

INDEX

1951 Convention relating to the Status regions with few states parties to, 90 of Refugees, 6, 43-6, 59, 62 states' declarations and reservations, accession to the Convention and the 323 Protocol, 259, 262, 272, 278 states not parties to, 259 treaty body for, 309 by Canada, 123, 136 application in cases of civil war, 221 universal application of, 218 and the application of national or 1957 Agreement relating to Refugee supranational law, 154 Seamen, 44 Article 35, 43, 83, 318, 320 1967 Protocol relating to the Status of cessation clause, 153-5, 222 Refugees, 6, 43–6, 85, 320 1990 Schengen Implementation definition of refugee, 137-46 and the EU Qualification Directive, Convention, 44 1997 Treaty of Amsterdam, 44 exclusion clause, 151-3, 155, 222 fairness, 216-18 A v. Australia, 174 accountability, 29, 275-85, 339 and governance, 75-96 implementation of, 322 and the international protection importance of, 278 regime, 277-82 interpretation of, 65, 255, 277, 297, public accountability and state 323 accountability, 282 in Canada, 126-8 Adan and Aitseguer, 113 convergence in interpretation, Adan v. SSHD, 113 214-32, 233, 255: initiatives for, Advisory Committee of outside 225-32; institutions with experts, proposal for, 3, 21–2, competence, 232-4, 244; 25, 33, 58, 316, 334, 342 reasons for, 216–25; prospects and accountability, 31 for, 225-34 argument in favour, 20, 25, 26 divergence in interpretation of, expertise of, 335 219-24, 225, 255, 324 membership, 336 dynamic nature of, 55, 217 operation of, 335-6 judicial experience in Europe, advocacy communities, 61 148-56 Afghanistan, 257 lack of an oversight body, 66 African Union, 337, 341 non-state actors, 83 Agenda for Protection, 56 normative provisions of, 82 Ahmed v. Austria, 114 preamble, 43 Al Sadoon v. United Kingdom, 112, 184 proposals for renegotiation of, 78 Alston, P., 195



INDEX 345

Amnesty International, 7, 303, 305 A.M.R.I. v. K.E.R., 134 Andrews v. Law Society of British Columbia, 139 Arakaki, Osamu, 286-301 Asia, Comprehensive Plan of Action, 86, Asia-Pacific region, refugees and asylum seekers in, 257, 270 accession to the Convention, 259 agenda for the region, 272 protracted outflows of refugees, 258 asylum, 9 in the Asia-Pacific region, 257 contribution of the judiciary to protection of asylum seekers, 109 - 22declining value of, 296-8 penalisation of asylum seekers, 277, restrictions on access to, 4-12, 78, 277, 297, 313 right to, 8, 62, 148, 308 treaty on, 71 Attorney General for Canada v. Attorney General for Ontario, 125 Australia detention of refugees and asylum seekers, 174 and the ICESCR, 200 interpretation of the Convention, 219 'Pacific Solution', 60 'refugee swap' with Malaysia, 92 UNHCR Handbook, 226 Autism-Europe v. France, 207 B. (R.) v. Children's Aid Society, 142 Bagdanavicius case, 115 Baker case, 128-9 Bali Process on People Smuggling, Trafficking in Persons and Related Transnational Crime in the Asia-Pacific Region, 270 Barutciski, Prof. Michael, 19, 59-74 Bayefsky, A. F., 164, 174 Benhabib, S., 279

Betts, Alexander, 9-12, 33, 94 'Big Cities' initiative, 88 Blake, Mr Justice Nicholas, 17, 18, 109-22, 329 burden-sharing, 9, 74, 92, 218, 339 between northern and southern states, 10 legal framework for, 219, 327 and the Responsibility to Protect, 270-2, 281 Businesseurope, 191 C v. Australia, 174 Cahn, Claude, 182-213 Cambodia, 264-5 refugee status determination in, 264 Canada accession to the Convention and the Protocol, 123, 136 Balanced Refugee Reform Act, 99, 102 Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, 98, 123, 127, 130, 132, 136, 137, 139, 142, 147 Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms of Quebec, 143 consensus on non-discrimination, 136 Constitution Act, 136 definition of refugee, 137-46 deportation, 130, 305 domestic enforceability of treaties, 125 freedom of religion, 142, 145 Gender Guidelines, 140, 141 Human Rights Code of Ontario, 135 and the ICESCR, 200 Immigration Act, 98, 99, 123, 136 Immigration and Refugee Board, 97-101, 124 background, 97-100 composition, 98 independence, 98 IRB Consultative Committee on Practices and Proceedings, 102 jurisdiction, 99 Refugee Protection Division, 99, 100

Bentham, Jeremy, 5



346 INDEX

Canada (cont.) Research Directorate, 102 and UNHCR, 100-3 Immigration and Refugee Protection Act, 98, 101, 124, 126, 127, 128, impact of international law and domestic law, 123-47 implementation of international treaties, 125 international collaboration, 103-5 interpretation of the Convention, 126-34, 147 judicial supervision of the Convention, 123-47 ministerial discretion, 128 national application of international law, 125-6 persecution, 137-41, 142-6 Protecting Canada's Immigration System Act, 99, 100, 102 refugee determination arrangements, 97, 124, 302, 306 rights of Convention refugees, 99 role of domestic human rights law, role of international law, 125-34, training and guidance of UNHCR field staff, 103, 104 and the UNHCR, 97-101 Working Group on Women Refugee Claimants, 141 Canada (Attorney General) v. Ward, 137 Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration) v. Mayers, 140, Canadian Council for Refugees, 302, 303, 305 Canadian Council of Churches, 305 Caplan, Eleanor, 303 Cartagena Declaration on Refugees, 44, 70, 86, 87 Chahal v. United Kingdom, 112, 114 Chaput v. Romain, 142 Cheung v. Minister of Employment and Immigration, 138

Chimni, B. S., 79-80 China, 221 civil law tradition, 254 civil society activism, 317, 342 assistance to stateless persons, 284 changing roles of, 292 flexibility and accessibility, 276 future possibilities, 307-9 giving effect to rights to fair trial and non-discrimination, 307-9 and the market, 289 networks of, 288, 296 participation in international regimes, 292 role in protection and accountability, 275-85 supervisory role, 292-3, 296 and a treaty body for the Convention, 309 and UNHCR, 282-3 Clark, Tom, 19, 302–9 COHRE v. Croatia, 211 Commission on Human Rights, Open-Ended Working Group, 196 Committee against Torture, 175, 213, 232, 233, 306 inquiries, 177 Optional Protocol, 177 Sub-Committee on the Prevention of Torture, 178 Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 167, 188, 194 ability to decline a complaint, 203 ability to request interim measures, admissibility assessment, 202 general comment on states parties' obligations, 189, 194 interpretive procedures, 189–90 recognition of its competence, 204 reporting, 194, 204 time limit, 202 transmission of its views, 203 Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, 167, 169, 179

Chia, Joyce, 160, 214-56



INDEX 347

de Albuquerque, Catarina, 192, 201

engagement with asylum and refugee issues, 172, 175 Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 179 early warning facility, 178 engagement with asylum and refugee issues, 172 Committee on the Rights of the Child, 167 engagement with asylum and refugee issues, 172 Common European Asylum System, common law, 226, 254 concept of reasonableness, 200 and international law, 132 Comprehensive Plan of Action in Asia, 87 Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 129, 260 Convention on the Civil Aspects of International Child Abduction, Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, 197 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 45, 321 Convention on the Rights of the Child, 117, 128, 129, 132, 133, 260, 281 Convention on the Status of Stateless Persons, 45 Convention Plus initiative, 56 Costa Rica, 104 Côte d'Ivoire, 179 Council of Europe Ad Hoc Committee of Experts on the Legal Aspects of Territorial Asylum, Refugees and Stateless Persons, 231 Committee of Ministers, 211 and the ICESCR, 182-211 supranational supervision of social rights, 190-3 Cross Border Network, 283 customary international law, 31, 261

de Guzman v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship and Immigration), Declaration of States Parties, 56 Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief, 146 Defence for Children International, 209 deportation, 305, 306 Dershowitz, Alan, 136 detention of refugees and asylum seekers, 174, 178, 266 alternatives to, 266-7 of children, 209 developing countries; see also North/South divide and the Convention, 259 and developed countries, 259 Dewitt, David, 15 discrimination, 171, 172, 189, 303, 306, 307-9 cases on, 206-8, 210 in housing, 211 racial, 172, 178, 207 and refugees, 171, 172, 189 requirement of positive action, 207 dispute settlement mechanisms, 243 Dörig, Dr Harald, 148-56 Dublin Convention, 113, 114

E. (Mrs.) v. Eve, 138, 141 economic, social and cultural rights assessment of adequacy of, 189 capacity to be legally binding, 187 collective nature of, 187 complaint mechanisms on, 205 core obligations, 190 development of legal thinking about, 188 and ethnic origin, 208 general legal obligations, 189 jurisprudence on, 206, 210 justiciability of, 187, 188, 190 positive rights, 188 remedies and accountability, 190 specific legal obligations, 190



348 INDEX

economic, social and cultural rights (cont.) violations of, 190 Edwards, Alice, 159-81 ELENA, 229, 230, 304 Elgafaji v. Staatsecretaris van Justitie, EM (Lebanon) case, 116 epistemic communities, 292 equality, 189, 225 ERRC v. Bulgaria, 207 EU Qualification Directive, 45, 111 and the Convention, 149, 219, 228, 229, 230 persecution, 115, 149 protection, 87, 89, 110 refugee status, 113-17, 148 reviews, 229, 230 European Asylum Support Office, 45 European Charter of Fundamental Rights, 44, 115, 148, 341 European Committee of Social Rights, 183, 190, 191, 213 Collective Complaints, 212 decisions of, 206-12 and the European Court of Human Rights, 211 requirements on ethnic data, 207 restrictions on access to rights, 210 right to shelter, 210 state implementation of the European Social Charter, 192 European Convention on Human Rights, 110, 150, 183, 184 European Council on Refugees and Exiles, 232 European Court of Human Rights, 52, 68, 110, 122, 210, 232, 306 composition of, 252 and the European Committee of Social Rights, 211 political support, 240 right to asylum, 308 success of, 240 workload of, 237, 247 European Court of Justice, 110, 122, 149-55, 232

cessation clause of the Convention. exclusion clause of the Convention. and the German judicature, 155 and the Qualification Directive, 118 success of, 240 European International Cities of Refuge Network, 88 European Legal Network on Asylum, 229, 230, 304 European Social Charter, 183, 205 collective complaints mechanism, Collective Complaints Procedure, 190, 191 jurisprudence on human rights, 192 lack of standing by individuals, 211 rights contained in, 185-6 European Trade Union Confederation, 191 European Trade Union Council, 192 European Union, 44, 110, 341 Agency for Fundamental Rights, asylum policy and legislation, 148 Common European Asylum System, 228 - 31contribution of the judiciary to protection of asylum seekers, 109 - 22definition of refugees, 89 directives on asylum, 86 harmonisation process, 44, 224 human rights based approach to persecution, 115 importance of the Convention in, 154 judicial experience with the Convention, 148-56 limitations of the Qualification Directive, 229 margin of appreciation in, 219 Procedures Directive, 45, 148, 231 supranational law, 149 fairness, 96, 216-18, 307-9 Feller, Erika, 82



INDEX 349

Fosu v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration), 144	Helton, Arthur, 160 HH (Somalia), 119 HLR v. France, 114
Francis v. The Queen, 125	Hong Kong, 90
freedom of movement, 87, 171	Horvath case, 114 human rights, 31, 20
Germany	in Canada, 135–7
application of the Convention, 149–55	focus on individu 73
German Asylum Procedure Act, 148, 151	respect for, 268 and state sovereig
and the ICESCR, 201	Human Rights Com
judicial experience with the	217, 232, 233
Convention, 148–56	Human Rights Cou
persecution, 113	freedom of move
Gibney, Matthew J., 277, 282	liberty and securi
Global Consultations on International	on non-discrimin
Protection, 54, 55, 58, 160, 226,	protection of the
255	the position of ali
globalisation, and refugee law, 295	ICCPR, 171
Goldman, Rick, 303	Universal Periodi
Goodman, Brian, 97–105	55, 167, 170,
Goodwin-Gill, Guy S., 8, 110, 321, 334	human rights cultur
York Conference, 15, 33, 34–6	Human Rights First
governance, 75–96	human rights law
beyond national boundaries, 82	in Canada, 135–7
competition for, 94	and definition of
debate about, 77–85, 94	group', 140
definition, 93–4	and international
democratisation of, 314–17	and state obligation
factual propositions underlying the	refugees, 89
debate on, 82–5	and state sovereig
theoretical dimensions of, 76	human rights move
Guidelines on international protection, 226	human rights regim
	human right human rights treaty
Guild, Elspeth, 182–213 Guterres, António, 105, 283	bodies, 55, 7
Guterres, Amomo, 103, 263	260, 306, 32 ₄
Hague Process, 88	authority of their
Hampton, Jean, 285	cases involving re
Hathaway, James, 110, 145, 309	complementary s
ICVA reform proposal, 80, 160	composition of, 1
obligations of states parties, 326	concluding obser
reform of the supervision	180
10101111 Of the baper fibrori	100

alia), 119 ance, 114 ıg, 90 ase, 114 thts, 31, 265 da, 135–7 n individual entitlements, for, 268 e sovereignty, 60, 64 ights Committee, 196, 213, 7, 232, 233, 306, 308 ights Council, 55, 167, 196 n of movement, 171 and security of persons, 172 discrimination, 171 on of the family, 172 ition of aliens under the CPR, 171 al Periodic Review process, 167, 170, 261 thts culture, 63 ights First, 232 hts law da, 135-7 inition of 'particular social oup', 140 ernational refugee law, 61 e obligations towards ugees, 89 e sovereignty, 64 thts movement, 62 thts regime: see international man rights law thts treaty monitoring dies, 55, 70, 73, 163–5, 235, 0, 306, 324 ty of their views, 176 volving refugees, 174 mentary supervision, 162 sition of, 163, 251 ling observations, 170, 171, 0 engagement with asylum and refugee issues, 169, 170 expertise of, 164 functions of, 165

mechanisms, 324, 339

UNHCR lack of leadership, 327

regional solutions, 78, 82

'regime', 91



350 INDEX

human rights treaty monitoring (cont.) gender representation on, 164 general comments, 173, 181 individual complaints, 174-7 information available to, 167 NGOs and, 306 participation in, 184 popular actions (actio popularisi), 174, 176, 181 procedures of, 177-80 public nature of reports, 170 reporting systems, 168, 180 supranational supervision, 182 terms of membership, 164 human trafficking, 176, 258, 265 humanitarian intervention, 283, 297

ICRC, 54 ILO, 54, 184 immigration law, 61, 258, 272 **Immigration Law Practitioners** Association, 177 Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, 306 Inter-American Court of Human Rights, 232, 233, 239, 241, 247 Inter-governmental Asia Pacific Consultation on Refugees, Displaced Persons and Migrants, 270 inter-governmental organisations, 287 advocacy role, 317 role in monitoring and reporting, 4, 342 supervisory role, 290, 338 and the UNHCR, 290-1 Intergovernmental Consultations on Migration, Asylum and Refugees, 105 INTERIGHTS, 211 internally displaced people, 41, 46, 65, 279, 281, 297 International Association of Refugee Law Judges, 52, 60, 79, 104, 232 International Association for the Study

of Persons with Disabilities, 201 international cooperation on protection, 9, 11, 35, 40, 69, 272, 319, 325 International Council for Voluntary Agencies, 80, 81, 160, 309, 324 International Court of Justice, 128, 129, 237, 238, 309 composition of, 252 interpretation of the Convention, 232 Statute of, 5 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, 171, 183, 184, 194, 260, 308 in Canada, 130, 132, 133, 146 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights arguments against supranational supervision, 196 complaints mechanisms, 183, 184, 197, 212 comprehensive v à la carte approach to supervision, 197, 199 international supervision of, 194 opposition to the Optional Protocol, 200 Optional Protocol, 183, 184, 193, 195, 196, 202-5 preambles, 202 political process towards supervisory mechanisms, 193-202 rights contained in, 185 states parties' obligations, 187, 189-90, 204 supervision of, 182–211 support for the Optional Protocol, 200, 201, 205 supranational consideration of complaints, 184, 212 International Criminal Court, 237, 238, 271 International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, 237 International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, 237 international human rights law, 84 compliance, 5

International Convention on the Rights

of Forced Migration, 81

International Commission of Jurists v.

International Bill of Rights, 183

Portugal, 192



INDEX 351

development of, 173, 177 and domestic legislation, 129 regional systems, 190 sources of state obligations, 180 international human rights organisations, 7 international humanitarian law, 117, and international refugee law, 245 international institutions, 40, 235, independence of members, 240 and the international legal community, 240 and state cooperation, 239 International Judicial Commission for Refugees, 342 appointment and conditions of office, 252-3 appointments commission, 252 part-time appointments, 251 remuneration, 253 authority of, 249 composition of, 244-5, 251-2 creation under the mandate of UNHCR, 241-2 deliberation process, 254 effectiveness of, 247-8 efficiency of, 247 engagement with interested parties, 2.50 and the EU Qualification Directive, 229 expertise of, 245 functions of, 242, 249, 253 funding and support for, 254-5 judicial character of, 235, 243-4 lack of enforcement powers, 246 legitimacy, 236-45, 246, 252 methods of operation, 250-5 normative influence of, 245, 246 not an adjudicatory forum, 235, 236 number of judges, 251 political feasibility of, 247 political support, 240 power to invite submissions, 254 powers assigned by UNHCR, 246 principles, 248-9

private funding of, 248, 254 promotion of discussion on interpretation, 236 proposal for, 22-3, 80, 160, 214-55, 336 - 7consensus on, 27, 34, 342 purpose of, 215, 235-48, 249 recognition of, 250 resources for, 247 selection of cases, 253-4 single or multiple opinions, 254 state involvement in, 245-6 terms of office, 253 UN rapporteur to disseminate information about its work, and the UNHCR, 24, 249 international law, 40, 289 importance of the Convention and Protocol, 278 and non-state actors, 289 respect for, 332 International Law Association's Burgh House Principles on the Independence of the International Judiciary, 252 international legal community, and the international institutions, international norms 62, 130, 131 International Organisation of Employers, 191 international organisations, 5, 20 and sovereign states, 5 techniques and models available to, 57 international protection regime, 9–10, 41, 49; see also international refugee regime actors in, 79 building capacity to enhance, 313 - 40and civil society, 275-85, 297 *Comprehensive Plan of Action* in Asia, 86 debate over governance of, 77–82 defining the governance of, 85 definition of regime, 91–3 democratisation of, 335



352 INDEX

international protection regime (cont.) governance, 76, 339 and human rights law, 60, 63 implementation of, 72 institutions other than UNHCR, 90 norms in, 261 and public accountability, 277-82 reform of, 76, 79, 95, 325, 328 regional and local regimes, 77, 78, 86, 87, 88, 95 responsibilities to non-refugees, 90 and state sovereignty, 66 strengthening of its implementation, transnational and local governance, international refugee regime, 251, 295, 296 compliance, 5 deficiencies of, 8 defining the governance of, 85 development of, 80 governance, 75-96, 313-17, 340 definition, 85-93 historical objectives, 63 and human rights law, 61-6 and humanitarian law, 245 'international' aspect, 86–9 Internet resources on, 296 interpretation of, 24 and justice, 217 lack of an oversight body, 65 lack of uniformity in, 323 legal basis for the UNHCR supervisory role, 317-22 monitoring of, 313-40 participation of civil society in, 293 politicisation of, 245 practical origins of, 63-6 reform of, 322-8 special position of, 218–19 supervision of, 313–40 universal framework for, 40 international regimes, 84, 296 networks within, 292 participation of civil society in, 292 international relations theory, 71, 286-300

liberalism, 288 neo-realism, 288 non-state actors in, 287-9 realism, 288 relativisation, 288 international 'soft law', 216, 225, 234, international society, 297 Iraq, 257 civil society organisations, 294 determination of refugee status, 293-6 earthquake and tsunami, 298-300 human rights, 299 Immigration Control and Refugee Recognition Act, 293 immigration system, 293 Japan Association of Refugees, 298-300 NGOs' cultivation and formulation of knowledge, 295 NGOs' supervisory role, 298 participation of civil society in refugee status determination, UNHCR Representative in, 294, 296, Japan Association of Refugees, 298–300 assistance to evacuees and displaced people, 299 awareness of protection issues, 300 JHA v. Spain, 175 Jonah case, 109 Jones, Prof. Martin, 19, 75–96 judiciary, independence of, 243 justice, 217

Kälin, Walter, 54, 79, 160, 242, 320, 321, 322, 323

Kampala Convention for the Protection and Assistance of Internally Displaced Persons in Africa, 46

Keohane, Robert, 288

KH (Article 15(c) Qualification Directive Iraq CG, 117

Kindred, Hugh M., 125



Kline, Paula, 303

Kneebone, Susan, 82

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-107-02285-0 — The UNHCR and the Supervision of International Refugee Law Edited by James C. Simeon Index More Information

INDEX 353

initiatives promoting convergence of

Koskenniemi, Martti, 95 Krivenko, Ekaterina, 115, 117 Lane, Melissa, 278 Lao Hmong refugees, 178, 263, 276 LaViolette, Nicole, 125 legal aid, transnational, 30 legitimacy, 237 and the discipline of the law, 244 and independence of members, 240 and the International Judicial Commission for Refugees, 236-45, 246, 252 separation of powers, 243 sources of, 237, 238, 241 liberalism, 288 Libya, 179 Loescher, Gil, 11-12

Maaouia case, 308
MacDonald, Flora, 303
Malaysia, 92, 279, 280
Martin, S., 181
mass expulsions of people, 8
McAdam, Jane, 8, 321
McGrath, Susan, 15, 279, 280, 281
McNamara, Dennis, 181
Mexico, 177
Milner, James, 11–12
monitoring, 161, 180
Muntarbhorn, Vitit, 257–72
Myanmar, 257, 263, 276, 280, 281

NA v. United Kingdom, 118
Nanda, Ved P., 7–8
Nansen, Fridtjof, 64
Nansen Passport, 64
national human rights institutions, 91
nationality, 151
Neier, Aryeh, 187
Németh v. Canada (Justice), 134
Neve, A., 78, 82
Nicholson, Frances, 6
non-governmental organisations, 24,
29, 283, 287, 292, 337
advocacy role, 283, 302, 317

interpretation, 232 involvement in court cases, 305 limitations of, 338 naming and shaming of violations of, 29, 337, 342 role in monitoring and reporting, 4, 31, 342 supervisory role, 27, 29, 31, 34, 35, 302, 337, 338 non-refoulement, 7, 62, 134, 259, 277, non-state actors, 286–300 accountability of, 282 definition, 287 in international relations theory, 287-9 as norm entrepreneurs, 11 participation in the international refugee regime, 293 role of, 300 supervisory role, 287 normativity, 260-2 North, Justice Anthony, 22-3, 60, 79, 160, 214-56, 336-7 North Korea, 257, 261 North/South divide, 4-10, 12, 24, 184, 205, 281, 317, 340 Nye, Joseph, 288

OAU Refugee Convention, 43–6, 69, 87 OHCHR, 92 Organization of American States, 341

Palermo Convention, 89

Perryman, Benjamin N., 123–47
persecution, 109, 111, 221
agents of, 113
because of religion, 142–6
Convention standard, 7
danger of, 153
definition, 116, 149
fear of, 154
gender-based, 140, 141, 175
human rights-based approach to,
115
and nationality, 151



354 INDEX

persecution (cont.) R. v. Big M Drug Mart, 142, 145 R v. Secretary of State for the Home non-state agents of, 221 physical abuse, 150 Department, ex parte Adan, on racial grounds, 151 reasons for, 150 realism, 288 social group, 110, 111, 137-41, 220 reasonableness, 200 Petcharamesree, Dr Sriprapha, 17, refugee 275-85, 329 definition, 87, 89-91, 109, 249, 258, Plant, R., 188 Plaut, W. Gunther, 7 definition in the Convention, 8, Pogge, Thomas, 196 137-46, 220, 277 poverty, 196 definition in the EU, 111, 149-51 protection, 48-54, 257; see also Refugee Legal Group, 177 international protection regime refugee status national procedures for, 262-5, 272 accountability, 281 and advocacy, 302-5 number of applications, 85 and the discretion of the asylum procedures for determination, 9, 30, state, 263 50, 154, 166, 262-5, 272 effectiveness of, 115, 223 in Canada, 97 evolution of, 120 in Japan, 293-6 internal, 223 unfairness in, 96 judicial elaboration of criteria, 120 withdrawal of refugee status, 154, refugee protection, 161 sources of, 120 Refugee Survey Quarterly, 81 sufficiency of, 121 refugees and asylum seekers, 41 and supervisory mechanisms, 332 acceptance rates, 224, 225 of those fleeing armed conflict, 118 in the Asia-Pacific region, 257 through court initiatives, 305 causes of displacement, 272 through international treaty body claims before human rights treaty initiatives, 306 bodies, 174-7 **UNHCR Executive Committee** collective nature of problems of, initiatives, 307 176 in urban areas, 88 complaint system for, 184 'protection gaps', 93, 115, 118, 174, consensus on legal obligations 259, 261, 263 towards, 73 detention of, 174, 178, 209, 266 Protection in the Americas Strategy, 104 differential treatment of, 308 public international law, 4-12 forum shopping, 259 definition, 4 legal rights for, 64 enforcement, 5 links between country of origin, resistance to, 24 transit, first asylum and Puebla Process, 104 resettlement, 267, 269 Pushpamathan v. Canada (Minister of management of refugee flows, 64, 73 Citizenship and Immigration), numbers of, 279 127 opportunities for meaningful livelihoods, 267 QD (Iraq) v. SSHD, 117, 119 and other undocumented persons, Quaker Council for European Affairs (QCEA) v. Greece, 193 portrayal as illegal immigrants, 258



INDEX 355

registration of birth of children, 281, to shelter, 210 River International, 283 responsibility for, 270-2 Rohinyas, 280, 283 rights of, 94, 95, 96, 168-71, 177, Rome Statute of the International 181, 218, 249, 339 Criminal Court, 152 Ross v. New Brunswick School District rights of rejected asylum seekers, 209 - 10No. 15, 143 safety of, 265-7 rule of law, 244 secondary movements, 258 solidarity, 267-70 safe countries of origin, 303, 305, 308 status of children of refugees, 281, 'safe third country', 223 284 Sakamoto, Yoshikazu, 288 as threats, 297 sanctuary movements, 88 treatment of asylum seekers in the Sen, Amartya, 195 first asylum country, 266 separation of powers, 243 regimes, 91-3 Sheekh v. The Netherlands, 114, 116 conflict between norms and Shoukri, Mamdouh, 15 decision-making procedures, Simeon, James C., 1-36, 313-43 91 Singh v. Canada (Minister of international, 94 Employment and Immigration), norms and institutions of, 91 123 regional mechanisms for supervising Social Policy Group, 282 international refugee rights Soering case, 112 instruments, 27, 31 solidarity, 267-70 reporting on the implementation of international and regional, 270 international instruments, 20, South Africa, 104, 179 25, 26, 34, 57, 166 sovereign states, 5, 73, 182, 262, concluding observations, 167 283 and the ICESCR, 205 guidelines on form and content, and the International Judicial 166 harmonised guidelines, 166 Commission for Refugees, 242 Lists of Issues, 166 and international organisations, 5 on refugee rights, 168-71 and international society, 297 responsibility and international supervision, 41 individual, 155 interpretation and implementation obfuscation of, 315, 325 of treaties, 292 Responsibility to Protect, 40, 271, 281 Sri Lanka, 177 Reul v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship states parties to international refugee and Immigration), 145 rights instruments, 28, 35, 259 rights collective responsibility, 338 to affordable health care, 189 commitment to stronger protection to asylum, 8, 62, 148, 308 norms, 66 to development, 195, 196 consent to UNHCR supervision, 61, to education, 183, 189 66 to fair trial, 307-9 cooperation with UNHCR, 322, 340 to food, 189 Declaration, 56 to peaceful enjoyment of one's international consensus among, 21 possessions, 183 and international human rights law, to self-determination, 198 89, 161



> INDEX 356

states parties to international (cont.) legislative definitions of terms, 224 objections on the application of the Convention by other states parties, 326 obligations, 80 compliance, 3, 11-12, 30, 159, 290, 314 cooperation, 42, 48, 83, 218, 341 Peer Review Group, 337 provision of information and statistics, 27, 43, 165-71 reporting, 165-71 and UNHCR supervision, 48, 319 state sovereignty and human rights, 60, stateless persons, 8, 41, 45, 281, 284 states not signatories to the international refugee instruments, 28, 35 Statute of the Office of the United Nations High Commission for Refugees, 6, 13–14, 42, 59, 67, 72, 75, 318 Strategic Humanitarian Action and Research Centre, 160 SUARAM, 278, 280, 283 subsidiary protection, 110, 111–13, 154 serious harm, 112 Sunstein, C., 188 supervision complementary, 159-81 definition, 161 and monitoring, 161, 180 supervisory mechanisms and accountability, 29 and capacity building, 29, 30, 32 effectiveness of, 339 elements of, 160, 180 geographic variation, 28, 29, 32, 34 independent, 325 judicial supervision, 29, 30, 35 meaning of, 30, 32, 34 peer review mechanisms, 31, 55 political process towards, 193-202 proliferation of, 57

and protection, 332 regional, 27, 31 and state sovereignty, 41 supranational law, 149 Suresh v. Canada (Minister of Citizenship anad Immigration), 129 - 31Swing, William Lacy, 276 Syndicat national des Professions du tourisme v. France, 206-7 Syndicat Northcrest v. Amselem, 143, terrorism, 152, 155 Thailand, 263, 280, 281, 282, 283 Thai Committee for Refugees, 90 Thlimmenos v. Greece, 210 torture, 129, 131, 175, 208-9 treaty interpretation, 217 Treaty on the Functions of the European Union, 44 TT v. UK, 114 Türk, Volker, 6, 26, 33, 39-58, 180, 332 - 4keynote speech, 17, 20, 329 questions posed for the conference, 3, 20, 24, 316, 333-4 UNHCR mandate, 39-57, 313, 32.1 UK Asylum and Immigration Tribunal, contribution of the judiciary to protection of asylum seekers, 109 - 22and the ECHR, 122 Human Rights Act 1998, 121, 122 judicial structure of, 121–2 UN, 40 Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement, 46

and the ICESCR, 182-211 UN Charter, 63, 260 Special Procedures, 261 Special Rapporteurs, 261 UN General Assembly, 67, 321 and the UNHCR, 83 UN peacekeepers, 271



INDEX 357

UN Security Council, 153 and human rights violations, 271 and the ICC, 271 UN Special Rapporteur on the Situation of Human Rights in the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, 261 **UN Treaty Bodies** individual complaints procedure, international supervision by, 186-90 UNHCR, 7, 290, 333 10-Point Plan on Refugee Protection and Mixed Migration, 269-70 accountability, 56 advisory and consultative role, 50, 52 advocacy role, 31, 52 Age, Gender and Diversity Mainstreaming strategy, 56-8 Agenda for Protection, 161 Assistant High Commissioner (Protection), 68 authority of, 68, 315, 337 autonomy of, 69 and Canada, 97-101 capacity building role, 4, 34 capacity of, 32 and CEDAW, 169 challenges facing, 4-12 and civil society groups, 282-3, 287 constraints on its actions, 282 consultative practices, 83 cross-issue linkages, 10 development of international law and standards, 53 dialogue with NGOs, 283, 307 Division of International Protection, 68, 70, 173 effectiveness, 24 enforcement powers, 42, 290, 315, engagement with all branches of states and with civil society, 49 entitlement to data and information, expansion of its operations, 84 expertise in refugee protection, 71

expertise of, 242 facilitative role of, 12 feedback to states parties, 24 financial resources, 12 dependence on donors, 3, 11, 28, 31, 54, 69, 325, 339 limitations of, 28, 30, 34, 248, 282, 316 functions, 14, 67-72, 318 Global Consultations on International Protection, 215 Global Needs Assessment initiative, governance, 12, 95 Guidelines on international protection, 26, 53, 173, 215, 225, 226, 228 Handbook on Procedures and Criteria for Determining Refugee Status, 52, 225, 226 High Commissioner's Dialogues on Protection Challenges, 20, 56, hybrid nature of, 243 independence of, 68 influence of, 10, 269 influence on treaty monitoring bodies, 164, 165, 173, 181 information on country conditions, 165 and INGOs and NGOs, 11-12, 290 - 1inter-agency framework, 49 and internally displaced persons, 65 international collaboration, 103-5 and the International Judicial Commission for Refugees, 249 interpretation of the Convention, 225 - 8intervention in judicial proceedings, 51, 113 involvement in countries of origin, 49,63 issuing of legal positions, 52 leadership skills and expertise, 11 mandate, 12, 39-57, 63, 67-72, 261, institutional mandate, 64, 70, 242 and resources, 31, 34



> 358 INDEX

UNHCR (cont.) monitoring of state practice and follow-up intervention, 50 obligations of, 96 operational focus, 63, 321, 333 operational role in host countries, 49,84 origins of, 59-61 and other UN agencies, 341 'Parinac' conference with NGOs, participatory planning and needs assessment, 56 partnerships, 49 persons of concern, 46-7, 48, 52 promotion of international uniformity and standardisation, 291 promotion of protection norms, 291 promotion of ratification of the Convention, 14, 319 protection functions, 48, 49 provision of country of origin information, 102, 180 reform of, 81, 315, 325 refugee camps in non-Convention states, 49 Refugee Status Determination, 24 as a regime, 93 Regional Consultation on Detention of Asylum-Seekers and Refugees, 266 relationship with Canada's IRB, 100 - 3reporting system, 171 Representative in Japan, 294, 296, 299 requirement for invitation from states, 12, 321 requirement to cooperate with governments, 67 responsibilities of, 67, 96, 325, 342 and regional organisations, 341 safe countries of origin, 304 separation of powers, 243 sources of funds, 340 strategic relationship with civil society, 283

strengthening of its supervisory role, 66 supervisory role, 48, 69, 77, 293 complementary supervision, 159-81 components of, 160, 180 debate on, 54-6, 61 enhancement of capacity for, 1-35, 66, 325 implementation of, 54 legal basis of, 35, 42, 317-22 limits of, 59-72, 339 and non-state actors, 286-300 and protection standards, 39-57, 32.1 transparency, 12 a treaty monitoring body, 53 'watchdog' functions, 67–72 work for systemic change, 49 UNHCR Executive Committee, 83, 161, 262 and the Canadian IRB, 103 Conclusions, 50, 56, 58, 72, 227, 228 consultations with civil society, 83 inclusion of non-states parties, 83 mandate, 70-2 membership, 171 and NGOs, 307 practical evolution, 71 Special Sub-Committee on international protection, 21, 334, 335, 336, 342 consensus on reconstitution of, 3, 20, 25, 34, 58, 316 purpose of reconstitution of, 27, 339, 342 United States, and the ICESCR, 200 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 75, 183, 193, 260 University of Michigan, 232, 309 USA and Canada, Safe Third Country Agreement, 86, 305 van Ert, Gib, 133 Treaties, 127

Vienna Convention on the Law of Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action, 195



INDEX 359

Vienna World Human Rights Conference, 195, 197, 212 Vietnam, 268–9 Law on Vietnamese Nationality, 268 Vilvarajah case, 118, 120

Waltz, Kenneth, 288 war crimes, 152 Ward v. Canada, 110, 119 Westphalian system of states, 289, 297 World Organisation Against Torture, 208–9

York 2010 International Conference, 2, 3, 13–19, 328–31 breakout sessions, 16, 21, 27, 33, 332, 334–8 Evaluation Report, 331 facilitation of dialogue, 329 feedback on, 17 keynote addresses, 16, 17, 18, 329 legal instruments and remedies, 18

outcomes, 13, 14, 21-32, 33-4, 343 panel sessions, 331-2 participants, 329, 330 plenary panel sessions, 18, 332 programme, structure and organisation, 15-19, 23-32, 328, 331-4 purpose, 14, 16, 328 role of civil society, 19 role of the judiciary in supervision, survey of participants, 330 UNHCR supervisory role, 18 website, 14, 15 York University Centre of Refugee Studies, 1 Young, Margot, 136

Zhu v. Canada (Citizenship and Immigration), 145 Zieck, Marjoleine, 315, 320, 321, 325, 327 Zinn, Russel W., 123–47