

THE POLITICS OF HERESY IN AMBROSE OF MILAN

Community and Consensus in Late Antique Christianity

Ambrose of Milan is famous above all for his struggle with, and triumph over, 'Arian' heresy. Yet, almost all of the evidence comes from Ambrose's own writings, and from pious historians of the next generation who represented him as a champion of orthodoxy. This detailed study argues instead that an 'Arian' opposition in Milan was largely conjured up by Ambrose himself, lumping together critics and outsiders in order to secure and justify his own authority. Along with new interpretations of Ambrose's election as bishop, his controversies over the faith, and his clashes with the imperial court, this book provides a new understanding of the nature and significance of heretical communities in late antiquity. In place of rival congregations inflexibly committed to doctrinal beliefs, it envisages a world of more fluid allegiances in which heresy – but also consensus – could be a matter of deploying the right rhetorical frame.

MICHAEL STUART WILLIAMS is Lecturer in Roman History in the Maynooth University Department of Ancient Classics. He has published widely on the history and culture of late-antique Christianity and is the author of *Authorised Lives in Early Christian Biography: Between Eusebius and Augustine* (Cambridge University Press, 2008). He has edited two volumes of scholarly essays under the title *Unclassical Traditions* and is the co-editor of *Peace and Reconciliation in the Classical World* (Routledge, 2017).



THE POLITICS OF HERESY IN AMBROSE OF MILAN

Community and Consensus in Late-Antique Christianity

MICHAEL STUART WILLIAMS

Maynooth University





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
4843/24, 2nd Floor, Ansari Road, Daryaganj, Delhi – 110002, India
79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107019461 DOI: 10.1017/9781139094658

© Michael Stuart Williams 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc
A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ısвn 978-1-107-01946-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



> Dennis Arnold Williams 25 December 1943 – 8 August 2015



Dr Johnson proceeded: 'Sir, there is a great cry about infidelity; but there are, in reality, very few infidels. I have heard a person, originally a Quaker, but now, I am afraid, a Deist, say, that he did not believe there were, in all England, above two hundred infidels'.¹

¹ James Boswell, The Life of Samuel Johnson, LL.D (1791).



Contents

Acknowledgements List of Abbreviations		<i>page</i> viii x
Lis	0 9 11001000000000000000000000000000000	А
	Introduction: The Strange Death of "Arian" Milan	I
Ι	Making Distinctions: Christian Identity and Community in Late Antiquity	13
2	A Tale of Two Bishops: Auxentius of Milan and the Election of Ambrose	58
3	Framing the Faith: Aquileia, <i>De fide</i> and the Rhetoric of Unity	III
4	Manufacturing Consensus: Communities, Leaders and the First Basilica Crisis	165
5	Popular Appeal: Unity and Authority in the Second	
	Basilica Crisis	214
	Conclusion: Waiting for the Arians	287
Bil	pliography	312
Index of Modern Authors		337
General Index		338



Acknowledgements

Nothing I say here will suffice to repay the debts I have incurred in the course of working on this book. It is easiest to begin with the most obvious: much of this book was planned and written during two periods of sabbatical leave granted to me by Maynooth University, and I should like to thank the university for providing me with these opportunities to pursue my research and my colleagues in the Department of Ancient Classics for not grudging my absence. The final stages were undertaken while I was the beneficiary of a Humboldt Research Fellowship for Experienced Researchers, and for this I am especially grateful to the Humboldt Foundation and to Hartmut Leppin, my host at the J.W. Goethe-Universität Frankfurt am Main, as well as to Sigrid Mratschek, David Scourfield and Christopher Kelly for supporting my application and to Steffen Patzold for his advice at a crucial stage.

In the course of my research I have benefited greatly from the resources made available to me at Maynooth University and at Trinity College, Dublin; at the Bodleian and Sackler libraries in Oxford; at the J.C. Senckenburg library in Frankfurt and the Bibliothek A3 in Mannheim; and at the Centrale Bibliotheek and Maurits Sabbebibliotheek in Leuven. In Oxford I was also encouraged and supported by David Parrott, Robin Lane Fox and Bryan Ward-Perkins.

Early versions of some of this book's ideas and arguments were presented at conferences and seminars in Vancouver, Oxford, Glasgow, Dublin, Maynooth, Exeter and Ghent. I wish to thank Mark Vessey, Neil McLynn, Julia Shear, Edward Herring, David Scourfield, Richard Flower and Koen De Temmerman for the invitations to speak and the audiences at each event for their positive responses and valuable discussion both formal and informal. I am especially grateful for feedback offered on these and other occasions by Lorena Atzeri, Gillian Clark, Kate Cooper, Philip de Souza, Thomas Graumann, Peter I. Kaufman, Gavin Kelly, Melissa Markauskas, Nicholas Mataya, Neil McLynn, Sigrid Mratschek,



Acknowledgements

ix

Éric Rebillard, David Scourfield, Peter Van Nuffelen, Bryan Ward-Perkins and Robin Whelan.

Some of my friends and colleagues devoted an extraordinary amount of time to helping me, and I can only hope that the final product will go some way towards repaying them. Richard Flower on multiple occasions offered detailed advice on difficult problems; Christopher Kelly likewise offered advice and support throughout. Jacqui Maxwell and Robin Whelan each read a draft of what is now Chapter 1 and offered valuable comments. Richard Flower, Meaghan McEvoy and Muriel Moser each read a draft of the final version and not only provided written comments but also set aside time to discuss the structure and purpose of the work as a whole. The anonymous readers provided by Cambridge University Press provided encouragement and insightful commentary, even as the book turned out to be very different from what they had initially been led to believe. All of these have saved me from embarrassing errors of fact and interpretation. None of them is to be held responsible for any of the errors or follies that remain.

At the Press, Michael Sharp was endlessly helpful and supportive at every stage, and he took great pains to ensure that the process of publication ran smoothly from start to finish. I would like to acknowledge the assistance of Elizabeth Hanlon and Joanna Breeze, along with the rest of the production team and my indefatigable copy-editor.

Finally, the most important contributions often go unnoticed by those who make them. Chief among these is the support and encouragement I have received from my family and friends. Among those who offered help and advice or who simply listened to me talk about Ambrose are Kieran McGroarty, Catherine Ware, Eoghan Moloney, Will Desmond, Katarina Domijan, Julie Rodgers, Sarah Kennedy, Oliver O'Sullivan, Donncha O'Rourke, Eva-Maria Kuhn, Aaron Johnson, Linda Huber, Ann Fielding and Ashley Clements. My progress on the book was followed with constant attention and encouragement by my mother, Mary Johnstone, and my father, Dennis Williams, whose own lives provided me with inspiration and, I hope, some insight into the Christians of late antiquity. And I could never have reached this stage without the love and support of Sofie Remijsen, who listened to reports of my daily progress with her accustomed patience and good advice and who was always ready to remind me that there is life outside of a book.



CCSL

Cambridge University Press 978-1-107-01946-1 — The Politics of Heresy in Ambrose of Milan Michael Stuart Williams Frontmatter More Information

Abbreviations

Ancient authors and texts are abbreviated according to the conventions applied in the *Oxford Classical Dictionary* (3rd edn. rev., Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003); further Christian authors and texts are abbreviated where possible according to *The SBL Handbook of Style* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1999). Note additional and adapted abbreviations as follows:

Corpus Christianorum, Series Latina; Turnhout: Brepols,

	1953
CJ	Codex Justinianus, ed. P. Krüger in Corpus Iuris Civilis,
	vol. 2; Berlin: Weidmann, 1892
Const. Sirm.	Constitutiones Sirmondianae, see Codex Theodosianus (CTh)
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum; Vienna:
	Tempsky, 1865
CTh	Codex Theodosianus, ed. Th. Mommsen, with P. Meyer,
	Theodosiani libri XVI, cum Constitutionibus
	Sirmondianis; Berlin: Weidmann, 1904
EAA	Collection des Études augustiniennes, Série Antiquité;
	Turnhout: Brepols, 1954
FC	Fontes Christiani. Freiburg: Herder/Turnhout: Brepols,
	1990.
GCS	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten drei
	Jahrhunderte; Leipzig/Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 1897
ODCC	Oxford Dictionary of the Catholic Church, ed. F. L. Cross
	and E. A. Livingstone, 3rd edn.; Oxford: Oxford
	University Press, 2005
PCBE II	Prosopographie chrétienne du bas-empire, II: Prosopographie
	de l'Italie chrétienne (313–604), ed. C. Pietri and L. Pietri, 2
	vols.; Rome: École française de Rome, 1999–2000
PG	Patrologiae cursus completus, series Graeca, ed. JP.
	Migne; Paris: Imprimerie Catholique, 1857–66



List of Abbreviations

xi

PL	Patrologiae cursus completus, series Latina, ed. JP. Migne;
	Paris: Imprimerie Catholique, 1844–1964
PLRE I	Prosopography of the Later Roman Empire, I: AD 260–395,
	ed. A. H. M. Jones, J. R. Martindale and J. Morris;
	Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1971
PLS	Patrologiae Latinae Supplementum, ed. A. Hamman;
	Paris: Éditions Garnier, 1958–74
SC	Sources chrétiennes; Paris: Éditions du Cerf, 1942