

Investment Treaty Arbitration

Judging Under Uncertainty

Investment claims have exposed the vague nature of the standards by which arbitral tribunals are expected to adjudicate them and the policy reasons which explicitly or implicitly have an influence. The ad hoc nature of the tribunals and the decisions reached on various controversial issues have brought to the fore the issue of consistency.

Andrés Rigo Sureda's Hersch Lauterpacht Memorial Lectures examine how arbitral discretion is exercised in the face of uncertainty of the law. It explores the choices made by arbitral tribunals as they approach treaty interpretation, as they search for limits in determining jurisdiction and the content of the standards of protection, and as they search for consistency in the exercise of arbitral discretion.

ANDRÉS RIGO SUREDA is a judge on the Administrative Tribunal of the IMF and a member of the Sanctions Committee (the Anticorruption Tribunal) of the Inter-American Development Bank. He has extensive experience as an arbitrator and mediator in commercial and investor–states disputes, and served with the World Bank in various capacities from 1973 to 2000, including Assistant General Counsel and Deputy General Counsel.



Recent books in the Hersch Lauterpacht Memorial Lecture Series

ANDRÉS RIGO SUREDA Investment Treaty Arbitration: Judging Under Uncertainty 9781107022515 hardback

RALPH ZACKLIN
The United Nations Secretariat
and the Use of Force in a Unipolar
World: Power v. Principle
9780521194136 hardback

JOHN H. JACKSON Sovereignty, the WTO, and Changing Fundamentals of International Law 9780521860079 hardback 9780521748414 paperback

JAN PAULSSON Denial of Justice in International Law 9780521851183 hardback

FRANCISCO ORREGO VICUNA
International Dispute Settlement in
an Evolving Global Society:
Constitutionalization, Accessibility, Privatization
9780521842396 hardback

MARTTI KOSKENNIEMI
The Gentle Civilizer of Nations:
The Rise and Fall of International Law
1870–1960
9780521623117 hardback
9780521548090 paperback

THOMAS M. FRANCK
Recourse to Force: State Action
against Threats and Armed Attacks
9780521820134 hardback
9780521104203 paperback

ANTONIO CASSESE
Self-Determination of Peoples: A Legal Reappraisal
9780521481878 hardback
9780521637527 paperback



Investment Treaty Arbitration

Judging Under Uncertainty

ANDRÉS RIGO SUREDA





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town,
Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107022515

© Andrés Rigo Sureda 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data
Rigo Sureda, Andrés
Investment treaty arbitration: judging under uncertainty / Andres Rigo Sureda.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.
ISBN 978-1-107-02251-5 (hardback : alk. paper)
1. Investments, Foreign – Law and legislation. 2. Arbitration and award,
International. 3. Commercial treaties. I. Title.

K3830.R54 2012

346′.092 – dc23 2012009121

ISBN 978-1-107-02251-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

Foreword by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht		page vii
Ac	knowledgements	viii
Ta	ble of cases	ix
	Introduction	1
PA	RT I: DISCRETION: THE SEARCH FOR MEANING	
1	Uncertainty, judicial discretion and policy	7
2	Treaty interpretation	20
	1. Clarity and common sense	24
	2. Balance between purposes	26
	3. Balance between purpose and text	27
	4. Interpretation of silence: the MFN clause controversy	29
	5. Interpretation of umbrella clauses	32
	6. The weight of the non-disputing State party	36
PA	RT II: THE SEARCH FOR LIMITS	
	Introduction	42
3	Form or substance: the nationality of corporate	
	claimants	43
	1. Direct and indirect control	45
	2. Transfer of shares	46
	3. Indirect control by nationals of the host State	50
	4. Misrepresentation	53
4	Multiple approaches to define investment	56
	1. The comprehensive approach	57

v



Contents

	2. Form or substance	59
	3. Elements of 'investment': description or jurisdiction	60
	4. Contribution of investment to economic development	66
5	Legitimate expectations, risk and due diligence	76
	1. Fair and equitable treatment	76
	2. Full protection and security	86
	3. Expectations and investor awareness of the BIT	92
PA	RT III: THE SEARCH FOR CONSISTENCY	
	Introduction	98
6	Principles	99
7	Precedent	109
	1. The weight of precedent	114
	2. Precedent and values	124
	3. The interpretation of precedent: ratio decidendi and obiter dicta	127
	4. Towards a stronger doctrine of precedent?	130
8	Publicists	132
	Conclusion	139
Bi	Bibliography	
	Index	



Foreword

by Sir Elihu Lauterpacht C.B.E. Q.C. LL.D.

In the remarkable substantive and procedural expansion of international law during the last half-century the development and protection of international investment has occupied a prominent position. And within this area a significant contribution has come from the impressive growth in the international litigation that is one of the principal reflections of the enhanced status of individuals and corporations in the international legal system. In the forefront has been the adoption in 1965 of the International Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes, together with the emergence of hundreds of bilateral treaties containing watertight provisions for the settlement of such disputes. The present thoughtful and incisive book identifies and probes many of the problems now embedded in the extensive arbitral jurisprudence reflecting this development. They have deep significance for international law.

Nobody could be better qualified to explore these matters than the present author, Dr Andrés Rigo Sureda. For more than twenty-five years he occupied a central position in this field as one of the leading lawyers of the World Bank, eventually becoming its Deputy General Counsel. Since leaving the Bank he has himself been an active practitioner and arbitrator in the field. His connection with Cambridge goes back to 1968 when he was a Ph.D. student on an Overseas Research Fellowship of the BIICL and later a Senior Rouse Bell Student of Trinity College. We remain grateful to him for contributing this stimulating study, originally given as a series of Hersch Lauterpacht Memorial Lectures, containing much enlightening discussion of perennial problems of international adjudication, not the least of which is his penetrating treatment of the role and limits of judicial discretion.

E. Lauterpacht June 2011

vii



Acknowledgements

This study has its origin in the Sir Hersch Lauterpacht Memorial Lectures delivered at the Lauterpacht Centre of Cambridge University in late 2008. The author thanks Professors Sir Eli Lauterpacht and James Crawford for their invitation to deliver the lectures on the 25th anniversary of the Lauterpacht Centre. The author is grateful to the Warden and Fellows of All Souls College who elected him to a visiting fellowship (2006–7) to carry out research for the Lectures. Thanks are also due to Judd Kessler and Professors Michael W. Riesman and Edith Brown-Weiss, who read the manuscript and made useful suggestions. The enthusiastic and thorough editing of an earlier draft by Federica Paddeu, a Cambridge graduate student, is particularly recognized. Any remaining infelicitous language or errors are the author's alone.



Table of cases

By alphabetical order of claimant. The decisions and awards listed are generally available at http://ita.law.uvic.ca/. In some instances they are not, and can be found in the source indicated.

- ADC & ADMC Management Limited v. Republic of Hungary, ICSID Case No. ARB/03/16, Award, 2 October 2006 55, 59
- AES Corporation v. The Argentine Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/02/17, Decision on Jurisdiction, 26 April 2005, 12 ICSID Reports 312 117, 131
- African Holding Company of America and Société Africaine de Construction au Congo SARL v. Republic of Congo, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/21, Award, 29 July 2008 53, 55
- Aguas del Tunari SA v. Republic of Bolivia, ICSID Case No. ARB/02/3, Decision on Respondent's Objections to Jurisdiction, 21 October 2005 22, 32, 37, 53, 55, 93, 95, 127
- Alex Genin and others v. Republic of Estonia, ICSID Case No. ARB/99/2, Award, 25 June 2001, 6 ICSID Reports 241 83
- Amco Asia Corporation, Pan American Development Ltd and PT Amco Indonesia (AMCO) v. Republic of Indonesia, ICSID Case No. ARB/81/1, Jurisdiction, 25 September 1983, 1 ICSID Reports 389 45
- American Manufacturing and Trading, Inc (AMT) v. Zaire, ICSID Case No. ARB/93/1, Award, 21 February 1997, 5 ICSID Reports 14 88, 89
- Application for Review of Judgment No. 333 of the United Nations Administrative Tribunal, Advisory Opinion, ICJ Reports (1987) 123
- Asian Agricultural Products Ltd (AAPL) v. Sri Lanka, ICSID Case No. ARB/87/3, Award, 27 June 1990, 4 ICSID Reports 250 86



- ATA Construction, Industrial and Trading Company v. Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan, ICSID Case No. ARB/08/2, Award, 18 May 2010 58
- Autopista Concesionada de Venezuela (Aucoven), CA v. Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, ICSID Case No. ARB/00/5, Decision on Jurisdiction, 27 September 2001, 6 ICSID Reports 419 49, 118
- Banro American Resources, Inc and Société Aurifère du Kivu et du Maniema SARL v. Democratic Republic of the Congo, ICSID Case No. ARB/98/7, Award, 1 September 2000, (2002) 17 ICSID Review FILJ 382 47, 48
- Barcelona Traction Light and Power Company, Limited, Judgment, ICJ Reports 1970 113
- Bayindir Insaat Turizm Ticaret Ve Sanayi AS v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan, ICSID Case No. ARB/03/29, Decision on Jurisdiction, 14 November 2005 61, 62, 64, 115
- Berschader v. The Russian Federation, SCC Case No. 080/2004, Award, 21 April 2006 22, 24, 31, 60
- Biwater Gauff (Tanzania) Limited v. United Republic of Tanzania, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/22, Award, 24 July 2008 68, 71
- BP American Production Co v. Argentine Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/04/8, Decision on Jurisdiction, 27 July 2006 117
- Canadian Cattlemen for Fair Trade v. United States, UNCITRAL (NAFTA), Award on Jurisdiction, 28 January 2008 119
- Cementownia 'Nowa Huta' SA v. Republic of Turkey, ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/06/2 (ECT), Award, 17 September 2009 94
- Československa obchodní banka (CSOB), as v. Slovak Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/97/4, Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 24 May 1999, 5 ICSID Reports 335 58, 61, 62, 115
- CME Czech Republic BV (The Netherlands) v. Czech Republic, UNCITRAL, Final Award, 14 March 2003, 9 ICSID Reports 264 37
- CMS Gas Transmission Company v. Argentine Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/01/8. Decision on Annulment, 25 September 2007, 14 ICSID Reports 251 19, 117, 129
- Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija S.A. and Comagnie Générale des Eaux/Vivendi Universal v. Argentine Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/97/3, Decision on Annulment, 3 July 2002, 6 ICSID Reports 340 35, 82
- Consortium RFCC v. Kingdom of Morocco, ICSID Case No. ARB/00/6, Award, 22 December 2003, (2005) 20 ICSID Rev FILJ 391 78
- Desert Line Projects LLC v. Yemen, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/17, Award, 6 February 2008 136
- Eastern Sugar BV v. Czech Republic, SCC Case No. 088/2004 80, 84, 85



- Ecuador v. Occidental Exploration & Production Co, Court of Appeal Commercial Court, 2 March 2006, [2006] EWHC 345 (Comm) 124
- Elettronica Sicula SPA (ELSI), Judgment, ICJ Reports 1989 99
- Enron Creditors Recovery Corporation (formerly Enron Corporation) and Ponderosa Assets, LP v. Argentine Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/01/3, Decision on Jurisdiction, 14 January 2004, 11 ICSID Reports 273 54
- Eureko B.V. v. Republic of Poland, Partial Award and Dissenting Opinion, 19 August 2005 27, 32, 37, 138
- Fedax N.V. v. Venezuela, ICSID Case No. ARB/96/3, Decision on Jurisdiction, 11 June 1997, 5 ICSID Reports 186; Award, 9 March 1998, 5 ICSID Reports 200 32, 58, 60, 62, 63, 66
- Fireman's Fund Insurance Company v. United Mexican States, ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/02/1, Award, 17 July 2006 79
- Gabčíkovo-Nagymaros Project (Hungary/Slovakia), Judgment, ICJ Reports 1997 106
- GAMI Investments, Inc v. Mexico, UNCITRAL (NAFTA), Award, 15 November 2004, 13 ICSID Reports 147 84
- Gas Natural S.D.G., S.A. v. Argentine Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/03/10, Decision on Preliminary Questions on Jurisdiction, 17 June 2005, 14 ICSID Reports 284 30, 115
- GEA Group Aktiengesellschaft v. Ukraine, ICSID Case No. ARB/08/16, Award, 31 March 2011 59
- Generation Ukraine, Inc. v. Ukraine, ICSID Case No. ARB/00/9, Award, 16 September 2003, 10 ICSID Reports 240 38, 81, 85
- Glamis Gold, Ltd. v. The United States of America, UNCITRAL, Award, 8 June 2009 11, 18, 112, 120, 134, 137
- Gustav F W Hamester GmbH & Co KG v. Republic of Ghana, ICSID Case No. ARB/07/24, Award, 18 June 2010 105, 123
- Inceysa Vallisoletana, S.L. v. Republic of El Salvador, ICSID Case No. ARB/03/26, Award, 2 August 2006 22, 103
- Industria Nacional de Alimentos, SA and Indalsa Perú, SA (formerly Empresas Lucchetti, SA and Lucchetti Perú, SA) v. Republic of Perú, ICSID Case No. ARB/03/4 (Peru/Chile BIT), Decision on Annulment, 5 September 2007 22, 92
- International Thunderbird Gaming Corporation v. United Mexican States, (NAFTA UNCITRAL), Final Award, 26 January 2006 29, 81
- Jan de Nul NV and Dredging International NV v. Arab Republic of Egypt, ICSID Case No. ARB/04/13, Decision on Jurisdiction, 16 June 2006 93, 117



- Joy Mining Machinery Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt, ICSID Case No. ARB/03/11, Award on Jurisdiction, 6 August 2004, 13 ICSID Reports 123 58, 62, 63, 64, 72, 78
- LESI, SpA and Astaldi, SpA v. People's Democratic Republic of Algeria, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/3, Decision on Jurisdiction, 12 July 2006, and Award, 12 November 2008 61, 62, 83, 90, 114
- LFH Neer and Pauline Neer (USA) v. United Mexican States, 1926, 6 RIAA 60 82
- Liberian Eastern Timber Corporation (LETCO) v. The Republic of Liberia, ICSID Case No. ARB/83/2, Award, 31 March 1986, 2 ICSID Reports 346 117
- Loewen Group, Inc. and Raymond L. Loewen v. United States, ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/98/3 (NAFTA), Award, 26 June 2003 14, 15, 50
- Maffezini v. Kingdom of Spain, ICSID Case No. ARB/97/7, Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 25 January 2000, 5 ICSID Reports 396 30, 107, 108, 123
- Malaysian Historical Salvors, SDN, BHD v. Malaysia, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/10, Award, 17 May 2007, and Annulment Decision, 16 April 2009 12, 63, 73, 115, 117, 135
- Methanex v. United States, UNCITRAL (NAFTA) 13, 25, 115, 120, 125, 126, 135
- Decision on Petitions from Third Persons to Intervene as 'Amici Curiae', 15 January 2001, 7 ICSID Reports 224 13, 115, 135
- Partial Award on Jurisdiction and Admissibility, 7 August 2002, 7 ICSID Reports 239 25
- Mihaly International Corporation v. Democratic Socialist Republic of Sri Lanka, ICSID Case No. ARB/00/2, Award, 15 March 2002, 6 ICSID Reports 310 16, 61, 63
- MTD Equity Sdn Bhd and MTD Chile SA v. Republic of Chile, ICSID Case No. ARB/01/7, Decision on Annulment, 21 March 2007, 13 ICSID Reports 500 77
- Pantechniki SA Contractors & Engineers v. Republic of Albania, ICSID Case No. ARB/07/21, Award, 30 July 2009 12, 64, 72, 74, 90, 91, 134, 135
- Parkerings-Compagniet AS v. Republic of Lithuania, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/8, Award, 11 September 2007 80, 81
- Patrick Mitchell v. Democratic Republic of the Congo, ICSID Case No. ARB/99/7, Annulment, 1 November 2006 63, 66, 67, 68, 116
- Philippe Gruslin v. Malaysia, ICSID Case No. ARB/99/3, Award, 27 November 2000 37



Table of cases

- Phoenix Action Ltd v. Czech Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/06/5, Award, 15 April 2009 69, 94, 105
- Plama Consortium Limited v. Bulgaria, ICSID Case No. ARB/03/24, Decision on Jurisdiction, 8 February 2005, 13 ICSID Reports 272 and Award, 27 August 2008 18, 30, 53, 103
- PSEG Global Inc. and Konya Ilgin Elektrik Üretim ve Ticaret Limited Sirketi v. Republic of Turkey, ICSID Case No. ARB/02/5, Decision on Jurisdiction, 4 June 2004, 11 ICSID Reports 434, and Award, 19 January 2007 58, 66, 116
- Renta 4 S.VS.A et al. v. Russian Federation, SCC No. 24/2007, Award on Preliminary Objections, 20 March 2009 12, 18, 24, 27, 28, 31, 39, 85, 119, 121, 124, 128, 129, 137
- RosInvestCo UKLtd. v. The Russian Federation, SCC Case No. Arb. V079/2005, Award on Jurisdiction, October 2007 18, 27, 31, 38, 121, 136
- Saipem S.p.A. v. The People's Republic of Bangladesh, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/07, Award, 30 June 2009 11, 58, 59, 120
- Salini Costruttori SpA and Italstrade SpA v. Kingdom of Morocco, ICSID Case No. ARB/00/4, Decision on Jurisdiction, 23 July 2001, 6 ICSID Reports 400 60, 61, 62, 78
- Saluka Investments BV v. Czech Republic, PCA, Partial Award, 17 March 2006, para. 240, available at: www.pca-cpa.org/showpage.asp?pag_id=1149p 50, 80, 84, 109
- Sempra Energy International v. The Argentine Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/02/16, Decision of 28 February 2007 116, 118
- SGS Société Générale de Surveillance S.A. v. Islamic Republic of Pakistan, ICSID Case No. ARB/01/13, Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 6 August 2003, 8 ICSID Reports 406 33, 34, 107
- SGS Société Générale de Surveillance SA v. Republic of the Philippines, ICSID Case No. ARB/02/6, Decision on Objections to Jurisdiction, 29 January 2004, 8 ICSID Reports 518 26, 33, 34, 35, 107, 112, 124
- Siemens A.G. v. Argentina, ICSID Case No. ARB/02/8, Decision on Jurisdiction, 3 August 2004, 12 ICSID Reports 174 30
- Société Générale v. Dominican Republic, UNCITRAL, LCIA Case No. UN7927, Preliminary Objections to Jurisdiction, 19 September 2008 59, 60, 64, 94
- Société Ouest Africaine des Bétons Industriels (SOABI) v. State of Senegal, ICSID Case No. ARB/82/1, Dissenting Opinion, 25 February 1988, 2 ICSID Reports 277 18, 45, 128
- Soufraki v. United Arab Emirates, ICSID Case No. ARB/02/7, Award, 7 July 2004, 12 ICSID Reports 158 54

xiii



- Spanish Zone of Morocco Claims, Claim No 44 Rzini (Dar Ben Karrish, Harvest), 1923, 2 UNRIAA 615 87, 88
- Técnicas Medioambientales Tecmed, SA v. United Mexican States, ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/2, Award, 29 May 2003, 10 ICSID Reports 134 83, 107
- The Rompetrol Group NV v. Romania, ICSID Case No. ARB/06/3, Decision on Jurisdiction and Admissibility, 18 April 2008, para. 85 52, 55, 137
- Tokios Tokelės v. Ukraine, ICSID Case No. ARB/02/18, Decision on Jurisdiction, 29 April 2004, 11 ICSID Reports 313 51, 64, 65, 93
- TSA Spectrum de Argentina S.A. v. Argentine Republic, ICSID Case No. ARB/05/5, Award, 19 December 2008 35, 52, 137
- United Parcel Service of America Inc v. Government of Canada, UNCITRAL (NAFTA), Decision on Amici Curiae, 17 October 2001 126
- Víctor Pey Casado and President Allende Foundation v. Republic of Chile, ICSID Case No. ARB/98/2, Award, 8 May 2008 69
- Waste Management, Inc v. United Mexican States (II), ICSID Case No. ARB(AF)/00/3, Award, 30 April 2004, 11 ICSID Reports 361 79, 83, 121
- World Duty Free Company v. Republic of Kenya, ICSID Case No. ARB/00/7, Award, 4 October 2006 104
- Yaung Chi Oo Trading PTE Ltd v. Government of the Union of Myanmar, ASEAN Case No. ARB/01/1, Award, 31 March 2003, (2003) 81
- Zhinvali Development Ltd v. Republic of Georgia, ICSID Case No. ARB/00/1, Award, 24 January 2003, 10 ICSID Reports 6 66, 116