

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

Index

- Adams, Dr John Bodkin 35–6, 304–5
 Adams, M. 318
Adomako [1995] 4, 43
 facts and trial 57–8, 185
 ‘gross negligence’ 44, 122–5, 129, 144–5, 198, 204
 expansion of four-part test 149–50
 relevance of context 104, 109, 116, 154–5, 185
 adversary system 81–3, 86
 Alghrani, A. 149–50
 Allain, Dr Jean-Pierre 267, 269, 271–4
 Allen, Neil 7, 10, 123, 153, 185
 Allitt, Beverly 27
 Alpers, Professor Ann 292–3
 anaesthesia, mortality and the courts from ether to *Adomako* 4, 43–64
 Adomako 57–8, 63–4
 Adomako and luck 59–62
 Adomako’s case compared to others 59–60
 Adomako’s qualifications 62
 effect of allegation of leaving the patient 61
 hostility of expert medical witnesses 58, 60
 anaesthesia, errors and death 44–7
 blameworthy violations 45–6, 128
 errors having substantial chance of causing significant harm 45
 manslaughter investigations after medication errors/mechanical problems 46–7
 Dr Yogasakaran’s case 46–7, 63
 anaesthetists more likely to be investigated and convicted 44
 conclusion – lessons from history 62–4
 voluntary disclosure of information declining 63
 the first conviction 54–62
 Adomako 57–62
 continued concern over anaesthetic mortality deaths 56
 Dr William Gray’s case 54–5
 Dr Chander Notaney’s case 55, 60
 media attention to medical error/declining public trust in doctors 56–7
 history, anaesthesia and death 47–54
 Commissions to examine safety of anaesthetics 50
 concerns over deaths associated with chloroform 50, 63
 concerns over increasing number of deaths under anaesthesia 52–4
 first inquest into possible chloroform-related death 49–50
 first inquest into possible ether-related death 48–9
 Hewitt’s reform proposals and proposed legislation 51–2
Andrews [1937] 253, 254
 Annual Report of the Serious Hazards of Blood Transfusion (2001–2002) 179
 Ashworth, A. 2, 130, 132, 149
 assisted dying *see* physician-assisted dying and palliative medicine; *see under* victims’ voices, interests and criminal justice in the healthcare setting
 Association of Anaesthetists 54, 56
 Australia – doctors who kill and harm their patients 3–4, 9, 248–64
 an Australian perspective 261–4
 appropriateness of current test for negligent manslaughter 262–3
 criminal prosecutions rare 249, 255, 261–2
 increase in prosecutions 264
 proposed special medical homicide offence 263–4
 basis for criminal liability 249–55
 the cases 255

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

Index

321

- Dr Bailey and Dr Gill 255–6
- Dr Jayant Patel 248, 259, 262
- Dr George Pegios 254, 257–8, 264
- Graeme Reeves 248, 258–9, 262
- Dr Gerrit Reimers 256, 263
- Dr Suman Sood 256–7, 264
- Dr William Valentine 255
- Dr Bruce Ward 257, 264
- legal obstacles to conviction 252–5
 - causation 254–5
 - consent 252–3
 - gross negligence 253–4
- offences 250–2
 - causing bodily harm 251–2
 - manslaughter 250–1
- publicity orders 207
- Baker, R. 41
- Barshi, L. 178
- Bateman* [1925] 60–1, 123, 254
- Battin, Margaret 308
- Beecher, H. K. 54
- Belgium 306
- Berger, John 37
- Biggs, H. 313
- Bismark, Marie 240
- Blair, Ross 231
- blood transfusions
 - HIV contamination *see* France – role of the criminal law in healthcare malpractice
 - involuntary automaticity 178–9, 181–2
- Bolam* test 109
- Boldt, Dr H. J. 51, 62
- Bonython* [1984] 102–3
- Brahams, D. 62
- Brazier, M. 2, 123, 149–50
- Brearey-Horne, Penelope J. 8, 10
- Bronitt, S. 252
- Brown* [1993] 252
- Bunkle, Phillida 235
- Burke* [2005] 311–12, 318
- Callaghan* [1952] (Australia) 250–1, 253, 254
- Callahan, R. 263
- Canada 207
- Canter, David 24
- Care Quality Commission 182–3, 213
- Cartwright Report (New Zealand) 235
- Casteret, Anne-Marie 270
- Cellarius, V. 312
- Chabot, B. 315–16
- Chalmers, James 5, 8
- Clarkson, C. 128
- clincide 19–20
 - contemporary cases 27–30
 - healthcare serial killings in different healthcare systems 27–9, 42
 - patterned by routine activities of offenders' non-criminal activities 28–30
 - fictional accounts of clincide 32–5
 - meaning 19
 - number of healthcare professionals committing clincide 19–20
 - scale of suspicious deaths compared to proven murders 19
 - as serial killing 20
- Code of Patients' Rights (New Zealand) 229–30, 232, 234, 237, 247
- Coggon, J. 312
- Cole, G. F. 290–1
- Coney, Sandra 235
- Confidential Enquiries 213–15, 225
 - criticisms in Reports 214–15
 - definitions of maternal death and substandard care 213–14
- confidentiality *see* doctors, disease transmission, confidentiality and criminal process
- Controlled Substances Act 1970 (US) 283–6
- 'controlling mind' 144–5, 167, 224
- Cook, Robert 94, 98
- Coroners Act 1988 (New Zealand) 236, 243
- coroners and inquests 88
 - anaesthesia, errors and death 44–5, 47–9, 52–4, 55, 58–60
- ECHR Article 2 making coronial investigations more extensive 87–8, 121
- families of victims increasingly engaged in coroners' work 89, 99
- increase in complaints/inquests into medical deaths 118, 135, 146
- medical deaths before the 1990s rarely extensively investigated 1
- New Zealand 242–3
- Shipman* case 16–17, 22, 24–6
- corporate liability *see* maternal death and Corporate Manslaughter and Corporate Homicide Act 2007; medical manslaughter – organisational liability
- Cotszold Geotechnical Holdings* [2011] 193–5, 199, 218–22, 224–5
- Coull, R. 190
- criminal law and healthcare 2–3, 5, 10

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

322 Index

- Crown Prosecution Service (CPS) 7, 57, 82–3, 118
 Code for Crown Prosecutors 118–19, 133
 evidential test 89–92, 118–19, 133, 144–5, 199
 public interest test 90–2, 118–19, 133, 144–5
 corporate manslaughter guidance 207–8
 corporate manslaughter protocol with HSE and regulatory agencies 193, 207–8
 DPP's consent required for corporate manslaughter offence 193
 DPP's guidance on homicide 124–5
 DPP's guidelines on public interest in assisted suicides 93–4, 109, 150, 301
 possible further guidance on factors for/against prosecution 109, 116, 150
 ECHR Article 2 making investigations more extensive 87–8, 94, 120–1, 139, 155–6
 investigations influenced by victims' families 89, 156
 medical deaths and near-deaths 90–2, 95, 102
 Special Crime Division 119–20, 139
 victim involvement in prosecution decision-making 89–92
see also prosecution decision-making in medical manslaughter cases
 Cullen, Charles 29
- Davie v. Edinburgh Magistrates* [1953] 102
 defensive medicine 5, 154–7
 'ripple effect' of manslaughter prosecutions 244
 voluntary disclosure of information declining 63
 deference *see under* healthcare professionals
 Dekker, S. 47, 61
Detection of Secret Homicide, The (Havard) 35
 Devlin, Lord 35–6
 Director of Public Prosecutions (DPP) *see under* Crown Prosecution Service (CPS)
 disclosure 63, 241
see also doctors, disease transmission, confidentiality and criminal process
- disease transmission *see* doctors, disease transmission, confidentiality and criminal process
 diversion *see under* use and impact of the criminal process on treatment of pain in the USA
 Dobinson, Ian 9, 262
Doctor Glas (Soderberg) 33
Doctor's Dilemma, The (Shaw) 18, 32–3
 doctors, disease transmission, confidentiality and criminal process 5, 78
 breaching confidentiality to prevent the onward transmission of HIV 68–70
 distinction between a duty and a power to warn 69–70
 duty of care 69
 confidentiality and the investigation of accusations of crime 70–5
 communicating confidentiality guarantees 73–5
 medical records 71–3, 75
 nature of what is recorded 75
 record-keeping in anonymous form 73–4
 research records 72, 74
 solicitor–client privilege and doctor–patient communications 72–3
 criminalisation of HIV transmission and debates on intervention 66
 medical advice and criminal culpability 75–8
 medical advice as determinative of culpability 76–8
 nature of medical confidentiality 67–8, 73
 justifications 67, 78
 Donaldson, Sir Liam 18
Dr No (Fleming) 36
 Drug Enforcement Administration (USA) 284–5, 295–6, 298
 Duff, R. 127, 129
 Dufoix, Georgina 267, 275–6
 Dunn [2010], 164–5
 Duthie Report on the Safe and Secure Handling of Medicines 221
- Eagleton, T. 24
Easing the Passing (Devlin) 35–6
 emergencies 167, 202–3
 as exculpatory factor 106–7
 failure to deal with 214
 Erin, C. A. 1

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

Index

323

- European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)
- Article 2 311
 - duty on public bodies to conduct extensive investigations 87–9, 94
 - effects of interpretation 96–7, 100, 120–1, 135, 139
 - Article 3 311
 - Article 7 164, 172
 - Article 8 311
- Evans* [2009] 124
- evidence, need to retain and disclose 188, 191
- experts/expert evidence 119–20
- see also* medical manslaughter and expert evidence: the role of context and character
- Fabius, Laurent 275–6
- Farrell, Anne-Maree 9–10
- Ferner, R. 92, 131–4, 155–6
- Filkins, J. A. 297
- Fortunate Man, A* (Berger) 37
- Forty Years of Murder* (Simpson) 35
- France – role of the criminal law in
- healthcare malpractice 3–4, 9, 131, 265–79
 - analysing the use of criminal law in cases of healthcare malpractice 276–8
 - claims for financial compensation joined to criminal complaints 276
 - institutional and regulatory reform 278
 - involuntary offences on grounds of social utility 276, 279
 - potential for criminal liability leading to precautionary approach 277–9
- conclusion 278–9
- appropriateness of criminal law for addressing collective failure 278–9
- French approach as an alternative to the English approach 279
- HIV blood contamination episode 265–70
- blood service and manufacture of plasma-derived products 266–7
 - extent of blood donations infected with HIV 269–70
 - ministries responsible for national blood system 268
 - risk contaminated blood posed to PWH 269–70
 - testing and licensing of drugs/medical devices 268–9
 - use of the criminal law 270–6
 - exposure of high rate of HIV infection among haemophiliacs 270
 - first set of proceedings 271–3
 - Lucas Report 270–1, 275
 - second set of proceedings 274
 - third set of proceedings 275–6
- Frank, Arthur 30
- Friedman, L. 195
- Garetta, Dr Michel 266–7, 269–74
- Garland, D. 85–6, 97
- General Medical Council 115, 156–7
- advance care planning guidance 310
 - confidentiality guidance 69–70
 - educational standards 52
 - failure to protect public in drug conviction cases 15–16
 - Fitness to Practise jurisdiction 40
 - regulating the medical profession 1, 24–5
 - response to Shipman's drug convictions 15
 - unsafe working practices guidance 181–2
 - withdrawal of artificial hydration/nutrition guidance 311
- Gill* [1992] (Australia) 255–6
- Goldenbaum, D. M. 294–6
- Goldsworthy, Peter 31
- Gooderham, Peter 7–8
- Gordijn, B. 316–17
- Great Western Hospitals NHS Trust* 211–13, 217–23, 225
- Green, R. G. 178–9
- Griffiths, Danielle 6–7, 9–10, 88–9, 91
- Griffiths, J. 318
- gross negligence manslaughter *see under* prosecution decision-making in medical manslaughter cases
- Guy's & St Thomas' NHS Trust* [2008] 186
- Hall* [2007] 159
- Hart, H. 130
- Hart, Dr Julian Tudor 32
- Havard, John 35
- Healey, A. 178
- Health and Disability Commissioner (New Zealand) *see under* New Zealand's response to health practitioner negligence
- Health and Disability Commissioner Act 1994 (New Zealand) 232, 239–40
- health and safety 196–8
- Health and Safety at Work Act (1974) 185–6, 193–4, 198, 212
 - burden of proof 197

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

324 Index

- health and safety (cont.)
 - liability to prosecution under 192–3, 196–7
- Health and Safety Executive (HSE) 119, 193, 197, 220
 - and CPS guidance on corporate manslaughter 207–8
 - liaison protocol between CPS, HSE and regulatory agencies 193, 207–8
 - ‘name and shame’ database 207
- Sentencing Guidelines 193, 197–8, 206–7
- Health Practitioners Competence Assurance Act 2003 (New Zealand) 232–3, 240
- Healthcare Commission, 185, 225
 - maternity service provision survey 216
 - Mid Stafford Hospital report 182–3
 - Northwick Park Hospital report 216
- healthcare professionals
 - anaesthetists’ errors *see* anaesthesia, mortality and the courts from ether to *Adomako*
 - criminal liability as strongest formal condemnation 2
 - deference
 - criminal justice agencies and judges becoming less deferential 1–2
 - declining levels of public trust and deference 2–4, 132, 134–5, 262
 - deference previously shown to medical profession 1, 55, 87
 - healthcare management accountability 2, 7, 200–1, 205–6, 217–18
 - see also* medical manslaughter – organisational liability
 - increased vulnerability to criminal charges/investigations 1–2
 - misuse of drugs 16
 - see also* use and impact of the criminal process on treatment of pain in the USA
 - unsafe working practices, what should clinical staff do about 181–4, 191
 - doctors’ professional duty stipulated by GMC 181–2
 - failure by management to take reasonable action 182–4
 - reasonable action by employer/contracting body 182
 - reporting systems and whistleblowing policies 182
- Hervé, Edmond 267, 275–6
- Hewitt, Dr F. W. 51–2, 62
- HIV blood contamination *see* France – role of the criminal law in healthcare malpractice
- HIV transmission *see* doctors, disease transmission, confidentiality and criminal process
- Holm, S. 319
- homicide law in England and Wales 121–2, 184
- Horder, J. 128
- Human Fertilisation and Embryology Act 1990 (as amended by HFE 2008) 1
- Human Rights Review Tribunal (New Zealand) 239, 247
- Human Tissue Act 2004 1
- Hunt, Dr John 31–2, 38
- Hurwitz, Brian 4, 41
- Hurwitz* [2006] (USA) 297–9
- Inglehart, R. 318
- Inglis, Francis 94, 98
- inquests *see* coroners and inquests
- involuntary automaticity and medical manslaughter 7–8, 177
 - causative factors of involuntary automaticity 180
 - clinical staff actions on unsafe working practices *see under* healthcare professionals
 - gross negligence manslaughter: its use in the medical setting 184–6
 - Adomako* and Misra and responsibility of their employers 185–6
 - finer on public bodies 186, 206–7, 223
- homicide offences 184
- individual liability or corporate liability for manslaughter? 186–8
- unheeded warnings 187–8
- involuntary automaticity 177–9
 - aviation and healthcare comparison in context of safety 178–9
 - leading to errors 178
 - nature of involuntary automaticity 177–8
 - verbal double-checking safety checklist procedures to reduce errors 178, 181
- involuntary automaticity: what can be done about it? 181
- medical mistakes and involuntary automaticity 179–80
 - blood transfusions 178–9
 - radiotherapy 179–80
- need to retain and disclose evidence 188, 191

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

Index

325

- role of criminal liability 188–9
- true *mens rea*? 190
- ‘whistleblowers’, treatment of 183, 190–1

- James, Daniel 92–3
- Janssens, R. 316–17
- Jernigan, J. C. 292
- Jones, R. 166
- juries 91
 - convincing the jury 135–6, 145
 - corporate manslaughter
 - health and safety regulations relevant in considering culpability 196
 - issues for consideration 217–23
 - verdicts on more than one charge 208
 - ill-suited to determining mental disorders 162–3, 172
 - more willing to convict where restorative justice used 155
 - subjective recklessness test, applying 147
 - sympathy for healthcare professionals 91, 144–5
 - reluctance to convict in small towns 291
 - unheeded warnings, effect on jury’s decision 187–8, 190

- Kaplan, H. S. 180
- Kazarian, Melinee 9–10
- Keating, H. 129
- Kelly, HM Advocate v.* [2001] 72, 74
- Keown, J. 305
- King’s Fund 216
- Kollas, C. D. 292, 294
- Kramer, J. 272

- Lacey, Nicola 110
- Lancet, The* 31, 49–51, 59, 63
 - Lancet Commission 50
- Laurie, G. T. 302
- Law Commission 101, 160, 201, 203–4
- Lawrence* [1982] 58
- Le Médecin malgré lui / A Doctor and No Doctor* (Molière) 32
- Leader, Darian 22–3
- Levinas, E. 24
- Libby, R. T. 296
- Linden, J. V. 180
- Linsell* [1997] 310–11
- Loder, Caroline 94–5
- Long* [1995] 231
- Lovrich, N. P. 292–4
- Lucas, Michel 270–1, 275
- Lund, Frank 94, 98
- Lyons, Barry 4, 97–8

- MacIntosh, Sir Robert 52–4, 63
- Mahendra, Dr B. 24
- Majors, Orville Lynn 28
- Malèvre, Christine 28
- Malice Aforethought* (Iles) 33–4
- Manning, Joanna 246–7
- Mascie-Taylor, H. 177–8, 180–1
- Mason, J. K. 302
- maternal death and Corporate
 - Manslaughter and Corporate Homicide Act 2007 (CMCH Act) 16, 122, 144–5, 210–26
 - case study: the ‘needless’ death of Mayra Cabrera 211–13
 - Care Quality Commission review 213
 - deaths of Sereena Ali and Violet Stephens 212–13
 - systemic organisational failings 211–13
- CMCH Act and *Great Western Hospitals NHS Trust* 211–13, 217–23, 225
- Cotswold Geotechnical Holdings* 193–5, 199, 218–22, 224–5
- concerns about poor systems, practices and procedures in maternity services 210–11
- conclusion 223–6
 - systemic deficiencies as more than an insignificant cause of death 225–6
 - tentative approach taken to prosecutions under CMCH Act 223–5
- statistics on maternal deaths 210
- systemic organisational deficiencies as contributory cause of maternal death 213–17
- Confidential Enquiries *see* Confidential Enquiries
- Healthcare Commission report on Northwick Park Hospital 216
- Healthcare Commission survey into maternity service provision 216
- King’s Fund study 216
- NHS Litigation Authority/Clinical Negligence Scheme for Trusts 217, 223
- McCall Smith, A. 46–7, 128, 246
- McDowell, S. 92, 131–4, 155–6
- McSherry, B. 252
- Medical Council of New Zealand 232–4, 240–2
- Medical Defence Union 133
- Medical Error Action Group (Australia) 249

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

326 Index

- medical manslaughter and expert evidence:
 - the roles of context and character 6, 101–16
 - character of defendants 110–16
 - characters ‘not fitting in’, racism and expert assessment 89, 114–16
 - experts’ evaluations about character as well as conduct 111–13
 - legitimacy of attention to behaviour and attitude 113
 - relevance of character to criminal liability 110–11
 - risks of using character perceptions for gross negligence assessments 113–14
 - conclusion 115–16
 - experts 102–3
 - evaluating the admissibility and reliability of expert evidence 102–3
 - identifying experts for interview 103
 - scope of scientific evidence 102
 - relevance of context 104–9, 115
 - ‘bad apples’ approach 104–5
 - being overworked as exculpatory factor 105
 - bias, hindsight and outcome 105
 - Bolam* test and gross negligence 109
 - broad test/flexible approach to investigating/interpreting context 104
 - emergencies as exculpatory factor 106–7
 - experts dependent on quality of evidence presented to them 108–9,
- medical manslaughter:
 - organisational context as exculpatory factor 105–8
 - organisational liability 8, 122, 192–209
 - brief conceptual and legal history 194–6
 - corporations as legal persons 194–5
 - historical development of corporate liability 195–6
 - clinical staff actions on unsafe working practices *see under* healthcare professionals
 - conclusion 208–9
 - ‘controlling mind’ 144–5, 167, 224
 - Corporate Manslaughter and Corporate Homicide Act 2007 (CMCH Act)
 - broader legal landscape 192–3
 - and corporate manslaughter 200–7
 - difficulty in securing convictions for corporate manslaughter as driver 198–9
 - first prosecution under CMCH Act 193–5, 199, 218–22, 224–5
 - liaison protocol between CPS, HSE and regulatory agencies 193, 207–8
 - corporate manslaughter and CMCH Act 192, 200
 - causing death 203–4
 - culpability element 204–5
 - exemptions 202–3
 - finances on public bodies 186, 206–7, 223
 - offence 201
 - penalties 206–7
 - publicity orders 207, 225–6
 - relevant duty of care 201
 - remedial orders 207, 225–6
 - senior management 205–6
 - Sentencing Guidelines 193, 197–8, 206–7
 - threshold question 201
 - gross negligence (common law) manslaughter 198–9
 - health and safety 196–8
 - involuntary automaticity 179–80
 - medical manslaughter often a chain of relatively small mistakes 146
 - prosecution policy 207–8
 - role of criminal liability 188–9
 - serious systemic failures 142, 151–2, 154–5
 - Special Crime Division’s role 120
 - warnings *see* warnings
 - whistleblowing, retribution for 190
 - see also* maternal death and Corporate Manslaughter and Corporate Homicide Act 2007
 - Medical Practitioners Act 1995 (New Zealand) 232–3
 - Meisel, A. 292
 - Mental Capacity Act 2005
 - s. 44 of the Act 7, 153, 160–1
 - defendant having ‘care of’ the victim 166
 - incapacitated decision-making 163
 - lack of legal certainty surrounding statutory offences 164–5
 - prohibition of ill-treatment and wilful neglect 160–1, 172
 - Mental Health Act 1983
 - s. 127 of the Act 7, 153, 160
 - fortifying common law duty of care 166
 - lack of legal certainty surrounding statutory offences 164–5
 - meaning of ‘mental disorder’ 162–3

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

Index

327

- mental disorder and a caring obligation 164
- prohibition of ill-treatment and wilful neglect 160, 172
- receiving psychiatric treatment 163
- mercy killings 94, 98
- Merrett, Jamie 126, 152
- Merry, A. 46–7, 128, 130, 231, 235, 246
- Mid Staffordshire Hospital 7
 - accountability of healthcare management 2, 162
 - ‘directing and controlling mind’ 167
 - reporting of concerns not acted upon 182–3
- Milford Haven Port Authority* [2000] 186
- Misra* [2004] 109, 116, 122, 124–5, 129, 148, 185–6
- Misuse of Drugs Act (1971) 16
- Mitterrand, President François 272
- Mola* [2007] 75–8
- Montgomery, J. 129
- Morrell* [2002] 172
- Mullock, Alexandra 10
- National Patient Safety Agency 3
- Netherlands 3–4
 - palliative care/CDS 10, 313–17, 319
 - development of 316–17
 - importance of 313–16
 - and PAD 302–3, 317
 - physician-assisted dying (PAD) on request 302–3, 318
 - legalisation 304, 306, 314
 - majority of requests rejected/subject to delaying tactics 315
 - stopping eating and drinking as an alternative 315–16
- Netter, Dr Robert 268, 271
- New Zealand Medical Law Reform Group (NZMLRG) 229, 231
- New Zealand Quality of Healthcare Study 238
- New Zealand’s response to health practitioner negligence 3–4, 8–10, 154, 229–47
 - accountability in 2012 246–7
 - whether pendulum has swung too far 246–7
 - background 230–1
 - NZMLRG’s campaign for reform 229, 231
 - prosecutions for medical manslaughter under Crimes Act 230–1
 - a changed perspective 245–6
 - liability only where health practitioner kills by reckless acts/omissions 245
 - manslaughter conviction an unhelpful form of accountability 246
- Code of Patients’ Rights 229–30, 232, 234, 237, 247
- conclusion 247
- gross negligence manslaughter 243–5
 - inconsistency in approach 243–4
 - invoking criminal law for negligence frustrates accountability channels 244
 - ‘ripple effect’ of manslaughter prosecutions 244
- Health and Disability Commissioner (HDC), 9, 229–30, 240–1
 - greater flexibility in handling complaints 239–40
 - naming policy 241–2
 - reduction in investigations 233–5
 - statutory complaints regime 232, 237–9, 246–7
- impact of law changes 233–5
 - competence reviews 233–4
 - reduction in criminal and disciplinary proceedings 233
 - reduction in HDC investigations 233–5
- increased complaints/publicity in healthcare events and rehabilitation 229
- July 1996 – a turning point 231–3
 - introduction of Code of Patients’ Rights 232
 - new regulatory system for medical practitioners 232–3
 - reduction in manslaughter threshold/gross negligence introduced 231–2
- new forms of accountability 235–7
 - accident compensation scheme/barring damages claims 235–7
 - focus on competence assurance 237
 - impact of introduction of Coroners Act 236
 - outdated professional regulation/concern about self-regulation 236
 - underdevelopment of patients’ rights 235
- other developments 241–3
 - coroners’ inquests 242–3
 - HDC naming policy 241–2
 - Medical Council’s rehabilitative approach 242
 - voluntary disclosure 241
 - voluntary public disclosure 241

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

328 Index

- New Zealand's response to health practitioner negligence (cont.)
 patient safety movement 238–40
 competence assurance 232–3, 240
 extended right of proceedings before Human Rights Review Tribunal 239
 greater flexibility for HDC in handling complaints 239–40
 high prevalence of preventable harm to patients 238
 reformed coverage of medical accidents under compensation legislation 240
 rehabilitative focus in interests of the public 238
 'systems thinking' 238
- Nicklinson, Tony 94
- Norris, Lisa 179–80
- Northwick Park Hospital 216
- Norwood, Frances 317
- Nydam* [1977] (Australia) 253–4
- O'Doherty, S. 136
- OLL Ltd* [1996] 224
- On Murder Considered as One of the Fine Arts* (De Quincey) 20
- O'Neill, Onora 36–7
- organisational liability *see* medical manslaughter: organisational liability
- Ost, S. 1, 315–16
- pain treatment *see* physician-assisted dying and palliative medicine; use and impact of the criminal process on treatment of pain in the USA
- palliative treatment *see* physician-assisted dying and palliative medicine
- Paper Mask, A* (Collee) 36
- Patel* [2011] (Australia) 248, 259, 262
- Paterson, Ron 8–10
- Pegios* [2008] 254, 257–8, 264
- Perfect English Murder, The* (Orwell) 35
- Petiot, Dr Marcel 29
- Petrov, Dr Maxim 29
- physician-assisted dying and palliative medicine 10, 301–19
 conclusion 318–19
 continuous deep sedation (CDS) 306–10
 consent 310, 313
 ethical concerns over use of CDS 307–8
 factors cited for instigating CDS 309–10
 hastening death and CDS 305–9, 312, 318
 human dignity, respect for 313, 318
 legal distinction between causing death and allowing patient to die 309
 nature of palliative sedation 302, 308
 use of CDS 307
 and withdrawing artificial hydration and nutrition 307–9, 311
- Netherlands *see* Netherlands
- perilous palliation: the boundary between caring and killing 301–2, 304–6
 double effect doctrine 301–2, 304–6, 309, 312, 318
 tension between palliative care and physician-assisted dying (PAD) in UK 304, 317
 arguments against legalising any form of PAD 303–4
 arguments in favour of legalising PAD 304
 what the patient wants? 311–13
 early terminal sedation 312–13
- Pickles, Dr William 31
- police 82–3
 actions and investigations/discharge of duties as matters for the police 88
 deaths/near-deaths from medical care investigations 88–9
 referral of cases to CPS 118
 ECHR Article 2 and more extensive investigations 87–9, 94, 139, 141, 155–6
 families' concerns, responding to 89, 156
 more investigations about medical treatment standards 118, 135, 146, 155–6
 liaison protocol between CPS, HSE, and regulatory agencies 193, 207–8
- Operation Orcadian* 47
- victim involvement in police decision-making 86–9
- Police and Criminal Evidence Act (1984) 71
- Porter, Roy 31
- Powers, M. 43
- Prentice and Sullman* [1994] 104, 123, 131, 147–8
- prescription drugs *see* use and impact of the criminal process on treatment of pain in the USA
- Pritchard* [1865] 65
- prosecution decision-making in medical manslaughter cases 6–7, 117–58
 alternatives to medical manslaughter by gross negligence 145–55

Index

329

- a context-specific offence of 'medical neglect endangering life' 150–6
- a context-specific revised version of gross negligence manslaughter 149–50
- reckless manslaughter/raising the bar of liability 114, 117, 146–9
- background to medical manslaughter cases
 - Code for Crown Prosecutors *see under* Crown Prosecution Service (CPS)
 - CPS Special Crime Division role 119–20, 139
 - ECHR Article 2, effects of interpretation of 87–8, 94, 120–1, 139, 155–6
 - increased complaints/investigations relating to medical deaths 118, 155–6
 - instructing appropriate experts 119–20
 - referral of case by police to CPS 118
- conclusion 155–7
- gross negligence manslaughter
 - alternatives to medical manslaughter by gross negligence 145–55
 - corporate liability and health and safety offences 198–9
 - trends in prosecutions for medical manslaughter by gross negligence 131–6
 - uncertainty of gross negligence manslaughter 121–31, 133, 145
 - use in the medical setting 184–6
- methodology 157–8
- prosecution decision-making in relation to healthcare deaths in England/Wales 136–45
- no breach of the duty of care 122, 138–40
- no decision 136–7
- failure to establish causation 122, 140–2, 146, 150, 156
- failure to reach 'gross' threshold 142–5, 147–8
- prosecution – all tests met 137–8
- prosecution policy on corporate manslaughter 207–8
- trends in prosecutions for medical manslaughter by gross negligence 131–6
- convincing the jury 91, 135–6, 144–5
- no evidence of an increase in prosecutions 117, 131–4, 145–6
- increase in prosecutions but no lowering of threshold 132–3, 135
- uncertainty of gross negligence manslaughter/medical manslaughter 121–31, 133, 145
- can negligent behaviour be deterred? 130–1
- criminality or 'badness' 123–6
- elements to be proved for gross negligence manslaughter 122
- 'gross negligence', meaning of 122–6
- homicide law in England and Wales 121–2, 184
- is negligence culpable? 127–9
- medical manslaughter, meaning of 122
- moral luck 126–7, 148, 152
- objective nature of test for gross negligence manslaughter 117, 123, 125
- psychiatric care and criminal prosecution 7, 159–73
- conclusions 172–3
- failing to care 159
- ill-treatment and wilful neglect 160–2
- a new welfare offence? 165–73
- deliberating recklessness 171–2
- no duty, no crime 166–7
- possible new offence 165
- 'unnecessary suffering' 169–71
- problems with prosecuting 162–5, 172
- diagnostic gateways troublesome 162–3
- first limb of s. 127 Mental Health Act redundant 164
- lack of legal certainty surrounding statutory offences 164–5
- requirement of medical treatment for mental disorder confusing 163–4
- a question of causation 167–9
- public demands for medical accountability 2–3, 145–6, 235
- Purdy* [2009] 92–3
- Quick, Oliver 6, 44–5, 90–1
- context-specific offence of 'medical neglect endangering life' 152–3, 151
- increased prosecutions/complaints against doctors 89, 132–3, 135, 262
- reckless manslaughter 146–7, 149–50, 151
- vagueness of 'gross negligence' test and reliance on instinct 126
- Quill, T. E. 313
- radiotherapy 179–80
- recklessness 58
- deliberating recklessness 171–2

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

330 Index

- recklessness (cont.)
 - as running an unjustified or unreasonable risk 171–2, 76
 - subjective recklessness 126
 - and determining gross negligence 90–1, 124–5, 138, 142–3, 184
 - as test for medical manslaughter 6, 76, 109, 114, 116–17, 146–9, 152
- Reeves, Graeme 248, 258–9, 262
- restorative justice 6, 10, 97–9, 131
 - for assisted dying cases 98–9
 - for medical deaths and near-deaths 98–9, 155
- Roux, Professor Jacques 267–8, 271–2
- Rowley* [2003] 123–5, 148
- Royal College of General Practitioners 38
- Royal College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists 216
- Salisu* [2009] 159, 168–9
- Sanders, Andrew 5–7, 9–10, 91
- Sargent, Dr Norman 44
- Seale, C. 304, 306–10, 313–14
- Seddon, M. 235
- serial killings – case of Dr Shipman
 - see* Shipman, Dr Harold
- Seymour, J. E. 314
- Sharpe, Lisa 129, 154–5
- Shipman, Dr Harold 4, 13–42
 - background 14–15, 18, 22–3
 - psychological make-up 15, 22–4
 - career 14–18
 - drug addiction and offences 15
 - GMC response to convictions and resumption of practice 15
 - powers under s. 12 Misuse of Drugs Act 1971 not exercised 16
 - suspicions/concerns raised by Dr Linda Reynolds 16–17
- clinicide *see* clinicide
- crimes shifting public levels of trust and deference 4
- health services providing supportive context for serial killers 1, 14, 17–18
- pattern of Shipman's deaths 21–6
 - crimes committed 13–16, 25–6
 - method of killings 21–2
 - timings of killings 21
 - victim groups 22
- Shipman Inquiry chaired by Dame Janet Smith 13–14, 18, 24–6, 40
- Dr Banks criticised 17
- flawed nature of first police investigation 17
- GMC failure to protect public in drug conviction cases 15–16
- suspicious deaths 19
- trust in healthcare 36–42
 - perceptions of Shipman as a good doctor 37–8, 40–1
 - primitive forging of Kathleen Grundy's will 17, 41–2
 - recognition of Shipman's bizarre attitudes and practices 38–40
 - standing and trust in which profession held 36–7
 - trust and pretending to qualifications 36
- type and antitype 30–6
 - dangers of doctors providing medical care and certifying cause of death 35–6
 - fictional accounts of clinicide and medical incompetence 32–5
 - nature of UK general practice and GPs 30–2
- Shone* [2005] 170–1
- Sigler, K. A. 295
- Simpson, Keith 35
- Sinclair, Douglas 95
- Skegg, Peter 245–6
- Smith, Rt Hon Justice Smith 38
 - chairing the Shipman Inquiry *see under* Shipman, Dr Harold
- Snow, John 50
- Soderberg, Hjalmar 33
- Sood* [2006] (Australia) 256–7, 264
- Strid, Judi 235
- Suicide Act (1961) 10, 301
- Sullman see* *Prentice and Sullman*
- Swango, Michael 27–9
- Sykes, N. 305–9
- Sykes, W. S. 52, 63
 - Thirty-Seven Little Things Which Have All Caused Death* 63
- Tadros, V. 129
- Taktak* [1988] (Australia) 254
- Taylor, Kelly 311–12, 316
- Thorns, A. 305–9
- Toft, Brian 7–8, 177–8, 180–1
- Turner, C. L. 181
- United States of America (USA)
 - anaesthetic mortality deaths, concern over 56
 - Drug Enforcement Administration 284–5, 295–6, 298
 - healthcare fraud 20

Cambridge University Press

978-1-107-02153-2 - Bioethics, Medicine and the Criminal Law Volume II: Medicine, Crime and Society

Edited by Danielle Griffiths and Andrew Sanders

Index

[More information](#)

Index

331

- healthcare professionals committing
 - clincide 19–20
- pain treating *see* use and impact of the criminal process on treatment of pain in the USA
- physician-assisted suicide 294, 316
- publicity orders 207
- use and impact of the criminal process on treatment of pain in the USA 3–4, 9–10, 280–300
 - case of William Hurwitz 297–9
 - conclusion 299–300
 - diversion of pharmaceuticals 280–1
 - extent of pharmaceutical diversion 284
 - increase in pharmaceutical diversion 283
 - meaning of diversion 283–4
 - numbers of prescriptions as indication of possible diversion 295–6
 - sources of diverted pharmaceuticals 283–4
 - impact of criminal process on pain treatment 295–7
 - efforts to control harm caused by opioids focused on prescribers 297
 - fear of investigation as significant barrier to pain treatment 295–6
 - prescription drug abuse, death and diversion 280–4
 - misuse of prescription drugs prevalent 282–3
 - prosecution of physicians in the USA 285, 287–90
 - reported white-collar crime involving physicians 289–90
 - white-collar crime and prosecutorial discretion 288–9
 - prosecution of physicians in the USA, factors associated with 290–2
 - community context 291–2
 - factors influencing charging decisions 290–1
 - prosecution of physicians for treating pain and prescribing opioids 292–5
 - charges against physicians rare in context of prescribing opioids 294–5
 - divergent views on standard of care in palliative medicine 294
 - intercollegial discord/disagreements between providers and families 293
 - lack of prosecutors' knowledge on role of opioids in pain treatment 293–4
 - reluctance to prosecute in relation to treating dying patients 292
 - regulation of medical practice in the USA 286
 - regulation of medicine by state boards of medicine and osteopathy 286–7
 - regulation of prescription drugs 284–5
 - Controlled Substances Act 1970 (CSA) 283–6
 - penalties 284–5
 - state laws can be more restrictive than the federal CSA 285
 - under-treated pain 280–2
 - fear of investigation as significant barrier to pain treatment 295–6
 - under-prescribing to avoid costs associated with an investigation 296
 - when should the criminal process be used against physicians? 297
- Valentine* [1842] (Australia) 255
- victims' voices, interests and criminal justice in the healthcare setting 5–6, 81–100, 111
 - assisted dying 92–5, 120
 - restorative justice for assisted dying cases 98–9
 - victims' views 92, 95–6, 99
- Code of Practice for Victims of Crime 84, 95
 - conclusion 99–100
- EU Framework Decision on treatment of victims 84
- punitive segregation and penal policies 85–6, 99–100
- victim involvement in police decision-making 86–9
- victim involvement in prosecution decision-making 89–92, 132, 135, 146
- victims and criminal justice 81–6
 - victims forgotten 81–3
 - victims rediscovered 83–6
- victims' voices and victims' interest:
 - punitive or 'restorative' 84–5, 95–9
 - restorative justice 6, 10, 97–9
 - restorative justice for medical deaths and near-deaths 98–9
- warnings
 - distinction between a duty and a power to warn 69–70
 - ignoring warnings and gross negligence 125, 137–8, 147, 151
 - official warnings in restorative justice process 97
 - reporting systems, need for 182, 189

332 Index

- warnings (cont.)
 - requirement of reasonable action in
 - response to warnings 182–5, 191
 - corporate liability for failure to respond 182–4, 189–91
 - effect on jury’s decision of unheeded warnings 7–8, 187–8, 190
 - HSE warnings 220
 - need to retain and disclose evidence 188, 191
 - whistleblowing 182
 - corporate liability 190
 - treatment of ‘whistleblowers’ 190–1
- Wells, Celia 8, 10, 217
- Westbrook, J. I. 181
- Weyers, H. 318
- whistleblowing *see under* warnings
- Wilks, Michael 305
- Williams, Glenys 309
- Williams, Lynda 235
- Woollin [1999] 305
- Women’s Health Action (New Zealand) 235
- Yeo, S. 263–4
- Yogasakaran [1990] (New Zealand) 231
- Yorker, P. 19–20
- Youngner, S. J. 292
- Ziegler, Stephen J. 9–10, 292–4