollution to Abate Acidification, Eutrophication and
 Ground-Level Ozone 340
- 1999 Basel Protocol on Liability and Compensation for Damage Resulting from Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes and their Disposal 305
- 2000 Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety (Cartagena Protocol)
- 2001 International Convention on Civil Liability for Bunker Oil Pollution Damage 305
- 2001 International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture (ITPGR) 273
- 2001 Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants (Stockholm Convention) 20, 41–5, 52–3, 109, 179, 181–3, 216, 219, 229, 251, 374–5
- 2006 International Tropical Timber Agreement (ITTA 2006) 151
- Nagoya Protocol on Access to Genetic Resources and the Fair and Equitable Sharing of Benefits Arising from their Utilization to the Convention on Biological Diversity (Nagoya Protocol)
 93, 107–8, 243–8, 256, 350

EU treaties

Treaty establishing the European Economic Community (TEEC), 294 UNTS 17 361

Treaty establishing the European Community [2006] OJ C321E/1 (TEC) 15, 36, 90, 99, 207, 296, 361

Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) and Treaty on the European Union (TEU) [2010] OJ C83/1 (jointly referred to as the Lisbon Treaty)

Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union [2010] OJ C83/389 (EU Charter) 116, 263-4, 285, 360



xvi

TABLE OF TREATIES

EU agreements

Partnership and Cooperation Agreement between the EC and their Member States, of the one part, and the Republic of Armenia, of the other part, [1999] OJ L239/3 (EU-Armenia PCA) 342

Partnership and Cooperation Agreement between the EC and their Member States, of the one part, and Georgia, of the other part, [1999] OJ L205/3 (EU-Georgia PCA) 252

Agreement on Trade, Development and Cooperation between the European Community and its Member States, of the one part, and the Republic of South Africa, of the other part, [1999] OJ L311/3 (EU–South Africa Agreement) 252, 341

Partnership Agreement between the members of the African, Caribbean and Pacific Group of States of the one part, and the EC and its Member States, of the other part, signed in Cotonou on 23 June 2000, [2000] OJ L317/3 (Cotonou Agreement) 138, 170, 206, 228–31, 241–3, 252

Agreement Establishing an Association between the EC and Its Member States, of the one part, and the Republic of Chile, of the other part, [2002] OJ L352/3 (EU–Chile Association) 190, 194

Stabilisation and Association Agreement between the EC and their Member States, of the one part, and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, of the other part, [2004] OJ L84/13 (EU–Macedonia Association) 241

Euro-Mediterranean Agreement establishing an Association between the EC and its Member States, of the one part, and the People's Democratic Republic of Algeria, of the other part, [2005] OJ L265/2 (EU-Algeria Association) 241

Stabilisation and Association Agreement between the EC and their Member States, of the one part, and the Republic of Croatia, of the other part, [2005] OJ L26/3 (EU-Croatia Association) 241, 252

Economic Partnership Agreement between the CARIFORUM States, of the one part, and the EC and Its Member States, of the other, [2008] OJ L/289/I/3 (EU–CARIFORUM EPA) 244, 248

Framework Agreement between the EU and its Member States, on the one part, and the Republic of Korea, on the other part, signed on 10 May 2010 (EU–Korea Agreement) 241

Free Trade Agreement between the EU and Its Member States of the one part, and the Republic of Korea, of the other part, signed on 6 October 2010 (EU–Korea FTA) 195–200, 241



TABLE OF TREATIES

xvii

Agreement establishing an Association between the EU and its Member States, on the one hand, and Central America on the other, initialled on 22 March 2011 (EU–Central America Association) 170, 195–200, 241, 244, 255

Free Trade Agreement between the EU and its Member States, on one side, and Colombia and Peru, on the other, initialled on 23–24 March 2011 (EU-Colombia and Peru FTA) 170, 195–200, 241–3, 255



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ABS access and benefit-sharing

ACCC Aarhus Convention Compliance Committee
ACP African, Caribbean and Pacific Group of States

AG Advocate General

AJIL American Journal of International Law

APP Asia-Pacific Partnership for Clean Development and Climate

AR4 IPCC Fourth Assessment Report

ASR Articles on the Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful

Acts

AWG-KP Ad Hoc Working Group on Annex I Parties' Further Commitments

under the Kyoto Protocol

AWG-LCA Ad Hoc Working Group on Long-term Cooperative Action under

the UNFCCC

BASIC Brazil, South Africa, India and China
CCLR Carbon and Climate Law Review
CCS carbon capture and storage

CDM (Kyoto Protocol) Clean Development Mechanism

CERs certified emission reductions

CETA Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement

CFSP Common Foreign and Security Policy

CMLR Common Market Law Review

CO₂ carbon dioxide

COP Conference of the Parties

COREPER Committee of Permanent Representatives
CSD Commission on Sustainable Development
CSDP Common Security and Defence Policy

CSPs country strategy papers

DARIO Draft Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations

DCI Development Cooperation Instrument
DG Directorate-General (European Commission)

EAP Environmental Action Programme

EC European Community

ECHR European Convention on Human Rights

ECJ European Court of Justice, now Court of Justice of the EU

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

xviii



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

xix

EDF	European Development Fund
EEA	European Environment Agency
EEAS	European External Action Service
EIA	environmental impact assessment
EJIL	European Journal of International Law

ELR Environmental Law Review ENB Earth Negotiations Bulletin

ENPI European Neighbourhood and Partnership Instrument

ENRTP Environment and Sustainable Management of Natural Resources

Thematic Programme

EPA Economic Partnership Agreement

ETS Emission Trading Scheme

EU European Union

FAO Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

FCPF World Bank's Forest Carbon Partnership Facility
FLEGT Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade

FTA free trade agreement

GATT General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade

GBEP Global Bioenergy Partnership
GCCA Global Climate Change Alliance
GDN Green Diplomacy Network
GEP Global Environmental Politics

GSP [EU] Generalised System of Preferences

HFC-23 trifluoromethane

HUDOC ECtHR Document Collections

ICAO International Civil Aviation Organization

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICLQ International and Comparative Law Quarterly

ICTSD International Centre for Trade and Sustainable Development

IEA International Energy Agency

IISD International Institute for Sustainable Development

ILC International Law Commission
ILM International Legal Materials

IOLRInternational Organisations Law ReviewIPCCIntergovernmental Panel on Climate ChangeIPPCIntegrated Pollution Prevention and ControlITLOSInternational Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

IWC International Whaling Commission

JCMS Journal of Common Market Studies

JEL Journal of Environmental Law

JEEPL Journal for European Environmental and Planning Law

JI Joint Implementation (ETS)



XX LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

JIEL Journal of International Economic Law

JWT Journal of World Trade

MCPFE Ministerial Conference on the Protection of Forests in Europe

MDG Millennium Development Goal
MEA multilateral environmental agreement
MERCOSUR (South America) Common Southern Market

NGO non-governmental organisation

NLBI Non-legally Binding Instrument on All Types of Forests

NYIL Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

ODA official development assistance

OECD Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development

PFOS perfluoroctane sulfonates POPs persistent organic pollutants

RECIEL Review of European Community and International Environmental

Law

REDD reducing emissions from deforestation and degradation

REIO regional economic integration organisation

RSP regional strategy papers

SAICM Strategic Approach to International Chemicals Management

SDS Sustainable Development Strategy
SEA strategic environmental assessment
SFM sustainable forest management
SIA sustainability impact assessment

TEC Treaty establishing the European Community
TEEB The Economics of Ecosystems and Biodiversity

UN United Nations

UNEP United Nations Environment Programme

UNFF United Nations Forum on Forests

VPA Voluntary Partnership Agreement (FLEGT)
WSSD World Summit on Sustainable Development

WTO World Trade Organization

YbIEL Yearbook of International Environmental Law

YEL Yearbook of European Law