

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01968-3 — The Road to Maxwell's Demon
Conceptual Foundations of Statistical Mechanics
Meir Hemmo , Orly R. Shenker
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The Road to Maxwell's Demon
Conceptual Foundations of Statistical Mechanics

Time asymmetric phenomena are successfully predicted by statistical mechanics. Yet the foundations of this theory are surprisingly shaky. Its explanation for the ease of mixing milk with coffee is incomplete, and even implies that un-mixing them should be just as easy. In this book the authors develop a new conceptual foundation for statistical mechanics that addresses this difficulty. Explaining the notions of macrostates, probability, measurement, memory, and the arrow of time in statistical mechanics, they reach the startling conclusion that Maxwell's Demon, the famous *perpetuum mobile*, is consistent with the fundamental physical laws.

Mathematical treatments are avoided where possible, and instead the authors use novel diagrams to illustrate the text. This is a fascinating book for graduate students and researchers interested in the foundations and philosophy of physics.

MEIR HEMMO is an Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy, University of Haifa. He has written on the foundations of quantum mechanics and statistical mechanics.

ORLY R. SHENKER is a Senior Lecturer at the Program for the History and Philosophy of Science, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem. She has written on the foundations of classical and quantum statistical mechanics and on the rationality of science.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01968-3 — The Road to Maxwell's Demon
Conceptual Foundations of Statistical Mechanics
Meir Hemmo , Orly R. Shenker
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The Road to Maxwell's Demon
Conceptual Foundations of Statistical Mechanics

MEIR HEMMO
University of Haifa

ORLY R. SHENKER
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-107-01968-3 — The Road to Maxwell's Demon
 Conceptual Foundations of Statistical Mechanics
 Meir Hemmo, Orly R. Shenker
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107019683

© M. Hemmo and O. Shenker 2012

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2012

Reprinted 2013

First paperback edition 2014

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Hemmo, Meir.

The road to Maxwell's demon / Meir Hemmo, Orly Shenker.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-107-01968-3 (Hardback)

1. Maxwell's demon. 2. Second law of thermodynamics.
 3. Statistical thermodynamics. 4. Maxwell, James Clerk, 1831–1879.

I. Shenker, Orly. II. Title.

QC318.M35H46 2012

536'.71–dc23

2012012613

ISBN 978-1-107-01968-3 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-107-42432-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-107-01968-3 — The Road to Maxwell's Demon
Conceptual Foundations of Statistical Mechanics
Meir Hemmo , Orly R. Shenker
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

To my wife Tami, and to my children Alma, Avigail, and Shaul – M. H.
For my daughter Marie – may your trajectory, like that of
Maxwell's Demon, evolve through growing
potentialities and increasingly meaningful experiences – O. S.

Contents

	<i>Preface</i>	<i>page xi</i>
1	Introduction	1
2	Thermodynamics	16
	2.1 The experience of asymmetry in time	16
	2.2 The Law of Conservation of Energy	18
	2.3 The Law of Approach to Equilibrium	22
	2.4 The Second Law of Thermodynamics	25
	2.5 The status of the laws of thermodynamics	38
3	Classical mechanics	40
	3.1 The fundamental theory of the world	40
	3.2 Introducing classical mechanics	42
	3.3 Mechanical states	43
	3.4 Time evolution of mechanical states	49
	3.5 Thermodynamic magnitudes	51
	3.6 A mechanical no-go theorem	56
	3.7 The ergodic approach	62
	3.8 Conclusion	71
4	Time	72
	4.1 Introduction: why mechanics cannot underwrite thermodynamics	72
	4.2 Classical kinematics	73
	4.3 The direction of time and the direction of velocity in time	74
	4.4 The description of mechanical states	76
	4.5 Velocity reversal	80

4.6	Retrodiction	84
4.7	Time reversal and time-reversal invariance	86
4.8	Why the time-reversal invariance of classical mechanics matters	91
5	Macrostates	94
5.1	The physical nature of macrostates	94
5.2	How do macrostates come about?	97
5.3	Explaining thermodynamics with macrostates	105
5.4	The dynamics of macrostates	106
5.5	The physical origin of thermodynamic macrostates	108
5.6	Boltzmann's macrostates	111
5.7	Maxwell–Boltzmann distribution	115
5.8	The observer in statistical mechanics	119
5.9	Counterfactual observers	123
6	Probability	125
6.1	Introduction	125
6.2	Probability in statistical mechanics	126
6.3	Choice of measure in statistical mechanics	132
6.4	Measure of a macrostate and its probability	136
6.5	Transition probabilities without blobs	137
6.6	Dependence on observed history?	139
6.7	The spin echo experiments	143
6.8	Robustness of transition probabilities	149
6.9	No probability over initial conditions	149
7	Entropy	153
7.1	Introduction	153
7.2	Entropy	154
7.3	The distinction between entropy and probability	158
7.4	Equilibrium in statistical mechanics	159
7.5	Law of Approach to Equilibrium	160
7.6	Second Law of Thermodynamics	162
7.7	Boltzmann's H -theorem	164
7.8	Loschmidt's reversibility objection	167
7.9	Poincaré's recurrence theorem	170
7.10	Boltzmann's combinatorial argument	171
7.11	Back to Boltzmann's equation: Lanford's theorem	175
7.12	Conclusion	178

Contents

ix

8	Typicality	182
	8.1 Introduction	182
	8.2 The explanatory arrow in statistical mechanics	183
	8.3 Typicality	184
	8.4 Are there natural measures?	186
	8.5 Typical initial conditions	187
	8.6 Measure-1 theorems and typicality	189
	8.7 Conclusion	191
9	Measurement	192
	9.1 Introduction	192
	9.2 What is measurement in classical mechanics?	193
	9.3 Collapse in classical measurement	200
	9.4 State preparation	202
	9.5 The shadows approach	206
	9.6 Entropy	207
	9.7 Status of the observer	209
10	The past	212
	10.1 Introduction	212
	10.2 The problem of retrodiction	213
	10.3 The Past Hypothesis: memory and measurement	216
	10.4 The Reliability Hypothesis	219
	10.5 Past low entropy hypothesis	222
	10.6 Remembering the future	224
	10.7 Problem of initial improbable state	226
	10.8 The dynamics of the Past Hypothesis	228
	10.9 Local and global Past Hypotheses	229
	10.10 Past Hypothesis and physics of memory	230
	10.11 Memory in a time-reversed universe	232
11	Gibbs	234
	11.1 Introduction	234
	11.2 The Gibbsian method in equilibrium	235
	11.3 Gibbsian method in terms of blobs and macrostates	238
	11.4 Gibbsian equilibrium probability distributions	240
	11.5 The approach to equilibrium	241

12	Erasure	246
	12.1 Introduction	246
	12.2 Why there is no microscopic erasure	247
	12.3 What is a macroscopic erasure?	248
	12.4 Necessary and sufficient conditions for erasure	251
	12.5 Logic and entropy	254
	12.6 Another logically irreversible operation	255
	12.7 Logic and entropy: a model	257
	12.8 What does erasure erase?	268
	12.9 Conclusion	268
13	Maxwell's Demon	270
	13.1 Thermodynamic and statistical mechanical demons	270
	13.2 Szilard's insight	273
	13.3 Entropy reduction: measurement	273
	13.4 Efficiency and predictability	278
	13.5 Completing the cycle of operation: erasure	280
	13.6 The Liberal Stance	284
	13.7 Conclusion	286
Appendix A	Szilard's engine	288
Appendix B	Quantum mechanics	300
	B.1 Albert's approach	301
	B.2 Bohmian mechanics	307
	B.3 A quantum mechanical Maxwellian Demon	309
	<i>References</i>	319
	<i>Index</i>	326

Preface

This book is a product of more than decade of joint work during which we have greatly benefited from discussions with many people.

First and foremost, the approach we put forward here has been greatly influenced by David Albert's groundbreaking book from 2000 *Time and Chance*. Albert's way of thinking about Maxwell's Demon has made us realize that the foundations of statistical mechanics are in need of clarification, refinement and sometimes even revision, and this realization has led us to develop many of our ideas that come up in this book. Although we agree with Albert on some important matters – such as the radical idea that Maxwell's Demon is consistent with statistical mechanics – our approach substantially differs from his on a number of issues. However, the need to explain our differing opinions has greatly helped us sharpen our thoughts on the topics we address in this book.

Many conversations with the late Itamar Pitowsky over more than two decades have been extremely valuable to us. Itamar's open mind to new ideas and his constant encouragement throughout our research kept us on the right track.

It is a special pleasure to thank the members of the philosophy of physics group which meets monthly as it has for several years at the Edelstein Centre for the History and Philosophy of Science at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem: in particular we thank Yemima Ben-Menahem, Alon Drori, Daniel Rohrlich, Lev Vaidman, Boaz Tamir, and Simcha Rozen. We received valuable comments from the participants in two series of workshops in which we have presented some of our ideas: New Directions in the Foundations of Physics organized by Jeff Bub, Rob Rynasiewicz and James Mattingly, and the meetings in Sesto, Italy organized by GianCarlo Ghirardi, Nino Zanghi, Shelly Goldstein and Delfet Dürr; and from the participants in two international meetings of

the Bar Hillel Colloquium for the History, Philosophy and Sociology of Science held at the Van Leer Institute in Jerusalem: in 2000, on the subject of foundations of statistical mechanics, and in 2008, on the subject of probability in physics, in honor of Itamar Pitowsky. We have also benefited from discussions and written exchanges with (in alphabetic order) Frank Arntzenius, Joseph Berkovitz, Jeff Bub, Criag Callender, Shelly Goldstein, Amit Hagar, Carl Hoefer, the late Rolf Landauer, Barry Loewer, Tim Maudlin, Wayne Myrvold and Jos Uffink. We also thank the Cambridge University Press editorial team and especially Lindsay Nightingale for her thorough copy editing.

This research has been supported by the Israel Science Foundation, grant numbers 240/06 and 713/10, and by the German-Israel Foundation, grant number 1-1054-112.5/2009.

Meir Hemmo, Orly Shenker