

SPINOZA AND GERMAN IDEALISM

There can be little doubt that without Spinoza, German Idealism would have been just as impossible as it would have been without Kant. Yet the precise nature of Spinoza's influence on the German Idealists has hardly been studied in detail. This volume of essays by leading scholars sheds light on how the appropriation of Spinoza by Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel grew out of the reception of his philosophy by, among others, Lessing, Mendelssohn, Jacobi, Herder, Goethe, Schleiermacher, Maimon, and, of course, Kant. The volume thus not only illuminates the history of Spinoza's thought, but also initiates a genuine philosophical dialogue between the ideas of Spinoza and those of the German Idealists. The issues at stake – the value of humanity; the possibility and importance of self-negation; the nature and value of reason and imagination; human freedom; teleology; intuitive knowledge; the nature of God – remain of the highest philosophical importance today.

ECKART FÖRSTER is Professor of Philosophy, German, and the Humanities at Johns Hopkins University, and Honorary Professor of Philosophy at the Humboldt-Universität, Berlin. His most recent publications include *The Twenty-Five Years of Philosophy* (2012) and *Kant's Final Synthesis* (2000).

YITZHAK Y. MELAMED is Associate Professor of Philosophy and the Humanities at Johns Hopkins University. He is the author of *Spinoza's Metaphysics of Substance and Thought* (forthcoming), and co-editor, with Michael A. Rosenthal, of *Spinoza's Theological-Political Treatise: A Critical Guide* (Cambridge, 2010).





SPINOZA AND GERMAN IDEALISM

EDITED BY
ECKART FÖRSTER
AND
YITZHAK Y. MELAMED





> CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, São Paulo, Delhi, Mexico City

Cambridge University Press The Edinburgh Building, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107021983

© Cambridge University Press 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2012

Printed in the United Kingdom at the University Press, Cambridge

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

 ${\it Library of Congress \ Cataloguing \ in \ Publication \ data} \\ {\it Spinoza \ and \ German \ idealism \ / \ edited \ by \ Eckart \ F\"{o}rster, \ Yitzhak \ Y. \ Melamed.}$

p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.

18 BN 978-1-107-02198-3 (hardback)

I. Spinoza, Benedictus de, 1632–1677. 2. Idealism, German–History. 3. Philosophy,
German–17th century. I. Förster, Eckart. II. Melamed, Yitzhak Y., 1968–

B3998.87275 2012

199'.492-dc23 2012014212

ISBN 978-1-107-02198-3 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> To our children, Kira Förster, and Yonathan-Moshe, Alma-Eva, and Daniel-Jacob Melamed





Contents

Lis	t of contributors	page 1x
Lis	t of abbreviations	xi
	Introduction	I
Ι	Rationalism, idealism, monism, and beyond <i>Michael Della Rocca</i>	7
2	Kant's idea of the unconditioned and Spinoza's: the fourth Antinomy and the Ideal of Pure Reason <i>Omri Boehm</i>	27
3	"The question is whether a purely apparent person is possible's Karl Ameriks	, 44
4	Herder and Spinoza Michael N. Forster	59
5	Goethe's Spinozism Eckart Förster	85
6	Fichte on the consciousness of Spinoza's God Johannes Haag	100
7	Fichte on freedom: the Spinozistic background Allen Wood	121
8	Spinoza in Schelling's early conception of intellectual intuitio Dalia Nassar	n 136
9	Schelling's philosophy of identity and Spinoza's <i>Ethica more</i> geometrico Michael Vater	156

vii



viii	Contents	
Ю	"Omnis determinatio est negatio": determination, negation, and self-negation in Spinoza, Kant, and Hegel Yitzhak Y. Melamed	175
II	Thought and metaphysics: Hegel's critical reception of Spinoza Dean Moyar	197
12	Two models of metaphysical inferentialism: Spinoza and Hegel <i>Gunnar Hindrichs</i>	214
13	Trendelenburg and Spinoza Frederick Beiser	232
14	A reply on Spinoza's behalf Don Garrett	248
Bib	liography	269
Ind	ex of references to Spinoza's Ethics	276
Gen	neral index	278



Contributors

- KARL AMERIKS is McMahon-Hank Professor of Philosophy at the University of Notre Dame.
- FREDERICK BEISER is Professor of Philosophy at Syracuse University.
- OMRI BOEHM is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the New School for Social Research, New York.
- MICHAEL DELLA ROCCA is Andrew Downey Orrick Professor of Philosophy at Yale University.
- ECKART FÖRSTER is Professor of Philosophy, German, and the Humanities at Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, and Honorary Professor of Philosophy at the Humboldt-Universität, Berlin.
- MICHAEL N. FORSTER is Glen A. Lloyd Distinguished Service Professor of Philosophy and the College at the University of Chicago.
- DON GARRETT is Professor of Philosophy and Chair of Department at New York University.
- JOHANNES HAAG is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Potsdam.
- GUNNAR HINDRICHS is Visiting Associate Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pennsylvania.
- YITZHAK Y. MELAMED is Associate Professor of Philosophy and the Humanities at Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore.
- DEAN MOYAR is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore.
- DALIA NASSAR is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Villanova University.



X

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02198-3 - Spinoza and German Idealism Edited by Eckart Förster and Yitzhak Y. Melamed Frontmatter More information

List of contributors

MICHAEL VATER is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Marquette University, Milwaukee.

ALLEN WOOD is Ruth Norman Halls Professor of Philosophy at Indiana University, Bloomington.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press

www.cambridge.org



Abbreviations

(for complete references see the bibliography)

AA	Kant, Gesammelte Schriften (Akademie Ausgabe)
A/B	Kant, <i>Critik der reinen Vernunft</i> , 1st edn. (A); and 2nd edn. (B), respectively
AT	Descartes, <i>Oeuvres de Descartes</i> (ed. Adam and Tannery)
C	The Collected Works of Spinoza (ed. and trans. Curley)
CM	Spinoza, Metaphysical Thoughts (in C)
CSM	The Philosophical Writings of Descartes (trans.
	Cottingham, Stoothoff, and Murdoch)
DPP	Spinoza, Descartes' Principles of Philosophy (in C)
E	Spinoza, <i>Ethics</i> : a(-xiom), app(-endix), c(-orollary),
	d(-efinition), dem(-onstration), expl(-anation),
	lem(-ma), p(-roposition), pref(-ace), s(-cholium).
	[Thus, e.g., E1d3 is the third definition of Part 1 and
	E1p16dem is the demonstration of proposition 16 of
	Part 1]
EL	Hegel, The Encylopaedia Logic
Ep.	Spinoza, The Letters
FW	Fichte, Werke, ed. I. H. Fichte
G	Spinoza, Opera (ed. C. Gebhardt). [E.g., G IV/25/12 is a
	reference to Vol. IV of Gebhardt's critical edition, p. 25,
	line 12]
GA	Fichte, Gesamtausgabe der Bayrischen Akademie der
	Wissenschaften
GW	Hegel, Gesammelte Werke



xii	List of abbreviations
HA	Goethe, Werke (Hamburger Ausgabe)
HG	Herder, Werke (ed. U. Gaier et al.)
HKA	Schelling, Werke (Historisch-kritische Ausgabe)
HS	Herder, Sämtliche Werke (ed. Suphan et al.)
IW	Fichte, Introductions to the Wissenschaftslehre and Other
	Writings (1787–1800)
KGA	Schleiermacher, Kritische Gesamtausgabe
KpV	Kant, Critique of Practical Reason
KrV	Kant, Critique of Pure Reason
KV	Spinoza, Short Treatise on God, Man, and his Well-Being
	(in C)
LHP	Hegel, Lectures on the History of Philosophy
LPR	Hegel, Lectures on the Philosophy of Religion
NR	Fichte, Foundations of Natural Right
SE	Fichte, System of Ethics
SL	Hegel's Science of Logic (trans. Miller)
SW	Schelling, Sämtliche Werke
TIE	Spinoza, Treatise on the Emendation of the Intellect (in C)
TTP	Spinoza, Theologico-Political Treatise
W	Hegel, Werke in 20 Bänden