

> Criminal Law, Philosophy and Public Health Practice

The goal of improving public health involves the use of different tools, with the law being one way to influence the activities of institutions and individuals. Of the regulatory mechanisms afforded by law to achieve this end, criminal law remains a perennial mechanism to delimit the scope of individual and group conduct. However, criminal law may promote or hinder public health goals, and its use raises a number of complex questions that merit exploration.

This examination of the interface between criminal law and public health brings together international experts from a variety of disciplines, including law, criminology, public health, philosophy and health policy, in order to examine the theoretical and practical implications of using criminal law to improve public health.

A. M. Viens is Lecturer in Law at the University of Southampton. He is also a Research Fellow at the Institute for Medical Ethics and History of Medicine, Ruhr-University Bochum.

John Coggon is Reader in Law at the University of Southampton.

Anthony S. Kessel is Director of Public Health Strategy for Public Health England. He is also an Honorary Professor at the London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine.



Cambridge Bioethics and Law

This series of books was founded by Cambridge University Press with Alexander McCall Smith as its first editor in 2003. It focuses on the law's complex and troubled relationship with medicine across both the developed and the developing world. Since the early 1990s, we have seen in many countries increasing resort to the courts by dissatisfied patients and a growing use of the courts to attempt to resolve intractable ethical dilemmas. At the same time, legislatures across the world have struggled to address the questions posed by both the successes and the failures of modern medicine, while international organisations such as the WHO and UNESCO now regularly address issues of medical law.

It follows that we would expect ethical and policy questions to be integral to the analysis of the legal issues discussed in this series. The series responds to the high profile of medical law in universities, in legal and medical practice, as well as in public and political affairs. We seek to reflect the evidence that many major health-related policy debates in the UK, Europe and the international community involve a strong medical law dimension. With that in mind, we seek to address how legal analysis might have a trans-jurisdictional and international relevance. Organ retention, embryonic stem cell research, physician assisted suicide and the allocation of resources to fund health care are but a few examples among many. The emphasis of this series is thus on matters of public concern and/or practical significance. We look for books that could make a difference to the development of medical law and enhance the role of medico-legal debate in policy circles. That is not to say that we lack interest in the important theoretical dimensions of the subject, but we aim to ensure that theoretical debate is grounded in the realities of how the law does and should interact with medicine and health care.

Series Editors

Professor Margaret Brazier, University of Manchester Professor Graeme Laurie, University of Edinburgh Professor Richard Ashcroft, Queen Mary, University of London Professor Eric M. Meslin, Indiana University

Books in the series

Marcus Radetzki, Marian Radetzki and Niklas Juth, Genes and Insurance: Ethical, Legal and Economic Issues
Ruth Macklin, Double Standards in Medical Research in Developing Countries
Donna Dickenson, Property in the Body: Feminist Perspectives
Matti Häyry, Ruth Chadwick, Vilhjálmur Árnason and Gardar Árnason, The Ethics and Governance of Human Genetic Databases: European Perspectives
Ken Mason, The Troubled Pregnancy: Legal Wrongs and Rights in Reproduction



Daniel Sperling, Posthumous Interests: Legal and Ethical Perspectives

Keith Syrett, Law, Legitimacy and the Rationing of Health Care

Alastair Maclean, Autonomy, Informed Consent and the Law: A Relational Change Heather Widdows, Caroline Mullen, The Governance of Genetic Information: Who Decides?

David Price, Human Tissue in Transplantation and Research

Matti Häyry, Rationality and the Genetic Challenge: Making People Better?

Mary Donnelly, Healthcare Decision-Making and the Law: Autonomy, Capacity and the Limits of Liberalism

Anne-Maree Farrell, David Price and Muireann Quigley, Organ Shortage: Ethics, Law and Pragmatism

Sara Fovargue, Xenotransplantation and Risk: Regulating a Developing Biotechnology

John Coggon, What Makes Health Public?: A Critical Evaluation of Moral, Legal, and Political Claims in Public Health

Mark Taylor, Genetic Data and the Law: A Critical Perspective on Privacy Protection

Anne-Maree Farrell, The Politics of Blood: Ethics, Innovation and the Regulation of Risk

Stephen Smith, End-of-Life Decisions in Medical Care: Principles and Policies for Regulating the Dying Process

Michael Parker, Ethical Problems and Genetics Practice

William W. Lowrance, Privacy, Confidentiality, and Health Research

Kerry Lynn Macintosh, Human Cloning: Four Fallacies and Their Legal Consequence

Heather Widdows, The Connected Self: The Ethics and Governance of the Genetic Individual

Amel Alghrani, Rebecca Bennett and Suzanne Ost, Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume I: The Criminal Law and Bioethical Conflict: Walking the Tightrope

Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders, Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Margaret Brazier and Suzanne Ost, Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume III: Medicine and Bioethics in the Theatre of the Criminal Process

Sigrid Sterckx, Kasper Raus and Freddy Mortier, Continuous Sedation at the End of Life: Ethical, Clinical and Legal Perspectives

A. M. Viens, John Coggon and Anthony S. Kessel, Criminal Law, Philosophy and Public Health Practice





Criminal Law, Philosophy and Public Health Practice

Edited by

A. M. Viens, John Coggon and Anthony S. Kessel





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107022782

© Cambridge University Press 2013

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2013

Printed and bound in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Criminal law, philosophy and public health practice / [edited by]

A. M. Viens, John Coggon, Anthony S. Kessel.

pages cm. – (Cambridge bioethics and law)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02278-2 (hardback)

ISBN 978-1-107-02278-2 Hardback

1. Public health laws-Criminal provisions. 2. Public health administration I. Viens, A. M. (Adrian M.) editor of

compilation. II. Coggon, John, 1980– editor of compilation.

III. Kessel, A. (Anthony) editor of compilation.

K3570.C73 2013

345'.0242-dc23

2013020830

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

A. M. VIENS, JOHN COGGON AND ANTHONY S. KESSEL Criminal law, regulatory frameworks and public health ROGER BROWNSWORD Drugs, crime and public health: a lesson from criminology 42 DOUGLAS N. HUSAK Criminal law, drugs and harm reduction 62 TOM WALKER Morality and strategy in politicising tobacco use: criminal law, public health and philosophy 79 JOHN COGGON Pursued by the 'fat' police? Prosecuting the parents of obese children 102 TRACEY ELLIOTT Disease transmission, liability and criminal law JAMES CHALMERS Compulsion, surveillance, testing and treatment: a truly 'criminal' matter? 142 JEAN V. McHALE Epidemiological criminology and violence prevention: addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence		List of contributors Acknowledgements	page ix xi
ROGER BROWNSWORD 3 Drugs, crime and public health: a lesson from criminology 42 DOUGLAS N. HUSAK 4 Criminal law, drugs and harm reduction 62 TOM WALKER 5 Morality and strategy in politicising tobacco use: criminal law, public health and philosophy 79 JOHN COGGON 6 Pursued by the 'fat' police? Prosecuting the parents of obese children 102 TRACEY ELLIOTT 7 Disease transmission, liability and criminal law 124 JAMES CHALMERS 8 Compulsion, surveillance, testing and treatment: a truly 'criminal' matter? 142 JEAN V. McHALE 9 Epidemiological criminology and violence prevention: addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes 17	1		1 L
from criminology DOUGLAS N. HUSAK 4 Criminal law, drugs and harm reduction TOM WALKER 5 Morality and strategy in politicising tobacco use: criminal law, public health and philosophy JOHN COGGON 6 Pursued by the 'fat' police? Prosecuting the parents of obese children TRACEY ELLIOTT 7 Disease transmission, liability and criminal law JAMES CHALMERS 8 Compulsion, surveillance, testing and treatment: a truly 'criminal' matter? JEAN V. McHALE 9 Epidemiological criminology and violence prevention: addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes 17	2		19
TOM WALKER 5 Morality and strategy in politicising tobacco use: criminal law, public health and philosophy JOHN COGGON 6 Pursued by the 'fat' police? Prosecuting the parents of obese children TRACEY ELLIOTT 7 Disease transmission, liability and criminal law JAMES CHALMERS 8 Compulsion, surveillance, testing and treatment: a truly 'criminal' matter? JEAN V. McHALE 9 Epidemiological criminology and violence prevention: addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes	3	from criminology	42
criminal law, public health and philosophy JOHN COGGON Pursued by the 'fat' police? Prosecuting the parents of obese children TRACEY ELLIOTT Disease transmission, liability and criminal law JAMES CHALMERS Compulsion, surveillance, testing and treatment: a truly 'criminal' matter? JEAN V. McHALE Epidemiological criminology and violence prevention: addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes	4		62
of obese children TRACEY ELLIOTT Disease transmission, liability and criminal law JAMES CHALMERS Compulsion, surveillance, testing and treatment: a truly 'criminal' matter? JEAN V. McHALE Epidemiological criminology and violence prevention: addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes	5	criminal law, public health and philosophy	79
JAMES CHALMERS 8 Compulsion, surveillance, testing and treatment: a truly 'criminal' matter? 142 JEAN V. McHALE 9 Epidemiological criminology and violence prevention: addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes 17	6	of obese children	102
a truly 'criminal' matter? JEAN V. McHALE 9 Epidemiological criminology and violence prevention: addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes 17	7		124
addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes 17	8	a truly 'criminal' matter?	142
	9	addressing the co-occurrence of criminal violence and poor health outcomes	171

vii



iii	Contents	
10	Forensic epidemiology: strange bedfellows or the perfect match? Can public health and criminal law work together without losing their souls? ZITA LAZZARINI	192
11	From the criminal to the consensual: the shifting mechanisms of environmental regulation ROBERT G. LEE AND MARK STALLWORTHY	214
12	Criminal law and global health governance DAVID P. FIDLER	237
	Index	261



Contributors

TIMOTHY A. AKERS is Professor of Public Health and Assistant Vice President for Research Innovation and Advocacy, Division of Research and Economic Development, Morgan State University.

ROGER BROWNSWORD is Professor of Law, Dickson Poon School of Law, King's College London, and Honorary Professor in Law at the University of Sheffield.

JAMES CHALMERS is Regius Professor of Law, School of Law, University of Glasgow.

JOHN COGGON is Reader in Law, Southampton Law School, University of Southampton.

TRACEY ELLIOTT is Lecturer in Health Care Law, School of Law, University of Leicester.

DAVID P. FIDLER is James Louis Calamaras Professor of Law, Maurer School of Law, Indiana University Bloomington.

DOUGLAS N. HUSAK is Professor of Philosophy and Law, Department of Philosophy, Rutgers University.

ANTHONY S. KESSEL is Director of Public Health Strategy and Director of R&D and Responsible Officer, Public Health England, and Honorary Professor, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine.

ZITA LAZZARINI is Associate Professor and Director, Division of Public Health Law and Bioethics, University of Connecticut School of Medicine, University of Connecticut Health Center.

ROBERT G. LEE is Chair in Environmental Law, Exeter Law School, University of Exeter.

ix



x List of contributors

JEAN V. McHALE is Professor of Health Care Law and Director of the Centre for Health Law, Science and Policy, Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham.

ROBERTO H. POTTER is Director of Research Partnerships and Chair, Department of Criminal Justice, College of Health and Public Affairs, University of Central Florida.

MARK STALLWORTHY is Professor of Environmental Law and Co-Director of the Centre for Environmental and Energy Law and Policy, School of Law, Swansea University.

A. M. VIENS is Lecturer in Law, Southampton Law School, University of Southampton, and Research Fellow, Institute for Medical Ethics & History of Medicine, Ruhr-University Bochum.

TOM WALKER is Senior Lecturer in Ethics, School of Politics, International Studies and Philosophy, Queen's University Belfast.



Acknowledgements

The editors would like to thank all of the contributors to the volume for their dedication to this project. A debt of gratitude is also owed to Richard Ashcroft, Dermot Feenan, Christine Holmes and Richard Woodham. We would especially like to thank Finola O'Sullivan for her immense patience and support throughout this process. Royalties from this volume are being donated to two charities – Nacro (www.nacro. org.uk) and Merlin (www.merlin.org.uk).