

## ARISTOTLE'S *ETHICS* AND MORAL RESPONSIBILITY

Aristotle's *Ethics* develops a complex theory of the qualities which make for a good human being, and for several decades there has been intense discussion about whether Aristotle's theory of voluntariness, outlined in the *Ethics*, actually delineates what modern thinkers would recognise as a theory of moral responsibility. Javier Echeñique presents a novel account of Aristotle's discussion of voluntariness, arguing – against the interpretation by Arthur Adkins, and that inspired by Peter Strawson – that he developed an original and compelling theory of moral responsibility and that this theory has contributed in important ways to our understanding of coercion, ignorance and violence. His study will be valuable for a wide range of readers interested in Aristotle and in ancient ethics more broadly.

JAVIER ECHEÑIQUE is an associate professor at the Institute of Philosophy at the Pontifical Catholic University of Chile.

# ARISTOTLE'S *ETHICS* AND MORAL RESPONSIBILITY

JAVIER ECHEÑIQUE



Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-1-107-02158-7 — Aristotle's Ethics and Moral Responsibility  
 Javier Echeñique  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,  
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of  
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781107021587](http://www.cambridge.org/9781107021587)

© Javier Echeñique 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions  
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take  
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2012

First paperback edition 2015

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data*

Echeñique, Javier, 1980–

Aristotle's Ethics and Moral Responsibility / Javier Echeñique.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02158-7

1. Aristotle – Ethics. 2. Ethics, Ancient. I. Title.

B49I.E7E24 2012

171'.3 – dc23 2012006478

ISBN 978-1-107-02158-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-49965-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence  
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this  
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will  
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	page vi
<i>Abbreviations of Aristotle's texts</i>	viii
Introduction	I
PART I TOWARDS AN ACCOUNT OF ETHICAL ASCRIPTION	
1 Against the Strawsonian interpretation	19
2 Aristotle on ethical ascription	55
PART II THE DEFEATERS OF ETHICAL ASCRIPTION	
3 The definitions of violence	87
4 Coercion as justification and excuse I: the <i>Ethica Eudemia</i>	112
5 Coercion as justification and excuse II: the <i>Ethica Nicomachea</i>	134
6 Factual error and the source of blame	148
7 The pain condition	173
Conclusion	192
Appendix: Two lexical ambiguities	195
<i>Bibliography</i>	199
<i>Index</i>	207

## *Acknowledgements*

This book is the result of a conglomerate of efforts, not entirely my own. First and foremost, it is the result of working under the tutelage of Sarah Broadie, to whom I am particularly indebted for her sustained support during my years of study at the University of St Andrews, for disciplining what I initially thought of as incorrigible argumentation, and for provoking many ideas. It is also the result of having reflected on the insightful criticisms and suggestions of David Charles and Anthony Duff, as well as on the comments of those who have read individual chapters (Jens Timmermann, Dan Labriolla, Beris Gaut and James Harris).

I have also greatly benefited from having worked in a propitious academic environment during those years, one that gave me the opportunity of exposing my ideas in conferences (the APS 2010 and the NAAP 2008 conferences) and seminars, as well as in more informal contexts. My special thanks in this regard go to all the Chilean taxpayers who indirectly sustained my biological life throughout my doctorate, through the Presidente de la República Scholarship.

After I submitted my Ph.D dissertation, a number of people also read and commented on drafts of this book, or parts of it. Timothy Chappell, who read and commented on the book for Cambridge University Press, made many detailed suggestions for improvement, and two anonymous referees for Cambridge University Press also contributed to sharpening my perception of the possible objections that could be made to some of my arguments. I should like to record my gratitude to all the people mentioned above.

The work of turning the dissertation into a book has been mostly carried out in Santiago de Chile, as a lecturer at the Centre of Classical Studies (Universidad Metropolitana de las Ciencias de la Educación) and at the Department of Philosophy, Universidad de Chile. I am grateful to all my colleagues for their kind support and for the professional environment they

*Acknowledgements*

vii

help to create, despite the challenging circumstances surrounding public education in Chile. This book is dedicated to all of them.

To Hilary Gaskin at Cambridge University Press I am grateful for believing in this project from the very beginning, and to Anna Lowe, Tom O'Reilly and Elizabeth Davison for their diligence and kindness in answering all my queries.

I am also obliged to Angela Viola-Glapinska for tolerating during this year the inevitable side-effects associated with the writing of a book, and to my dear parents, Jorge and Rosario, for offering me their firm support during the whole period of my interest in philosophy, since its uncertain beginnings when I was an undergraduate student.

As will become evident, this work is also greatly indebted to Susan Sauvé Meyer's book *Aristotle on Moral Responsibility*, which has considerably raised the standards of discussion on this topic. *Aristotle's Ethics and Moral Responsibility* was completed before the reissue of Sauvé Meyer's book in 2011, so references are to the 1993 edition.

## *Abbreviations of Aristotle's texts*

Analytica Posteriora: *An. Post.*  
Analytica Priora: *An. Pr.*  
Ars Rhetorica: *Rhet.*  
Categoriae: *Cat.*  
De Anima: *De An.*  
De Caelo: *Cael.*  
De Generatione et Corruptione: *GC*  
De Motu Animalium: *MA.*  
De Sophisticis Elenchis: *Soph. El.*  
De Virtutibus et Vitiis: *De Virt.* (spurious)  
Ethica Eudemia: *EE*  
Ethica Nicomachea: *EN*  
Magna Moralia: *MM* (disputed authorship)  
Metaphysica: *Met.*  
Physica: *Phys.*  
Poetica: *Poet.*  
Politica: *Pol.*  
Topica: *Top.*