Grassroots for Hire

Although "grassroots" conjures up images of independent citizen organizing, much mass participation today is sponsored by elite consultants working for corporations and powerful interest groups. This book pulls back the curtain to reveal a lucrative industry of consulting firms that incentivize public activism as a marketable service. Edward Walker illustrates how, spurred by the post-1960s advocacy explosion and rising business political engagement, elite consultants have deployed new technologies to commercialize mass participation. Using evidence from interviews, surveys, and public records, Grassroots for Hire paints a detailed portrait of these consultants and their clients. Today, Fortune 500 firms hire them to countermobilize against regulation, protest, or controversy. Ironically, some advocacy groups now outsource organizing to them. Walker also finds that consultants are reshaping both participation and policymaking, but unethical "astroturf" strategies are often ineffective. This path-breaking book calls for a rethinking of interactions between corporations, advocacy groups, and elites in politics.

EDWARD T. WALKER is Assistant Professor in the Department of Sociology at the University of California, Los Angeles.

Business and Public Policy

Series Editor:

ASEEM PRAKASH, University of Washington

Series Board:

Vinod K. Aggarwal, University of California, Berkeley Tanja A. Börzel, Freie Universität Berlin David Coen, University College London Peter Gourevitch, University of California, San Diego Neil Gunningham, The Australian National University Witold J. Henisz, University of Pennsylvania Adrienne Héritier, European University Institute Chung-in Moon, Yonsei University Sarah A. Soule, Stanford University David Vogel, University of California, Berkeley

This series aims to play a pioneering role in shaping the emerging field of business and public policy. Business and Public Policy focuses on two central questions. First, how does public policy influence business strategy, operations, organization, and governance, and with what consequences for both business and society? Second, how do businesses themselves influence policy institutions, policy processes, and other policy actors, and with what outcomes?

Other books in the series:

- TIMOTHY WERNER, Public Forces and Private Politics in American Big Business
- HEVINA S. DASHWOOD, The Rise of Global Corporate Social Responsibility: Mining and the Spread of Global Norms
- LLEWLYN HUGHES, Globalizing Oil: Firms and Oil Market Governance in France, Japan, and the United States

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02136-5 - Grassroots for Hire: Public Affairs Consultants in American Democracy Edward T. Walker Frontmatter More information

Grassroots for Hire

Public Affairs Consultants in American Democracy

EDWARD T. WALKER University of California, Los Angeles



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Published in the United States of America by Cambridge University Press, New York

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107619012

© Edward T. Walker 2014

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2014

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data Walker, Edward T. Grassroots for hire : public affairs consultants in American democracy / Edward T. Walker. pages cm. – (Business and public policy) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-1-107-02136-5 (hardback) 1. Public interest lobbying – United States. 2. Community organization – United States. 3. Business and politics – United States. 4. Industrial policy – United States. 5. Democracy – United States. I. Title. JK1118.W346 2014 322'.30973–dc23

ISBN 978-1-107-02136-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-107-61901-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For Evelyn

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02136-5 - Grassroots for Hire: Public Affairs Consultants in American Democracy Edward T. Walker Frontmatter More information

Contents

List of figures	<i>page</i> ix
List of tables	х
Acknowledgements	xi
Part I Sources	
1 Grassroots from the top down	3
2 Defining the field and its implications	20
3 The formation of a grassroots industry	51
Part II Structure	
4 Methods for mobilizing the public	79
5 Corporate grassroots	108
6 Outsourcing advocacy? Consulting for associations	131
Part III Outcomes	
7 Participatory and policy impacts	155
8 Conclusion	192
Appendices	
1 Identifying consulting firms (baseline data)	207
2.1 Identifying firms to survey	210
2.2 SPAPCO survey procedures	214
2.3 SPAPCO survey questions	216
3.1 Website data: general firm characteristics	222
3.2 Website data: client lists	223
4.1 Interview procedures	226
4.2 Confidentiality practices	226

vii

Cambridge University Press
978-1-107-02136-5 - Grassroots for Hire: Public Affairs Consultants in American Democracy
Edward T. Walker
Frontmatter
More information

viii		Contents
5.1	Models of corporate grassroots: dependent variable	228
5.2	Models of corporate grassroots: independent variables	
	and estimation	229
6	Models of consulting for non-trade associations	238
7	Models of consulting for trade associations	240
8	On public affairs consulting as a profession	242
Bibli	iography	245
Publ	lic documents referenced	264
Inde	x	273

Figures

3.1	Career backgrounds of grassroots consulting	
	firm founders	page 58
3.2	From movements to interest groups, 1968–1990	62
3.3	Founding patterns of organizational populations	69
4.1	Clients of public affairs consultants (website data)	92
4.2	Policy target of a consultant's primary campaign (survey	
	data)	98
4.3	Clients of consultants (website data) and mean share of	
	revenue provided by each client type (survey data)	103
7.1	Demographic groups targeted in consultants' primary	
	campaign (survey data)	162
7.2	Stakeholder groups targeted for participation in	
	corporate-sponsored campaigns (survey data)	164
7.3	Self-reported success of campaigns, by policy goal of	
	client (survey data)	166
7.4	Perceived effectiveness of tactics for mobilizing public	
	participation (survey data)	168
7.5	Protests against Wal-Mart, 1998–2011	172
7.6	Location of the CN and EJ&E lines, and locations of	
	public meetings concerning the STB's draft	
	environmental impact statement between August and	
	September 2008	184
A.1	Introductory statement for SPAPCO survey	217

ix

Tables

3.1	Random effects Poisson GEE regression analyses of the	
	founding of public affairs consulting firms, 1972–2002	page 72
4.1	Partisanship by primary client type (website data)	94
4.2	Services provided by consultants (survey data)	96
4.3	Primary service provided by consultants (survey data)	97
5.1	Negative binomial regression of the count of consultants	
	hired by Fortune 500 firms on corporate characteristics	124
6.1	Rare event logistic regression of hiring a consultant by an	
	advocacy organization	147
A.1	Comparing consulting firms in the sample with excluded	
	firms (baseline data)	212
A.2	Rare event logistic regression of hiring a consultant by a	
	trade association	241

Acknowledgements

Studying how organizations mobilize political participation has instilled in me a deep appreciation of how individual and group actions are made possible by particular social contexts. Intellectual production is no different, as ideas about how best to understand social life require a fertile context in which to take root. Accordingly, this study would not have been possible without the support of those colleagues, students, research collaborators, family, and friends who helped me as I overhauled what started as a dissertation into a finished book.

First, I thank the public affairs consultants who took the time to sit for an interview with me, respond to my survey, and/or provide feedback on the project. Although our confidentiality agreements do not, of course, permit me to offer personal thanks here to the many who took time out of their (often incredibly) busy schedules to participate, I hope all of my interviewees and respondents know how much I value their support of this research.

This work was made possible with the support of a number of grants and fellowships. As a doctoral dissertation, this research was awarded a Doctoral Dissertation Improvement Grant from the National Science Foundation (#SES-0527344). This grant was used to collect the baseline data on the population of consultants. In order to assess which of these consulting firms survived, I received a small seed grant from the University of Vermont College of Arts and Sciences. This allowed me to write the grant proposal for the surveys and interviews of the firms that survived, which, in turn, was funded jointly by the NSF's Sociology and Political Science programs (#SES-0851153). Support through the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation's (RWJF) Scholars in Health Policy Research program provided me with a leave from teaching and time to complete this book. Of course, although I am exceedingly grateful for support from these funders, they bear no responsibility for the analyses reported here.

I was also fortunate enough to receive thoughtful questions and feedback on various portions of this project during talks at Harvard

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02136-5 - Grassroots for Hire: Public Affairs Consultants in American Democracy Edward T. Walker Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

Acknowledgements

Business School, New York University, the Ohio State University, Pennsylvania State University, Institut d'études politiques de Paris (Sciences-Po), University of Connecticut, University of North Carolina-Chapel Hill, University of California-Los Angeles, University of California-San Diego, University of Michigan, University of Vermont, and the University of Western Ontario's Ivey School of Business.

This project would not have been possible without the hard work of a number of research assistants and peers at Penn State, Vermont, and Michigan who helped with data collection, including Simon Boehme, Benjamin Dube, Heather Ellis, Dara Ewing, Rebecca Falkenstern, Jasmine Fledderjohann, Katie Johnson, Kirstin Kapustik, Marie Krouse, Kathryn Lindenmuth, Daniele Loprieno, Leslie MacConnell, Jennifer Matson, Jessica Pavel, Heather Seitz, Coryn Shiflet, and Rachel Smith.

Colleagues at each of my institutional homes since this project began have helped in some fashion. At Penn State, the dissertation committee who helped me to launch this project deserves particular thanks: John McCarthy, Alan Sica, Lee Ann Banaszak, Roger Finke, and Nancy Love. Alan's unrivaled knowledge of the history of sociological thought continues to serve as an excellent resource for his students. In John I found perhaps the best intellectual mentor that a junior scholar could be so fortunate to find. His commitment to rigorous, systematic, and yet creative forms of sociological inquiry are an inspiration, and his model as a careful mentor of graduate student research is one that I can only hope to emulate in some small part with my own students.

A number of peers at Penn State also read drafts, provided feedback, and offered moral support during the project's early stages: Amy Adamczyk, Latrica Best, Amber Boydstun, Cassie Dorius, Shawn Dorius, Dan Hawkins, Nathan Hess, Jacob Hibel, Kelly Innes, Erik Johnson, Andrew Lindner, Andrew Martin, Nivi Menon, Pat Rafail, Phil Schwadel, and Michael Stout. Frank Baumgartner also provided helpful resources as the project developed, both in our collaborative work and in his suggestions about this book. I am also grateful for his willingness to share data that he and John McCarthy collected from the *Encyclopedia of Associations* (used in Chapter 6).

The University of Vermont's sociology department served as a stimulating and collegial context during this project's adolescent stage. I received useful feedback on this project throughout my time there. Beth

xii

xiii

Acknowledgements

Mintz read what became Chapter 6 carefully and made excellent suggestions. I also benefited from discussions about Chapter 3 and the broader project with Nick Danigelis, Alice Fothergill, Kathy Fox, Anthony Gierzynski, Lutz Kaelber, Nikki Khanna, Tom Streeter, and Rick Vanden Bergh.

My time as an RWJF Scholar in Health Policy Research provided access to what is perhaps the most fertile scholarly environment in the social sciences. Through this fellowship, I received feedback on portions of this book, especially the introductory chapters and Chapters 4–7, from Megan Andrew, Graeme Boushey, Seth Freedman, Alice Goffman, Rick Hall, Hahrie Han, Paula Lantz, Trevon Logan, Hans Noel, Edward Norton, Brendan Nyhan, Fabio Rojas, Kevin Stange, and Patty Strach. While at Michigan, I also received excellent suggestions from scholars outside the RWJF program including Elizabeth Armstrong, Jerry Davis, Liz Gerber, Michael Heaney, Rob Jansen, Sandy Levitsky, Mark Mizruchi, and Kiyo Tsutsui. Most of all, I was lucky enough to have Mayer Zald as a regular lunch date and reviewer of my work during those years, as Mayer's ideas helped to inspire and motivate this research. His passing in 2012 was a great personal and collective loss.

UCLA has served as an ideal intellectual home since my arrival here in 2011, and my thinking about public participation and advocacy has evolved based on exchanges with Josh Bloom, Rogers Brubaker, Zeke Hasenfeld, Hannah Landecker, Ching Kwan Lee, Michael Mann, Chris Rea, Gabriel Rossman, Bill Roy, Abigail Saguy, Stefan Timmermans, Roger Waldinger, Andreas Wimmer, and Lynne Zucker. I also thank Alan Fiske and Mark Peterson for help navigating the institution during my transition to the university and in the final months of completing this book.

Beyond my various institutional homes, a number of scholars have read, commented on, or discussed chapters of this book, and deserve particular thanks: Forrest Briscoe, Matt Desmond, Marc Dixon, Jonathan Doh, Craig Jenkins, Colin Jerolmack, Brayden King, Jeff Manza, David Meyer, Sarah Soule, Steve Vallas, David Vogel, Tim Werner, and Lori Qingyuan Yue. Doug McAdam has also provided support for my scholarly development during my time writing this book. Caroline Lee and Michael McQuarrie, my collaborators on a broader project about the link between public participation and inequality, have served as important sources of ideas throughout my Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-02136-5 - Grassroots for Hire: Public Affairs Consultants in American Democracy Edward T. Walker Frontmatter <u>More information</u>

Acknowledgements

time working on this project. I also thank Vincent Roscigno and Randy Hodson, who offered thorough feedback in their role as editors of the *American Sociological Review* when my article – the major findings of which are reproduced in Chapter 3 – appeared in 2009. Additionally, thanks are due to those who have supported my efforts to publicize this research, including former *Contexts* editors Doug Hartmann and Chris Uggen and also Sewell Chan at the *New York Times*.

My survey would not have been possible without the support of Penn State's Survey Research Center, especially Brian Sonak for his careful attention to programming details. I also received essential feedback on survey drafts from Frank Baumgartner, Daniel Kreiss, Michael Lord, John McCarthy, Beth Mintz, and Patty Strach.

Moving further into the past, I would like to thank those advisors who inspired my initial interest in sociology. Doug Porpora's love of ideas is contagious, and I know that I'm not the only one of his former students who credits their continuing excitement about sociology, in part, to those famous multi-hour conversations in his office. I also owe much to the early mentorship of Bob Brulle, Dave Kutzik, and Wes Shumar.

My particular thanks go to Business and Public Policy series editor Aseem Prakash, to John Haslam at Cambridge University Press, and to editorial board members Sarah Soule and David Vogel. Both Aseem and John have made considerable efforts to improve this manuscript and bring it into print. Additionally, I thank Aseem for hosting a thoughtprovoking session at the International Studies Association meetings in San Diego in 2012, highlighting recent or forthcoming books in the Business and Public Policy series.

Lastly, I would like to thank my family for their strong support during the writing of this book. My parents and brother – respectively, Joan, Edward, and Daniel Walker – were careful listeners and offered excellent suggestions for how to help the work reach a broader audience. Most of all, I thank Lauren Kusiv for her crucial support of me and of this project from the very start. Lauren has read draft chapters, helped me think through decisions along the way, and talked with me endlessly about the changing nature of public participation and advocacy. She has also been an exceedingly patient, supportive, and caring partner throughout multiple moves and during times when finishing this book and presenting its findings kept me away from home.

This book is dedicated to our daughter, Evelyn Rose Walker.

xiv